





Office of Science

# Transport coefficients of transient hydrodynamics for the HRG and thermal-mass quasiparticle models

Gabriel Soares Rocha (gabriel.soares.rocha@vanderbilt.edu) based on arXiv:2402.06996 with G. S. Denicol The 39th Winter Workshop on Nuclear Dynamics – Jackson Hole, WY, USA February 16th, 2024

# Introduction

- With ultra-relativistic Heavy Ion Collisions, nuclear matter in extreme conditions can be studied; Heinz, Snellings Annu. Rev. Nucl. Part. Sci. 63 (2013) 123-151 Gale, Jeon, Schenke Int. J. of Mod. Phys. A, Vol. 28, 1340011 (2013)
- QCD at zero baryon chemical potential: crossover between hadron and Aoki et al. Nature, 443:675–678 (2006) 50 yrs of QCD paper EPJ C 83 (2023) 1125 Borsanyi et al, JHEP 11, 077 (2010) Leutwyler The strong interactions 2212.14791



# Introduction

- Current understanding of the dynamics implemented in hybrid codes;
- Crucial element: relativistic hydrodynamic models (Solvers: MUSIC, Schenke Jeon, & Gale, PRC 82, 014903 (2010)
   CLVisc, VISHNU); Pand, Petersen & Wang PRC 97, 064918 (2018)
   Shen et al arXiv: 1409.8164 (2014)
- Kinetic theory as a guide; Romatschke & Romatschke Cambridge Monographs @Denicol Niemi Molnar Rischke PRD 85, 114047 (2012); Mathematical Physics 1712.05815 Denicol, Jeon, Gale PRC 90 024912 (2014)



# Hydrodynamic variables and equations of motion

- Hydrodynamics: dynamics of coarse grained macroscopic variables (temperature/energy density, velocity);
- Basic equations of motion: local conservation of energy and momentum;

$$\partial_{\mu} T^{\mu
u} = 0$$
 continuity equations  $\partial_t \left( {}^{ ext{energy/}}_{ ext{momentum}} 
ight) + ec{
abla} \cdot \left( {
m fluxes} 
ight) = 0$ 



# Hydrodynamic variables and equations of motion

 $T^{\mu
u} = T^{\mu
u}_{
m eq} + T^{\mu
u}_{
m diss}$ 

• Dissipative fluids:

energy density

Equilibrium part/ Thermodynamic relations

$$\varepsilon_0 u^{\mu} u^{
u} - P_0(\varepsilon_0) \Delta^{\mu
u}$$

pressure

Non-equilibrium components

$$- \Pi \Delta^{\mu
u} + \pi^{\mu
u}$$

bulk viscous pressure

anisotropic pressure

$$\Delta^{\mu\nu} = g^{\mu\nu} - u^{\mu}u^{\nu}$$

space-like projector



Credit: Chun Shen https://youtu.be/G-Fbon0YQak

# Hydrodynamic variables and equations of motion

Dissipative fluids:  $T^{\mu\nu} = T^{\mu\nu}_{
m eq} + T^{\mu\nu}_{
m diss}$ Equilibrium part/ Non-equilibrium components Thermodynamic relations  $-\Pi\Delta^{\mu
u}+\pi^{\mu
u}$  $\varepsilon_0 u^{\mu} u^{\nu} - P_0(\varepsilon_0) \Delta^{\mu\nu}$ energy density bulk viscous pressure anisotropic pressure pressure  $\partial_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu}=0$ Not enough for eq + diss (4 equations, 10 variables)

Constitutive relations/independent dynamic equations are needed. One way: Kinetic theory

Credit: Chun Shen

https://youtu.be/G-Fbon0YQak

# Microscopic derivation from Kinetic Theory

de Groot et al, *Relativistic Kinetic Theory: Principles and Applications* (North-Holland, 1980) Denicol, Rischke Microscopic Foundations of Relativistic Fluid Dynamics. Springer, 2021

