# Observation of structures at $\sim 17$ and $\sim 38 \mathbf{M e V} / \mathbf{c}^{2}$ in the $\gamma \gamma$ invariant mass spectra in $\mathbf{p C}, \mathbf{d C}$, and $\mathbf{d C u}$ collisions at $\boldsymbol{p}_{\text {lab }}$ of a few $\mathbf{G e V} / \mathbf{c}$ per nucleon 

Kh.U. Abraamyan ${ }^{1,2 *}$, Ch. Austin ${ }^{3}$, M.I. Baznat ${ }^{4}$, K.K. Gudima ${ }^{4}$, M.A. Kozhin ${ }^{1}$, S.G. Reznikov ${ }^{1}$, and A.S. Sorin ${ }^{1,5}$<br>${ }^{1}$ VBLHEP JINR, 141980 Dubna, Moscow region, Russia<br>${ }^{2}$ International Center for Advanced Studies, YSU, 0025, Yerevan, Armenia ${ }^{3} 33$ Collins Terrace, Maryport, Cumbria CA15 8DL, England<br>${ }^{4}$ Institute of Applied Physics, MD-2028 Kishinev, Moldova<br>${ }^{5}$ BLTP JINR, 141980 Dubna, Moscow region, Russia<br>* E-mail: abraamyan@jinr.ru

## Abstract

The results of an analysis of the invariant mass spectra of photon pairs produced in $d \mathrm{C}, p \mathrm{C}$ and $d \mathrm{Cu}$ interactions at momenta of $2.75,5.5$ and $3.83 \mathrm{GeV} / c$ per nucleon respectively, are presented. Signals in the form of enhanced structures at invariant masses of about 17 and $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ are observed. The results of testing of the observed signals, including the results of the Monte Carlo simulation are presented. The test results support the conclusion that the observed signals are the consequence of detection of the particles with masses of about 17 and $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ decaying into a pair of photons

## Outline

- The experiment
- $\mathrm{\gamma Y}$ invariant mass spectra
- The background estimations
- Check of the observed peaks
- Data simulation
- Conclusion


## Introduction

- A series of experiments on the production of photon pairs in the interactions of protons, deuterons and alpha particles with nuclei was carried out on the internal beams of the Nuclotron at JINR. The experiments were performed on a multichannel two-arm gamma spectrometer of the SPHERE setup (PHOTON-2 setup). The results of the first analysis on the production of eta mesons (selection of photons from different arms of the spectrometer) have been published in: Kh.U. Abraamyan et al., Phys. Rev. C80, 034001 (2009). [arXiv:0806.2790]
- At the suggestion of colleagues from Portugal, Eef van Beveren and George Rupp, the spectra of photon pairs in the region of invariant masses around $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ were analyzed in order to search for the E38 boson. The results of this analysis (photons from the same spectrometer arm) are published in:
Kh.U. Abraamyan et al. Check of the structure in photon pairs spectra at the invariant mass of about $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$. EPJ Web of Conferences 204, 08004 (2019).


## EXPERIMENT

The data acquisition of production of neutral mesons and $\gamma$-quanta in pC , $d C$, and $d C u$ interactions has been carried out with internal beams of the JINR Nuclotron.

The PHOTON-2 setup includes $32 \gamma$-spectrometers of lead glass. The modules of the $\gamma$-spectrometer are assembled into two arms of 16 units. These modules in each arm are divided into two groups of 8 units. The output signals in each group are summed up linearly and after discrimination by amplitude are used in fast triggering. In this experiment, the discriminator threshold was at the level of 0.4 GeV . Triggering takes place when there is a coincidence of signals from two or more groups from different arms. (The block-scheme of electronic equipment is in sl. № 46.)
Detailed description of the experiments is in:
Kh. U. Abraamyan et al., Phys. Rev. C 80, 034001 (2009); arXiv:0806.2790.

PHOTON-2 setup (multichannel Cherenkov
y spectrometer of the SPHERE facility) on internal beams of the NUCLOTRON


Kh.U. Abraamyan et al., Instruments and Experimental Techniques 32, 58 (1989); 39, 775 (1996).

Multichannel $\gamma$-spectrometer of the SPHERE setup (the PHOTON-2 setup) in experiments on the internal beams of the Nuclotron
$\breve{C} 1, \breve{C} 2-$
$\gamma$-spectrometers of lead glass,
S1, S2 -
scintillation counters of $2 \times 15 \times 15 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$.

A detailed description of the setup is in:
Kh.U. Abraamyan et al., Phys. Rev. C80, 034001 (2009)
arXiv:0806.2790.


## A schematic drawing of a single module of the $\psi$-spectrometer



Block diagram of the electronic equipment of the PHOTON-2 setup


## The background estimation method

The so-called event mixing method was used to estimate the combinatorial background: a photon in one event from the first arm is combined with a photon in other events from the second arm.

The background normalization was carried out in two steps. First, the background is normalized to the total pair number. Naturally that at the event mixing the $\eta$-meson maximum is not reproduced disturbing the overall normalization. At the second step this shortcoming of the background estimate is corrected by an auxiliary factor obtained by iterating treatment of the resonance contribution to the spectrum.

