

# Precision nucleon charges and form factors from lattice QCD

Sungwoo Park, LLNL

Lattice QCD workshop on hadron and quark matter (LQCDW1), Sejong University, Seoul, Jan 5, 2024

LLNL-PRES-XXXX

This work was performed under the auspices of the U.S. Department of Energy by Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory under Contract DE-AC52-07NA27344.

#### PNDME Collaboration:

#### Thirteen 2+1+1-flavor HISQ ensembles = clover-on-HISQ formulation

NME Collaboration:

#### Thirteen 2+1-flavor clover ensembles = clover-on-clover formulation

USQCD, and IC at LANL

#### **PNDME and NME members**

- Tanmoy Bhattacharya (LANL)
- Vincenzo Cirigliano (INT)
- Rajan Gupta (LANL)
- Emanuele Mereghetti (LANL)
- Boram Yoon (LANL)
- Junsik Yoo (LANL)
- Yong-Chull Jang (BNL)
- Sungwoo Park (LLNL)
- Santanu Mondal
- Huey-Wen Lin (MSU)
- Balint Joo (ORNL)
- Frank Winter (JLab)

#### References

#### PNDME

•	Charges:	Gupta et al, PRD.98 (2018) 034503						
•	AFF: VFF:	Gupta et al, PRD 96 (2017) 114503, Jang et al, PRL 124 (2020) 072002, Jang et al, arXiv:2305.11330 Jang et al, PRD 100 (2020) 014507						
•	σ	Gunta et al PRI 127 (2021) 2/2002						
	$\sigma_{\pi N}$	Gupta et al, FRE 127 (2021) 242002						
•	$d_n$ from $\Theta$ -term	Bhattacharya etal, PRD 103 (2021) 114507						
•	$d_n$ from qEDM	Gupta et al, PRD 98 (2018) 091501						
•	Moments of PDFs	Mondal et al, PRD 102 (2020) 054512						
•	Proton spin:	Lin et al, PRD 98 (2018) 094512						
Ν	ME							
•	Charges, FF:	Park et al, PRD 105 (2022) 054505						
•	Moments of PDFs	Mondal et al, JHEP 04 (2021) 044						
	Acknowledgements: MILC for HISQ ensembles. DOE for computer allocations at NERSC and OLCF,							

### Contents

- Introduction
  - Physics from nucleon form factors and charges
  - Methodology for calculation of nucleon matrix elements using lattice QCD
- Excited-state effect on nucleon matrix elements
  - Effect from  $N\pi$  /  $N\pi\pi$  multihadron excited states
- Results
  - Isovector axial, electric and magnetic form factors
  - Flavor diagonal axial, scalar, and tensor charges

# Introduction

Physics from nucleon form factors and charges

Methodology for calculation of **nucleon matrix elements** using **lattice QCD** 

# Lepton-nucleon scattering

- Nucleon charges and form factors give the strength of the interaction of external probes (electrons, neutrinos, · · · ) with nucleons and are critical inputs in experimental searches of physics beyond the standard model.
- High precision results for axial, electric and magnetic form factors versus Q<sup>2</sup> needed for determining (quasi-) elastic cross-section of (ν, e, μ) scattering off nuclei

$$\begin{array}{l} F_A = \text{axial form factor} \\ \tilde{F}_P = \text{induced pseudoscalar} \\ G_E = F_1 - \tau F_2 \text{ Electric} \\ G_M = F_1 + F_2 \text{ Magnetic} \\ \tau = Q^2/4M^2 \\ M=M_n=M_p \approx 939 \text{ MeV} \\ m = M_{\pi} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{d\sigma}{dQ^2} \begin{pmatrix} \nu_l + n \to l^- + p \\ \bar{\nu}_l + p \to l^+ + n \end{pmatrix} & \bullet \text{ Quasi-ela} \\ &= \frac{M^2 G_F^2 \cos^2 \theta_c}{8\pi E_\nu^{-2}} \left\{ A(Q^2) \pm B(Q^2) \frac{(s-u)}{M^2} + C(Q^2) \frac{(s-u)^2}{M^4} \right\}, \quad \mathbf{v}(\bar{\mathbf{v}}) \\ A(Q^2) &= \frac{(m^2 + Q^2)}{M^2} \left[ (1+\tau) F_A^2 - (1-\tau) F_1^2 + \tau (1-\tau) F_2^2 + 4\tau F_1 F_2 \\ &- \frac{m^2}{4M^2} \left( (F_1 + F_2)^2 + (F_A + 2F_P)^2 - 4 \left( 1 + \frac{Q^2}{4M^2} \right) F_P^2 \right) \right], \quad \mathbf{N} \end{aligned}$$



