Precision calculations for future e+ecolliders: targets and tools

P. Monni (CERN) on behalf of the workshop committee

FCC Physics Programme meeting - 12 July 2022



QCD (and SM) aspects of FCC-ee



Reaching the precision foreseen at FCC(ee) poses outstanding challenges on theory calculations. Evolution in many areas is required to meet the goals





QCD (and SM) aspects of FCC-ee

jet physics (algorithms,

Precision calc^{ns} (pert. & non-pert.)

This talk reviews mainly QCD aspects, EW corrections will be discussed tomorrow in A. Freitas' talk [link]





Goal of the workshop

–17 Jun 2022	Enter your search term Q
JERN urope/Zurich timezone	
Overview Programme Committee Timetable Application Form	 The main goal is to identify clear theoretical and computational targets for high-precision predictions of relevance to the programme of future e+e- colliders. The workshop will be divided into two parts, of one week each, as follows: Week 1 (7th to 10th of June): select key physics questions and observables Week 2 (13th to 17th of June): current status and advancements in multi-loop calculations

227 registered participants, of which 40-50 attending in person

Committee: S. Abreu, J. Alcaraz, J. Alimena, P. Azzi, D. D'Enterria, A. Freitas, G. Heinrich, A. Huss, M. Mangano, M. McCullough, P. Monni, J. Usovitsch, M. Vos

Targets: main objectives and observables of the FCCee programme



		Thursday, 9 June		
10:00 → 11:00		Coffee Break	③ 1h ♀ 4/2-011 - TH	common room
13:00 → 18:30	Talks and	d discussions: key physics questions and observables	♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference	Room 🖉 -
	13:00	Experimental constraints on Higgs properties	𝔇 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference	Room 🖉 -
		The talk will review the physics potential of future lepton (e+e-) colliders for I > H)), highlighting in particular the experimental targets and those measuren	Higgs production, e.g. Higgs-strahlung (e e -> HZ) and VBF (ε nents that rely heavily on theory inputs, such as precision cal	e -> H v v (W W - lculations.
		Speaker: Jenny List (Deutsches Elektronen-Synchrotron (DE))		
	14:00	Theory precision for Higgs observables	𝔇 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference	Room 🖉 -
		The talk will review the status of theory calculations for H production, e.g. Hi at future lepton colliders, and highlight the requirements to match the forese	ggs-strahlung (e e -> HZ) and VBF (e e -> H v v (W W -> H)), a en experimental precision.	and Higgs decays
	15:00	Speaker: Li Lin Yang	QCD (jets)-TH corr	nmon room (
	15:30	Non-perturbative aspects of QCD jet observables ¶		Room 🖉 -
		The talk will review the current understanding of non-perturbative (linear) con and jet rates. The prospects for new calculations needed at future e+e- mack experiments.	rrections to final state observables at lepton colliders, such a nines should be highlighted in view of the accuracy required a	as event shapes at these
		Speaker: Paolo Nason (Max Planck Society (DE))		
	16:30	Prospects for precision QCD jet calculations	𝔇 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference	Room 🖉 -
		This talk will review calculations for multi-jet production in e+e- collisions; en future colliders, and whether these can be achieved with state-of-the-art tech	nphasizing the precision targets and prospects for new calconnology.	ulations needed at
		Speaker: Andrea Banfi (University of Sussex)		
	-			

	Wednesday, 8 June	
10:00 → 11:00	Coffee Break	③ 1h ♀ 4/2-011 - TH common room
12:20 → 17:10 T a	alks and discussions: key physics questions and observables	♥ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room
	13:00 Initial state QED radiation aspects for future lepton colliders	
	The talk will discuss the latest progress in the description of QED corrections to the initial s factorisation to beamstrahlung and YFS approaches. This talk highlights the necessary ste experiments.	state, such as the application and limitations of collinear eps to achieve the precision demanded by future lepton collider
	Speaker: Stefano Frixione (INFN)	
	14:00 TH colloquium	S 1h ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room
	15:00 https://indico.cern.ch/event/1124737/	pair physics
	15:30 Theory aspects in top-pair production ¶	③ 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room
	The talk will review the status of theory calculations for tt production at threshold energies requirements to match the foreseen experimental precision.	and above at future lepton colliders, and highlight the
	Speaker: Martin Beneke (Technische Universitaet Muenchen (DE))	
	16:30 Experimental possibilities at and above the top-pair threshold	③ 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room
	The talk will review the physics potential of future lepton (e+e-) colliders at the tt threshold and those measurements that rely heavily on theory inputs, such as precision calculations.	and above, highlighting in particular the experimental targets
	Speaker: Frank Simon (Max-Planck-Institut fuer Physik)	







