#### **CEC/IC**

29th International Cryogenic Engineering Conference International Cryogenic Materials Conference 2024 July 22-26, 2024, Geneva, Switzerland





Technology



FACULTÉ DES SCIENCES

Research and

**Swiss National** 

**Science Foundation** 

## **Advancing Superconductor Technology for High Field Applications: Current State and Emerging Trends**

#### **Carmine SENATORE**

Department of Quantum Matter Physics, University of Geneva, Switzerland Department of Nuclear and Particle Physics, University of Geneva, Switzerland

With special thanks to Amalia Ballarino, Bernardo Bordini, Luca Bottura and Thierry Boutboul (CERN) for the exciting collaborations in view of future colliders, to Davide Nardelli (Bruker) and Davide Uglietti (EPFL) for the very instructive exchanges and to my great team at UNIGE, Romain Babouche, Marco Bonura, Gianmarco Bovone, Florin Buta, Pablo Cayado, Francesco Lonardo, Celia Lucas and Damien Zurmuehle

## Outline

- What we do today and aim to achieve in the near future with superconductors
  - Focus on high magnetic field applications
- Which future for Low Temperature Superconductors (LTS) ?
  - Towards the <u>ultimate performance of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn</u> for a Future Circular Collider
- Which future for High Temperature Superconductors (HTS) ?
  - The technology-pull towards <u>magnetic fields beyond the reach of LTS</u> and the opportunity for <u>higher operating temperatures</u>
- Conclusions

## Outline

- What we do today and aim to achieve in the near future with superconductors
  - Focus on high magnetic field applications
- Which future for Low Temperature Superconductors (LTS) ?
  - Towards the <u>ultimate performance of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn</u> for a Future Circular Collider
- Which future for High Temperature Superconductors (HTS) ?
  - The technology-pull towards <u>magnetic fields beyond the reach of LTS</u> and the opportunity for <u>higher operating temperatures</u>
- Conclusions

#### Field-temperature phase diagram of technical superconductors



#### High field applications of <u>Low Temperature Superconductors</u> Field-temperature phase diagram of technical superconductors



#### High field applications of <u>High Temperature Superconductors</u> Field-temperature phase diagram of technical superconductors



#### **The application's pull towards higher magnetic fields** Field-temperature phase diagram of technical superconductors



#### **The call for High Field Magnets from High Energy Physics** Targets for a future 100 TeV hadron collider

Next-generation Energy-Frontier Particle Accelerators are intended to collide particles at energies of ~10 TeV pCM (parton center-of-mass energy), corresponding to proton-proton collisions in the 100 TeV range.



- The baseline of the FCC study is a 91 km-ring
- 14+ T-dipoles based on Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn would give 85-90 TeV
- 20 T-dipoles based on HTS would give ~120 TeV



parameter	FCC-hh	
collision energy cms [TeV]	85 - 120	
dipole field [T]	14 (Nb <sub>3</sub> Sn) – 20 (HTS)	
circumference [km]	90.7	
arc length [km]	76.9	
beam current [A]	0.5	
bunch intensity [10 <sup>11</sup> ]	1	
bunch spacing [ns]	25	
synchr. rad. power / ring [kW]	1020 - 4250	
SR power / length [W/m/ap.]	13 - 54	
long. emit. damping time [h]	0.77 – 0.26	
peak luminosity [10 <sup>34</sup> cm <sup>-2</sup> s <sup>-1</sup> ]	~30	
events/bunch crossing	~1000	
stored energy/beam [GJ]	6.1 - 8.9	
Integrated luminosity/main IP [fb <sup>-1</sup> ]	20000	

Adapted from <u>M. Benedikt, FCC Week 2024</u>

#### The call for High Field Magnets from High Energy Physics The concept for a high-energy muon collider





An entire zoo of superconducting magnets is needed for capturing pions, cooling muons and for the acceleration and collision rings



Muons are cooled through interaction with light matter and subsequent acceleration by RF cavities. Solenoids of 40 T to 60 T with a bore of 50 mm, only achievable with HTS, are required to meet the specification on the transverse emittance

According to the last P5 report, a 10 TeV muon collider is considered as an option for bringing energy frontier colliders back to US
Report of the 2023 Particle Physics Project Prioritization Panel
https://doi.org/10.2172/2368847

#### The call for High Field Magnets from Fusion Towards high-gain small-size fusion reactors



**HTS** are making possible new designs of compact fusion reactors because of two technical advantages with respect to LTS