# Physics from flavor diagonal nucleon charges

•  $g_A^q = \Delta q$ : Quark contributions to the nucleon spin

$$\frac{1}{2} = \sum_{u,d,s,\cdots} \left( \frac{1}{2} \Delta q + L_q \right) + J_g$$

X. Ji (1997),

 $L_q$ : orbital angular momentum of the quark  $J_q$ : total angular momentum of the gluons

•  $g_T^q$ : Quark EDM contributions to the neutron EDM  $d_n$ 

nEDM collab. (2020)

$$|d_n| = |d_u^{\gamma} g_T^u + d_d^{\gamma} g_T^d + d_s^{\gamma} g_T^s + \dots| \le 1.8 \times 10^{-26} e \text{ cm}$$

•  $g_{S}^{q} = \frac{\partial M_{N}}{\partial m_{q}}$ : Slope of the nucleon mass with respect to the quark mass

 $\sigma_{\pi N} = m_l g_s^{u+d}$ : Quark contributions to the nucleon mass  $\sigma_s = m_s g_s^s$ 

## Pion-nucleon sigma term

•  $\sigma_{\pi N} \equiv m_{ud} g_S^{u+d} \equiv m_{ud} \langle N | \bar{u}u + \bar{d}d | N \rangle$ , isospin limit



- Fundamental parameter of QCD that quantifies the amount of the nucleon mass generated by *u*&*d* quarks.
- $g_S$ : important input in the search of BSM physics!
  - Lattice calculation:

**<u>Direct</u>** vs Feynman-Hellmann  $\left(\frac{g_S^q}{Z_S} = \frac{\partial M_N}{\partial m_q}\right)$ 

 From phenomenology: connection to πN-scattering amplitude via Cheng-Dashen low-energy theorem

### Lattice QCD

[Formulated by K. Wilson (1974). Numerical computation field opened by M. Creutz (1979)]



Lattice QCD is QCD defined on a 4-dimensional Euclidean space-time lattice

- Finite lattice spacing: (*a*)
- Quark fields  $(q, \overline{q})$ , Gauge fields (gluons):  $(U_{\mu})$
- Perturbative & Numerical (nonperturbative) calculations

The simulation allows **ab initio** calculations of nonperturbative QCD interactions of quarks and gluons using the **Feynman path integral** formulation of QFT.

#### Major systematic errors coming from:

- Finite lattice spacing a (UV cut-off effect)
- Chiral fit to get value at physical pion mass
- Finite Volume

- Statistical errors
- Excited state contaminations
- Renormalization

#### Calculation of expectation values using importance sampling

Expection value of observables are calculated using the Feynman path integral approach. Starting point is the partition function:

$$Z = \int D[U] D[\bar{\psi}, \psi] e^{-S_{\text{lattice}}} = \int D[U] e^{-S_{gluon}[U]} det(M_{\text{quark}})$$

•  $S_{\text{lattice}} = S_{\text{gluon}} + \bar{\psi} M_{\text{quark}} \psi$ : Lattice QCD action of gluons and quarks

•  $M_{\text{quark}}$ : Lattice Dirac operator, a matrix in (x, y, z, t)+color+spin space

An ensemble is generated using Markov Chain Monte-Carlo with the probability distribution

$$P(\{U\}) = \frac{1}{Z} e^{-S_{gluon}[U]} det(M_{quark})$$

so that the expectation value of an observable  $\mathcal{O}$  is obtained as an ensemble average

$$\langle \mathcal{O} \rangle = \frac{1}{N_{\text{samp}}} \sum_{\{U\}} \mathcal{O}(\{U\})$$

Calculation of  $\Delta det(M_{quark})$  for the generation of ensemble, and  $M_{quark}^{-1}$  are the most expensive parts of the calculations.

#### Calculation of quark propagator

• M : Lattice Dirac operator, a matrix in (x, y, z, t)+color+spin space

(dimension  $\sim 10^9$ )

The inverse of the Dirac operator  $M^{-1}(y, x)$  is the quark propagator on a given background gauge configuration  $\{U\}$ .



