Probing the Symmetry Energy of Dense Neutron-Rich Matter with Terrestrial Experiments and Astrophysical Observations



Collaborators: Bao-Jun Cai, Ang Li, Macon Magno, Jake Richter, Wen-Jie Xie, Chang Xu and Nai-Bo Zhang

- What do we currently know about $E_{sym}(\rho)$?
- How to probe the E_{sym}(ρ)?
- How does the $E_{sym}(\rho)$ impact the speed of sound at high ρ ?
- Why is the $E_{sym}(\rho)$ still so uncertain especially at high ρ ?



Empirical parabolic law of the EOS of cold, neutron-rich nucleonic matter



Fundamental Microphysics Theories underlying each term in the EOS , what ..., why, where ...how

Experimental and Observational Macrophysics underlying each observable and phenomenon, what ..., why, where ...how

Empirical parameterizations especially useful for meta-modeling of EOS

Transport model simulations of heavy-ion collisions, energy density functionals for nuclear structures, Bayesian inferences of EOS, properties of neutron stars, waveforms of gravitational waves,

 $E(\rho, \delta) = E_0(\rho) + E_{sym}(\rho) \cdot \delta^2$ Assuming no hadron-quark phase transition

$$E_0(\rho) = E_0(\rho_0) + \frac{K_0}{2} \left(\frac{\rho - \rho_0}{3\rho_0}\right)^2 + \frac{J_0}{6} \left(\frac{\rho - \rho_0}{3\rho_0}\right)^3 + \frac{Z_0}{24} \left(\frac{\rho - \rho_0}{3\rho_0}\right)^4,$$

$$E_{\text{sym}}(\rho) = E_{\text{sym}}(\rho_0) + \frac{L}{3} \left(\frac{\rho}{\rho_0} - 1\right) + \frac{K_{\text{sym}}}{18} \left(\frac{\rho}{\rho_0} - 1\right)^2 + \frac{J_{\text{sym}}}{162} \left(\frac{\rho}{\rho_0} - 1\right)^3 + \mathcal{O}\left[\left(\frac{\rho}{\rho_0} - 1\right)^4\right]$$

Near the saturation density $\rho_{0,}$ they are Taylor expansions, appropriate for structure studies. Just parameterizations when applied to heavy-ion collisions and the core of neutron stars

Single-nucleon potential in isospin-asymmetric nuclear matter

$$U_{n/p}(k,\rho,\delta) = U_{0}(k,\rho) \pm U_{sym1}(k,\rho) \cdot \delta + U_{sym2}(k,\rho) \cdot \delta^{2} + o(\delta^{3})$$
Isovector
$$F_{F} = \frac{d\xi}{d\rho} = \frac{d(\rho E)}{d\rho} = E + \rho \frac{dE}{d\rho} = E + P/\rho$$
According to the Hugenholtz-Van Hove (HVH) theorem:
$$E_{F} = \frac{d\xi}{d\rho} = \frac{d(\rho E)}{d\rho} = E + \rho \frac{dE}{d\rho} = E + P/\rho$$
J. Dabrowski and P. Haensel, PLB 42, (1972) 163.
S. Fritsch, N. Kaiser and W. Weise, NPA. A750, 259 (2005).
C. Xu, B.A. Li, L.W. Chen, Phys. Rev. C 82 (2010) 054607.
Potential
$$L(\rho) = \frac{2}{3} \frac{\hbar^{2}k^{2}}{2m_{0}^{*}} |_{k_{F}} - \frac{1}{6} (\frac{\hbar^{2}k^{3}}{m_{0}^{*}^{2}} \frac{\partial m_{0}^{*}}{\partial k})|_{k_{F}} + \frac{3}{2} U_{sym,1}(\rho, k_{F}) + \frac{\partial U_{sym,1}}{\partial k}|_{k_{F}} \cdot k_{F} + 3U_{sym,2}(\rho, k_{F}),$$
Kinetic
Rong Chen, Bao-Jun Cai, Lie-Wen Chen, Bao-An Li, Xiao-Hua Li, Chang Xu, PRC 85, 024305 (2012)
Nucleon effective mass in isospin symmetric matter
$$m_{0}^{*}(\rho, k) = \frac{m}{1 + \frac{m}{\hbar^{2}k} \frac{\partial U_{0}(\rho, k)}{\partial k}},$$
Neutron-proton effective mass splitting in neutron-rich matter
$$m_{0}^{*}(\rho, k) = \frac{m}{1 + \frac{m}{\hbar^{2}k} \frac{\partial U_{0}(\rho, k)}{\partial k}},$$