Non-equilibrium dynamics: Boltzmann equation

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p}}=C[f_{\mathbf{p}}]$$

spacetime dependence

Compatibility with conservation laws

collision term: interaction information



Adapted from: https://oph.cf2.guoracdn.net/main-gimg-ce13aa5d6f2394d9c2dccf6c912e79e4

 $T^{\mu
u} = \int dP \ p^{\mu}p^{
u}f_{p}, \quad \Longrightarrow \quad \partial_{\mu}T^{\mu
u} = 0$ 

• Boltzmann contains more dynamics than hydro  $\rightarrow$  truncation procedure

\*GSR, Wagner, Denicol, Noronha, Rischke [arXiv: 2311.15063] Denicol Niemi Molnar Rischke PRD 85, 114047 (2012); Fotakis et al PRD 106, 036009 (2022) Wagner & Gavassino PRD 109, 016019 (2024) **7** 

# Microscopic derivation from Kinetic Theory

Denicol, Rischke Microscopic Foundations of Relativistic Fluid Dynamics. Springer, 2021
 Non-equilibrium dynamics: Boltzmann equation

 $p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p}} = C[f_{\mathbf{p}}]$ 

spacetime dependence

collision term: interaction information



Struchtrup, Physics of Fluids 16, 3921 (2004) Fotakis et al PRD 106, 036009 (2022)

Wagner et a PRD 016013 (2022)

de Groot et al, Relativistic Kinetic Theory: Principles and Applications (North-Holland, 1980)

- Boltzmann contains more dynamics than hydro  $\rightarrow$  truncation procedure
- → Exact equations of motion for non-equilibrium fields \*GSR, Wagner, Denicol, Noronha, Rischke [arXiv: 2311.15063] de Brito, Denicol [arXiV: 2401.10098]
- ightarrow "Small gradients, near equilibrium": relation between fields and  $\prod, \pi^{\mu
  u}$

ightarrow Closed equations of motion for  $\ \Pi,\pi^{\mu
u}$ 

Denicol & Rischke. *Microscopic Foundations of Relativistic Fluid Dynamics*. Springer, 2021 Wagner & Gavassino PRD 109, 016019 (2024)

#### Equations of motion and heavy-ion collisions

• At the end of this procedure, we have  $T_{\Pi}D\Pi + \Pi = -\zeta\theta - \delta_{\Pi\Pi}\Pi\theta + \lambda_{\Pi\pi}\pi^{\mu\nu}\sigma_{\mu\nu}$ 

 $\tau_{\pi} D \pi^{\langle \alpha \beta \rangle} + \pi^{\alpha \beta} = 2 \eta \sigma^{\alpha \beta} - \delta_{\pi \pi} \pi^{\alpha \beta} \theta - 2 \tau_{\pi} \omega_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} - \tau_{\pi \pi} \sigma_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} + \lambda_{\pi \Pi} \Pi \sigma^{\alpha \beta},$ 

### Equations of motion and heavy-ion collisions

Navier-Stokes (first-order terms)

Second-order terms

 $D = u \cdot \partial$ 

$$\theta \equiv \nabla_{\mu} u^{\mu}$$

Expansion rate

$$\sigma^{\mu\nu}\equiv\nabla^{\langle\mu} \mathbf{u}^{\nu\rangle}$$

symmetric-traceless projection Shear tensor





### Equations of motion and heavy-ion collisions

• At the end of this procedure, we have  $\tau_{\Pi}D\Pi + \Pi = -\zeta\theta - \delta_{\Pi\Pi}\Pi\theta + \lambda_{\Pi\pi}\pi^{\mu\nu}\sigma_{\mu\nu}$ ,

 $\tau_{\pi} D \pi^{\langle \alpha \beta \rangle} + \pi^{\alpha \beta} = 2 \eta \sigma^{\alpha \beta} - \delta_{\pi \pi} \pi^{\alpha \beta} \theta - 2 \tau_{\pi} \omega_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} - \tau_{\pi \pi} \sigma_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} + \lambda_{\pi \Pi} \Pi \sigma^{\alpha \beta},$ 