- 1. Higher critical fields, as the fusion power density in a tokamak is proportional to B<sup>4</sup>
- 2. The possibility to operate at higher temperatures, > 4 K, with a large margin that would allow withstanding the neutron heating and lower the cryogenic costs

Two examples: Commonwealth Fusion Systems and Tokamak Energy are both developing magnets for plasma confinement with peak fields at 20 T on the superconductor and operation in the 20 K range

## **Energy from Fusion: an emerging industrial business**



#### **Compact fusion Start-ups in China** Growing competitors in the race to fusion power



**Test of HH70 at Energy Singularity in June 2024** 

Company	Founded in	Technology	Fund rising	
ENN	2019	Spherical Tokamak	120 M€	
Startorus	2021	Spherical Tokamak	n/a	
Energy Singularity	2021	Compact Tokamak	100 M€	
Neo Fusion	2023	N/A	640 M€	

**ENN's Spherical Tokamak device EXL-50** 

#### **The call from High Field Science** Superconducting magnets for sustainable user facilities

High Magnetic Field Laboratories have as a goal to develop all-superconducting user magnets in the 40 T range. These magnets are intended to replace the current resistive ones, leading to a significantly lower energy consumption and to new scientific possibilities



I. Dixon, <u>IMCC Annual Meeting 2022</u> K. Amm, <u>FCC Week 2024</u>



#### A common strategy towards 40 T

- REBCO high field insert
- commercial LTS outsert 12-15 T

F. Debray, <u>HiTAT Workshop 2023</u>

#### The call for higher resolution in NMR spectroscopy A commercial application of ultra-high fields

Higher fields in NMR magnets lead to

- better resolution, i.e. better peak separation in the NMR spectra
- better signal to noise ratio



```
REBCO is the enabling technology for NMR
magnets up to 28.2 T (HTS/LTS hybrid, 2.2 K)
proton resonance frequency of 1.2 GHz
```

```
Next target is 1.3 GHz, 30.5 T
```

REBCO enables also NMR systems with reduced footprint compared to all LTS solutions



P. Vonlanthen, ASC 2022

# Outline

• What we do today and aim to achieve in the near future with superconductors

- Focus on high magnetic field applications
- Which future for Low Temperature Superconductors (LTS) ?
  - Towards the <u>ultimate performance of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn</u> for a Future Circular Collider
- Which future for High Temperature Superconductors (HTS) ?
  - The technology-pull towards <u>magnetic fields beyond the reach of LTS</u> and the opportunity for <u>higher operating temperatures</u>
- Conclusions

#### Industrial fabrication of multifilamentary Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn wires Three technologies developed at industrial scale



**Bronze Process** Sn source: Cu-Sn alloy Low Critical Current Density (J<sub>c</sub>) Limited by the solubility of Sn in Cu

**Presently produced by** 



FURUKAWA



Internal Sn Diffusion Process

Sn source: metallic Sn

**High Critical Current Density (J**<sub>c</sub>**)** 



Powder-In-Tube (PIT) method

Sn source: NbSn<sub>2</sub> and Sn powders

LUVATA



Western Superconducting Technologies Co.,Ltd.

Used for NMR spectrometers, ITER magnets, HL-LHC magnets, laboratory magnets

## The experience of HL-LHC on Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn accelerator magnets **(**

- HL-LHC represent the first experience with a production of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn-based accelerator magnets
- More than 150 coils built at CERN and in the US
- The scaling of the MQXF quadrupole up to 7 m-long prototypes was successful
- Magnets are working also at 4.5 K





Section of a Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn dipole magnet





https://home.cern/news/news/accelerators/hilumi-news-72m-long-niobium-tin-quadrupole-magnet-manufactured-cern

#### Towards the ultimate performance of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn for the FCC-hh Dipoles at B = 16 T based on Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn with a non-Cu J<sub>c</sub>(4.2K, 16 T) = 1'500 A/mm<sup>2</sup>



 $A_{coil} \propto SC mass \propto$ 

J. Parrell et al., AIP Conf. Proc. <u>711</u> (2004) 369 T. Boutboul et al., IEEE TASC 19 (2009) 2564 DOI: <u>10.1063/1.1774590</u> DOI: <u>10.1109/TASC.2009.2019017</u>

#### Strategies to increase the critical current density of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn The Internal Oxidation method - Critical current density $\propto 1/(grain size)$



Idea from Benz (1968) of an Internal Oxidation to form fine precipitates in Nb to impede the Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn grain growth Benz, Trans. Metall. Soc. AIME, <u>242</u> (1968) 1067-1070

Use of a Nb-alloy containing Zr or Hf: Zr and Hf have stronger affinity to oxygen than Nb

