## Pion-Nucleon Scattering in Chiral Perturbation Theory

in collaboration with V. Bernard, E. Epelbaum, A. Gasparyan, M. Hoferichter, J. Gegeila, H. Krebs, B. Kubis, U.-G. Meißner, J. Elvira de Ruiz, D. Yao

- $\Delta$-less formulation
- $\Delta$-ful formulation
- Subthreshold matching


## Motivation and Methodology

Aim Theoretical description of $\pi \mathrm{N} \rightarrow \pi \mathrm{N}$ and $\pi \mathrm{N} \rightarrow \pi \pi \mathrm{N}$ above threshold

```
Problem I QCD is non-perturbative for low energies
Solution I Effective Field Theory = Chiral Perturbation Theory
Problem II Resonances play an important role
Solution II Inclusion of the most dominant resonance }\Delta(1232
        as an explicit degree of freedom
```


## Chiral Approaches

## BxPT

- EFT of Standard Model
- Relies upon chiral symmetry of QCD
- DOF are mesons and baryons instead of quarks
- Breakdown scale of theory: $\Lambda_{b}$


## $\mathrm{HB} \chi \mathrm{PT}$

- Non-relativistic limit of $\chi$ PT
- Inclusion of $1 / m_{N}$ expansion into power counting
- HB- $\pi \mathrm{N}: q / m_{N} \sim q / \Lambda_{b}$ HB-NN: $q / m_{N} \sim\left(q / \Lambda_{b}\right)^{2}$
- Original motivation: calculations beyond tree-level


## Formal Aspects

## BZPI \& HBXPY

Effective Lagrangian


## ByPI \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian


## $\mathrm{B} \gamma \mathrm{PI}$ \& H HByPT

Effective Lagrangian


Tree Graphs


## $\mathrm{B} \gamma \mathrm{PI}$ \& H HByPT

Effective Lagrangian


Tree Graphs


## $\mathrm{B} \gamma \mathrm{PI}$ \& H HByPT

Effective Lagrangian


Tree Graphs


## $\mathrm{B} \gamma \mathrm{PI}$ \& H HByPT

Effective Lagrangian


Tree Graphs


Loop Graphs



Transition from LO loops to NLO loops


## Renormalivation I

## Meson Sector

$$
\begin{aligned}
M^{2} & =M_{\pi}^{2}+\delta M^{(4)} \\
Z_{\pi} & =1+\delta Z_{\pi}^{(4)} \\
F & =F_{\pi}+\delta F_{\pi}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Axial-coupling constant



## Nucleon Self Energy

$$
\begin{aligned}
m & =m_{N}+\delta m^{(2)}+\delta m^{(3)}+\delta m^{(4)} \\
Z_{N} & =1+\delta Z_{N}^{(3)}+\delta Z_{N}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Linear Combinations

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \bar{c}_{1} \rightarrow \bar{c}_{1}+2 M_{\pi}^{2}\left(\bar{e}_{22}-4 \bar{e}_{38}+\bar{c}_{1} \beta_{l_{3}} \bar{l}_{3} /\left(32 \pi^{2} F_{\pi}^{2}\right)\right) \\
& \bar{c}_{2} \rightarrow \bar{c}_{2}-8 M_{\pi}^{2}\left(\bar{e}_{20}+\bar{e}_{35}\right) \\
& \bar{c}_{3} \rightarrow \bar{c}_{3}-4 M_{\pi}^{2}\left(2 \bar{e}_{19}-\bar{e}_{22}-\bar{e}_{36}\right) \\
& \bar{c}_{4} \rightarrow \bar{c}_{4}-4 M_{\pi}^{2}\left(2 \bar{e}_{21}-\bar{e}_{37}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Meson Sector

$$
\begin{aligned}
l_{i} & =\frac{\beta_{l_{i}}}{32 \pi^{2}} \bar{l}_{i}+\beta_{l_{i}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{M_{\pi}^{2}}{\mu^{2}}\right)\right) \\
\bar{\lambda} & =\frac{1}{16 \pi^{2}}\left(\frac{1}{d-4}+\frac{1}{2}\left(\gamma_{E}-1-\ln 4 \pi\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## HB approach

$$
\begin{aligned}
d_{i} & =\bar{d}_{i}+\delta d_{i}=\bar{d}_{i}+\frac{\beta_{d_{i}}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{M_{\pi}^{2}}{\mu^{2}}\right)\right) \\
e_{i} & =\bar{e}_{i}+\delta e_{i}=\bar{e}_{i}+\frac{\beta_{e_{i}}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{M_{\pi}^{2}}{\mu^{2}}\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Covariant "modified" EOMS scheme

$$
\begin{aligned}
& c_{i}=\bar{c}_{i}+\delta c_{i}^{(3)}+\delta c_{i}^{(4)} \\
& d_{i}=\bar{d}_{i}+\delta d_{i}+\delta d_{i}^{(3)}+\delta d_{i}^{(4)} \\
& e_{i}=\bar{e}_{i}+\delta e_{i}+\delta e_{i}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
x \in\{c, d, e\}
$$

$$
\delta x_{i}^{(n)}=\frac{\delta \bar{x}_{i, f}^{(n)}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}+\frac{\beta_{x_{i, B}}^{(n)}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{m_{N}^{2}}{\mu^{2}}\right)\right)
$$