- Second order transport (MUSIC)
  - Single-particle content;
  - High temperature limit (m/T <<1);
  - Approximate collision term;

$$C[f_{\mathbf{p}}] \simeq -\frac{E_{\mathbf{p}}}{\tau_{R}}(f_{\mathbf{p}}-f_{0\mathbf{p}})$$

https://webhome.phy.duke.edu/~jp401/music\_manual/hydro.html#viscous-hydrodynamics Denicol, Jeon, Gale PRC 90 024912 (2014)



https://github.com/MUSIC-fluid/MUSIC

#### Current implementation (MUSIC)

 $\tau_{\Pi} D\Pi + \Pi = -\zeta \theta - \overline{\delta_{\Pi\Pi}} \Pi \theta + \lambda_{\Pi\pi} \pi^{\mu\nu} \sigma_{\mu\nu},$ 

$$\tau_{\pi} D \pi^{\langle \alpha \beta \rangle} + \pi^{\alpha \beta} = 2 \eta \sigma^{\alpha \beta} - \delta_{\pi \pi} \pi^{\alpha \beta} \theta - 2 \tau_{\pi} \omega_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} - \tau_{\pi \pi} \sigma_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} + \lambda_{\pi \Pi} \Pi \sigma^{\alpha \beta},$$

High temperature: second-order ↔ first order and speed of sound

Denicol, Jeon, Gale PRC 90 024912 (2014)

$$\begin{aligned} \tau_{\Pi} &= \frac{\zeta}{15(\varepsilon_{0} + P_{0})(1/3 - c_{s}^{2})^{2}} \\ \tau_{\Pi} &= \frac{2}{3}\tau_{\Pi} \\ \tau_{\pi} &= \frac{5\eta}{\varepsilon_{0} + P_{0}} \end{aligned} \qquad \delta_{\pi\pi} = \frac{4}{3}\tau_{\pi} \quad \tau_{\pi\pi} = \frac{10}{7}\tau_{\pi} \quad \lambda_{\pi\Pi} = \frac{6}{5}\tau_{\pi} \end{aligned}$$

 Goal: update Denicol, Jeon, Gale PRC 90 024912 (2014) with toy models containing more realistic degrees of freedom

### The Hadron Resonance Gas and the Quasiparticle Model



Using kinetic theory toy models as guides, how do transport coefficients behave?

### The hadron-resonance gas

• Hadron-resonance gas toy model

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p},i} = C_i[f_{\mathbf{p}}] \simeq -\frac{E_{\mathbf{p},i}}{\tau_R}(f_{\mathbf{p},i}-f_{0\mathbf{p},i}),$$

Celaxation time approximation
J. L. Anderson and H. Witting, Physica 74, 466 (1974)

$$i = \{\pi^{0}, \pi^{\pm}, K^{0}, K^{\pm}, \eta, f_{0}(500), \cdots \}$$
$$f_{0\mathbf{p},i} = g_{i}e^{-\beta u_{\mu}p_{i}^{\mu}}$$

$$T^{\mu
u} = \sum_{i=1}^{N_{\mathrm{spec}}} \int dP_i p_i^{\mu} p_i^{
u} f_{\mathbf{p},i}.$$

Landau prescription:

$$T^{\mu}_{\nu}u^{\nu}=\varepsilon_{0}u^{\mu}$$

Procedure:

Boltzmann  $\rightarrow$  Hydro truncation + Relaxation time approximation  $\rightarrow$  Hydro equations of motion



• Quasiparticle kinetic theory toy model

P. Romatschke *PRD*, *85*(6), 065012 (2012) . Jeon & Yaffe PRD, *53*(10), 5799 (1996); Calzetta, E., & Hu, B. L.. *PRD 37*(10), 2878 (1988). Jeon PRD 52 3591-3642 (1995) Alqahtani et al PRC 92, 054910 (2015)