Invariant mass distributions of $\mathrm{p} p$ pairs without (left figure) and with (right figure) the background subtraction in the reaction $p(5.5 \mathrm{Gev} / \mathrm{c})+\mathrm{C}$, at minimal cuts: $\mathrm{E} \varphi \geq 50 \mathrm{MeV}$.


The first observation (nucl-ex/0607027; PR C80, 2009, p.034001). Invariant mass distributions of $\mathrm{\gamma}$ pairs without (upper panel) and with (bottom panel) the background subtraction after the criteria (1)-(3).


## From the PDG

## OTHER LIGHT MESONS

```
NODE \(=M \times X \times 015\)
```


## Further States

```
OMITTED FROM SUMMARY TABLE
This section contains states observed by a single group or states poorly established that thus need confirmation. Publications that exclude earlier claims in this section are listed under 'Other Related Papers.'
QUANTUM NUMBERS, MASSES, WIDTHS, AND BRANCHING RATIOS
```



The experimental ( $\odot$ ) and simulated ( $\Delta$ ) data for the $d(2 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+C$ (left) and $p(4.6 \mathrm{GeV})+C$ (right) reactions. The curves are contributions of $R \rightarrow \gamma \gamma$ decays.


Check of the resonance structure at an invariant mass of pairs of $\gamma$-quanta and pairs of $\boldsymbol{\pi}^{\mathbf{0}}$-mesons of about $\mathbf{3 6 0} \mathbf{~ M e V / c ^ { \mathbf { 2 } }}$. Eur. Phys. J. A (2016) 52: 259.



The Invariant-mass distributions of $\pi^{\circ} \pi^{\circ}$ pairs without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction for the reactions $\mathrm{d}+\mathrm{C}$ at $2.75 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon (left figure) and $\mathrm{p}+\mathrm{C}$ at $5.5 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ (right figure). The backgrounds are normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $450<\mathrm{M} \pi \pi<550 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c} 2$.
-------- Исходное сообщение $\qquad$
Тема: ArXiv:1203.4198
Дата: Thu, 17 May 2012 19:04:52 +0100
От: eef@teor.fis.uc.pt
Кому: Khachik Abraamyan [abraam@sunhe.jinr.ru](mailto:abraam@sunhe.jinr.ru)
Копия: George Rupp [george@ist.utl.pt](mailto:george@ist.utl.pt)
Dear Dr. Khachik Abraamyan and collaborators,
It was a pleasant surprise to read your article on "Resonance structure in diphoton and two-neutral-pion systems in Deuterium-Carbon interactions" ArXiv:1203.4198.

I am sorry that I did not come across your 2006 work nucl-ex/0607027 before today.
Your result is spectacular as it does not seem to fit into any type of model for strong interactions and worth to offer you my congratulations.

Do you yourself have an explanation for the resonance at 360 MeV ?
Actually, I was browsing in Google through data for diphotons where I found your work. The reason is that I myself and my collaborator George Rupp are interested in diphoton data from 30 to 50 MeV (see arXiv:1202.1739 and arXiv:1204.3287)

Unfortunately, your lower limit is 100 MeV , but I wonder whether that is a limitation of your setup at the JINR Nuclotron, or that it could be lowered to 30 MeV .

Kind regards,
Eef van Beveren

From the paper: Kh.U. Abraamyan et al. arXiv:1208.3829v1 [hep-ex]: Fig. 2.
Invariant mass distribution of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (A) from the reaction $d+\mathrm{Cu} \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+\mathrm{X}$ at 3.83 $\mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon. The green histogram shows the background contribution. The bottom panel show the spectra after the background subtraction. The background is normalized to the total pair number.


## Baldin ISHEPP XXIV

## Check of the structure in photon pairs spectra at the invariant mass of about $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$

Khachik Abraamyan ${ }^{1,2, *}$, Chris Austin ${ }^{3}$, Mircea Baznat ${ }^{4}$, Konstantin Gudima ${ }^{4}$, Mikhail Kozhin ${ }^{1}$, Sergey Reznikov ${ }^{1}$, and Alexander Sorin ${ }^{1,5}$<br>${ }^{1}$ VBLHEP JINR, 141980 Dubna, Moscow region, Russia<br>${ }^{2}$ Yerevan State University, 0025, Yerevan, Armenia<br>${ }^{3} 33$ Collins Terrace, Maryport, Cumbria CA15 8DL, England<br>${ }^{4}$ Institute of Applied Physics, MD-2028 Kishinev, Moldova<br>${ }^{5}$ BLTP JINR, 141980 Dubna, Moscow region, Russia


#### Abstract

Results of analysis of the effective mass spectra of photon pairs produced in $d \mathrm{C}, d \mathrm{Cu}$ and $p \mathrm{C}$ interactions at momenta of $2.75,3.83$ and $5.5 \mathrm{GeV} / c$ per nucleon, respectively, are presented. A structure at effective mass of about $38 \mathrm{MeV} / c^{2}$ is observed. The results of testing the observed signal are presented. The test results support the conclusion that the observed signal is the consequence of detection of a particle with a mass of about $38 \mathrm{MeV} / c^{2}$ decaying into a pair of photons.