## Fits to Experimental Data

$$
\begin{aligned}
& T^{b a}=\chi_{N^{\prime}}^{\dagger}\left(\delta^{a b} T^{+}+\mathrm{i} \epsilon^{b a c} \tau_{c} T^{-}\right) \chi_{N} \\
& T^{ \pm}=\bar{u}^{\left(s^{\prime}\right)}\left(A^{ \pm}+q B^{ \pm}\right) u^{(s)} \\
& f_{l \pm}^{I}(s)=\frac{1}{16 \pi \sqrt{s}}\left(\left(E+m_{N}\right)\left(A_{l}^{I}(s)+\left(\sqrt{s}-m_{N}\right) B_{l}^{I}(s)\right)\right. \\
& \left.+\left(E-m_{N}\right)\left(-A_{l \pm}^{I}(s)+\left(\sqrt{s}+m_{N}\right) B_{l \pm}^{I}\right)\right) \\
& X_{l}^{I}(s)=\int_{-1}^{1} \mathrm{~d} z X^{I}(s, t) P_{l}(z) \\
& X \in\{A, B\} \\
& T^{ \pm}=\bar{u}_{v}^{\left(s^{\prime}\right)}\left(g^{ \pm}+2 \mathrm{i} S \cdot q \times q^{\prime} h^{ \pm}\right) u_{v}^{(s)} \\
& f_{l \pm}^{I}(s)=\frac{E+m_{N}}{16 \pi \sqrt{s}} \int_{-1}^{1} \mathrm{~d} z\left(g^{I} P_{l}(z)+\boldsymbol{q}^{2} h^{I}\left(P_{l \pm}(z)-z P_{l}(z)\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

HB $\chi$ PT

Isospin basis

$$
X^{I=1 / 2}=X^{+}+2 X^{-}, \quad X^{I=3 / 2}=X^{+}-X^{-}
$$

Unitarization prescription

$$
\delta_{l \pm}^{I}(s)=\arctan \left(|\boldsymbol{q}| \operatorname{Re} f_{l \pm}^{I}(s)\right)
$$

## Dxperimental Data




## Electromagnetic corrections to $\pi N$ scattering

## B. Tromborg

The Niels Bohr Institute, Copenhagen, Denmark
S. Waldenstr $\phi \mathrm{m}$ and I. $\varnothing$ verb $\phi$

Institute of Physics, University of Trondheim, NLHT, Trondheim, Norway
(Received 27 October 1976)
Numerical results are presented for the electromagnetic corrections to the $S$ - and $P$-wave phase shifts and inelasticities in $\pi^{+} p$ and $\pi p$ scattering. A discussion is given of how to apply the corrections in practical data analysis.

## Piting Procedure



## Fluting Procedure



Workman et al. - Phys. Rev. C 86 (2012)

## Fluting Procedure



Workman et al. - Phys. Rev. C 86 (2012)

## Theoretical Error




Pits - LECs over $\mathrm{I}_{\pi}$


Input

| $m_{N}$ | $M_{\pi}$ | $F_{\pi}$ | $g_{A}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 938.27 | 139.57 | 92.2 | 1.289 |
| MeV |  |  |  |



## Predictions

## S-Waves Theo. Error



- RS

-=-=- $Q^{3}$
$-Q^{4}$

P-Waves Theo. Error


- RS

----- $Q^{3}$
$-Q^{4}$


## D-Waves Theo. Error



- GW

- GW

$--=-Q^{3}$
$\longrightarrow Q^{4}$

Good description of $\pi \mathrm{N} \rightarrow \pi \mathrm{N}$ data up to 100 MeV

- agreement with RS S- and P-waves
- disagreement with some GW D- and F-waves
- almost no differences between the counting schemes
- $X^{2}$ /dof increases for energies above 100 MeV
- deviations from plateau-like behavior for LECs above 100 MeV

Theoretical error underestimated for $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}>100 \mathrm{MeV}$

- $\Lambda_{b}<600 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\Delta(1232)$ is not included explicitly