Oxygen supply added to the composite: oxidation of Zr (Hf) and formation of nano- $ZrO_2$  (HfO<sub>2</sub>)



The Ohio State University

The first evidence of average grain size reduced down to ~ 50 nm (vs ~ 100 nm in regular wires) X. Xu et al., APL <u>104</u> (2014) 082602 DOI: <u>10.1063/1.4866865</u> X. Xu et al., Adv. Mat. 27 (2015) 1346 DOI: 10.1002/adma.201404335

J. Parrell et al., AIP Conf. Proc. <u>711</u> (2004) 369 T. Boutboul et al., IEEE TASC <u>19</u> (2009) 2564 DOI: <u>10.1063/1.1774590</u> DOI: <u>10.1109/TASC.2009.2019017</u>

#### Strategies to increase the critical current density of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn The Internal Oxidation method - Critical current density $\propto 1/(\text{grain size})$



Idea from Benz (1968) of an Internal Oxidation to form fine precipitates in Nb to impede the Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn grain growth Benz, Trans. Metall. Soc. AIME, <u>242</u> (1968) 1067-1070

Use of a Nb-alloy containing Zr or Hf: Zr and Hf have stronger affinity to oxygen than Nb

Oxygen supply added to the composite: oxidation of Zr (Hf) and formation of nano- $ZrO_2$  (HfO<sub>2</sub>)





The Ohio State University

 The first evidence of average grain size reduced

 down to ~ 50 nm (vs ~ 100 nm in regular wires)

 X. Xu et al., APL 104 (2014) 082602

 DOI: 10.1063/1.4866865

 X. Xu et al., Adv. Mat. 27 (2015) 1346





#### HT: 550°C x 100h + 650°C x 200h

## Internal Oxidation of test-bed Internal Sn subelements

#### 12-filament wires with an internal Sn source

w/o oxygen source

SnO<sub>2</sub> Core

SnO<sub>2</sub> Annular



Internal oxidation leads to a refinement of the grain size from ~100 nm to ~50 nm regardless of the oxygen source configuration G. Bovone *et al.*, Supercond. Sci. Tech. <u>36</u> (2023) 095018

DOI: <u>10.1088/1361-6668/aced25</u>



Layer J<sub>c</sub> determined from transport measurements

FCC layer  $J_c$  (4.2K,16T) = 2'500 A/mm<sup>2</sup> considering 60% of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn in the non-Cu area

G. Bovone et al., Supercond. Sci. Tech. 36 (2023) 095018 DOI: 10.1088/1361-6668/aced25

R(B) tests performed up to 33 T at LNCMI-Grenoble confirm that the record high  $B_{c2}$  values are achieved both with Hf and Zr

Nb-Ta-Hf

Nb-Ta-Zr

#### **Towards the development of multifilamentary wires** From test-bed subelements to prototype wires with Internal Oxidation



**Increasing the non-Cu J**<sub>c</sub> beyond state of the art is a necessary condition to get 16 T dipoles, but it is **not sufficient** 

**Other crucial conductor requirements:** 

• Have high tolerance to stress

- Be safe in case of magnet quench
- Have low magnetization
- Have a low price...

#### **Stress management is key for Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn-based accelerator magnets**



**Electromagnetic forces in an accelerator magnet** 

- The azimuthal component accumulates at the midplane of the coil, with a magnitude of many hundreds kN/m
- The radial component pushes the coil outwards with a maximum displacement localized again at the midplane
- The longitudinal component tends to elongate the coil

The combination of these forces with the pre-compression and the thermomechanical effects exposes the brittle and strain sensitive Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn to the risk of degradation

All design options developed for the 16 T dipoles for a future 100 TeV collider share a peak stress in the range of 150-200 MPa at operation, with the main component in the transverse direction of the Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn Rutherford cables



**Irreversible reduction of the critical current after unload** Mechanisms responsible for the performance degradation

Two mechanisms govern the permanent reduction of the critical current

• Formation of cracks in the Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn filaments

Cracks generate <u>a reduction of the current carrying cross</u> <u>section</u>  $\Rightarrow I_c^{unload}/I_{c0}$  is independent of the magnetic field

 Plastic deformation of the Cu matrix and residual stress on the Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn filaments

Residual stress induces <u>a permanent reduction of  $B_{c2}$  after</u> unload  $\Rightarrow I_c^{unload}/I_{c0}$  depends on of the magnetic field





#### **Tolerance to transverse stress of a single wire** Electromechanical tests on Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn wires impregnated with epoxy