### **Calculation of Nucleon Matrix Element**

• Properties of nucleons ( $\langle p|0|p \rangle$ , Form Factor) are extracted from the <u>**3-point correlation function**</u>  $C(t, \tau) \equiv \langle N^p(\tau)O(t)\overline{N}^p(0) \rangle$ :



### Clover fermions on 2+1-flavor Clover Ensembles

Ensemble ID	a [fm]	<i>Μ</i> <sub>π</sub> [MeV]	$M_{\pi}L$	N <sub>conf</sub>	N <sub>HP</sub>	N <sub>LP</sub>
a127m285	0.127	285	5.87	2002	8008	256256
a094m270	0.094	269	4.09	2469	7407	237024
a094m270L	0.094	269	6.15	4510	18040	577280
a093m220	0.093	216	4.95	2000	8000	256000
a093m220X	0.093	214	4.81	2005	8020	256640
a091m170	0.091	169	3.35	4012	16048	513536
a091m170L	0.091	170	5.01	3000	15000	480000
a073m270	0.073	272	4.81	4720	18800	604160
a072m220	0.072	223	5.10	2000	12000	192000
a071m170	0.071	166	4.28	2500	15000	240000
a070m130	0.070	127	4.37	980	5880	94080
a056m280	0.056	281	5.10	2700	16200	259200
a056m220	0.056	214	4.38	2049	12294	196704

 13 gauge ensembles generated by the Jlab/W&M/LANL/MIT collaborations



•  $O(2 - 6 \times 10^5)$  measurements done, Truncated solver method with bias correction

$$C^{\text{imp}} = \sum_{i=1}^{N_{\text{LP}}} \frac{C_{\text{LP}}(\mathbf{x}_i^{\text{LP}})}{N_{\text{LP}}} + \sum_{i=1}^{N_{\text{HP}}} \left[ \frac{C_{\text{HP}}(\mathbf{x}_i^{\text{HP}}) - C_{\text{LP}}(\mathbf{x}_i^{\text{HP}})}{N_{\text{HP}}} \right]$$

- Simulations are being done over a range of the three free (*unphysical*!) parameters  $(a, M_{\pi}, M_{\pi}L)$
- Results obtained by extrapolation to the physical values ( $a = 0, M_{\pi}^{\text{Phys}}, M_{\pi}L = \infty$ )

# Disconnected on 2+1+1-flavor HISQ Ensembles

Ensemble ID	a [fm]	<i>Μ</i> <sub>π</sub> [MeV]	$M_{\pi}L$	N <sup>conn</sup> Conf	N <sup>disc</sup> light/strange
a15m310	~0.15	320	3.93	1917	1917 / 1917
a12m310	~0.12	310	4.55	1013	1013 / 1013
a12m220	~0.12	228	4.38	744	958 / 870
a09m310	~0.09	313	4.51	2263	1017 / 1024
a09m220	~0.09	226	4.79	964	712 / 847
a09m130	~0.09	138	3.90	1290	1270 / 994
a06m310	~0.06	320	4.52	500	808 / 976
a06m220	~0.06	235	4.41	649	1001 / 1002

PNDME, PRD98, 034503 (2018) : Statistics for connected diagrams Analyzed for the disconnected diagrams

- Ensembles generated by MILC Collaboration
- 8 ensembles including one physical  $M_{\pi}^{\rm phys}$  ensemble
- HYP smeared  $N_f = 2 + 1 + 1$  MILC HISQ lattices,
- Clover fermion with a tree-level tadpole improved *c*<sub>SW</sub>

# Connected and disconnected diagrams

- Charges / Form factors are obtained from the nucleon ME  $\langle N | \bar{q} \Gamma q | N \rangle$
- Require high precision measurements of quark bilinear operators within the nucleon state for both "connected" and "disconnected" 3-point correlation functions,



Calculated with covariant Gaussian source smearing, multiple source-sink separation  $0.9 \leq \tau \leq 1.4$ , accelerated with coherent sequential inversions and the truncated solver method with bias correction. PNDME, PRD98, 034503 (2018) All-to-all quark propagator estimated by stochastic method using  $Z_4$  random sources, accelerated with the truncated solver method with bias correction and hoping parameter expansion. PNDME, PRD92, 094511 (2015) 14