## Your work on E38, arxiv:1208.3829

## DB <br> David Blaschke [david.blaschke@gmail.com](mailto:david.blaschke@gmail.com)

30.07.2020 7:06

Кому: Khachik Abraamyan; abraam@sunhe.jinr.ru Копия: Alexander Sorin

Dear Khachik jan
...
I would like to point out that there is severe interest in this state because in the context of understanding the hypothetical X17 boson, there is a model that would explain both states, including the one at 38 MeV , see table 1 of
https://arxiv.org/pdf/2001.04864.pdf

The author, Cheuk-Yin Wong, is a good old friend of mine and has pointed out your result to me which he has included to a recent update of his work. It seems to me that there could be some indication for the X17 state in your data too.
If that is true you should possibly revise your background analysis taking this state into account.

I am looking very much forward to hearing from you!

With best wishes,
David Blaschke

## Possibilities for detecting particles with low masses ( $\mathrm{M}<20 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ )

Triggering takes place when there is a coincidence of signals from two or more groups from different arms:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left(D_{1}+D_{2}\right) \times\left(D_{3}+D_{4}\right) \ldots \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

In order to studying the region of small invariant masses, we processed the data obtained in groups not participating in the trigger launch (thanks to the logical addition (see (1)), there are such groups in each event). The energies in such groups are not affected by the discriminator thresholds. Thus, the energy in such groups is arbitrary, starting from zero.

## Gamma's from the Groups outside the trigger

The figures on the second slide shows the sum of data for two groups that did not participate in the event triggering (after logical addition) (see (1), previous slide). Thus, the energy in the specified group could be arbitrary (without the influence of the discriminator thresholds)

For searching for a signal from a particle with a mass of $17 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$, the following selection criteria were used:
(i) the sum of the energies of photons in a pair, $E_{12}>250 \mathrm{MeV}$ (effective detection of pairs at the setup geometry);
(ii) the ratio of the energies of photons in a pair, $E_{\gamma 1} / E_{\gamma 2}<0.4$ (suppresses systematic errors due to violation of the energy-momentum conservation laws at the event mixing);
(iii) opening angle of photons in a pair, $\Theta_{\gamma \gamma}>7^{\circ}$ (suppresses systematic errors due to an excess of pairs with small opening angles at the event mixing).

## Results of the search for a signal at an invariant mass of photon pairs of about $17 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (i)-(iii) without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the $d+C, d+C u$ and $p+C$ reactions. The backgrounds are normalized by the numbers of pairs in the range $(22,32) \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.

## CHECK OF THE OBSERVED PEAKS <br> Different minimal energies of photons



The same as in previous dlide, but at different minimal energies of photons: 20; $30 ; 50$ and 60 MeV

## Gamma's from the triggering Groups

Below are the results of an analysis of photon pairs detected only in one group participating in the launch of the facility. Thus, the sum of photon energies in these events are influenced by the discriminator thresholds (see above, (1)).
The next slide shows the invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs under the following conditions:
(1) the number of detected photons in the group, $N \gamma=2$;
(2) the minimal energy of photons, EyMin = 20 MeV ;
(3) the sum of the energies of photons in a pair, $E_{12}>600 \mathrm{MeV}$ (taking into account the discriminator thresholds);
(4) the ratio of the energies $E \gamma 1 / E \gamma 2<0.4$ (suppresses systematic errors due to violation of the energy-momentum conservation laws at the event mixing);
(5) the opening angles of photons in a pair, $\Theta_{\gamma \gamma}>7^{\circ}$.

Gamma's from the triggering Grouns



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs at energies of photons, $\mathrm{E} \gamma>20 \mathrm{MeV}$, without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / n)+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / n)+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

## The same as on the previous slide, but for $\mathrm{Ev}>15$ and $\mathrm{Ev}>30 \mathrm{MeV}$


 Invariant mass distributions of $y \gamma$ pairs at energies of photons, $\mathrm{E}_{\gamma}>15 \mathrm{MeV}$, (left) and $\mathrm{E} \gamma>30 \mathrm{MeV}$ (right), without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

## The same as on the previous slide, but for the Nyv/Background ratio




Invariant mass distributions of $y \gamma$ pairs at energies of photons, $\mathrm{E}_{\boldsymbol{\gamma}}>15 \mathrm{MeV}$ (left) and $\mathrm{E} \gamma>30 \mathrm{MeV}$ (right), without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / n)+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

## Gamma's from different Groups. Signals from the $\pi^{0}$-mesons



The $N_{Y Y}$ to the background ratio for photon pairs from different groups (Right arm) for the $d+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p+\mathrm{C}$ reactions (left figures) and sum of these data at different scales.

## DATA SIMULATION

To simulate the $d+$ Cu reaction we use a transport code. At high energies it is the QuarkGluon String Model (QGSM) (N.S. Amelin, K.K. Gudima, and V.D. Toneev ) and at the energy of a few GeV the string dynamics is reduced to the earlier developed Dubna Cascade Model (DCM) (V.D. Toneev and K.K. Gudima) with upgrade of elementary cross sections involved (K. K. Gudima, S. G. Mashnik, and A. J. Sierk).

