

Type I von Neumann algebras from gravitational path integrals: Ryu–Takayanagi as entropy without holography

Based on: <u>arXiv:2310.02189</u> with Xi Dong, Donald Marolf and Zhencheng Wang

Eugenia Colafranceschi Western University







Proposed for holographic entanglement entropy in AdS/CFT





RT from the Gravitational Path Integral

Ryu–Takayanagi was originally proposed to compute holographic entanglement entropy in AdS spacetime, but the present understanding of the formula is much more general!

Gibbons-Hawking (1977)



 ψ^{\star}

 ψ^{\star}

Lewkowycz-Maldacena (2013)

- Path integral prescription for the construction of the state
- Replica trick:
 - consider n copies of the system and compute $\operatorname{Tr}[
 ho^n]$
 - analytically continue in *n* and compute the entropy as

$$S = (1 - n\partial n) \log \operatorname{Tr}[\rho^n] \Big|_{n=1} = \frac{A(\gamma)}{4G}$$
non-trivial part of variation
near γ

RT and the information paradox

• RT is the first version of a more general formula for the von Neumann entropy

$$S_{\text{gen}} = \frac{A(X)}{4G} + S_{\text{semi-cl}}(\Sigma_X)$$

[Faulkner, Lewkowycz, Maldacena, Engelhardt, Wall...]

RT and the information paradox

• RT is the first version of a more general formula for the von Neumann entropy

$$S_{\text{gen}} = \frac{A(X)}{4G} + S_{\text{semi-cl}}(\Sigma_X)$$

[Faulkner, Lewkowycz, Maldacena, Engelhardt, Wall...]

• This formula, applied to the black hole information problem, gives an entropy which follows the Page curve.



RT and the information paradox

• RT is the first version of a more general formula for the von Neumann entropy

$$S_{\text{gen}} = \frac{A(X)}{4G} + S_{\text{semi-cl}}(\Sigma_X)$$

[Faulkner, Lewkowycz, Maldacena, Engelhardt, Wall...]

• This formula, applied to the black hole information problem, gives an entropy which follows the Page curve.



Where to start?

General assumptions _____

Ryu–Takayanagi formula without holography?



Where to start?



R

 \bar{R}

• A UV-complete theory of quantum gravity should contain a map



Where to start?



• A UV-complete theory of quantum gravity should contain a map



- We might call this map a (Euclidean) gravitational path integral
- It might look like

$$\zeta(M) = \int_{\mathrm{bc}:M} \mathcal{D}g e^{-S[g]} \quad \text{ not a requirement!}$$

R

 \bar{R}

assumptions for the gravitational path integral

Setting

- Consider a gravitational system with two asymptotic codimension-2 boundaries
- The Hilbert space \mathcal{H}_{LR} a priori does not factorize!
 - reduced state on *L*/*R*?
 - entropy associated to *L*/*R*?



• Can we construct a Hilbert space \mathcal{H}_L associated with L such that the corresponding Ryu–Takayanagi formula can be understood in terms of a standard trace on \mathcal{H}_L ? (True with holography)

$$S_{\mathrm{vN}}(\rho_L) := -\mathrm{Tr}_L(\rho_L \ln \rho_L) = \mathsf{RT}$$
 formula
 $\downarrow \rho_L = \mathrm{Tr}_R(\rho)$ reduced state

TODAY:

This type of structure is present in any UV-complete, asymptotically locally AdS theory of quantum gravity in which the Euclidean path integral satisfies a simple set of axioms.

Related work

Axiomatic approach to TQFT and Gravity:

- Axiomatization of topological quantum field theories (TQFT) [Atiyah 1988]
- Attempt to define a gravitational partition function by generalising TQFT axioms [Rovelli, Barrett, Crane, Baez, Dolan, Freidel, Starodubtsev, Oeckl, ...]

