// Nathan Killoran

## XANADU

Better than classical? The subtle art of benchmarking quantum ML models

QTML, November 2023

#### // Credits

## Xanadu's quantum machine learning team



Dr Maria Schuld QML Team lead Dr Richard East Researcher Dr Joseph Bowles Researcher **Dr David Wakeham** Researcher **Dr Shahnawaz Ahmed** Researcher



Dr Nathan Killoran CTO Software Dr Chae-Yeun Park Researcher Dr David Wierichs Researcher Dr Korbinian Kottmann Researcher

## We're hiring!

// The QML team objective

Make quantum computers useful for machine learning



## **Progress in quantum machine learning**

Pre-NISQ: Fault-tol. subroutines



Outsource parts of the computation to a quantum computer

### NISQ era: Variational circuits



Use a model that is intrinsically quantum

#### // The QML team objective

## Make quantum computers useful for machine learning

For this to happen we need to change some things in our approach to research







#### // Checking the compass: Model design

"We use an ansatz of Pauli gates and entanglers..."



Our circuit designs should be motivated better.

#### // Checking the compass: Model design

"Quantum models generalise/train better/worse..."



### We don't know if our theory targets relevant questions.

#### // Checking the compass: Performance

"We prove an exponential speedup for QML..."



Our performance measures are not meaningful for (mainstream) ML.

#### // Checking the compass: Performance

## "Our quantum model does better on MNIST..."



Our experiments do not probe the right regimes yet.

## The subtle art of benchmarking

[Note: work in progress!]

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?

#### **Model selection**

- Arxiv papers >2018 with keywords "classif", "learn", "supervised", "MNIST" [3500 papers]
- >=30 Google Scholar citations
   [561 papers]
- New NISQ quantum model for classification on conventional classical data [29 papers]
- In random subset of 15 papers
- Found implementable [11 papers]

 $\rightarrow$  Coded up 12 models

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	ç
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	ā
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



#### DataReuploadingClassifier

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	£
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	α
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	) IV

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



#### DressedQuantumCircuitClassifier

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	c
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	2
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	k
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



IQPVariationalClassifier

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	¢
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	Kerr
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	le
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	ç
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	Conv

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



#### QuantumMetricLearner

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	6
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	)Keri
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	hel
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	QC
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	onv

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



#### CircuitCentricClassifier

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	6
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	VKeri
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	hel
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	Q
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	Conv

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



IQPKernelClassifier

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	6
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	ġ
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	£
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



QuantumKitchenSinks

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	Q
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	£
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	Keri
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	le
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	n n

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



	Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
	Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
	*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
	Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	QN
	Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
	[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
	[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
	*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	ຄ
	Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	Kerr
	Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	lel
1		
	Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	QC
	Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	VUC

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



#### QuanvolutionalNeuralNetwork

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	QZ
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1	Q
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	0010

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?



WeiNet

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3 Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2 *Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2 Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622 Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1 [Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2] [Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	QNN
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2 Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2 Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	QKernel
Henderson et al. "Quanvolutional neural networks: powering image recognition" 1904.04767v1 Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	QConv

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?

#### Tasks

- Binary classification
- Figure of merit: accuracy
- 4 datasets of variable dimension:

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?

#### Tasks

- Binary classification
- Figure of merit: accuracy
- 4 datasets of variable dimension:
  - **SIMPLE:** Linearly separated points in hypercube





## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?

#### Tasks

- **Binary classification** •
- Figure of merit: accuracy .
- 4 datasets of variable dimension:
  - **SIMPLE:** Linearly separated points • in hypercube
  - WIDELY USED: Pre-processed MNIST



-10

10

20

## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?