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p}} + rac{1}{2}\partial_{\mu}M^{2}(T)\partial_{(p)}^{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p}} = C[f_{\mathbf{p}}]$$

 $s_0(T) = \frac{gM(T)^3}{2\pi^2} K_3(M(T)/T).$ 

The quasiparticles are effective degrees of freedom (neither quarks nor gluons)

Known from lattice data

Borsanyi et al (Wuppertal-Budapest), JHEP 11, 077 (2010);

• Quasiparticle kinetic theory toy model

P. Romatschke *PRD*, *85*(6), 065012 (2012) . Jeon Calzetta, E., & Hu, B. L.. *PRD* 37(10), 2878 (1988). <sup>Jeon</sup> Alqahtani et al PRC 92, 054910 (2015)

Jeon & Yaffe PRD, *53*(10), 5799 (1996); Jeon PRD 52 3591-3642 (1995)

$$p^{\mu}\partial_{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p}} + \frac{1}{2}\partial_{\mu}M^{2}(T)\partial_{(p)}^{\mu}f_{\mathbf{p}} = C[f_{\mathbf{p}}]$$

• Traditional  $T^{\mu\nu}$  gets modified:

$$T^{\mu
u} \equiv \int dP p^{\mu} p^{
u} f_{\mathbf{p}} + g^{\mu
u} B q^{\mu
u}$$

Generic non-equilibrium relation

$$\partial_{\mu}B=-rac{1}{2}\partial_{\mu}M^{2}\int dP f_{\mathbf{p}}$$

• Judicious definition of temperature: B = B(T) an equilibrium variable GSR, Ferreira, Denicol, Noronha, PRD 106, 036022 (2022)

$$\int dP f_{\mathbf{p}} \equiv \int dP f_{0\mathbf{p}}$$

$$T^{\mu}_{
u}u^{
u}\equivarepsilon u^{\mu}$$

energy density with dissipative corrections

• Alternative definition of temperature: must use modified version of RTA

GSR, Denicol, Noronha PRL 127, 042301 (2021) GSR, Ferreira, Denicol, Noronha, PRD 106, 036022 (2022)

$$C[f_{p}] \propto -1 + |p^{\mu}\rangle \langle p^{\mu}|,$$

$$Counter terms to ensure local conservation laws$$

Procedure:

Boltzmann  $\rightarrow$  Hydro truncation + Relaxation time approximation\*  $\rightarrow$  Transient equations  $\rightarrow$  change to Landau matching

 $T^{\mu
u}_Q = T^{\mu
u}_L$ 

 $u^{\mu}_{Q}=u^{\mu}_{L},$ 

 $\begin{aligned} \varepsilon_0(T_Q) + \delta \varepsilon_Q &= \varepsilon_0(T_L) \\ P_0(T_Q) + \Pi_Q &= P_0(T_L) + \Pi_L, \\ \pi_Q^{\mu\nu} &= \pi_L^{\mu\nu}, \end{aligned}$ 



### Relaxation times, high-temperature limit



### Relaxation times, high-temperature limit



#### Relaxation times – smaller temperatures







GSR & Denicol [arXiv:2402.06996]

#### Bulk second-order transport coefficients

 $\tau_{\Pi} D\Pi + \Pi = -\zeta \theta - \delta_{\Pi\Pi} \Pi \theta + \lambda_{\Pi\pi} \pi^{\mu\nu} \sigma_{\mu\nu},$ 



#### Shear second-order transport coefficients

$$\tau_{\pi} D \pi^{\langle \alpha \beta \rangle} + \pi^{\alpha \beta} = 2\eta \sigma^{\alpha \beta} - \delta_{\pi \pi} \pi^{\alpha \beta} \theta - 2\tau_{\pi} \omega_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} - \tau_{\pi \pi} \sigma_{\mu}^{\langle \alpha} \pi^{\beta \rangle \mu} + \lambda_{\pi \Pi} \Pi \sigma^{\alpha \beta},$$

$$\int_{I_{HR}}^{\delta_{m}} \int_{I_{HR}}^{I_{HR}} \int_{I_{HR}}^{I_{H$$

### Linear causality

• Constraint on relaxation times  $1 - c_s^2 - \frac{1}{\varepsilon_0 + P_0} \left( \frac{4}{3} \frac{\eta}{\tau_\pi} + \frac{\zeta}{\tau_\Pi} \right) \ge 0$ 