Ryu-Takayanagi formula for spin network states

- Setting: open spin network graphs
- Entanglement entropy of boundary regions given by a bulk area law, with corrections from entanglement among intertwiners [Chirco, Oriti, Zhang, EC]



Related work

Towards understanding RT in the bulk

- [Lewkowycz, Maldacena (2013)]: gravitational path integral derivation of the RT formula. But the interpretation of RT as a standard entropy still required a holographic dual theory.
- Recent works have shown that, in various contexts, the RT entropy can be derived (up to an infinite constant) as the entropy of a type II von Neumann algebra. [Chandrasekaran, Longo, Penington, Witten, Jensen, Sorce, Speranza, Satishchandran...]
- The entropy of a standard quantum mechanical system is in terms of a Hilbert space trace $\text{Tr}(\cdot) = \sum_{i} \langle i | \cdot | i \rangle$ which provides a "state-counting interpretation". A Hilbert space trace corresponds to a type I trace.

TODAY:

RT formula with a state-counting interpretation, i.e. as entropy of a type I von Neumann algebra, without holography.

Outline

1. Axioms

2. Hilbert Space

3. Operator Algebras

4. Type I von Neumann Factors

5. Entropy (with state-counting interpretation)

(Euclidean) Gravitational Path Integral



 $M \supset g_M, \phi_M$

 $\zeta(M) = \int_{\mathrm{bc}:M} \mathcal{D}g\mathcal{D}\phi e^{-S[g,\phi]}$

boundary conditions "source-manifold"

(Euclidean) Gravitational Path Integral



(Euclidean) Gravitational Path Integral



- **1.** Finiteness: The path integral gives a well-defined map ζ from boundary conditions defined by smooth manifolds to the complex numbers \mathbb{C}
- **2.** Reality: ζ is a real function of (possibly complex) boundary conditions, i.e. $[\zeta(M)]^* = \zeta(M^*)$
- **3.** Reflection Positivity: ζ is reflection-positive
- **4.** Continuity: if the boundary manifold contains a cylinder of size ε , ζ is continuous under changes of ε



5. Factorization: $\zeta(M_1 \sqcup M_2) = \zeta(M_1)\zeta(M_2)$



 $\begin{array}{c} \hline N_2 \\ B^{d-2} \end{array} = |N_2\rangle \\ \hline B^{d-2} \\ \hline B^{d-2} \end{array} = |N_1\rangle \\ \hline B^{d-2} \\ \hline B^{d-2} \end{array}$

 $M_{N_1^*N_2}$







- The source-manifold $M_{N_1^*N_2}$ might not be smooth, and so $\zeta(M_{N_1^*N_2})$ might not be well defined
- We introduce rims:





- The source-manifold $M_{N_1^*N_2}$ might not be smooth, and so $\zeta(M_{N_1^*N_2})$ might not be well defined
- We introduce rims:
- $Y_B^{d-1} =$ set of rimmed source-manifolds with boundary *B*
- $\underline{Y}_{B}^{d-1} =$ linear combinations of rimmed source-manifolds with boundary B

• Define the pre-Hilbert space $H_B = \{ |N\rangle : N \in \underline{Y}_B^{d-1} \}$



• Define the pre-Hilbert space $H_B = \{ |N\rangle : N \in \underline{Y}_B^{d-1} \}$



• Consider the quotient of H_B by its null space and complete the result: Hilbert space \mathcal{H}_B

• Define the pre-Hilbert space $H_B = \{ |N\rangle : N \in \underline{Y}_B^{d-1} \}$



- Consider the quotient of H_B by its null space and complete the result: Hilbert space \mathcal{H}_B
- \mathcal{H}_B is the *B*-sector of the full quantum gravity Hilbert space:

$$\mathcal{H}_{QG} = igoplus_B \mathcal{H}_B$$

Outline

1. Axioms \checkmark



3. Operator Algebras

4. Type I von Neumann Factors

5. Entropy (with state-counting interpretation)

Algebra







• On the set $\underline{Y}_{B \sqcup B}^{d-1}$ we define a *left product* and a *right product*:



• On the set $\underline{Y}_{B \sqcup B}^{d-1}$ we define a *left product* and a *right product*:



- For convenience $ab := a \cdot_L b = b \cdot_R a$
- The set $\underline{Y}_{B \sqcup B}^{d-1}$ equipped with the left (right) product defines a left (right) surface algebra $A_L(A_R)$

• The algebras A_L and A_R are related by an antilinear isomorphism \star

• The algebras A_L and A_R are related by an antilinear isomorphism \star



• We will see that the left (right) algebra as a natural action on the left (right) B of $\mathcal{H}_{B\sqcup B}$



Trace

• The path integral defines a trace operation:



• It satisfies the cyclic property:



Trace

• The path integral defines a trace operation:



• The trace on A_L and A_R corresponds to the inner product on $\mathcal{H}_{B \sqcup B}$:

$$\langle a|b\rangle = \operatorname{tr}(a^*b) = \zeta \begin{pmatrix} & \langle a| \\ & & \rangle \\ & & & \rangle \\ & & & & |b\rangle \end{pmatrix}$$

• It is positive-definite: $tr(a^*a) = \zeta (M(a^*a)) = \langle a | a \rangle \ge 0$ Axiom 3

Trace Inequality

• We can prove the trace inequality $\operatorname{tr}(aa^{\star}bb^{\star}) \leq \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\operatorname{tr}(b^{\star}b)$

Use $a, b \in Y^{d-1}_{B \sqcup B}$ to define elements of $Y^{d-1}_{(B \sqcup B) \sqcup (B \sqcup B)}$



Trace Inequality

• We can prove the trace inequality $\operatorname{tr}(aa^{\star}bb^{\star}) \leq \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\operatorname{tr}(b^{\star}b)$





 $\langle \cup \cup | \cup \cup \rangle = \langle \boxtimes | \boxtimes \rangle = \langle a | a \rangle \, \langle b | b \rangle = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a) \operatorname{tr}(b^{\star}b)$

From the Cauchy-Schwarz inequality (consequence of positivity of the inner product on $\mathcal{H}_{B \sqcup B \sqcup B \sqcup B \sqcup B}$):



$$\left|\left< \uplus \right| \cup \cup \left> \right| \le \left| \left| \cup \cup \right> \right| \right| \left| \uplus \right>$$

• We define a representation of the left surface algebra on the Hilbert space: given $a \in A_L$ there is an associated operator $\hat{a}_L \in \hat{A}_L$ such that

$$\hat{a}_L \left| b \right\rangle = \left| a \cdot_L b \right\rangle = \left| a b \right\rangle$$



• We define a representation of the left surface algebra on the Hilbert space: given $a \in A_L$ there is an associated operator $\hat{a}_L \in \hat{A}_L$ such that

$$\hat{a}_L \left| b \right\rangle = \left| a \cdot_L b \right\rangle = \left| a b \right\rangle$$

• These operators are **bounded**:

$$\begin{aligned} |\hat{a}_L|b\rangle|^2 &= \langle ab|ab\rangle = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}abb^{\star}) \leq \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\operatorname{tr}(bb^{\star}) = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\langle b|b\rangle \\ &\uparrow \\ &\mathsf{trace\ inequality} \end{aligned}$$



• We define a representation of the left surface algebra on the Hilbert space: given $a \in A_L$ there is an associated operator $\hat{a}_L \in \hat{A}_L$ such that

$$\hat{a}_L \left| b \right\rangle = \left| a \cdot_L b \right\rangle = \left| a b \right\rangle$$

• These operators are **bounded**:

$$\begin{split} |\hat{a}_L|b\rangle|^2 &= \langle ab|ab\rangle = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}abb^{\star}) \leq \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\operatorname{tr}(bb^{\star}) = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\langle b|b\rangle \\ \uparrow \\ & \mathsf{trace inequality} \end{split}$$



• We can similarly define a representation \hat{A}_R of A_R :



$$\hat{a}_R \left| b \right\rangle = \left| a \cdot_R b \right\rangle = \left| b \cdot_L a \right\rangle = \left| ba \right\rangle$$