B.A. Li, B.J. Cai, L.W. Chen and J. Xu, Progress of Particle and Nuclear Physics, 99 (2018) 29.

$$n_{n-p}^* \approx 2\delta \frac{m}{\hbar^2 k_F} \left[-\frac{dU_{sym,1}}{dk} - \frac{k_F}{3} \frac{d^2 U_0}{dk^2} + \frac{1}{3} \frac{dU_0}{dk} \right]_{kF} \left(\frac{m_0^*}{m} \right)^2$$
$$\approx 2\delta \left(\frac{M_s^*}{M} \right)^2 \left[\frac{M}{M_v^*} - \frac{M}{M_s^*} \right]$$

Density and momentum dependence of Isoscalar and Isovector potentials Gogny Hartree-Fock predictions using 11 popular Gogny (finite-range) forces

PHYSICAL REVIEW C 90, 054327 (2014)

Isovector properties of the Gogny interaction

Roshan Sellahewa and Arnau Rios



Constraints on L as of 2013 based on 29 analyses of data



Bao-An Li and Xiao Han, Phys. Lett. B727 (2013) 276



Slope L of symmetry energy as of Feb. 2023



Curvature of the symmetry energy at saturation density



Progress in Constraining Nuclear Symmetry Energy Using Neutron Star Observables Since GW170817, B.A. Li, B.J. Cai, W.J. Xie and N.B. Zhang, *Universe* **2021**, 7(6), 182; <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/universe7060182</u>

Ratios of neutron to light charged particle ratios and elliptical flows from GSI Dan Cozma, EPJA 54 (2018) 3



How does the symmetry energy affect neutron star properties?

(1) The proton fraction x is determined by the E_{sym}(ρ) through charge neutrality and beta-equilibrium conditions:

 $x = 0.048 [E_{sym}(\rho) / E_{sym}(\rho_0)]^3 (\rho / \rho_0) (1 - 2x)^3$

Critical for the cooling mechanism of protoneutron stars and associated neutrino emissions, appearance of hyperons, kaon condensation, baryon resonances.....



(2) The pressure in the npe matter at beta equilibrium:

$$P(\rho,\delta) = \rho^2 \left[\frac{dE_0(\rho)}{d\rho} + \frac{dE_{\rm sym}(\rho)}{d\rho}\delta^2\right] + \frac{1}{2}\delta(1-\delta)\rho E_{\rm sym}(\rho)$$

(3) The crust-core transition density and pressure is determined by setting the **incompressibility of neutron star matter =0** (speed of sound becomes imaginary):

$$K_{\mu} = \rho^2 \frac{d^2 E_0}{d\rho^2} + 2\rho \frac{dE_0}{d\rho} + \delta^2 \left[\rho^2 \frac{d^2 E_{sym}}{d\rho^2} + 2\rho \frac{dE_{sym}}{d\rho} - 2E_{sym}^{-1} (\rho \frac{dE_{sym}}{d\rho})^2 \right] = 0$$

Lattimer & Prakash, Phys. Rep., 442, 109 (2007)

The crust-core transition density, pressure and isospin asymmetry are very sensitive to the fine details of the asymmetric nuclear matter EOS



Jun Xu, L.W. Chen, B.A. Li and H.R. Ma, APJ 697 (2009) 1549-1568

PHYSICAL REVIEW C 90, 054327 (2014)

Isovector properties of the Gogny interaction

Roshan Sellahewa and Arnau Rios



Solving the NS inverse-structure problems by calling the TOV solver within 3 Do-Loops: Given an observable-→ Find ALL necessary & sufficient EOSs

$$E_{0}(\rho) = E_{0}(\rho_{0}) + \frac{K_{0}}{2} (\frac{\rho - \rho_{0}}{3\rho_{0}})^{2} + \frac{J_{0}}{6} (\frac{\rho - \rho_{0}}{3\rho_{0}})^{3}, \qquad (2.15)$$

$$E_{\text{sym}}(\rho) = E_{\text{sym}}(\rho_{0}) + L(\frac{\rho - \rho_{0}}{3\rho_{0}}) + \frac{K_{\text{sym}}}{2} (\frac{\rho - \rho_{0}}{3\rho_{0}})^{2} + \frac{J_{\text{sym}}}{6} (\frac{\rho - \rho_{0}}{3\rho_{0}})^{3}(2.16)$$