## Including $\Delta(1232)$

## ByPI \& HBZPT

## Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{eff}} & =\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \quad \varepsilon=\left\{\frac{q}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

## ByPT \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{eff}}=\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&\left.+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}, \frac{q}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
&
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Delta$ Tree Graphs


## BZPI \& HBXPY

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }}= & \mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
+ & \mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
+ & \mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& \Delta \text { Tree Graphs }
\end{aligned}
$$



## ByPT \& HBryPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }}= \mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+ \mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\underbrace{\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}}_{\Delta N \Delta}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\} \\
& \Delta \text { Tree Graphs }
\end{aligned}
$$



## ByPT \& HBryPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }}= \mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+ \mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&+ \mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& \Delta \text { Tree Graphs }
\end{aligned}
$$



## BZPI \& HBXPY

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }}= \mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+ \mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&+\left.\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
& \Delta \text { Tree Graphs }
\end{aligned}
$$



## ByPT \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }}=\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&\left.+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
&
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Delta$ Tree Graphs

$\Delta$ Loop Vertices


## ByPI \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{eff}}= \mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+ \mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&+\underbrace{(1)}_{\pi N \Delta}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& \Delta \text { Tree Graphs }
\end{aligned}
$$


$\Delta$ Loop Vertices


## BZPI \& HBXPY

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{eff}}=\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&\left.+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
&
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Delta$ Tree Graphs

$\Delta$ Loop Vertices


## BryP \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{eff}}= \mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \\
&+ \mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
&+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\underbrace{\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}}_{\Delta N \Delta}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}\} \\
& \Delta \text { Tree Graphs }
\end{aligned}
$$


$3 \quad \Delta$ Loop Vertices


## BryP \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }} & =\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \quad \varepsilon=\left\{\frac{q}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Delta$ Tree Graphs

$\Delta$ Loop Vertices


## BryP \& HBzPT

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L}_{\text {eff }} & =\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \quad \varepsilon=\left\{\frac{q}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Delta$ Tree Graphs

$\varepsilon^{3} \quad \Delta$ Loop Vertices


## $\mathrm{B} \gamma \mathrm{PI} \& \mathrm{HB} \mathrm{HPT}$

Effective Lagrangian

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L}_{\mathrm{eff}} & =\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \pi}^{(4)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N}^{(4)} \quad \varepsilon=\left\{\frac{q}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{M_{\pi}}{\Lambda_{b}}, \frac{\Delta}{\Lambda_{b}}\right\} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi \Delta}^{(4)} \\
& +\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(1)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(2)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(3)}+\mathcal{L}_{\pi N \Delta}^{(4)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Delta$ Tree Graphs

$\Delta$ Loop Vertices


## Renormalivation I

Transition to $\Delta$-ful loops


## Renormalization I

## Transition to $\Delta$-ful loops


Nucleon Sector

$$
m=m_{N}+\delta m^{(2)}+\delta m^{(3)}+\delta m^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta m^{(4)}+\delta m^{(4, \Delta)}
$$

$$
Z_{N}=1+\delta Z_{N}^{(3)}+\delta Z_{N}^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta Z_{N}^{(4)}+\delta Z_{N}^{(4, \Delta)}
$$

$$
g=g_{A}+\delta g^{(3)}+\delta g^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta g^{(4, \Delta)}
$$

## $\Delta$ Sector

$$
\begin{gathered}
\mathbf{m}=m_{\Delta}+\delta \mathbf{m}^{(2)}+\delta \mathbf{m}^{(3)}+\delta \mathbf{m}^{(4)} \\
Z_{\Delta}=1+\delta Z_{\Delta}^{(3)}+\delta Z_{\Delta}^{(4)} \\
h=h_{A}+\delta h^{(3)}+\delta h^{(4)}
\end{gathered}
$$

## HB approach

$$
\begin{aligned}
c_{i} & =\bar{c}_{i}+\delta c_{i}^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta c_{i}^{(4, \Delta)} \\
d_{i} & =\bar{d}_{i}+\delta d_{i}+\delta d_{i}^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta d_{i}^{(4, \Delta)} \\
e_{i} & =\bar{e}_{i}+\delta e_{i}+\delta e_{i}^{(4, \Delta)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta x_{i} & =\frac{\beta_{x_{i}}+\beta_{x_{i}}^{\Delta}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{M_{\pi}^{2}}{\mu^{2}}\right)\right) \\
\delta x_{i}^{(n, \Delta)} & =\frac{\delta \bar{x}_{i, f}^{(n, \Delta)}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}+\frac{\beta_{x_{i}}^{(n, \Delta)}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{16 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{2 \Delta}{\mu}\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Covariant "modified" EOMS scheme