Tools: state of the art analytical and numerical techniques

	discussions: multi-loop computational techniques	♥ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room		10.00 Taiks and discussions: multi-loop computational techn	inques ♥ 4/3-006 - TH Conferenc
13:00	Latest IBP reduction techniques Image: Contract of the status and future prospects of IBP reduction techniques. The importance and the status and future prospects of IBP reduction techniques. The importance and the status and future prospects of IBP reduction techniques. The importance and the status and future prospects of IBP reduction techniques. The importance and the status and future prospects of IBP reduction techniques.	40m • 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room 🖉 👻		13:00 Local unitarity: perspectives for future lepto The talk will discuss the status and future prospects or	f the Loop-Tree Duality approach for the calculation of higher-order corrections
	reconstruction, multivariate partial fractioning and syzygys should be discussed. Speaker : Tiziano Peraro (University of Bologna and INFN)			relevant for future e+e- colliders (both for QCD and EW Speaker : Valentin Hirschi (CERN)	corrections).
	Tiziano_Peraro.pdf			FCC_ee_workshop	
14:00	Modern calculation techniques for multi-scale loop amplitudes	40m 💡 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room 🛛 🔽 🚽		14:00 Integrand subtraction & numerical integration	On (9 40m 9 4/3-006 - TH Conference
	The talk will review modern techniques to compute multi-leg/loop amplitudes, as well numerical techniques will be compared.	\rightarrow 17:00 Talks and discussions: multi-loop computational technique	♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room	The talk will discuss the status and future prospects or applications to future etc. colliders	f integrand-subtraction methods to construct locally finite two-loop amplitudes,
	Speaker: Vasily Sotnikov (University of Zurich (UZH))	13:00 Numerical calculations using pySecDec	() 40m 9 4/2.006 - TH Conference Poom	Speaker: Charalampos Anastasiou	
	Sotnikov_CERN_ee	The talk will discuss recent multi-loop calculations with PyS	ecDec, highlighting how these calculations and the technology adopted can be exploited for	Dr HPFCee_Anastasio	
15:00	Coffee break	Speakers: Vitalii Ivanovych Maheria, Vitalii Maheria	ections and reactions involving quark masses).	0 Coffee bre	eak 🕚 30m 💡 4/2-011 - TH co
15.20		Magerya-futurecolli			
15.30	The talk will discuss the status and future prospects for the numerical calculation of ty			30 Analytic methods for multi-loop calculations	s ③ 40m • 4/3-006 - TH Conference
	applications to future e+e- colliders.	14:00 Feynman parametrization and numerical integra	ion (9 40m 9 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room	technology adopted can be exploited for multiloop con	rections to Dreil-Yan and of the four-loop form factor, highlighting how these cald nputations at future lepton colliders.
	Speaker: Max Zoller (PSI)	integrals numerically, with a focus on the Mellin-Barnes met	nod. The prospects for future applications at future e+e- machines will be highlighted.	Speaker: Andreas von Manteuffel (Michigan State Un	niversity)
	Zoller_CERN_ee_20	Speakers: Janusz Gluza (University of Silesia (PL)), Janusz	Gluza (U. Silesia)	manteuffel-ee-2020	
		CERN_TH_MB_2022			
		15:00 Coffee break	• 20m • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •		
		15:30 Mixed QCD-EW corrections to neutral-current Dr	ell-Yan (\$ 40m \$ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room	•	
		The talk will discuss the recent calculations of QCD-EW corr exploited for multileon computations at future lepton collide	ections to Drell-Yan, highlighting how these calculations and the technology adopted can b	be	
		Speaker: Narayan Rana (INFN Milan)	is.		
		Rana_FCCee.pdf	13:00 \rightarrow 17:00 Talks and discussions: multi-	loop computational techniques	
3:00 → 17	A Talks and discussions: multi-loop computational techniques				
	13:00 Numerical evaluation of QCD virtual corrections with top qu collisions	arks in e+e- ③ 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference R 💽 ▼	13:00 DiffExp and Feynm	an parameter integration	𝔇 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room
	The talk will discuss recent multi-loop calculations involving heavy quarks exploited for multiloop computations at future e+e- colliders.	s, highlighting how these calculations and the technology adopted can be	The talk will discuss the talk will discuss the talk will discuss the this technology can be	e status and applications of the generalized power-series exploited for multiloop computations at future lepton col	solution of differential equations (e.g. DiffExp, CAESAR), highl liders.
	Speaker: Long Chen		Speaker: Martijn Hid	ding (Uppsala University)	
	Chen_FCCeeWorks		Talk_FCCee.pdf		
	14:00 TH colloquium	S 1h ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room			
	https://indico.cern.ch/event/1155782/		14:00	Coffee break	③ 30m ♀ 4/2-011 - TH common
	15:00 Coffee break	 ③ 30m ♀ 4/2-011 - TH common room (14:30 The AMFlow appro	bach	𝔇 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room
	15:30 Elliptic integrals	𝔇 40m ♀ 4/3-006 - TH Conference Room 🕝 🗸 🗸	The talk will discuss the	e status and applications of the AMFlow method to the ca	alculation of IBP systems and the solution of differential equat
	The talk will discuss the current understanding of elliptic integrals and fut	ture prospects in the context of multiloop calculations for future e+e- colliders.	master integrals. The ta	alk will highlight how this technology can be exploited for	multiloop computations at future lepton colliders.
	The talk will cover both the aspect of the analytic calculation of this class	of integrals as well as their numerical evaluation.	Speaker: Xiao Liu (Un	iversity of Oxford)	
	Speaker. Steran weinztern (Universität Mainz)		🔉 XI ju20220617 pd	f	