#### Tasks

- Binary classification
- Figure of merit: accuracy
- 4 datasets of variable dimension:
  - **SIMPLE:** Linearly separated points in hypercube
  - WIDELY USED: Pre-processed MNIST
  - [**REALISTIC:** Low-dimensional manifolds (Goldt 2019, Buchanan 2020)]
  - [TAILORMADE: Multi-dimensional Fourier series]



https://www.nature.com/articles/s41467-020-14578-5



## What is the best benchmark design we can come up with?

#### **Crucial decisions**

- Faithful implementation We carefully deduced the model design and training procedure from the paper
- Convergence criteria We compare averages over 2 loss intervals
- Batches in SGD We didn't optimize this hyperparameter, but adapted it to runtime needs
- Data preprocessing We always prescaled data to a meaningful interval (like [0, 2pi])
- Hyperparameter optimisation grid We balanced choices from paper, common sense and runtime considerations
- Classical comparison We pick matching box classical models with typical sizes: NN, SVM, CNN



## Hyperparameters matter





number of features

Test score range on PCA-reduced+subs. MNIST

Test score range on coarse-grained MNIST over all hyperparameters



## Out-of-the box classical models are not easily beaten



## Separable circuits perform the same

This is (more or less) the basic circuit we replace all quantum circuits with!





## What "features" do our quantum models create?

Example for input  $x = [x_{\gamma}, x_2]$ 



## What "features" do our quantum models create?

Example for input  $x = [x_{1}, x_{2}]$ 



## What "features" do our quantum models create?

Example for input  $x = [x_{\eta}, x_2]$ 

linear + trigonometric
sin(vx+b<sub>1</sub>)sin(wx+b<sub>2</sub>)

 $\frac{\sin(\mathbf{vx}+\mathbf{b}_{1})\cos(\mathbf{wx}+\mathbf{b}_{2})}{\cos(\mathbf{vx}+\mathbf{b}_{1})\sin(\mathbf{wx}+\mathbf{b}_{2})}$  $\cos(\mathbf{vx}+\mathbf{b}_{1})\cos(\mathbf{wx}+\mathbf{b}_{2})$ 

Pérez-Salinas et al. "Data re-uploading for a universal quantum classifier." 1907.02085v3	
Mari et al. "Transfer learning in hybrid classical-quantum neural networks." 1912.08278v2	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	
Lloyd et al. "Quantum embeddings for machine learning." 2001.03622	QN
Schuld et al. "Circuit-centric quantum classifiers." 1804.00633v1	Z
[Zhang et al. "Toward trainability of quantum neural networks." 2011.06258v2]	
[Zoufal et al. "Variational quantum Boltzmann machines." 2006.06004v1]	
*Havlíček et al. "Supervised learning with quantum-enhanced feature spaces." 1804.11326v2	ç
Wilson et al. "Quantum kitchen sinks: An algorithm for ML on near-term" 1806.08321v2	Nell
Huang et al. "Power of data in quantum machine learning." 2011.01938v2	ā
Hondorson et al. "Quanyolutional neural networks: neworing image recognition" 1004.04767v1	_
Wei "A quantum convolutional neural network on NISQ devices." 2104.06918v3	

## What "features" do our quantum models create?

Example for input  $x = [x_{\eta}, x_{2}]$ 

NN + trigonometric



## What "features" do our quantum models create?

Example for input  $x = [x_{\gamma}, x_2]$ 



## What "features" do our quantum models create?

Example for input  $x = [x_{\gamma}, x_2]$ 



## Separable circuits perform the same



## Are we "just" building trigonometric/polynomial feature extractors?



https://playground.tensorflow.org/

## Here comes the SU(N): multivariate quantum gates and gradients

Roeland Wiersema,<sup>1,2</sup> Dylan Lewis,<sup>3</sup> David Wierichs,<sup>4</sup> Juan Carrasquilla,<sup>1,2</sup> and Nathan Killoran<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Vector Institute, MaRS Centre, Toronto, Ontario, M5G 1M1, Canada <sup>2</sup>Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Waterloo, Ontario, N2L 3G1, Canada <sup>3</sup>Department of Physics and Astronomy, University College London, London WC1E 6BT, United Kingdom <sup>4</sup>Xanadu, Toronto, ON, M5G 2C8, Canada



21 Nov 2023, 16:45

# Thank you 🛞 XANADU

We're hiring!

**xanadu.ai** Twitter/X: @XanaduAI

Copyright © 2023 Xanadu Quantum Technologies Inc. | Strictly Confidential