The irreversible limit is defined at the force level leading to a 95% recovery of the initial I<sub>c</sub> after unload Here the irreversible stress limit is  $\sigma_{irr}$  (B=19T)= 155 MPa (force dived by groove area)

## **Comparison of B**<sub>c2</sub> **under load** and <u>after unload</u>

 $\Delta B_{c2}^{unload} \approx 0.5 T$ 

CS et al., Supercond. Sci. Technol., 36 (2023) 075001

DOI: 10.1088/1361-6668/acca50



The observed permanent degradation of I<sub>c</sub> after unload originates After unload from  $\sigma = 240$  MPa mainly from the residual stress

> The effect of cracks seems negligible up to very high transverse stress values

#### X-ray tomography and Machine Learning for crack detection An independent confirmation of the conclusions



- X-ray photon energy = 80 keV
- 360° rotation of the sample
- 10'000 projections
- 2560 x 2160 pixels
- 0.57 μm/pixel resolution



Marta MAJKUT Alexander RACK



A novel, non-destructive and non-invasive method to investigate the internal structure of high-performance Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn wires combines X-ray microtomography with machine-learning algorithms

T. Bagni et al., Sci. Reports 11 (2021) 7767 DOI: 10.1038/s41598-021-87475-6

#### X-ray tomography and Neural Networks for crack detection An independent confirmation of the conclusions



An analysis based on Convolutional Neural Networks was performed on the tomographic scan of the exact same sample used for the I<sub>c</sub> vs  $\sigma$  test, after unload from 240 MPa

Very few cracks were detected, none of them interrupting the subelements and responsible for the measured degradation by 15% of  $I_c$ 

T. Bagni et al., Supercond. Sci. Technol., 35 (2022) 104003 DOI: 10.1088/1361-6668/ac86ac

# Outline

- What we do today and aim to achieve in the near future with superconductors
  - Focus on high magnetic field applications
- Which future for Low Temperature Superconductors (LTS) ?
  - Towards the <u>ultimate performance of Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn</u> for a Future Circular Collider
- Which future for High Temperature Superconductors (HTS) ?
  - The technology-pull towards <u>magnetic fields beyond the reach of LTS</u> and the opportunity for <u>higher operating temperatures</u>
- Conclusions

## Industrial fabrication of REBCO coated conductors

 $REBa_2Cu_3O_{7-\delta}$ , RE = Y, Gd, Eu, Nd, Sm, Yb, ...



## **Fusion-driven expansion of REBCO production capacity**

(2028)

 $1200 \text{ km}_{12}/\text{yr}$ 

(2026)

A Furukawa Company

 $\rightarrow$ 



#### **Tailoring the critical current density of REBCO** Anisotropy, Intrinsic and Artificial defects and their Dimensionality

Intrinsic defects, e.g. point defects (0D), grain boundaries (2D), stacking faults (3D), are native pinning centers

Tailored artificial defects, e.g. nanocolumns (1D) and nanoparticles (3D), can be introduced to reduce anisotropy and enhance performance



BaZrO<sub>3</sub> (BZO) and BaHfO<sub>3</sub> (BHO) precipitate in the form of nanocolumns oriented along the c-axis of REBCO



J. Driscoll *et al.*, Nat. Mat. <u>3</u> (2004) 439 DOI: <u>10.1038/nmat1156</u> A. Goyal *et al.*, SUST <u>18</u> (2005) 1533 DOI: <u>10.1088/0953-2048/18/11/021</u>

# The approach varies from one manufacturer to the others

'|' | | | ||'

point defects

grain boundaries

stacking faults

nanoparticles



V. Selvamanickam *et al.*, IEEE TAS <u>21</u> (2011) 3049 – DOI: <u>10.1109/TASC.2011.2107310</u>



## **Angular dependence of I<sub>c</sub>: very fresh results**



UNIVERSITÉ DE GENÈVE

#### **High in-field J**<sub>c</sub> is not sufficient for UHF magnets A short note on the mechanical properties



- REBCO tapes are inherently prone to delamination
- Adhesion between layers seems to be process dependent
- A standardized process to determine the properties of the tapes is missing

H. Maeda, and Y. Yanagisawa, IEEE Trans. Appl. Supercond., 24 (2014) 4602412 DOI: <u>10.1109/TASC.2013.2287707</u>

#### **High in-field J**<sub>c</sub> is not sufficient for UHF magnets Screening Currents, Field Quality and Conductor Degradation



• Local Lorentz force due to the screening currents can be source of delamination force