$$E(\rho, \delta) = E_{0}(\rho) + E_{\text{sym}}(\rho) \cdot \delta^{2}.$$
Fix the saturation parameters $E_{0}(\rho_{0}), K_{0}, E_{\text{sym}}(\rho_{0})$ and
L at their most probable values currently known
$$Example: \qquad J_{0}^{=-189} \text{ is found} \\ \text{given } M_{\text{max}} = 2.01 M_{\text{sun}} \\ \int_{0} \text{ loop} \\ \text{Inversion} \qquad by \text{ brute force} \\ \hline \text{TOV} \\ \text{at } K_{\text{sym}} = -200 \& J_{\text{sym}} = 400 \\ \text{inside the } K_{\text{sym}} \text{ and } J_{\text{sym}} \text{ loops} \\ \text{N.B. Zhang, B.A. Li and J. Xu, APJ 859, 90 (2018)} \end{cases}$$



Impact of NICER's Radius Measurement of PSR J0740+6620 on Nuclear Symmetry Energy at Suprasaturation Densities



Radius: $13.7^{+2.6}_{-1.5}$ km (68%) (Miller et al. 2021) or $12.39^{+1.30}_{-0.98}$ km (Riley



Radius $R_{1.4}$ (km) (90% confidence level)	Source	Reference
$11.9^{+1.4}_{-1.4}$	GW170817	(Abbott et al. 2018)
$10.8^{+2.1}_{-1.6}$	GW170817	(De et al. 2018)
$11.7^{+1.1}_{-1.1}$	QLMXBs	(Lattimer & Steiner 2014)
$11.9\pm0.8, 10.8\pm0.8, 11.7\pm0.8$	Imagined case-1	this work
11.9 ± 0.8	Imagined case-2	this work

Table 1. The radius R_{1.4} data used in this work.

Wen-Jie Xie and Bao-An Li APJ 883, 174 (2019) APJ 899, 4 (2020)

Posterior probability distribution $P(\mathcal{M}|D) = \frac{P(D|\mathcal{M})P(\mathcal{M})}{\int P(D|\mathcal{M})P(\mathcal{M})d\mathcal{M}}$, (Bayes' theorem)

Likelihood:
$$P[D(R_{1,2,3})|\mathcal{M}(p_{1,2,\cdots 6})] = \prod_{j=1}^{3} \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}\sigma_{\mathrm{obs},j}} \exp[-\frac{(R_{\mathrm{th},j} - R_{\mathrm{obs},j})^{2}}{2\sigma_{\mathrm{obs},j}^{2}}],$$

Meta-modeling of nuclear EOS

Table 2. Prior ranges of the six EOS parameters used

Uniform prior distribution P(M) in the ranges of

Bayesian inference of high-density E_{sym} from the radii $R_{1.4}$ of canonical neutron stars in 6D EOS parameter space

Parameters	Lower limit	Upper limit (MeV)
K_0	220	260
J_0	-800	400
$K_{\rm sym}$	-400	100
$J_{ m sym}$	-200	800
L	30	90
$E_{\rm sym}(\rho_0)$	28.5	34.9

Posterior probability distribution function (PDF) of 6 EOS parameters from Bayesian analyses of GW170817 & NICER data for the canonical PSR J0030+0451 of masses around 1.4 solar mass





Bao-An Li, Bao-Jun Cai, Wen-Jie Xie, Nai-Bo Zhang, **Universe 7, 182 (2021)**

Examples of theoretical predictions for $E_{sym}(2\rho_0)$:

(1) Chiral EFT, $E_{sym}(2\rho_0) \approx 45 \pm 3 \text{ MeV}$ C. Drischler, R. J. Furnstahl, J. A. Melendez, and D. R. Phillips, PRL**125**, 202702 (2020)

(2) Quantum Monte Carlo, $E_{sym}(2\rho_0) \approx 46 \pm 4$

D. Lonardoni, I. Tews, S. Gandolfi, and J. Carlson, Phys. Rev. Research 2, 022033(R) (2020)

(3) Relativistic BHF in full Dirac space: 51.6 MeV

Sibo Wang, Hui Tong, Qiang Zhao, Chencan Wang, Peter Ring, Jie Meng, PRC 106 (2022) 2, L021305

(4) Relativistic BHF: ~ 53 MeV

Chencan Wang, Jinniu Hu, Ying Zhang, Hong Shen, Chin. Phys. C 46 (2022) 6, 064108

Why is the symmetry energy still so uncertain especially at high densities?



L.W. Chen, Nucl. Phys. Rev. 34, 20 (2017).
N.B. Zhang, B.A. Li, Eur. Phys. J. A 55, 39 (2019).

