

Geant4 Publication Procedure: Status and Plans

Dennis Wright
Geant4 Collaboration Meeting
8 October 2010

Topics

- The review process in detail
- Summary of talks/publications processed under present system
- Plans/requirements

Publication Board Members (and terms)

- Sebastien Incerti (1 year)
- John Apostolakis (2 years)
- Dennis Wright (3 years)

Procedure (1)

- Announcement of conference/paper, collection of abstracts, papers and talks
 - all future submissions to be transmitted directly to pub board by e-mail or mailing list
- Internal submission deadline
 - when there is a conference deadline, pub board must receive submissions at least three weeks beforehand
- Selection of editors
 - for journal publications, select according to publication policy document (at least two experts + one outside field)
 - for conferences with many submissions, set up Doodle poll to solicit editors; if number of submissions is large, cannot guarantee compliance with publication policy

Procedure (2)

- Pub board sends submission to editor team along with editor guidelines
 - draft of editor guidelines developed for last round of submissions
 - based on publication policy document, section IV
 - to be posted on publication board web page – currently open for comments/modifications
- Editors should review submissions and work directly with author(s) to implement changes
 - in case of deadline, this process must not take longer than 2 weeks
 - when complete, editors shall send their confidential recommendations (accept or reject) to pub board

Procedure (3)

- Based on editors' recommendations, pub board decides if paper/talk should be sent to journal/conference
 - decision should be made in no more than three days after receiving editors' recommendations
 - pub board to communicate decision directly with author(s)
 - author(s) responsible for sending final draft to journal/conference and a copy to pub board
- Pub board will keep/maintain:
 - copies of final drafts
 - list of collaborators who served as editors, and how often

Proposals

- Propose to Steering Board that the above procedure be adopted as official
- Publication policy document requires that paper/talk should be made available to full collaboration for comment. There was very little time for this during the MC2010 paper reviews
 - propose that in future, papers/talks be made available to collaboration ASAP, and that collaboration member comments be made directly to editors/authors
- Change publication policy document
 - replace “editor” with “reviewer”

Papers and Talks Processed under Current System (1)

- Calor2010 (May 10-14, Beijing)
 - talk presented before pub board creation
 - proceedings deadline: July 31
 - 1 paper
 - presenter : Andrea Dotti
 - editors: Luciano Pandola, Sunanda Banerjee, Jose Manuel Quesada
 - status: approved by pub board July 30, submitted to Calor2010

Papers and Talks Processed under Current System (2)

- MC2010 (October 17-21, Tokyo)
 - original conference proceedings deadline: August 31
 - 11 papers, 33 editors chosen
 - 9 papers submitted to MC2010, 1 paper withdrawn, 1 paper rejected
 - Geant4 deadline for sending oral presentations to editors: October 1
 - same editorial team as for papers
 - review and practice talks: 2-13 October
 - pub board decisions: 14, 15 October

Talks Currently Known to Pub Board (1)

- CHEP2010 (October 18-22, Taipei)
 - conference proceedings deadline: no details yet
 - 1 talk, Sunanda Banerjee
 - editors: chosen
 - Geant4 deadline for sending oral presentations to editors: October 1
 - review: 2-13 October
 - pub board decisions: 14-15 October

Talks Currently Known to Pub Board (2)

- IEEE-NSS (October 30-November 6, Knoxville, USA)
 - conference proceedings deadline: November 13
 - 2 papers
 - editors: to be chosen
 - Geant4 deadline for sending papers to editors: October 23
 - Geant4 deadline for sending talks to editors: October 30
 - review : 25-28 October
 - pub board decisions: 29 October

Talks Currently Known to Pub Board (3)

- MC2010 (9-12 November, Stockholm)
 - conference proceedings deadline: no details yet
 - 1 talk
 - editors: to be chosen
 - Geant4 deadline for sending talks to editors: 22 October
 - review: 25 October – 5 November
 - pub board decisions: 10 October

Plans and Requirements (1)

- A draft tracking system is definitely needed
 - also draft storage, but don't know if versioning is needed
- The pub board mailing list was used only a little
 - several people could not access the archive, so most discussion occurred through private e-mail
 - replace with HyperNews? – better for collecting and viewing editor responses
- Perhaps Indico or Confluence could handle both of the above
 - John Apostolakis will develop prototype
- Spreadsheet for keeping track of editors' effort
 - to balance workload and determine collaboration credit

Plans and Requirements (2)

- A lot of effort was required to coordinate the MC2010 papers
 - process needs to be streamlined
 - too much individual e-mail
 - editor guidelines should be posted on Geant4 web page or pub board page
 - in future, pub board members will alternate responsibility for papers as they are submitted
- Comments from those whose papers/talks were reviewed?