The following $\gamma$-decay channels are taken into account: the direct decays of $\pi^{0}, \eta, \eta^{\prime}$ hadrons into two $\gamma^{\prime} \mathrm{s}, \omega \rightarrow \pi^{o} \gamma, \Delta \rightarrow N \gamma$ and the Dalitz decay of $\eta \rightarrow \pi^{+} \pi^{-} \gamma, \eta \rightarrow \gamma+e^{+}+e^{-}$ and $\pi^{0} \rightarrow \gamma+e^{+}+e^{-}$, the $\eta^{\prime} \rightarrow \rho^{0}+\gamma$, the $\Sigma \rightarrow \Lambda+\gamma$, the $\pi N$ and $N N$-bremsstrahlung. One should note that in accordance with the HADES data, the $p n$-bremsstrahlung turned out to be higher by a factor of about 5 than a standard estimate and weakly depends on the energy. This finding, being in agreement with the result of Ref. L.P. Kaptari and B. K"ampfer, Nucl. Phys. A764, 338 (2006)., allowed one to resolve the old DLS puzzle [E.L. Bratkovskaya and W. Cassing, Nucl. Phys. A807, 214 (2008) ]. This enhancement factor is included in our calculations. Tests of this model in detail are described in Ref. Kh.U. Abraamyan et al., Phys. Rev. C80, 034001 (2009); arXiv:0806.2790.

## Estimates of systematic errors in the combinatorial background



The result of processing the simulated data by the same method as experimental data, for the $d(3 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ reaction (left) and comparison of the experimental and simulated spectra after the backgrounds subtraction (right). The backgrounds are normalized by the numbers of pairs in the range $(22,32) \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$. The selection criteria are in the figure.

Estimates of systematic errors in the combinatorial background


The same as in the previous slide (right figure), but for the sum of the spectra (after the backgrounds subtraction), obtained in three experiments (indicated in the figure). The curves indicate the interval of $\pm 3$ standard statistical errors in the simulated data. On the right figure, for the most stringent verification of the signals, the experimental data (in the left figure) were multiplied by a factor $K^{\prime} n=N$ model $\left(22<M y \gamma<32 M e V c^{2}\right) / N$ Exper. $\left(22<M \gamma \gamma<32 M e V / c^{2}\right)$.

A more rigorous quantitative verification of the signal at $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ (with the participation of K.Gudima and Ch.Austin) was given in:

## EPJ Web of Conferences 204, 08004 (2019)




Invariant mass distributions (per $3 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ ) of $\left.\gamma\right\rangle$ pairs from the decay of $\mathrm{E}(38)$ under the real experimental conditions: 4pairs $\gamma \gamma$, selected by means of labels of photons applied in the model; • - the result of processing the simulated data with the method applied to the experimental data. The curves are the experimental signal after the background subtraction (Gaussian approximation) proportional to the number of $d+C u$ events containing a pair of $\gamma \gamma$ in the required energy range. The signal in the simulated data reduced by a factor $K s=1 / 5$ (among the events, containing a photon from the decay of $E(38)$, each 5 th event was taken) (left figure) and by a factor $K s=1 / 10$ (right figure).

No cuts. Systematic errors


The result of processing the simulated data by the same method as experimental data, for the $d(3 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ reaction (left) and comparison of the experimental and simulated spectra after the backgrounds subtraction (right) at the minimum selection conditions. The backgrounds are normalized by the numbers of pairs in the range $(21,33) \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.

## No cuts. Systematic errors




The same as in the previous slide, but after cuts by the opening angle: $\Theta_{\gamma \gamma}>7^{\circ}$ (left figure) and $\Theta_{\gamma \gamma}>10^{\circ}$ (right figure). The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers in the spectra. The spectra after the backgrounds subtraction in the experimental and simulated data are normalized by the numbers of pairs in the range $(21,33) \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.

## CONCLUSION

- Along with $\pi^{0}$ mesons, signals in the form of enhanced structures at invariant masses of about 17 and $38 \mathrm{MeV} / c^{2}$ are observed in the reactions $p+C \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+x, d+C \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+x$ and $d+\mathrm{Cu} \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+x$ at momenta $5.5 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}, 2.75 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ and $3.83 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon, respectively. The results of testing of the observed signals, including the results of the Monte Carlo simulation support the conclusion that the observed signals are the consequence of detection of the particles with masses of about 17 and $38 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c} 2$ decaying into a pair of photons.
- In view of the many theoretical possibilities, it is of great to confirm the occurrence of X17 at different initial conditions and from different decay channels. The decay of both channels is in agreement with the composite picture of X17 and E38 (see the second slide).

Decay of the QED meson $X$ into a $\gamma \gamma$ pair (a), and an e+e-pair (b).
[C. Y. Wong, Open string QED meson description of the X17 particle and dark matter, JHEP, 08, 165 (2020)].
The our experiment corresponds to the decay in Figure (a) while the ATOMKI experimental observation corresponds to the decay by Figure (b)

(a)

(b)

## Thank you!

Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs in two different runs of measurement under condition $\mathrm{E} \gamma \geq 50$ MeV : with the empty target (dashed histogram) and with the internal carbon target (solid histogram) in the reaction $d C \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+X$ at $2.75 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon.


The relative efficiencies of $\gamma \gamma$-pairs detection and selection. EPJ Web of Conferences 204, 08004 (2019) 204, 08004 (2019)


The ratio of the number of triggered $\gamma \gamma$ pairs under real experimental conditions (at $E \gamma>50 \mathrm{MeV}$ (criterion (A))) on the total number in the simulated source, depending on the effective mass (per $2 \mathrm{MeV} / c 2$ ) of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs for the Model after excluding the events with $\gamma\rangle$ pairs from the $E(38)$ boson. In this analysis, the coincidence with the Left arm is not required (i.e. triggering takes place when there is a signal from one or two groups from the Right arm).