$$
\begin{aligned}
c_{i} & =\bar{c}_{i}+\delta c_{i}^{(3)}+\delta c_{i}^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta c_{i}^{(4)}+\delta c_{i}^{(4, \Delta)} \\
d_{i} & =\bar{d}_{i}+\delta d_{i}+\delta d_{i}^{(3)}+\delta d_{i}^{(3, \Delta)}+\delta d_{i}^{(4)}+\delta d_{i}^{(4, \Delta)} \\
e_{i} & =\bar{e}_{i}+\delta e_{i}+\delta e_{i}^{(4)}+\delta e_{i}^{(4, \Delta)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\delta x_{i} & =\frac{\beta_{x_{i}}+\beta_{x_{i}}^{\Delta}}{F_{\pi}^{2}}\left(\bar{\lambda}+\frac{1}{32 \pi^{2}} \ln \left(\frac{M_{\pi}^{2}}{\mu^{2}}\right)\right) \\
F_{\pi}^{2} \delta x^{(n)} & =a_{0}+a_{1} A_{0}\left(m_{N}^{2}\right) \\
F_{\pi}^{2} \delta x^{(n, \Delta)} & =a_{0}+a_{1} A_{0}\left(m_{N}^{2}\right)+a_{2} A_{0}\left(m_{\Delta}^{2}\right)+b_{1} B_{0}\left(m_{N}^{2}, 0, m_{\Delta}^{2}\right)+b_{2} B_{0}\left(m_{\Delta}^{2}, 0, m_{N}^{2}\right) \\
& +c_{1} C_{0}\left(m_{N}^{2}, 0, m_{\Delta}^{2}, 0, m_{N}^{2}, m_{N}^{2}\right)+c_{2} C_{0}\left(m_{N}^{2}, 0, m_{\Delta}^{2}, 0, m_{\Delta}^{2}, m_{\Delta}^{2}\right) \\
& +c_{3} C_{0}\left(m_{\Delta}^{2}, 0, m_{N}^{2}, 0, m_{N}^{2}, m_{\Delta}^{2}\right)+c_{4} C_{0}\left(m_{N}^{2}, 0, m_{\Delta}^{2}, 0, m_{N}^{2}, m_{\Delta}^{2}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$




$$
\hat{\chi}^{2}=\chi_{\pi N}^{2}+\chi_{\mathrm{RS}}^{2}+\chi_{C}^{2}
$$

incl. 8 leading subthreshold parameters

$$
\chi_{C}^{2}=\sum_{i}\left(\frac{a_{i}^{2}-\bar{a}_{i}^{2}}{\delta a_{i}^{2}}\right)^{2}
$$

$$
\boldsymbol{a}=\left\{g_{1}, b_{4}, b_{5}\right\}
$$

## Theoretical Error

convergence behavior $\delta \mathcal{O}_{i}^{(n)}=\max \left(\left|\mathcal{O}_{i}^{(1)}\right| Q^{n},\left\{\left|\mathcal{O}_{i}^{(k)}-\mathcal{O}_{i}^{(j)}\right| Q^{n-j}\right\}\right) \quad j<k \leq n: Q=\frac{\omega_{\mathrm{CMS}}}{\Lambda_{b}}$

$$
\begin{array}{l:l}
\text { actual higher order } & \delta \mathcal{O}_{i}^{(n)} \geq \max \left(\left\{\left|\mathcal{O}_{i}^{(k)}-\mathcal{O}_{i}^{(j)}\right|\right\}\right) \quad n \leq j<k \\
\Lambda_{b}=700 \mathrm{MeV}
\end{array}
$$ contributions

with
theo. error

- $\mathrm{HB}-\mathrm{NN}$
- $\mathrm{HB}-\pi \mathrm{N}$
- Cov


## without theo. error





$$
T_{\pi}<\{100,125,150,175,200\} \mathrm{MeV} \widehat{=}\{1704,1854,2176,2399,2564\} \text { data points }
$$

## Fits - LECs over $T_{\pi}$



- HB-NN
- $\mathrm{HB}-\pi \mathrm{N}$
- Cov


Input

| $m_{N}$ | $M_{\pi}$ | $F_{\pi}$ | $m_{\Delta}$ | $g_{A}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 938.27 | 139.57 | 92.2 | 1232 | 1.289 |