• We define a representation of the left surface algebra on the Hilbert space: given $a \in A_L$ there is an associated operator $\hat{a}_L \in \hat{A}_L$ such that

$$\hat{a}_L \left| b \right\rangle = \left| a \cdot_L b \right\rangle = \left| a b \right\rangle$$

• These operators are **bounded**:

$$\begin{aligned} |\hat{a}_L|b\rangle|^2 &= \langle ab|ab\rangle = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}abb^{\star}) \leq \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\operatorname{tr}(bb^{\star}) = \operatorname{tr}(a^{\star}a)\langle b|b\rangle \\ &\uparrow \\ &\mathsf{trace\ inequality} \end{aligned}$$

• The operator algebras $\hat{A}_{L/R}$ get a trace from the trace on $A_{L/R}$:

 $\operatorname{tr}(\hat{a}) := \operatorname{tr}(a)$



Outline

1. Axioms \checkmark

2. Hilbert Space \checkmark



 $\in \hat{A}_L$

 $|b\rangle$

 \sim

 \hat{a}_L

- 4. Type I von Neumann Factors **-**

5. Entropy (with state-counting interpretation)

- We constructed $\hat{A}_L, \hat{A}_R =$ commuting algebras of bounded operators on $\mathcal{H}_{B \sqcup B}$
- We can complete \hat{A}_L , \hat{A}_R to von Neumann algebras \mathcal{A}_L , \mathcal{A}_R by taking the closure in the weak (or strong) operator topology (or taking the double commutant of $\hat{A}_{L/R}$)

- We constructed $\hat{A}_L, \hat{A}_R =$ commuting algebras of bounded operators on $\mathcal{H}_{B \sqcup B}$
- We can complete \hat{A}_L , \hat{A}_R to von Neumann algebras \mathcal{A}_L , \mathcal{A}_R by taking the closure in the weak (or strong) operator topology (or taking the double commutant of $\hat{A}_{L/R}$)
- We show that the trace defined on $\hat{A}_{L/R}$ can be extended to (all positive elements of) the von Neumann algebra:





• We can study the structure of the von Neumann algebras via properties of the trace!

- We can prove that the trace is
 - 1) Faithful tr(a) = 0 iff a = 0
 - 2) Normal for any bounded increasing sequence a_n , tr $sup \ a_n = sup$ tr a_n
 - 3) Semifinite $\forall a \in \mathcal{A}^+, \exists b < a \text{ such that } \operatorname{tr}(b) < \infty$

- We can prove that the trace is
 - 1) Faithful tr(a) = 0 iff a = 0
 - 2) Normal for any bounded increasing sequence a_n , tr $sup \ a_n = sup$ tr a_n
 - 3) Semifinite $\forall a \in \mathcal{A}^+, \exists b < a \text{ such that } \operatorname{tr}(b) < \infty$
- It also satisfies the trace inequality (an extension of the 4-boundaries argument applies)
- Applying the trace inequality to $a = b = P \in A_L$ gives $tr(P) \ge 1$

- We can prove that the trace is
 - 1) Faithful tr(a) = 0 iff a = 0
 - 2) Normal for any bounded increasing sequence a_n , tr $sup \ a_n = sup$ tr a_n
 - 3) Semifinite $\forall a \in \mathcal{A}^+, \exists b < a \text{ such that } \operatorname{tr}(b) < \infty$
- It also satisfies the trace inequality (an extension of the 4-boundaries argument applies)
- Applying the trace inequality to $a = b = P \in \mathcal{A}_L$ gives $\operatorname{tr}(P) \ge 1$

Some known results on von Neumann algebras:

- Every von Neumann algebra is a direct sum or integral of factors (algebras with trivial center)
- These factors can be type I, II or III
- There is no faithful, normal and semifinite trace on type III ⇒ we cannot have type III
- on type II, for any faithful, normal and semifinite trace there are *nonzero projections with arbitrarily small trace* we cannot have type II

- We can prove that the trace is
 - 1) Faithful tr(a) = 0 iff a = 0
 - 2) Normal for any bounded increasing sequence a_n , tr $sup \ a_n = sup$ tr a_n
 - 3) Semifinite $\forall a \in \mathcal{A}^+, \exists b < a \text{ such that } \operatorname{tr}(b) < \infty$
- It also satisfies the trace inequality (an extension of the 4-boundaries argument applies)
- Applying the trace inequality to $a = b = P \in A_L$ gives $tr(P) \ge 1$
- Therefore, $A_{L/R}$ is a direct sum/integral of type I factors!