### Some lessons learned from REBCO magnet R&D

## The No-Insulation (NI) winding technique of REBCO coils

A new paradigm with advantages and drawbacks



**Compact winding** → very high current density in the winding

Self-protecting → turn-to-turn bypass of quench current (in principle) Superconducting coil Defect-tolerant → turn-to-turn bypass

of current in case of local I<sub>c</sub> drop



S. Hahn et al., *IEEE Trans. Appl. Supercond.*, <u>21 (2011)</u> 1592 DOI: <u>10.1109/TASC.2010.2093492</u>

U. Bong et al., Supercond. Sci. Technol. <u>34</u> (2021) 085003 DOI: <u>10.1088/1361-6668/ac0759</u>

A major drawback comes from the charging delays, which can be mitigated by Partial/Metal/Smart Insulation

**Other known drawbacks: unbalanced forces, induced overstresses** 

#### Lesson learned from REBCO magnet R&D Post-mortem analysis of REBCO tapes from ultra-high field test coils at MAGLAB

Three non-insulated Little Big Coils (35 mm OD, 14 mm ID and 50 mm length) tested in the 37 mm diameter cryostat of the 31 T Bitter magnet at NHMFL





Calculated hoop stress distribution without screening currents

Calculated hoop stress distribution with screening currents

Conductor plastic deformation occurs at nominal JBR stress levels below the yield stress of Hastelloy, ~1 GPa @ 4 K

X. Hu *et al.,* SuST <u>33</u> (2020) 095012 DOI: <u>10.1088/1361-6668/aba79d</u>

#### **Lesson learned from REBCO magnet R&D** Post-mortem analysis of REBCO tapes from ultra-high field test coils at MAGLAB

Three no-insulation Little Big Coils (35 mm OD, 14 mm ID and 50 mm length) tested in the 37 mm diameter cryostat of the 31 T Bitter magnet at NHMFL



Magnetization maps of tapes extracted from LBC2 with evident signs of degradation

X. Hu *et al.*, SuST <u>33</u> (2020) 095012 DOI: 10.1088/1361-6668/aba79d

#### Lesson learned from REBCO magnet R&D The quench test of the 20 T/ 20 K no-insulation SPARC Toroidal Field Model Coil



### **From REBCO tapes to REBCO-based dipole magnets**



### Some considerations on price: Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn vs REBCO



Price (arbitrary units) per unit length and current for Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn and HTS (mainly REBCO), based on CERN orders and requests

The normalization is done for B = 12 T (// c-axis for REBCO) and T = 4.2 K

## Conclusions

- LTS currently dominate the superconductor market, driven by MRI, NMR spectroscopy, and large-scale scientific projects. Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn continues to lead in high-field applications.
- Efforts to achieve compact accelerator dipoles with B > 14 T for the Future Circular Collider are pushing Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn to its ultimate performance.
- Internal oxidation has emerged as a practical solution to enhance J<sub>c</sub>, with ongoing development to implement this technology in industrial wires. But the improved transport properties must be accompanied by mechanical robustness.
- The FCC would require a significant procurement of advanced Nb<sub>3</sub>Sn wire (approximately 10'000 tons) and is the primary driver of this development. Who else could benefit from this advancement?
- HTS has the potential for higher operating fields and/or higher operating temperatures.
- **REBCO** is becoming available at affordable prices from multiple sources, driven by private fusion programs.
- There is still much to learn about using REBCO in magnets. Challenges include tape geometry, intrinsic anisotropy, layered structure, and large filament size.
- No major roadblocks have emerged so far, but there is still a long way to close the technology gap with LTS magnets. If we maintain momentum, breakthroughs will come.



29th International Cryogenic Engineering Conference International Cryogenic Materials Conference 2024 July 22-26, 2024, Geneva, Switzerland









FACULTÉ DES SCIENCES

Research and Technology

> Swiss National Science Foundation



## Thank you for the attention !

Carmine SENATORE carmine.senatore@unige.ch http://supra.unige.ch

Acknowledgments: This work was done under the auspices of CHART (Swiss Accelerator Research and Technology Collaboration, <u>https://chart.ch</u>). Financial support was provided by the Swiss National Science Foundation (Grant No. 200021\_184940) and by the European Organization for Nuclear Research (CERN), Memorandum of Understanding for the FCC Study, Addendum FCC-GOV-CC-0175 (KE 4663/ATS). This work was also funded by the European Union's Horizon 2020 Research and Innovation programme under Grant Agreement No 951714 (SuperEMFL) and by the European Union's Horizon Europe Research Infrastructures programme under Grant Agreement No 101094300 (MuCol).