MeV

| $B^{\prime}$ |  |  |  |  | $c^{\circ}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\varepsilon^{4}$ | $\pi \mathrm{N}$ | $\pi \mathrm{N}+\mathrm{RS}$ | $\pi \mathrm{N}$ | $\pi \mathrm{N}+\mathrm{RS}$ | $\pi \mathrm{N}$ | $\pi \mathrm{N}+\mathrm{RS}$ |
| $h_{A}$ | - 1.38(1) | 1.37(1) | - 1.39(1) | 1.38(1) | - $1.42(1)$ | 1.40(1) |
| $c_{1}$ | -1.45(5) | -1.39(3) | - $-1.29(5)$ | $-1.30(4)$ | - $-1.50(4)$ | -1.32(3) |
| $c_{2}$ | 0.39(13) | 0.51(10) | - $1.66(13)$ | $1.61(10)$ | - $0.52(7)$ | 0.86(5) |
| $c_{3}$ | -2.14(7) | -2.12(6) | -2.37(5) | -2.34(5) | -1.98(7) | -1.98(6) |
| $c_{4}$ | 2.47 (10) | 2.29(5) | 2.56(10) | 2.43(6) | 2.31(7) | 2.28(4) |
| $d_{1+2}$ | 2.12(7) | $2.07(6)$ | 1.98 (7) | . $1.94(6)$ | 1.67(5) | 1.74 (5) |
| $d_{3}$ | -2.61(6) | -2.62(5) | -1.97(4) | -1.96(4) | -3.13(4) | -3.07(4) |
| $d_{5}$ | 0.36(3) | 0.39(3) | 0.13(3) | 0.15 (3) | 0.90(3) | 0.81(3) |
| $d_{14-15}$ | --3.38(13) | 3.53(12) | --2.75(11) | -2.76(10) | --2.94(10) | -3.16(9) |
| $e_{14}$ | 2.10 (15) | 2.30 (13) | 1.76 (14) | 1.92(12) | 1.76(12) | 1.61(10) |
| $e_{15}$ | -3.41(45) | -4.13(26) | - $-1.92(50)$ | -2.61(31) | -2.27(19) | -2.50(17) |
| $e_{16}$ | 2.55 (48) | 2.70 (28) | - $-1.23(56)$ | -0.65(37) | 1.40(18) | 0.88(9) |
| $e_{17}$ | -0.63(23) | -0.53(20) | -0.59(21) | -0.71(19) | -0.96(15) | -0.87(14) |
| $e_{18}$ | -0.82(43) | -0.11(15) | -0.36(42) | 0.30(21) | 0.82(18) | 1.03(10) |
| $g_{1}$ | -2.41(20) | -2.52(19) | -2.55(19) | -2.60(17) | -2.35(21) | -2.32(20) |
| $b_{4}$ | -1.33(34) | -1.45(29) | -1.44(31) | -1.56(28) | $1.07(43)$ | 1.55 (28) |
| $b_{5}$ | -1.24(37) | -1.39(32) | -1.31(35) | -1.39(32) | 0.81(65) | $1.35(32)$ |
| $\chi_{\chi N}^{2} / \mathrm{dof}$ | 1.73 | 1.73 | 1.80 | 1.80 | 1.78 | 1.80 |
| $\overline{\bar{\chi}}_{\pi N}^{2} / \mathrm{dof}$ | 1.91 | 1.92 | 1.92 | 1.92 | 1.91 | 1.93 |

## Predictions




- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=167 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=140 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=121 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=90 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=42 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$

$工 \varepsilon^{4}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=167 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=140 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=121 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=90 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=42 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$


- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=167 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=140 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=121 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=90 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=42 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$

- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=167 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=140 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=121 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=90 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$
- $\mathrm{T}_{\pi}=42 \pm 5 \mathrm{MeV}$


## S-Waves Theo. Error



- RS

$$
\begin{gathered}
\text {--.-... } \varepsilon^{2} \\
-=-=-\varepsilon^{3} \\
\quad \varepsilon^{4}
\end{gathered}
$$

P-Waves Theo. Drror


## D. Waves Theo. Error



## F-Waves Theo. Error



Good description of $\pi \mathrm{N} \rightarrow \pi \mathrm{N}$ data up to 170 MeV

- agreement with exp. scattering data
- agreement with RS S- and P-waves
- problems with some GW D- and F-waves
- almost no differences between the counting schemes
- $\mathrm{X}^{2} / \mathrm{dof}$ stays constant for energies above 100 MeV
- limited by applicability of K-matrix unitarization
- correlations between LECs


## Extensions

- Complex mass approach
- consistent combined fits of $\pi \mathrm{N} \rightarrow \pi \mathrm{N}$ and $\pi \mathrm{N} \rightarrow \pi \pi \mathrm{N} \exp$. data
- $Q^{4}$
- $\varepsilon^{4}$