# Excited-state effect

Effect from  $N\pi$  /  $N\pi\pi$  multihadron excited states

### **Calculation of Nucleon Matrix Element**

• Properties of nucleons ( $\langle p|0|p \rangle$ , Form Factor) are extracted from the <u>**3-point correlation function**</u>  $C(t, \tau) \equiv \langle N^p(\tau)O(t)\overline{N}^p(0) \rangle$ :



- Nucleon operator creates ground state nucleons (N) plus all excited states with the same quantum number, including Nπ, Nππ, Nρ, N\*(1440), N\*(1710), ….
- Nucleon signal/noise decays  $\propto e^{-(E-1.5M_{\pi})\tau}$  with Euclidean time  $\tau$ .

### Excited state contamination (ESC)

• Excited states (ES) that give significant contribution to a particular nucleon matrix element are not known a priori.  $\rightarrow \chi PT$  is a very useful guide



### Corrections to the scalar charge in $\chi$ PT



# ESC from $N\pi$ and $N\pi\pi$



 $M_{\pi} \approx 135 MeV$ 

- We carry out two types of analyses:
  - 1. The "standard" fit to  $C_{2pt}(\tau)$ uses wide priors for all the excited-state amplitudes,  $A_i$ , and masses,  $M_i$ , to stabilize the fits.
  - 2. The " $N\pi$ " fit in which a narrow prior is used for  $M_1$ with the central value given by the non-interacting energy of the lowest allowed  $N\pi$  or  $N\pi\pi$  state on the lattice
  - For  $g_{\Gamma}^{s}$ , the leading multihadron ES is expected to be  $\Sigma K$  $\rightarrow$  "standard" analysis



# $g_S^{u+d}$ : Excited state effect

PNDME, PRL 127 (2021) 242002



- Scalar is sensitive to  $N\pi$  state
- Output is close to the phenomenological determination

# ESC from $N\pi$ and $N\pi\pi$ : $g_S^{u+d}$



ChPT estimate of ESC from  $N(\mathbf{k})\pi(-\mathbf{k})$  and  $N(\mathbf{0})\pi(\mathbf{k})\pi(-\mathbf{k})$  intermediate states PNDME, PRL 127, 242002 (2021), Supplemental Material

GEVP improvement with { $N(\mathbf{0})$ ,  $N(\mathbf{1})\pi(-\mathbf{1})$ } Talk from Yan Li (ETMC), Lattice 2023

# Analysis using multihadron operators Generalized eigenvalue problem: I = 1/2, $G_{1,g}$





# I = 1/2 spectrum in the cm frame



$$N(0)\pi(0), N(1)\pi(-1), ...$$
$$\left(N_{M} \otimes \left(\frac{1}{2}^{+}\right)_{M}^{1} \otimes D_{L=1,M}^{[1]}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}}$$
$$\left(N_{M} \otimes \left(\frac{3}{2}^{+}\right)_{M}^{1} \otimes D_{L=1,M}^{[1]}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}}$$

$$\begin{split} &N(0)\pi(1), N(1)\pi(0), ..\\ &(N_{M}\otimes(\frac{1}{2}^{+})_{M}^{1}\otimes D_{L=0}^{[0]})^{1/2[100]E_{1}}\\ &(N_{M}\otimes(\frac{1}{2}^{+})_{M}^{1}\otimes D_{L=1,M}^{[1]})^{1/2[100]E_{1}}\\ &(N_{M}\otimes(\frac{1}{2}^{+})_{M}^{1}\otimes D_{L=1,M}^{[1]})^{3/2[100]E_{1}}\\ &(N_{M}\otimes(\frac{3}{2}^{+})_{S}^{1}\otimes D_{L=1,M}^{[1]})^{1/2[100]E_{1}}\\ &(N_{M}\otimes(\frac{3}{2}^{+})_{S}^{1}\otimes D_{L=1,M}^{[1]})^{3/2[100]E_{1}}, ... \end{split}$$

# $G_P^{u-d}$ : Excited state effect

 $2\hat{m}G_P(Q^2) = 2M_N G_A(Q^2) - \frac{Q^2}{2M_N}\tilde{G}_P(Q^2)$ 

[NME (2021), PRD 105 054505]  $a \approx 0.071 \text{ fm}, M_{\pi} \approx 170 \text{ MeV}$ At  $\vec{q} = \frac{2\pi}{L}(1,0,0)$ 

- Data displayed: 3-point/2-point ratio of correlation functions showing dependence on  $t, \tau$  due to ES
- Gray band:  $G_P^{u-d}(\vec{q})$  determined from the ES fit.