# Conclusions

- We have provided updated expressions for various transient hydro transport coefficients using the HRG and QPM;
- We find that:
  - the normalized bulk viscosity has different expressions in the high temperature limit for both models;
  - transport coefficients related to bulk are usually sensitive to temperature;
- Future: finite chemical potential; non-linear causality; momentum-dependent relaxation time.





# THAT'S ALL FOR TODAY!

# **BACKUP SLIDES**

# Transient hydro and Boltzmann moments

Denicol and Rischke. *Microscopic Foundations of Relativistic Fluid Dynamics*. Springer, 2021 Denicol Niemi Molnar Rischke PRD 85, 114047 (2012);

#### **Boltzmann eqn. dynamics** → **Moments dynamics**

In pa

$$\rho_{r}^{\mu_{1}\cdots\mu_{\ell}} = \int dP E_{p}^{r} p^{\langle \mu_{1}} \cdots p^{\mu_{\ell} \rangle} \delta f_{p, \rightarrow} \stackrel{\text{deviation from local}}{\underset{\text{equilibrium}}{\text{equilibrium}}} \delta f_{p} \equiv f_{p} - f_{0p}$$
  
rticular,  $\Pi = \frac{1}{3} (\rho_{2} - m^{2} \rho_{0}) \quad \pi^{\mu\nu} = \rho_{0}^{\mu\nu}$ 

# Transient hydro and Boltzmann moments

Denicol and Rischke. *Microscopic Foundations of Relativistic Fluid Dynamics*. Springer, 2021 Denicol Niemi Molnar Rischke PRD 85, 114047 (2012);

#### Boltzmann eqn. dynamics $\rightarrow$ Moments dynamics

de Brito, Denicol 2401.10098 Full EoMs

$$\rho_r^{\mu_1\cdots\mu_\ell} = \int dP E_p^r p^{\langle \mu_1}\cdots p^{\mu_\ell\rangle} \delta f_p,$$

For example:



**Navier-Stokes** 

**Coupling terms** 

**Relaxation times** 

Hydrodynamics: reduction of d.o.f's

$$\mu_1\cdots\mu_\ell \to \{\Pi,\pi^{\mu\nu}\}$$

(Landau matching

# Transient hydro and Boltzmann moments

Denicol and Rischke. *Microscopic Foundations of Relativistic Fluid Dynamics*. Springer, 2021 Denicol Niemi Molnar Rischke PRD 85, 114047 (2012);

**Boltzmann eqn. dynamics** → **Moments dynamics** 

 $ho_{\mathbf{r}}$ 

$$\rho_r^{\mu\nu} = \frac{\eta_r}{\eta} \pi^{\mu\nu} \equiv \mathcal{C}_r \pi^{\mu\nu} + \mathcal{O}(2).$$

Struchtrup, Physics of Fluids 16, 3921 (2004) Fotakis et al PRD 106, 036009 (2022) Wagner et a PRD 016013 (2022)

Hydrodynamics: reduction of d.o.f's

$$\Pi^{\dots\mu_{\ell}} \to \{\Pi, \pi^{\mu\nu}\}$$

(Landau matching)

#### **Temperature matching**

• We impose that  $T_Q^{\mu\nu} = T_L^{\mu\nu}$ , and since  $u_Q^\mu = u_L^\mu$ ,  $\varepsilon_0(T_Q) + \delta \varepsilon_Q = \varepsilon_0(T_L)$  $P_0(T_Q) + \Pi_Q = P_0(T_L) + \Pi_L,$  $\pi^{\mu\nu}_{Q} = \pi^{\mu\nu}_{I},$  $T_Q = T_L - \frac{3\Pi_L}{(\partial \varepsilon_0 / \partial T_L)(1 - 3c_s^2)} + \mathcal{O}(2),$  $\Pi_Q = \frac{\Pi_L}{1 - 3c_s^2} - \frac{9}{2} \frac{\partial c_s^2}{\partial \varepsilon_0} \frac{\Pi_L^2}{(1 - 3c_s^2)^3} + \mathcal{O}(3).$ 