## Subthreshold Parameters

## Matching RS to $\chi P I$

## RS analysis

| $d_{00}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-1}\right]$ | $-1.36(3)$ | $d_{00}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-2}\right]$ | $1.41(1)$ |
| :--- | ---: | :--- | ---: |
| $d_{10}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3}\right]$ | $1.16(2)$ | $d_{10}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $-0.159(4)$ |
| $d_{01}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3}\right]$ | $1.16(2)$ | $d_{01}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $-0.141(5)$ |
| $d_{20}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-5}\right]$ | $0.196(3)$ | $b_{00}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-2}\right]$ | $10.49(11)$ |
| $d_{11}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-5}\right]$ | $0.185(3)$ | $b_{10}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $1.00(3)$ |
| $d_{02}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-5}\right]$ | $0.0336(6)$ | $b_{01}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $0.21(2)$ |
| $b_{00}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3}\right]$ | $-3.45(7)$ |  |  |

$$
\begin{gathered}
T^{I}(\nu, t)=\bar{u}\left(p^{\prime}\right)\left\{D^{I}(\nu, t)-\frac{\left[\phi^{\prime}, \phi\right]}{4 m_{N}} B^{I}(\nu, t)\right\} u(p) \\
\bar{D}^{ \pm}(\nu, t)=\binom{1}{\nu} \sum_{n, m=0}^{\infty} d_{m n}^{ \pm} \nu^{2 m} t^{n} \\
\bar{B}^{ \pm}(\nu, t)=\binom{\nu}{1} \sum_{n, m=0}^{\infty} b_{m n}^{ \pm} \nu^{2 m} t^{n}
\end{gathered}
$$

Hoferichter, Ruiz de Elvira, Kubis,
Meißner - Phys.Rev.Lett. 115 (2015)

## RS analysis

| $d_{00}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-1}\right]$ | $-1.36(3)$ | $d_{00}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-2}\right]$ | $1.41(1)$ |
| :--- | ---: | :--- | ---: |
| $d_{10}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3}\right]$ | $1.16(2)$ | $d_{10}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $-0.159(4)$ |
| $d_{01}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3}\right]$ | $1.16(2)$ | $d_{01}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $-0.141(5)$ |
| $d_{20}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-5}\right]$ | $0.196(3)$ | $b_{00}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-2}\right]$ | $10.49(11)$ |
| $d_{11}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-5}\right]$ | $0.185(3)$ | $b_{10}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $1.00(3)$ |
| $d_{02}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-5}\right]$ | $0.0336(6)$ | $b_{01}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-4}\right]$ | $0.21(2)$ |
| $b_{00}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3}\right]$ | $-3.45(7)$ |  |  |

$$
T^{I}(\nu, t)=\bar{u}\left(p^{\prime}\right)\left\{D^{I}(\nu, t)-\frac{\left[q^{\prime}, \phi\right]}{4 m_{N}} B^{I}(\nu, t)\right\} u(p)
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \bar{D}^{ \pm}(\nu, t)=\binom{1}{\nu} \sum_{n, m=0}^{\infty} d_{m n}^{ \pm} \nu^{2 m} t^{n} \\
& \bar{B}^{ \pm}(\nu, t)=\binom{\nu}{1} \sum_{n, m=0}^{\infty} b_{m n}^{ \pm} \nu^{2 m} t^{n}
\end{aligned}
$$

Hoferichter, Ruiz de Elvira, Kubis,
Meißner - Phys.Rev.Lett. 115 (2015)