Precision physics at the Z pole

Numbers	s are given hei	re for FCC-e	e (best pros	pects)	[From P. Janot's talk]
Observables	Present value	FCC-ee stat.	FCC-ee current syst.	FCC-ee ultimate syst.	Theory input (not exhaustive)
m _z (keV)	91187500 ± 2100	4	100	10 ?	Lineshape QED unfolding Relation to measured quantities
Γ _z (keV)	2495500 ± 2300 [*]	4	25	5?	Lineshape QED unfolding Relation to measured quantities
σ ⁰ _{had} (pb)	41480.2 ± 32.5 [*]	0.04	4	0.8	Bhabha cross section to 0.01% $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$ cross section to 0.002%
N_{ν} (×10 ³) from σ_{had}	2996.3 ± 7.4	0.007	1	0.2	Lineshape QED unfolding $(\Gamma_{vv}/\Gamma_{\ell\ell})_{SM}$
Rℓ (×10³)	20766.6 ± 24.7	0.04	1	0.2 ?	Lepton angular distribution (QED ISR/FSR/IFI, EW corrections)
$lpha_{s}$ (m _z) (×10 ⁴) from R _{ℓ}	1196 ± 30	0.1	1.5	0.4 ?	Higher order QCD corrections for $\Gamma_{\rm had}$
R _b (×10 ⁶)	216290 ± 660	0.3	?	< 60 ?	QCD (gluon radiation, gluon splitting, fragmentation, decays,)

- parametric uncertainties (i.e. couplings, masses)
- In an optimistic scenario, consider statistical uncertainties as the ultimate target

7

• Theory crucial in 3 ways: measurement/calibration (e.g. QED ISR); interpretation of results (EWPO);

Initial state radiation and collinear factorisation

- Modelling of QED ISR central in FCCee (Z pole physics, WW, tt thresholds, ZH,...)
- E.g. NLL/NLO corrections to total rates ($\tau_{\min} = -$



[From S. Frixione's talk (plot from Bertone et al. '22)]

• Recently important progress in formulating collinear factorisation (as opposed to YFS) beyond LO/LL.

NLL sizeable (% level) and proc./obs. dependent (Also large renormalisation scheme dep.)









Initial state radiation and collinear factorisation

- More progress needed in coming years:
 - but tough)
 - Simultaneous resummation at <u>all-orders</u> of soft (non-collinear) and collinear logarithms (traditionally two approaches used - YFS / coll. factorisation). Potentially relevant in studies at the ttbar threshold
 - Exclusive implementation in (accurate) MCPS's (several tools exist, important to explore how to improve logarithmic accuracy in view of recent developments in QCD)

NNLL coll. factorisation needed to improve further (within reach with modern perturbative techniques,