- We can prove that the trace is
 - 1) Faithful tr(a) = 0 iff a = 0
 - 2) Normal for any bounded increasing sequence a_n , tr $sup \ a_n = sup$ tr a_n
 - 3) Semifinite $\forall a \in \mathcal{A}^+, \exists b < a \text{ such that } \operatorname{tr}(b) < \infty$
- It also satisfies the trace inequality (an extension of the 4-boundaries argument applies)
- Applying the trace inequality to $a = b = P \in \mathcal{A}_L$ gives $tr(P) \ge 1$
- Therefore, $\mathcal{A}_{L/R}$ is a direct sum/integral of type I factors!
- The spectrum of $z\in\mathcal{Z}_L$ (center of \mathcal{A}_L) is discrete

$$\mathcal{A}_L = igoplus_{\mu} \mathcal{A}_{L,\mu}$$

• $\mathcal{A}_L, \mathcal{A}_R$ are each other commutants on $\mathcal{H}_{B\sqcup B}$, and so they have the same center \mathcal{Z}



• $\mathcal{H}_{B\sqcup B}$ can be decomposed into eigenspaces of \mathcal{Z}

$$\mathcal{H}_{B\sqcup B} = \bigoplus_{\mu} \mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B\sqcup B}$$

with $\mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B\sqcup B} = \mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B\sqcup B,L} \otimes \mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B\sqcup B,R}$

Outline

1. Axioms \checkmark

2. Hilbert Space \checkmark



3. Operator Algebras \checkmark

4. Type I von Neumann Factors \checkmark

5. Entropy (with state-counting interpretation)



type I !



 Faithful, normal, semifinite traces on type I algebras are unique up to an overall normalization constant. Therefore, on a given μ-sector

$$\operatorname{tr}(a) = n_{\mu} \operatorname{Tr}_{\mu}(a) = n_{\mu} \sum_{i} {}_{L} \langle i | a | i \rangle_{L},$$

 Faithful, normal, semifinite traces on type I algebras are unique up to an overall normalization constant. Therefore, on a given μ-sector

trace inequality

$$\operatorname{tr}(a) = n_{\mu} \operatorname{Tr}_{\mu}(a) = n_{\mu} \sum_{i} {}_{L} \langle i | a | i \rangle_{L},$$

 $1 \leq \operatorname{tr}(P) = n_{\mu}$

• For a = P one-dimensional projection onto a state in $\mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B \sqcup B, L}$ we have $\operatorname{Tr}_{\mu}(P) = 1$



positivity of the inner product on $\mathcal{H}_{B \sqcup B \sqcup B \sqcup B} \qquad \qquad \mathrm{tr}(P) \geq 1 \qquad \qquad \mathrm{tr}(P) = 0$

positivity of the inner product on

$$\mathcal{H}_{\sqcup_{i=1}^{n}(B\sqcup B)}$$

 $tr(P) \ge n - 1$ $tr(P) = 0, 1, \cdots, n - 2$

 $\Rightarrow n_{\mu}$ is a positive integer!

• Therefore on a given μ -sector $\operatorname{tr} = n_{\mu} \operatorname{Tr}_{\mu}$ with $n_{\mu} \in \mathbb{Z}^+$

- Therefore on a given μ -sector $\operatorname{tr} = n_{\mu} \operatorname{Tr}_{\mu}$ with $n_{\mu} \in \mathbb{Z}^+$
- We define the extended Hilbert space factors:

where $tr = \tilde{T}r_{\mu}$!