$$
h_{A}=1.40 \pm 0.05 \quad g_{1}=b_{4}=b_{5}=0 \pm 3
$$

| $\mathrm{N}^{3} \mathrm{LO}$ | $Q^{4}$ | $\varepsilon^{4}$ | $Q^{4}$ | $\varepsilon^{4}$ | $Q^{4}$ |  |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $c_{1}$ | $-1.11(3)$ | $-1.11(3)$ | $-1.11(3)$ | $-1.11(3)$ | $-1.12(3)$ | $-1.10(3)$ |
| $c_{2}$ | $3.61(4)$ | $1.41(38)$ | $3.17(3)$ | $1.28(20)$ | $3.35(3)$ | $1.16(20)$ |
| $c_{3}$ | $-5.60(6)$ | $-1.88(45)$ | $-5.67(6)$ | $-2.04(39)$ | $-5.70(6)$ | $-2.10(39)$ |
| $c_{4}$ | $4.26(4)$ | $2.03(28)$ | $4.35(4)$ | $2.07(29)$ | $3.97(3)$ | $1.91(27)$ |
| $d_{1+2}$ | $6.37(9)$ | $1.78(31)$ | $7.66(9)$ | $2.90(30)$ | $4.70(7)$ | $1.78(24)$ |
| $d_{3}$ | $-9.18(9)$ | $-3.64(36)$ | $-10.77(10)$ | $-5.91(50)$ | $-5.26(5)$ | $-3.25(14)$ |
| $d_{5}$ | $0.87(5)$ | $1.52(7)$ | $0.59(5)$ | $1.03(7)$ | $0.31(5)$ | $0.66(6)$ |
| $d_{14-15}$ | $-12.56(12)$ | $-4.38(54)$ | $-13.44(12)$ | $-5.17(55)$ | $-8.84(10)$ | $-3.41(41)$ |
| $e_{14}$ | $1.16(4)$ | $1.64(10)$ | $0.85(4)$ | $1.12(16)$ | $1.17(4)$ | $1.28(11)$ |
| $e_{15}$ | $-2.26(6)$ | $-4.95(15)$ | $-0.83(6)$ | $-3.30(25)$ | $-2.58(7)$ | $-3.07(13)$ |
| $e_{16}$ | $-0.29(3)$ | $4.21(16)$ | $-2.75(3)$ | $1.92(43)$ | $-1.77(3)$ | $1.71(17)$ |
| $e_{17}$ | $-0.17(6)$ | $-0.44(6)$ | $0.03(6)$ | $-0.39(7)$ | $-0.45(6)$ | $-0.51(7)$ |
| $e_{18}$ | $-3.47(5)$ | $1.34(29)$ | $-4.48(5)$ | $0.67(31)$ | $-1.68(5)$ | $1.30(17)$ |


| $\mathrm{N}^{3} \mathrm{LO}$ | $Q^{4}$ | $\varepsilon^{4}$ | $Q^{4}$ | $\varepsilon^{4}$ | $Q^{4}$ | $\varepsilon^{4}$ | RS |
| :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $a_{0+}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-1} 10^{-3}\right]$ | -1.5 | $-1.5(8.5)$ | -8.0 | $1.2(20.4)$ | -5.7 | $-0.8(10.3)$ | $-0.9(1.4)$ |
| $a_{0+}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-1} 10^{-3}\right]$ | 68.5 | $96.3(2.0)$ | 58.6 | $70.0(3.3)$ | 83.8 | $83.6(1.9)$ | $85.4(9)$ |
| $a_{1+}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3} 10^{-3}\right]$ | 134.3 | $136.0(9.7)$ | 132.1 | $135.2(8.7)$ | 128.0 | $132.7(9.0)$ | $131.2(1.7)$ |
| $a_{1+}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3} 10^{-3}\right]$ | -80.9 | $-80.0(3.4)$ | -90.1 | $-86.4(2.7)$ | -78.1 | $-81.1(3.6)$ | $-80.3(1.1)$ |
| $a_{1-}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3} 10^{-3}\right]$ | -55.7 | $-47.5(10.5)$ | -73.7 | $-56.9(7.1)$ | -53.5 | $-51.4(7.9)$ | $-50.9(1.9)$ |
| $a_{1-}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3} 10^{-3}\right]$ | -10.0 | $-5.6(4.9)$ | -23.7 | $-14.4(6.5)$ | -11.8 | $-10.4(5.7)$ | $-9.9(1.2)$ |
| $b_{0+}^{+}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3} 10^{-3}\right]$ | -42.2 | $-31.4(8.1)$ | -44.5 | $-32.6(21.3)$ | -54.7 | $-33.9(8.5)$ | $-45.0(1.0)$ |
| $b_{0+}^{-}\left[M_{\pi}^{-3} 10^{-3}\right]$ | -31.6 | $7.1(2.3)$ | -65.2 | $-34.1(5.7)$ | 2.3 | $2.9(2.1)$ | $4.9(8)$ |

## S-Waves Stat. Drror



P-Waves stat. Error


## D-Waves Stat. Error



F-Waves Stat. Drror


Hellmann-Feynman theorem

$$
\sigma_{\pi N}=M_{\pi}^{2} \frac{\partial m_{N}}{\partial M_{\pi}^{2}}
$$

| $\sigma_{\pi N}[\mathrm{MeV}]$ |  |
| :---: | :---: |
| $Q^{2}$ | $\varepsilon^{2}$ |
| $57.8 \pm 1.9$ | $53.7 \pm 1.9$ |
| $Q^{3}$ | $\varepsilon^{3}$ |
| $58.3 \pm 1.9$ | $60.7 \pm 3.3$ |
| $Q^{4}$ | $\varepsilon^{4}$ |
| $64.9-0.8 e_{1} \pm 2.0$ | $63.9-0.8 e_{1} \pm 2.1$ |