Precision physics at the Z pole

Numbers are given here for FCC-ee (best prospects)					[From P. Janot's talk]
Observables	Present value	FCC-ee stat.	FCC-ee current syst.	FCC-ee ultimate syst.	Theory input (not exhaustive)
m _z (keV)	91187500 ± 2100	4	100	10 ?	Lineshape QED unfolding Relation to measured quantities
Γ _z (keV)	2495500 ± 2300 [*]	4	25	5?	Lineshape QED unfolding Relation to measured quantities
σ ⁰ _{had} (pb)	41480.2 ± 32.5 [*]	0.04	4	0.8	Bhabha cross section to 0.01% $e^+e^- \rightarrow \gamma\gamma$ cross section to 0.002%
N_{v} (×10 ³) from σ_{had}	2996.3 ± 7.4	0.007	1	0.2	Lineshape QED unfolding $(\Gamma_{vv}/\Gamma_{\ell\ell})_{SM}$
Rℓ (×10³)	20766.6 ± 24.7	0.04	1	0.2 ?	Lepton angular distribution (QED ISR/FSR/IFI, EW corrections)
$lpha_{s}$ (m _z) (×10 ⁴) from R $_{\ell}$	1196 ± 30	0.1	1.5	0.4 ?	Higher order QCD corrections for $\Gamma_{\rm had}$
R _b (×10 ⁶)	216290 ± 660	0.3	?	< 60 ?	OCD (gluon radiation, gluon splitting, fragmentation, decays,)

• Theory crucial in 3 ways: measurement/calibration; interpretation of results; parametric uncertainties

QCD uncertainties concern all three categories

Precision physics in Z → jets

- e⁺e⁻, μ⁺μ⁻, γ γ @ NNLO EW still beyond reach]
- states, non-perturbative dynamics, HQ asymmetries, fragmentation functions, τ decays (α_s), ...
 - Typical example: R_b, A_{FB} requires QQg and qqg(→ QQ) @ 2 loops with m_b dependence
- Significant progress needed for multi-jet final states (both fixed-order and resummations)
 - Examples;
 - 3 jets @ N³LO QCD
 - 4 & 5 jets at NNLO QCD
- AMFlow, ...). Further progress is needed to control kinematic distributions precisely

• Main challenges from EW aspects: EWPO Z \rightarrow qq+X @ 3 loops EW and beyond, beam calibration [e+e- \rightarrow

• Also high potential for precision QCD studies: α_{s} , gauge structure and spin correlations in multi-jet final

Possibly already achievable in the next few years thanks to multi-scale techniques developed for LHC calc^{ns}

• Many new directions are under investigation: e.g. prospects for numerical approaches to calculate total rates at N^(2/3)LO (also for EW corrections) look very promising (e.g. Feynman parameters; local unitarity,



The elephant in the room: hadronisation

- Better understanding of hadronisation in jet observables appears to be essential to control differential distributions (event shapes, jet rates, jet substructure). Serious limitation of TH accuracy
- Possible avenues (possibly in combination deserves further thoughts):
 - techniques to calculate leading corrections as 1/Q expansion (at higher energies)
- new observables with reduced NP sensitivity (LHC jet substructure technology may help) [From A. Banfi's & P. Nason's talks]



e.g. Recently first steps in understanding linear (1/Q) corrections in multi-jet final states (e.g. event shapes or jet rates in e+e⁻ →3 jets)



Higgs physics

- Experimental precision approaching 0.1% in many cases at ZH threshold
- Example: total cross section will be measured with precision in the range 0.2%-0.5%. Necessary ingredients:
 - $e^+e^- \rightarrow Z H$, H v v (e^+e^-) @ 2 loops EW (hard at the moment)
 - expansions and new numerical techniques (fast evaluation of amplitudes)

[From L. L. Yang's talk] Gong, Li, Xu, LLY, Zhao: 1609.03955

\sqrt{s} (GeV)	$\mathcal{O}(m_t^2)$	$\mathcal{O}(m_t^0)$	$\mathcal{O}(m_t^{-2})$	$\mathcal{O}(m_t^{-4})$
240	81.8%	16.2%	1.4%	0.4%
250	81.7%	16.1%	1.5%	0.5%
300	80.0%	15.2%	2.1%	1.1%
350	69.7%	12.6%	2.7%	2.1%
500	137%	18.6%	17.3%	31.1%



E.g. $1/m_t$ expansion below s ~ $(2 m_t)^2$, and $m_{\rm H}^2$, $m_{\rm Z}^2 <<$ s, $m_{\rm t}^2$ elsewhere. Such methods could help in EW corrⁿ too