- $\chi PT$ :  $N\pi$  state coupling large in the axial current
- Output of a simultaneous fit *increases* the axial form factors by  $G_A \sim 5$  %,  $\tilde{G}_P \sim 35$  %,  $G_P \sim 35$  %
- Satisfies PCAC relation!

### PCAC: Excited state effect

[NME (2021), PRD 105 054505]



$$2\hat{m}G_P(Q^2) = 2M_N G_A(Q^2) - \frac{Q^2}{2M_N}\tilde{G}_P(Q^2)$$

 $G_F^{u-d}$ : Excited state effect

[NME (2021), PRD 105 054505]  $a \approx 0.071 \text{ fm}, M_{\pi} \approx 170 \text{ MeV}$ At  $\vec{q} = \frac{2\pi}{L}(1,0,0)$ 

- Over 4 different strategies to control the ES effect,  $G_E^{u-d}(\vec{q})$  has  $\approx 4\%$  variation
- At larger momentum transfer  $\vec{q}$ , the data and fit become less sensitive to ES



- Data displayed: 3-point/2-point ratio of correlation functions showing dependence on  $t, \tau$  due to ES
- Gray band:  $G_E^{u-d}(\vec{q})$  determined from the ES fit.



# $g_T^u$ : Excited state effect

PNDME (2022) PRELIMINARY



• Tensor is not sensitive to  $N\pi$  state



# ESC in $g_T^s$ is not resolved

PNDME (2022) PRELIMINARY

- For  $g_T^s$ , 3pt function doesn't show excited state effect
- Constant fit to 3pt/2pt ratio.



# Results

Isovector axial, electric and magnetic form factors  $(Q^2$  dependence fit, chiral-continuum extrapolation) Flavor diagonal axial, scalar, and tensor charges

### Nonperturbative renormalization in RI-sMOM

 Regularization independent (symmetric) momentum subtracted scheme (RIsMOM)

$$_{p'}\langle f|\mathcal{O}_R^{f'}|f\rangle_p = \delta_{ff'}.$$

• For flavor diagonal charges, we explicitly evaluated the 3×3 flavor (*u*, *d*, *s*) mixing matrices in



### Nucleon Isovector Form Factors

[NME collab., all preliminary]
Clover fermion on N<sub>f</sub> = 2 + 1 clover ensembles



#### Axial form factors

•  $N\pi$  excited state needed to satisfy PCAC relation. Impact on FF is large

# Electric & Magnetic form factors

- Less sensitive to the details of the excited states
- Good agreement with the Kelly curve [J.J.Kelly, PRC 70, 068202 (2004)] 31



# $G_A^{u-d}$ : Examined Dipole, Pade and z-expansion fits



[NME (2022), PRD 105 054505]

# $g_A^{u-d}$ : chiral continuum extrapolation

[NME (2023), preliminary]



• Axial charges obtained from the  $Q^2 \rightarrow 0$  extrapolation to  $G_A(Q^2)$ 

$$g(a, M_{\pi}, M_{\pi}L) = c_1 + c_2 a + c_3 M_{\pi}^2 + c_4 \frac{M_{\pi}^2 e^{-M_{\pi}L}}{\sqrt{M_{\pi}L}}$$

# $G_E^{u-d}$ : Examined Dipole, Pade and z-expansion fits



[NME (2022), PRD 105 054505 ]

# $\langle r_E^2 \rangle^{u-d}$ : Chiral-Continuum-Finite Volume extrapolation

$$\langle r_E^2 \rangle^{u-d} = -6 \frac{d}{dQ^2} \left( \frac{G_{E,M}^{u-d}(Q^2)}{G_{E,M}^{u-d}(0)} \right) \Big|_{Q^2=0}$$



Leading corrections included in the fit ansatz

• 
$$c_1 + c_2 a + c_3 \log \frac{M_{\pi}^2}{\lambda^2} + c_4 \log \frac{M_{\pi}^2}{\lambda^2} e^{-M_{\pi}L}$$