$$
\sigma_{\pi N}=(59.1 \pm 3.5) \mathrm{MeV}
$$

## Thank You !

## Backup

| LECs | $1 / m_{N}$ | $d_{00}^{+}$ | $d_{10}^{+}$ | $d_{01}^{+}$ | $d_{20}^{+}$ | $d_{11}^{+}$ | $d_{02}^{+}$ | $b_{00}^{+}$ | $d_{00}^{-}$ | $d_{10}^{-}$ | $d_{01}^{-}$ | $b_{00}^{-}$ | $b_{10}^{-}$ | $b_{01}^{-}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| HB | $Q^{4}$ | -0.48 | -0.67 | 0.70 | 1.30 | 0.80 | 0.052 | -1.44 | 0.71 | 0.77 | -0.06 | 6.67 | 6.29 | 0.47 |  |
| Cov |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |


| LECs | $1 / m_{N}$ | $d_{00}^{+}$ | $d_{10}^{+}$ | $d_{01}^{+}$ | $d_{20}^{+}$ | $d_{11}^{+}$ | $d_{02}^{+}$ | $b_{00}^{+}$ | $d_{00}^{-}$ | $d_{10}^{-}$ | $d_{01}^{-}$ | $b_{00}^{-}$ | $b_{10}^{-}$ | $b_{01}^{-}$ |
| :---: | :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| HB | $Q^{4}$ | -0.48 | -0.67 | 0.70 | 1.30 | 0.80 | 0.052 | -1.44 | 0.71 | 0.77 | -0.06 | 6.67 | 6.29 | 0.47 |
| Cov | $Q^{4}$ | -1.19 | 0.69 | 0.95 | 0.66 | 0.51 | 0.003 | -1.85 | 0.92 | 0.50 | -0.04 | 6.50 | 5.62 | 0.53 |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Cov | All | -1.22 | 0.75 | 0.97 | 0.54 | 0.43 | -0.004 | -6.05 | 1.40 | -0.21 | -0.25 | 8.03 | 4.13 | 0.38 |
| RS |  | -1.36 | 1.16 | 1.16 | 0.20 | 0.18 | 0.034 | -3.45 | 1.41 | -0.16 | -0.14 | 10.49 | 1.00 | 0.21 |


| LECs | $1 / m_{N}$ | $d_{00}^{+}$ | $d_{10}^{+}$ | $d_{01}^{+}$ | $d_{20}^{+}$ | $d_{11}^{+}$ | $d_{02}^{+}$ | $b_{00}^{+}$ | $d_{00}^{-}$ | $d_{10}^{-}$ | $d_{01}^{-}$ | $b_{00}^{-}$ | $b_{10}^{-}$ | $b_{01}^{-}$ |
| :---: | :---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| HB | $Q^{4}$ | -0.48 | -0.67 | 0.70 | 1.30 | 0.80 | 0.052 | -1.44 | 0.71 | 0.77 | -0.06 | 6.67 | 6.29 | 0.47 |
|  | $Q^{4}$ | -1.19 | 0.69 | 0.95 | 0.66 | 0.51 | 0.003 | -1.85 | 0.92 | 0.50 | -0.04 | 6.50 | 5.62 | 0.53 |
| Cov | $Q^{5}$ | -1.22 | 0.73 | 0.98 | 0.52 | 0.38 | -0.004 | -5.05 | 1.24 | 0.21 | -0.17 | 8.49 | 3.30 | 0.29 |
|  | $Q^{6}$ | -1.21 | 0.72 | 0.97 | 0.59 | 0.42 | -0.005 | -6.24 | 1.43 | -0.33 | -0.27 | 8.06 | 3.91 | 0.36 |
|  | $Q^{7}$ | -1.22 | 0.75 | 0.97 | 0.53 | 0.43 | -0.004 | -5.96 | 1.38 | -0.19 | -0.25 | 8.00 | 4.23 | 0.39 |
| Cov | All | -1.22 | 0.75 | 0.97 | 0.54 | 0.43 | -0.004 | -6.05 | 1.40 | -0.21 | -0.25 | 8.03 | 4.13 | 0.38 |
| RS |  | -1.36 | 1.16 | 1.16 | 0.20 | 0.18 | 0.034 | -3.45 | 1.41 | -0.16 | -0.14 | 10.49 | 1.00 | 0.21 |

odd powers in $\mathrm{M}_{\pi}$ enhanced by
$\pi$

## even powers in $\mathrm{M}_{\pi}$

 enhanced by$\ln \left(M_{\pi}^{2} / m_{N}^{2}\right)$
$\arctan \left(M_{\pi} / m_{N}\right)$