# The relaxation time approximation

- All hydro models require inversion of the lin. collision matrix (highly non-trivial);
- Relaxation time approximation (RTA)

J. L. Anderson and H. Witting, Physica 74, 466 (1974)

$$f_{0\mathbf{p}}\hat{L}\phi_{\mathbf{p}}\simeq-rac{u_{\mu}p^{\mu}}{ au_{R}}(f_{\mathbf{p}}-f_{0\mathbf{p}})$$

widely used in HIC phenomenology: e.g. particlization

### □limited scope (constant $\tau_R$ and Landau matching conditions)

Credit: http://jetscape.org/sims/



• Alternative matching obliges the use of a modified RTA GSR, Denicol, Noronha PRL 127, 042301 (2021) GSR, Ferreira, Denicol, Noronha, PRD 106, 036022 (2022)

$$C[f_{p}] \propto -1 + |p^{\mu}\rangle\langle p^{\mu}|,$$
Traditional RTA
  
Projector in the subspace of conserved quantities in an orthogonal basis

$$C_{Q}[f_{\mathbf{p}}] \simeq -\frac{E_{\mathbf{p}}}{\tau_{R}} f_{0\mathbf{p}} \left[ \phi_{\mathbf{p}} - \frac{\langle \phi_{\mathbf{p}} E_{\mathbf{p}}^{2} \rangle_{0}}{I_{3,0}} E_{\mathbf{p}} + \frac{\langle \phi_{\mathbf{p}} E_{\mathbf{p}} p^{\langle \mu \rangle} \rangle_{0}}{I_{3,1}} p_{\langle \mu \rangle} \right]$$
$$I_{3,0} = \langle E_{\mathbf{p}}^{3} \rangle_{0}$$
$$I_{3,0} = \langle F_{\mathbf{p}}^{3} \rangle_{0}$$
$$I_{3,1} = (1/3) \langle E_{\mathbf{p}} \mathbf{p}^{2} \rangle_{0}$$



Alternative matching obliges the use of a modified RTA GSR, Denicol, Noronha PRL 127, 042301 (2021) GSR, Ferreira, Denicol, Noronha, PRD 106, 036022 (2022)

$$C[f_{p}] \propto -1 + |p^{\mu}\rangle\langle p^{\mu}|,$$

ace of n an orthogonal basis

recovery of fundamental properties of the collision term  $\hat{L}1 = 0$ ,  $\hat{L}p^{\mu} = 0$ .



### Comparison with pQCD







pQCD data - Ghiglieri, Moore, Teaney Phys. Rev. Lett. 121, 052302 (2018)

Debye mass - Laine, Schicho and Schroeder PRD 101 023532 Lattice data - Bazavov et al (HotQCD) PRD 90 094503 (2014), arXiv 1407.6387 [hep-lat];

## New results – high-temperature limit, other coefficients





$rac{\delta_{\Pi\Pi}}{ au_{\Pi}}$	$rac{\lambda_{\Pi\pi}}{ au_{\Pi}(1/3-c_s^2)}$	$rac{\delta_{\pi\pi}}{ au_\pi}$	$rac{ au_{\pi\pi}}{ au_{\pi}}$	$rac{\lambda_{\pi\Pi}}{ au_{\pi}}$
2 3	8 5	4 3	$\frac{10}{7}$	6 5
2 3	2	4 3	$\frac{10}{7}$	6 5
	2 3	$\frac{4}{3}$	$\frac{10}{7}$	$-\frac{3456}{5}\left(\frac{1}{3}-c_s^2\right)$

34

-1