Hadronic Higgs decays

[From J. List's talk] Higgs decay to jets ...in SMEFT fit

	decay	intr
	$H \to b\bar{b}$	~ 0
:	$H \to c \bar{c}$	$ \sim 0$
	$H \to gg$	\sim



Projected reduction of TH uncertainties (total rates) within reach of current technology

 δg_H^{gg}



Hadronic Higgs decays

- Accuracy significantly lower for differential distributions (e.g. potential sensitivity to light-quark Yukawa couplings)
- N³LO (+resummations) probably achievable in the coming decade, sufficient to reduce perturbative uncertainties at the ~% level
- However, hadronisation remains a great bottleneck
 - E.g. thrust distribution in $H \rightarrow gg$ decays (NNLO+PS in the plot)

Same considerations as for Z → jets; developments in MC technology also crucial to improve on this aspects



Top physics

- Huge potential from threshold scan: up to per-mille accuracy on cross section & asymmetries
- Great challenge for theory to match experimental precision ("intrinsic" and parametric unc.^s)

[From F. Simon's talk]





Top physics: threshold

- PNRQCD predictions known to N³LO (also including EW+non-resonant effects @ NNLO)
- Uncertainty in top mass (potential subtracted) ~ 40 MeV (Beneke et al.). Exp. target 20 MeV
 - Some improvements already from matching of N³LO+NNLL (ongoing, NNLL from Hoang et al.)
 - Ultimately N4LO in PNRQCD needed (currently out of reach) and NLL ISR QED (including soft limit)



Top physics: continuum

- NNLL+NNLO (Boronat et al.), still needs a careful assessment of uncertainties
- - A new(er) idea to measure the top mass in a theoretically well-defined scheme in high-energy running above the threshold



matched NNLO + NNLL calc luminosity spectrum folded Extraction of short distance



• 360-380 GeV and radiative events requires matching of continuum and threshold calculations. Available at

• Continuum: target is 0.1% on cross section. NNLO QCD available (Chen et al.) but 2 loop EW is large! N³LO QCD + NNLO EW necessary in the end, probably feasible (with a lot of work) in the coming decade(s).

	cms energy	CLIC, \sqrt{s}	$= 380 \mathrm{GeV}$	ILC, \sqrt{s} :	= 500 GeV
	luminosity $[fb^{-1}]$	500	1000	500	4000
	statistical	$140\mathrm{MeV}$	$90\mathrm{MeV}$	$350\mathrm{MeV}$	$110{\rm MeV}$
A Constant of the Constant of	theory	$46\mathrm{MeV}$		$55\mathrm{MeV}$	
ulation	lum. spectrum	201	MeV	201	MeV
in explicitly;	photon response	161	MeV	85	MeV
MSR mass	total	$150\mathrm{MeV}$	$110\mathrm{MeV}$	$360\mathrm{MeV}$	$150\mathrm{MeV}$



WW threshold (and above)

Precise extraction of TGCs and W mass & width: e.g. δm_W~few MeV (statistical error ~ 0.5 MeV!)





WW threshold (and above)

- Theory modelling enters differently in different signatures/channels. To be precisely assessed
 - Control over QED ISR (discussed earlier); EFT resonant aspects near threshold
 - Signal & background: 2f (calibration), 4f final states (e+e- → qqev particularly relevant)
 - Colour reconnection in hadronic channels (more generally MC generators)

fully hadronic $q\bar{q}q\bar{q}$





 $B_{h}^{2} = 45.4\%$

semi-leptonic $q\bar{q}\ell\nu_{\ell}$







 $9B_{\ell}^2 = 10.6\%$

[From G. Wilson's talk]





Outlook

- Astounding experimental programme at FCCee, drastic reduction of statistical (and systematic) uncertainties: theory precision likely to be among the main bottlenecks
- Feynman integrals calculations
- QCD (hadronisation, colour reconnection); EFT (e.g. Coulomb) effects in MC generators, ...
- jets & resummations,...)

• Many/all areas of theory calculations need to be involved, this workshop mainly covered the field of

• Most challenges are technical in nature: hard calculations, currently beyond reach but likely to be achieved with natural evolution of the field in the coming decade(s), and a large amount of work

• Some conceptual issues, which need significant breakthroughs in the years to come: non-perturbative

• Short term plan: try to collect targets into a "shopping list" to be shared with the community (input from all speakers and many participants); iterate workshop on other TH areas in coming years (e.g. MC generators,