E_{sym} around (1-2)ρ₀ is most relevant for determining the radii of canonical neutron stars, existing 1.4M_{sun}NS observations do NOT constrain much E_{sym} above 2ρ₀ where SRC effects are important.

Impact of symmetry energy on sound speed and spinodal decomposition in dense neutron-rich matter Nai-Bo Zhang & Bao-An Li

The European Physical Journal A 59, Article number: 86 (2023)



Adiabatic sound speed in nucleonic matter

Symmetry energy





Fig. 3. The speed of sound C_{NM}^2 in unit of c^2 in nucleonic matter with fixed isospin asymmetries as a function of density using the symmetry energy $E_{\text{sym}}(\rho)$ functions with J_{sym} varying between -200 and 800 MeV as shown in the right panel of Fig. 2. The orange dashed line corresponds to the conformal limit $C^2 < 1/3$.

Isospin chemical potential

 $E_{\text{sym}}(\rho_1)\delta(\rho_1) = E_{\text{sym}}(\rho_2)\delta(\rho_2).$

Equilibrium sound speed in neutron stars (n+p+e+muons) at beta-equilibrium

1.0-200 300 0.8 400 -100 500 100 200 $^{\circ}$ 0.6 600 700 $E_{svm}(\rho_0)=31.7$ L=60 0.4 $K_{sym} = -230$ $J_0 = -190$ 800 0.2 Always has a peak 300 0.8 500 0.6 $^{\circ}_{\rm C}$ 6007000.4 -100 -200 0.2 200 1000.0 2 3 5 4 6

 ρ/ρ_0

Physics of Isospin fractionation

 $E(\rho, \delta) = E_0(\rho) + E_{sym}(\rho) \cdot \delta^2 + \mathcal{O}(\delta^4)$



What are the fundamental physics behind the symmetry energy?

$$U_{n/p}(k,\rho,\delta) = U_0(k,\rho) \pm U_{sym1}(k,\rho) \cdot \delta + U_{sym2}(k,\rho) \cdot \delta^2 + o(\delta^3)$$

Isospin dependence of strong interactions and correlations

 $V_{T0} = V'_{np} \text{ (n-p pair in the T=0 state)}$ $V_{T1} = V_{nn} = V_{pp} = V_{np} \text{ (charge independence in the T=1 state)}$ Tensor force due to pion and ρ meson exchange MAINLY in the T=0 channel $V_{T1} = V_{nn} = V_{pp} = V_{np}$ (charge independence in the T=1 state) $V_{np}(T0) \neq V_{np}(T1)$

In a simple interacting Fermi gas model:

Isospin-dependent correlation function

$$U_{sym}(k_F,\rho) = \frac{1}{4}\rho \int [V_{T1}(r_{ij})f^{T1}(r_{ij}) - V_{T0}(r_{ij})f^{T0}(r_{ij})]d^3r_{ij}$$

M.A. Preston and R.K. Bhaduri, Structure of the Nucleus, 1975

Isospin-dependent effective 2-body interaction

Major issues relevant to high-density E_{sym}, heavy-ion reactions and neutron stars

- Momentum dependence of the symmetry potential due to the finite-range of isovector int.
- Short-range correlations due to the tensor force in the isosinglet n-p channel
- Spin-isospin dependence of the 3-body force
- Isovector interactions of \triangle (1232) resonances and their spectroscopy (mass and width)
- Possible sign inversion of the symmetry potential at high momenta/density

Dominance of the isosinglet (T=0) interaction



The short and long range tensor force



2nd order tensor force contribution to the potential part of symmetry energy

G.E. Brown and R. Machleidt, Phys. Rev. C50, 1731 (1994).

S.-O. Bacnman, G.E. Brown and J.A. Niskanen, Phys. Rep. 124, 1 (1985).

T.T.S. Kuo and G.E. Brown, Phys. Lett. 18, 54 (1965)



$$\frac{\langle V_{\rm sym} \rangle}{A} = \frac{12}{e_{eff}} \cdot \frac{k_F^3}{12\pi^2} \{ \frac{1}{4} \int V_t^2(r) d^3r - \frac{1}{16} \int [\frac{3j_1(k_F r)}{k_F r}]^2 V_t^2(r) d^3r \}$$

Ang Li and Bao-An Li, arXiv:1107.0496

C. Xu, A. Li and B.A. Li, Journal of Physics: Conference Series 420, 012190 (2013)

Short-range tensor forces affects the high-density symmetry energy



At saturation density, the 2nd order potential contribution due to the tensor force is about 7-14 MeV, it is 9 MeV with Av18