Nucl.Phys.A635, 121 (1998) Nucl.Phys.A679, 698 (2001) Phys.Rev.D71, 034508 (2005)



Large systematic uncertainty from the excited state effect

The slope  $(r_E)$  is turns out to be very sensitive to various ES fits even though we had a relatively small  $G_E^{u-d}(\vec{q}) \approx 4\%$ variation at smallest  $\vec{q}$ 

#### [PNDME collab., preliminary] Nucleon Flavor Diagonal Charges Clover fermion on $N_f = 2 + 1 + 1$ HISQ ensembles Flavor mixing calculated nonperturbatively : Comparison with FLAG 2021 results Chiral-Continuum extrapolation including a data at <sup>A</sup>Phys 0.70 0.75 0.80 0.85 -0.5 -0.45 -0.4 -0.35 10 20 30 40 50 60 70 -0.09 -0.06 -0.03 Ω PNDME '22 (Preliminary $\sigma_{\pi N}$ PNDME 22 (Preliminary) PNDME '22 (Preliminary) PNDME '22 (Preliminary) ETM '19 PNDME '18 - ETM '19 ETM '19 2 + 1 + 1PNDME 21 **PNDME (2021)** -----Mainz '19 $\vdash$ PNDME '18 PNDME '18 **BMW 20** $\sigma_{\pi N}$ which does 2QCD '18 H ETM 19 Mainz '18 Mainz '18 not require JLQCD '18 ETM 14A renormalization χQCD '18 χQCD '18 2QCD '16 Engelhardt '12 ETM '17 ETMC '17 $H \to \Box H$ JLQCD 18 ETMC '17 χQCD 15A ァ **BMW 15** 0.70 0.75 0.80 0.85 -0.5 -0.45 -0.4 -0.35 -0.09 -0.06 -0.03 0 $g^d_A$ $g_A^n$ scatt -Ruiz de Elvira 17 0.8 0.9 -0.25 -0.20 -0.15 -0.02 0.01 0.7 -0.03 -0.01 0 Š Hoferichter 15 PNDME '22 (Preliminary) PNDME '22 (Preliminary) Alarcon 11 PNDME '22 (Preliminary) ETM '19 ETM '19 ETM '19 10 20 30 40 50 60 70 MeV PNDME '18 PNDME '18 PNDME '18 -20 0 20 40 60 80 100 Mainz '19 Mainz '19 Mainz '19 JLQCD '18 JLQCD '18 $\sigma_s$ JLQCD '18 PNDME 22 (Preliminary) ETM '17 ETM '17 ETM '17 Θ H-FF-ĿСH **BMW 20** 0.8 -0.25 -0.20 -0.02 -0.01 0.7 0.9 -0.15 -0.03 0 0.01 $g_T^d$ $g_T^s$ =2+1. ETM 19 $g_T$ MILC 12 ž Axial and Tensor charges ILQCD 18

• Less sensitive to the details of the excited states

# Nucleon sigma terms (Scalar charges)

χQCD 15

MILC 12

MeV

100

ž

-20

0

20

40

60

80

 $\sigma_{N\pi}$ : Excited-state effects are large and results very sensitive to  $N\pi$  /  $N\pi\pi$  states

# Summary

- Using *lattice QCD*, we are calculating *nucleon isovector form factors and flavor diagonal charges* as part of a comprehensive analysis of nucleon structure
- Form factors presented as a function of  $Q^2$  over  $0.04 < Q^2 < 1 \text{ GeV}^2$ .
- We are investigating excited state effects
  - Contributions from  $N\pi$  /  $N\pi\pi$  multihadron excited states
    - Evidence of large ES for  $\tilde{G}_P$ ,  $G_P$ , and  $g_S^{u,d}$  ( $\sigma^{\pi N}$ ).
  - Need higher statistics to resolve the ES at  $M_{\pi}^{\rm Phys}$  and on finer lattices (smaller a)
  - Higher order ES fits are under investigation
  - Study with multihadron  $N\pi$  operators is in progress

# Acknowledgements

- We thank the MILC collaboration for providing the 2+1+1-flavor HISQ lattices.
- The calculations used the CHROMA software suite.
- We thank DOE for computer time allocations at NERSC and OLCF.
- We thank the USQCD collaboration for computer time
- Institutional Computing at LANL for computer time