The $E(38)$ detection and selection efficiency versus the energy threshold reduction factor for the Left Arm of the Spectrometer

inquiry on E38 particle

## Cheuk-Yin Wong [wongcyor@gmail.com](mailto:wongcyor@gmail.com)

30.07.2020 6:48

Koмy: abraamyan@jinr.ru
x17v4.pdf
697,34 K5

07/29/2020 (To. Prof. Khachik Abraamyan, abraamyan@jinr.ru)

Dar Prof. Abraamyan,
(2) Is it possible for you to go to the invariant mass region of 10-20

MeV region where another boson state, the X 17 state at 17 MeV , is predicted to occur? You may need to lower your E12 value. I would expect that the yield for such a boson state is much greater than the yield for the E38 state, but the background may also be greater.

Best regards!

Cheuk-Yin Wong
Distinguished Senior Physicist
Physics Division
Oak Ridge National Laboratory
Oak Ridge, TN 37831

## https://agenda.infn.it/event/26303/sessions/20094/\#20210908



## Influence of the used criteria <br> 2) No cuts $+\Theta v v>7^{\circ}$



The $N Y V$ to the background ratio for photon pairs from from the Groups outside the trigger for the reactions $d$ (2.0 $\mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

## Influence of the used criteria

## 3) No cuts + $\Theta v v>7^{\circ}+\mathrm{Ev}>30 \mathrm{MeV}$



The $N Y V$ to the background ratio for photon pairs from from the Groups outside the trigger for the reactions $d(2.0$ $\mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

## Influence of the used criteria

## 1) No cuts



The $N_{Y V}$ to the background ratio for photon pairs from the Groups outside the trigger for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}$, $d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

Estimates of systematic errors in the combinatorial background



The results of processing the simulated data by the method which was applied to the experimental data (i.e., the difference of the combinatorial spectrum and the background obtained by the event mixing method. The selection criteria are in the pictures.

## Проверка структуры при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов 38 МэВ/с². Новости.



February 01, 2020


February 29, 2020

Invariant mass distributions of $y y$ pairs at the minimum selection conditions (no cuts), for the reaction $d+\mathrm{Cu} \rightarrow Y+\gamma+x$ at $3.8 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon obtained in the Left Arm (left figure) and in the Right Arm (right figure). The backgrounds are normalized by the numbers of pairs in the range $(21,33) \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.



The $N_{\gamma \gamma}$ to the background ratio for photon pairs from different groups for the $d+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p$ +C reactions obtained in the Left Arm (left figure) and in the Right Arm (right figure).



The same as in the previous slide, but at another scale



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (1)-(5) (shown in the figure) without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the $d+C$, $d+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p+\mathrm{C}$ reactions obtained in the Left Arm (left figure) and in the Right Arm (right figure). The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers in the spectra.



As can be seen from previous slide, the signal from X17, which is visible (as a relief) in the data obtained in the Right Arm is practically not visible in the data from the Left Arm (due to the low statistics): the signal "sinks" in statistical errors. With such a selection (data in triggering Groups subject to the threshold of the discriminators), a signal from E38 is visible. It is weak, "ragged", but withstands the stability test with a significant shift of the full spectrum (with background) (see Figures below).



Распределения по эффективной массе пар $\gamma \gamma$ до (верхние панели) и после (нижние панели) вычитания фона, в группах, не участвовавших в запуске триггера. Фон нормирован по полному числу пар в спектре (левый рисунок) и по числу пар в области (22,32) МэВ/с²

Предварительные результаты поиска сигнала при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов около 17 МэВ/c².





Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (i)-(iii), for different minimal energies of photons, without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The backgrounds are normalized to the total pair numbers.

Analysis of the operation of individual modules, after which some modules were excluded in order to exclude deterioration in the amplitude resolution: amplitude spectra (left) and spectra from the Nal crystals doped with ${ }_{241} A m$ sources in separate modules in the $d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ experiment


## Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 МэВ/с².

## EPJ Web of Conferences 138, 04006 (2017)



The invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (i)-(ii) (see SI. 26) in the reactions $d(2 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+C \rightarrow \gamma+$ $Y+X$ after the background subtraction, in the events recorded in different intervals of accelerator cycle. The backgrounds are normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $200<M_{Y Y}<300 \mathrm{MeV} / c$.

## Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов

 и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 МэВ/с².
## EPJ Web of Conferences 138, 04006 (2017)



The invariant mass distributions (per $20 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ ) of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria:
(i) the number of photons in an event, $N_{Y} \leq 3$ (the events of each type (one of the photons in the left arm and two on the right, etc.) were analysed separately, the results were summarized);
(ii) the energies of photons, $100<E \gamma<750 \mathrm{MeV}$,
in the reactions $d(2 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+C \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+X$ (left figure) and $\mathrm{p}(4.6 \mathrm{GeV})+C \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+X$ (right figure) after the background subtraction. The backgrounds are normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $200<\mathrm{M} \gamma \nu<300 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.

## Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 M эВ/с².