- Therefore on a given μ -sector $\operatorname{tr} = n_{\mu} \operatorname{Tr}_{\mu}$ with $n_{\mu} \in \mathbb{Z}^+$
- We define the extended Hilbert space factors:

- where $tr = \tilde{Tr}_{\mu}$!
- The full extended Hilbert space:

$$\widetilde{\mathcal{H}}_{B\sqcup B} := \bigoplus_{\mu \in \mathcal{I}} \left(\widetilde{\mathcal{H}}_{B\sqcup B,L}^{\mu} \otimes \widetilde{\mathcal{H}}_{B\sqcup B,R}^{\mu} \right)$$

⇒ The hidden sectors allow to interpret the path integral trace as a Hilbert space trace

 \checkmark The trace tr defines an entropy on the left/right B

• Given a state $|\psi\rangle \in \mathcal{H}_{B\sqcup B}$ we can define a reduced density operator $ho_\psi \in \mathcal{A}_L$



• The von Neumann entropy is $S^L_{vN}(\psi) = \operatorname{tr}(-\rho_\psi \ln \rho_\psi)$

 $\checkmark~$ The trace ${\rm tr}~$ defines an entropy on the left/right B~



$$S_{vN}^L(\psi) = \operatorname{tr}(-\rho_{\psi} \ln \rho_{\psi})$$

✓ Thanks to the relation $tr = \tilde{T}r_{\mu}$ this entropy has a state-counting interpretation as left entropy on the extended Hilbert space $\tilde{\mathcal{H}}_{B \sqcup B}$

 \checkmark The trace tr defines an entropy on the left/right B



$$S_{vN}^L(\psi) = \operatorname{tr}(-\rho_{\psi} \ln \rho_{\psi})$$

- ✓ Thanks to the relation $tr = \tilde{T}r_{\mu}$ this entropy has a state-counting interpretation as left entropy on the extended Hilbert space $\tilde{\mathcal{H}}_{B \sqcup B}$
- \checkmark We can compute this entropy via the replica trick:

$$\operatorname{tr}(\rho_{\psi}^{n}) = \zeta \left(M(\left[\psi\psi^{\star}\right]^{n}) \right)$$

$$S_{vN}^{L}(\psi) = (1 - n\partial n) \log \operatorname{tr}(\rho_{\psi}^{n})\big|_{n=1}$$



 \checkmark The trace tr defines an entropy on the left/right B



$$S_{vN}^L(\psi) = \operatorname{tr}(-\rho_{\psi} \ln \rho_{\psi})$$

- ✓ Thanks to the relation $tr = \tilde{T}r_{\mu}$ this entropy has a state-counting interpretation as left entropy on the extended Hilbert space $\tilde{\mathcal{H}}_{B \sqcup B}$
- \checkmark We can compute this entropy via the replica trick:

$$\operatorname{tr}(\rho_{\psi}^{n}) = \zeta \left(M(\left[\psi\psi^{\star}\right]^{n}) \right)$$

$$S_{vN}^{L}(\psi) = (1 - n\partial n) \log \operatorname{tr}(\rho_{\psi}^{n})\big|_{n=1}$$
$$= \frac{A(\gamma)}{4G} \quad \mathbf{RT}$$



✓ If the theory admits a semiclassical limit described by Einstein-Hilbert or JT gravity, we can argue (by following Lewkowycz-Maldacena) that in such a limit the entropy is given by the Ryu-Takayanagi entropy

Conclusions



- A gravitational path integral satisfying a simple and familiar set of axioms defines type I von Neumann algebras of observables associated with codimension-2 boundaries.
- The path integral also defines a trace and entropy on these algebras.
- The Hilbert space on which the algebras act decomposes as

$$\mathcal{H}_{B\sqcup B} = \bigoplus_{\mu} \mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B\sqcup B,L} \otimes \mathcal{H}^{\mu}_{B\sqcup B,R}$$

- The path integral trace is equivalent to a standard trace on an extended Hilbert space: $tr = Tr_{\mu}$.
- This provides a state-counting interpretation of the entropy, even when the gravitational theory is not known to have a holographic dual.
- In the semiclassical limit, the entropy is given by the Ryu-Takayanagi formula.



Thanks for the attention!