What are the Short Range Correlations (SRC) in nuclei ? (Modified from a slide by Eli Piasetzky)



Nucleon pairs with <u>large relative</u> <u>momenta</u> and <u>small CM momenta</u> **Short Range Correlated pairs:** temporal fluctuations of strongly interacting nucleon pairs in close proximity

Effects of the tensor force in T=0 neutron-proton interaction channel

(1) high-momentum tail in nucleon momentum distribution

H.A. Bethe

Ann. Rev. Nucl. Part. Sci., 21, 93-244 (1971)



FIGURE 10. Two nucleons are initially in states B and C, having average momentum P and relative momentum k. When they interact they are shifted to states D and E outside the Fermi sphere, with relative momentum k'. If they are initially in a ³S state and interact by tensor force, then they are in a ³D₁ state in DE.

(2) isospin dependence of short-range correlation (SRC) in neutron-rich matter

O. Hen et al. (Jlab CLAS collaboration), Science 346, 614 (2014)



M. Duer et al., PRL 122, 172502 (2019).



Experimental evidence of isospin-dependent nucleon momentum distribution: Deformed-Fermi distributions in neutron-rich matter







M. Duer et al., Nature 560, 617 (2018).







Reduced Kinetic symmetry energy wrt free Fermi gas (FFG)



Chang Xu, Ang Li and Bao-An Li, JPCS 420, 012190 (2013). O. Hen, B.A. Li, W.J. Guo, L.B. Weinstein, E. Piasetzky, Phys. Rev. C 91 (2015) 025803. B.J. Cai, B.A. Li, Phys. Rev. C 92 (2015) 011601(R).

Protons move faster than neutrons in n-skin



B.J. Cai, B.A. Li and L.W. Chen, PRC 94, 061302 (R) (2016)

Effects of isospin-dependent SRC on the kinetic symmetry energy of quasi-nucleons

Chang Xu, Ang Li and Bao-An Li, JPCS 420, 012190 (2013).

Free-Fermi Gas (FFG): kinetic E_{sym} =12.3 MeV at ρ_0

if more than 15% nucleons are in the high-momentum tail of SNM due to the tensor force for n-p T=0 channel, the kinetic symmetry energy becomes negative



$$E_{kin} = \alpha \int_0^\infty \frac{\hbar^2 k^2}{2m} n(k) k^2 dk,$$

$$E_{sym}^{kin} = E_{PNM}^{kin} - E_{SNM}^{kin} < 0$$



Self-Consistent Green's Function Approach (A. Rios et al.)



	$S_{\rm tot}$ [MeV]	$S_{\rm kin} [{ m MeV}]$	$S_{\rm pot} [{ m MeV}]$	L [MeV]		
Av18	25.1	4.9	20.2	37.7		
Nij1	27.4	4.6	22.8	48.5		
CDBonn	28.8	7.9	20.9	52.6		
N3LO	29.7	7.2	22.4	55.2		

Brueckner-Hartree-Fock approach (I. Vidana et al. Using the Hellmann-Feynman theorem V18 potential plus the Urbana IX three-body force.

At saturation density, the Free Fermi Gas (FFG) model prediction is about 12.5 MeV

	E_{NM}	E_{SM}	E_{sym}	L
$\langle T \rangle$	53.321	54.294	-0.973	14.896
$\langle V \rangle$	-34.251	-69.524	35.273	51.604
Total	19.070	-15.230	34.300	66.500

EOS of dense neutron-rich matter is a major scientific motivation of

- (1) High-energy rare isotope beam facilities around the world
- (2) Various x-ray satellites
- (3) Various gravitational wave detectors

Among the promising observables of high-density symmetry energy:

- $\frac{\pi}{\pi} \frac{\pi}{\pi}$ and $\frac{n}{p}$ spectrum ratio, neutron-proton differential flow and correlation function in heavy-ion collisions at intermediate energies
- Radii of neutron stars
- Neutrino flux of supernova explosions
- Tidal polarizability in neutron star mergers, strain amplitude of gravitational waves from deformed pulsars, frequency and damping time of neutron star oscillations

B.A. Li, L.W. Chen and C.M. Ko, Phys. Rep. 464, 113 (2008)

Topical Issue on Nuclear Symmetry Energy edited by Bao-An Li, Àngels Ramos, Giuseppe Verde and Isaac Vidaña

EPJA, Vol. 50, No. 2 (2014)

From Earth to Heaven: multi-messengers of nuclear EOS

Truly multi-messenger approach to probe the EOS of dense neutron-rich matter = astrophysical observations + terrestrial experiments + theories + ...