## EPJ Web of Conferences 138, 04006 (2017)



Invariant mass distributions (per $20 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ ) of $\left.\gamma\right\rangle$ pairs in the reactions $\mathrm{d}(2 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C} \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+X$ after the background subtraction, at the number of photons in an event, $N \gamma=2$ and at the energies of photons, $100<\mathrm{E}$ $\gamma<750 \mathrm{MeV}$ (left figure), and the same but after a "miscalibration" of the modules by the introduction of chaotic coefficients in the range $0 \div 2$ : $\mathrm{Ei} \rightarrow \mathrm{Ei} \cdot 2 \cdot \mathrm{RND}(\mathrm{i})$, (where Ei is the energy in the i -th module, RND(i) are random numbers) (right figure). Here, the average of results obtained after the introduction of 6 different sets of random numbers is shown. The backgrounds are normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $200<\mathrm{M} \mu \mathrm{p}<300 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.

## Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 МэВ/с².

## EPJ Web of Conferences 138, 04006 (2017)



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs from the $d(3 \mathrm{GeV} / n)+\mathrm{Cu}$ reaction after the background subtraction, at the number of photons in an event, $N \gamma=2$ and at the energies of photons, $100<E \gamma<850 \mathrm{MeV}$, without (left figure) and with the reaction $\pi+\pi \rightarrow R \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma$ (right figure), under the real experimental conditions. The spectra are the result of processing the simulated data with the method which was applied to the experimental data. The contribution of photon pairs from the resonance decay (selected with the help of labels of photons applied in the model) is shown by the solid line. The auxiliary factors KNorm of the backgrounds normalization (see below) are given in the figures.

Cheuk-Yin Wong [wongcyor@gmail.com](mailto:wongcyor@gmail.com)
31.12.2020 20:17

Кому: abraamyan Копия: Alexander Sorin; David Blaschke


Invariant mass distributions of $y \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (i)-(iii), at the energies of photons, $\mathrm{E} \gg 50 \mathrm{MeV}$, without (upper panel) and with (bottom panel) the background subtraction obtained for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The background is normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $22<\mathrm{Myy}<32 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c} 2$. The curve is the Gaussian approximation of experimental points in the interval $12 \div 32 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c} 2$. The main parameters of the Gaussian are shown in the figure. Normalization factor of the Gaussian (total number of pairs after the background subtraction), $\mathrm{A}=659.4 \pm 79.8$.


Different levels of selection for the opening angles of $\gamma \gamma \gamma$ pairs



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (i)-(iii), at the energies of photons, $\mathrm{E} \gg 50$ MeV , without (upper panel) and with (bottom panel) the background subtraction obtained for the reactions $d(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}, d(3.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{Cu}$ and $p(4.64 \mathrm{GeV})+\mathrm{C}$. The background is normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $22<\mathrm{Myy}<32 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.



## Required statistics

$$
\begin{gathered}
n_{\sigma}=\frac{N_{R}}{\Delta N_{R}}>3 \\
\Delta N_{R}=\sqrt{N_{\gamma \gamma}} \Rightarrow N_{\gamma \gamma}=n_{\sigma}^{2} / \tau^{2}
\end{gathered}
$$

where $\tau=N_{R} / N_{\gamma \gamma}$ ( $\approx$ the signal - to - background ratio). The statistics necessary for reliable extraction of the signal ( $n_{\sigma} \geq 5$ ),

$$
\begin{equation*}
N_{\gamma \gamma} \geq 25 / \tau^{2}\left(\text { at least }, N_{\gamma \gamma}>10 / \tau^{2}\right) \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

The luminosity of the internal deuteron beam with a momentum of 2.75 GeV/c per nucleon

The luminosity was estimated using the following formula:

$$
L=\frac{N_{\text {Inter. } / \mathrm{sec}}}{\sigma(d+C)}
$$

where

$$
N_{\text {Inter. } / \mathrm{sec}} \approx \frac{1}{6} \cdot 10^{9} \mathrm{int} . / \mathrm{sec}
$$

is the number of interactions per second,

$$
\sigma(d+C) \approx 500 \mathrm{mb}
$$

is the cross section of $d C$-interactions.
As a result, the luminosity can be estimated as:

$$
L \approx 3 \cdot 10^{32} \mathrm{~cm}^{-2} \cdot \mathrm{~s}^{-1} .
$$

# Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар $\gamma$-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 МэВ/с². 

## EPJ Web of Conferences 138, 04006 (2017)

## Different parts of the collected statistics

The purpose of this analysis is to show different appearances of the signal at low (for a given signal-to-background ratio) statistics. In particular, this allows to explain the lack of appearance of the signal in other experiments (TAPS, WA80) and make predictions for possible appearances of the signal in upcoming experiments.
To create conditions, in terms of statistics similar to those of the experiment on TAPS (see also our analysis of this experiment in [Phys. Rev. C 80, 034001 (2009)]), we divided the statistics recorded in the reaction $\mathrm{d}(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}$ into 19 parts. Each part was analysed separately, under the conditions shown in SI. 27. The spectrum in SI. 27 contains a total of 189864 selected ( $N Y=2$ ) events. The number of pairs after the background subtraction in the range of $300-420 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$ (in the vicinity of the resonance mass), is $2386 \pm 280$. Thus, the expected average number of pairs after the background subtraction in the above indicated range, for the each part is $126 \pm 64$, i.e. 2 standard deviations. In our experiment, each of these spectra is a result of $\sim 10^{11} \mathrm{~d}(2.0 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{n})+\mathrm{C}$ interactions. Some results of this analysis are shown below.

## Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар $\gamma$-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 МэВ/с².

EPJ Web of Conferences 138, 04006 (2017)



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs in the reaction $d(2 \mathrm{GeV} / n)+C \rightarrow \gamma+\gamma+X$ after the background subtraction, under the same conditions as in figure 3, for different parts of the statistics collected in this experiment. The auxiliary normalization factors KNorm are given in the figures.

From checks of the enhancement (signal from $\pi^{0}$ )


The two-dimensional distribution of the magnitude $\left(N_{\eta}-B\right) / N_{\gamma}$ on the invariant mass of the pairs and the energies of photons in the pair (showing NYY - B > 200).


■ 0.125-0.15 $\square 0.1-0.125$ ■ 0.075-0.1 $\square 0.05-0.075$ $\square 0.025-0.05$ ■ 0-0.025

The two-dimensional distribution of the magnitude $\left(N_{r \gamma}-B\right) / \sqrt{N_{r \gamma}}$ on the total energy of pairs and the opening angles of photons in the pair

21.09 .16


Результат влияния систематических ошибок при малых углах на установки СФЕРА. При $\cos \theta$ близком к единице возникает резкий провал, который проявляется при смешивании событий. Порог 50 MeB (левый рисунок), порог 200 MeB (правый рисунок)

## Schematic drawing of the location of the Electromagnetic Calorimeter on the BM@N setup



Schematic and general view of a single cell of the calorimeter


Effective mass distributions of photon pairs (pairs of clusters) in the reaction Kr (2.6 GeV / nucleon) + Sn


## The background estimation

To see a possible structure of the invariant mass spectra, a background should be subtracted.
The so-called event mixing method was used to estimate the combinatorial background: a photon in one event from the Right arm of the Calorimeter is combined with photon in other events from the same arm.
In the mixing are involved events in which there are two or more photons satisfying the criteria applied to clusters and to the pairs of clusters.

Invariant mass distribution of photon pairs (pairs of clusters) in the reaction $\mathrm{Kr}(2.6 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{nucleon})+\mathrm{Sn}$, under minimal selection conditions (shown in the figure). The top shaded histogram shows the background contribution. The background obtained using the event mixing method and normalized to the number of pairs in a range of masses 22-32 $\mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$. Bottom panel shows the ratio of number of pairs to the background.


Invariant mass distribution of photon pairs (pairs of clusters) in the reaction $\mathrm{C}(4 \mathrm{GeV} /$ nucleon $)+\mathrm{C}$ - results of Monte Carlo simulation (Model QGSM), for the distance of ECAL from the target 860 cm . The top shaded histogram shows the background contribution. The background obtained using the event mixing method and normalized to the total pair number. Bottom panel shows the ratio of number of pairs to the background.


Отношение энергии в центральном (с максимальной энергией) модуле на вторую по величине энергию в модулях. Квадратиками обозначены экспериментальные данные, кружочками представлены данные, полученные с помощью моделирования методом Monte Carlo. Нормировка по полному числу $\psi$-квантов.


## Энергетическое распределение фотонов



## Charged particles contribution



Charged particles contribution after background subtraction


The mean number of detected photons in an event, recorded in different intervals of accelerator cycle, with a minimum energy of photons, Epmin $=50 \mathrm{MeV}$ (left) and Epmin $=100 \mathrm{MeV}$ (right).


Dependence of the linearity coefficient of the $\gamma$-spectrometer on the energies of electrons and $\gamma$-quanta (from the paper: Kh. U. Abraamyan et al., Prib. Tekh. Eksp. 1, 57 (1989)
[Instruments and Experimental Techniques 32, 58 (1989)).


Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria: E$\rangle>40 \mathrm{MeV}, \mathrm{E}_{12}>250 \mathrm{MeV}$, after the background subtraction obtained for the $d+C, d+C u$ and $p+C$ reactions at different levels of cutoff in the opening angles of photons The backgrounds are normalized by the numbers of pairs in the range $(22,32) \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.



## The results of approximation of the spectra of invariant masses of photon pairs after subtraction of the background, by the Gaussian function, at different levels of cutoff in the opening angle of photons

| ©yy $>6.5^{\circ}$ |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| - Parameters |  | $\checkmark$ |  |
|  |  | Value | Standard Error |
| Dn | y0 | 0 | 0 |
|  | XC | 15.59316 | 0.3408 |
|  | w | 4.01606 | 0.39028 |
|  | A | 1022.73161 | 135.81183 |
|  | sigma | 2.00803 |  |
|  | FWHM | 4.72855 |  |
|  | Height | 203.18954 |  |

Reduced Chi-sqr $=3.00817607017$
$\operatorname{COD}\left(R^{\wedge} 2\right)=0.76212045150244$
Iterations Performed $=12$
Total Iterations in Session $=12$
Fit converged - tolerance criterion satisfied.
Some parameter values were foxed.
sigma, FWHM, Height are derived parameter(s).



Reduced Chi-sqr $=1.05369599059$
$\operatorname{COD}\left(R^{\wedge} 2\right)=0.88059854822854$
Iterations Performed $=8$
Total Iterations in Session $=8$
Fit converged - tolerance criterion satis fied.
Some parameter values were foxed.
sigma, FWHM, Height are derived parameter(s).
Statistics
$\pm$



Reduced Chi-sqr $=1.15923520492$
$\operatorname{COD}\left(R^{\wedge} 2\right)=0.85612455701405$
Iterations Performed $=12$
Total Iterations in Session $=12$
Fit converged - tolerance criterion satisfied.
Some parameter values were foxed.
sigma, FWHM, Height are derived parameter(s),


## The basic parameters of the lead glass hodoscope

| Number of lead glasses | $32 \mathrm{TF}-1$, total weight 1422 kg |
| :--- | :--- |
| Module cross section | $\mathrm{r}=9 \mathrm{~cm}$ of insert circumference |
| Module length | $35 \mathrm{~cm}, 14$ R.L. |
| Spatial resolution | 3.2 cm |
| Angular resolution | 0.6 |
| Energy resolution | $(3.9 / p E+0.4) \%, E[\mathrm{GeV}]$ |
| Gain stability | $(1-2) \%$ |
| Dynamic range | $50 \mathrm{MeV}-6 \mathrm{GeV}$ |
| Minimum ionizing signal | $382 \pm 4 \mathrm{MeV}$ of the photon equivalent |
| Total area | 0.848 m 2 |

Numbers of detected photons in the Right arm of the $\gamma$-spectrometer at a minimal energy of photons of 50 MeV (left figure) and 150 MeV (right figure)


Distributions of calculated value of $\Delta M \gamma y$ for photon pairs selected from the Right arm of the $\gamma$-spectrometer, under the Criteria $(A)$, for the vicinity of the $\mathrm{E}(38)$ mass: $36<M y \gamma<40 \mathrm{MeV} / c 2$, at $\Delta \Theta=0$ (left figure) and at the maximum value of $\Delta \Theta=0.9 \circ$ (right figure).



Распределение по инвариантной массе пар $ү \gamma$ от распада $\pi 0$ мезонов, промоделированных с учетом реальных условий эксперимента в реакции $C+C \rightarrow \pi 0+x$ при импульсе 4.5 ГэВ/с на нуклон. Сплошная гистограмма - спектр при отсутствии наложений (исключены при помощи меток, примененных в модели), пунктирная гистограмма - полный спектр с учетом наложений. Нормировка спектров по полному числу пар $ү \gamma$


Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар $\psi$-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около $360 \mathrm{M} \mathrm{B} / \mathrm{c}^{2}$.
Eur. Phys. J. A (2016) 52: 259.


The invariant-mass distribution of $\gamma\rangle$ pairs from the $d+C$ reaction after the background subtraction. Both experimental ( $\bullet$ ) and simulated points are obtained under the same conditions.

Проверка резонансной структуры при инвариантной массе пар $\psi$-квантов и пар $\pi^{\circ}$-мезонов около 360 МэВ/c². Eur. Phys. J. A (2016) 52: 259.



The Invariant-mass distributions of $\pi^{\circ} \pi^{\circ}$ pairs without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction for the reactions $\mathrm{d}+\mathrm{C}$ at $2.75 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon (left figure) and $\mathrm{p}+\mathrm{C}$ at $5.5 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ (right figure). The backgrounds are normalized to pair numbers in the interval: $450<\mathrm{M} \pi \pi<550 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c} 2$.

Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma\rangle$ pairs without (left figure) and with (right figure) the background subtraction in the reaction $d(5.5 \mathrm{Gev} / \mathrm{c})+\mathrm{C}$, at minimal cuts: $\mathrm{E} \gamma \geq 50 \mathrm{MeV}$.


Проверка структуры при инвариантной массе пар ү-квантов 38 МэВ/с². EPJ Web of Conferences 204, 08004 (2019)



Invariant mass distributions of $\gamma \gamma$ pairs satisfying criteria (i)-(iii) (criteria (A)) without (upper panels) and with (bottom panels) the background subtraction obtained for the reaction $d+\mathrm{Cu}!\gamma+\gamma+X$ at $3.83 \mathrm{GeV} / \mathrm{c}$ per nucleon. The top shaded histograms show the background contribution. The background is normalized to the total pair number (left) and to the number of pairs in a range of masses $50-70 \mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c2}$ (right). The curve is the Gaussian approximation of the experimental points in the range (14; 70 ) $\mathrm{MeV} / \mathrm{c} 2$

## Optimal conditions for X17

In order to study the region of small invariant masses, we processed the data obtained in groups not participating in the trigger launch (thanks to the logical addition (see (1), previous slide), there are such groups in each event). To collect sufficient statistics, we processed the data obtained in several experiments.
(i) the number of detected photons in the group, $N \nu=2$;
(ii) the minimal energy of photons, $E \gamma M i n=40 \mathrm{MeV}$;
(iii) the sum of the energies of photons in a pair, E12 > 250 MeV (effective
detection of pairs at the setup geometry);
(iv) the ratio of the energies $E \gamma 1 / E \gamma 2<0.4$ (suppresses systematic errors due to violation of the energy-momentum conservation laws at the event mixing);
(v) the opening angles of photons in a pair, $\Theta_{\gamma \gamma}>70$.

