Higher-order corrections for  $t\bar{t}W$  production

Nikolaos Kidonakis

in collaboration with Chris Foster

- Higher-order soft-gluon corrections
- $t\bar{t}W^+$  and  $t\bar{t}W^-$  cross sections
- Top-quark  $p_T$  and rapidity distributions





#### $t\bar{t}W$ production

observation of  $t\bar{t}W$  events at 7, 8, 13 TeV collisions at the LHC

measurements are significantly higher than theoretical predictions

QCD corrections at NLO are large,  $\sim 47\%$  at 13.6 TeV

electroweak corrections are smaller but significant

the QCD corrections are dominated by soft-gluon emission

further improvement in theoretical accuracy by the inclusion of higher-order soft-gluon corrections

 $\rightarrow$  approximate NNLO (aNNLO) and approximate N<sup>3</sup>LO (aN<sup>3</sup>LO) predictions

#### **Soft-gluon corrections**

They are important for top-quark processes and they approximate known exact results at NLO and NNLO very well

partonic processes  $q(p_q) + \bar{q}'(p_{\bar{q}'}) \rightarrow t(p_t) + \bar{t}(p_{\bar{t}}) + W(p_W)$ 

define  $s = (p_q + p_{\bar{q}'})^2$ ,  $t = (p_q - p_t)^2$ ,  $u = (p_{\bar{q}'} - p_t)^2$ 

we define the threshold variable  $s_4 = (p_{\bar{t}} + p_W + p_g)^2 - (p_{\bar{t}} + p_W)^2 = s + t + u - m_t^2 - (p_{\bar{t}} + p_W)^2$ where extra gluon with  $p_g$  emitted

At partonic threshold  $p_g \rightarrow 0$  and thus  $s_4 \rightarrow 0$ 

Soft corrections  $\left[\frac{\ln^k(s_4/m_t^2)}{s_4}\right]_+$  with  $k \le 2n-1$  for the order  $\alpha_s^n$  corrections

Resum these soft corrections for the double-differential cross section

Finite-order expansions  $\rightarrow$  no prescription needed or used (this avoids underestimating the size of the corrections)

Approximate NNLO (aNNLO) and approximate  $N^3LO$  (aN<sup>3</sup>LO) predictions for cross sections and differential distributions

### **Soft-gluon Resummation**

$$d\sigma_{pp \to t\bar{t}W} = \sum_{q,\bar{q}'} \int dx_a \, dx_b \, \phi_{q/p}(x_a,\mu_F) \, \phi_{\bar{q}'/p}(x_b,\mu_F) \, d\hat{\sigma}_{q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W}(s_4,\mu_F)$$

take Laplace transforms  $d\tilde{\hat{\sigma}}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}(N) = \int (ds_4/s) e^{-Ns_4/s} d\hat{\sigma}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}(s_4)$ and  $\tilde{\phi}(N) = \int_0^1 e^{-N(1-x)} \phi(x) dx$  with transform variable N

Then

$$d\tilde{\sigma}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}(N) = \tilde{\phi}_{q/q}(N_q,\mu_F) \; \tilde{\phi}_{\bar{q}'/\bar{q}'}(N_{\bar{q}'},\mu_F) \; d\tilde{\hat{\sigma}}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}(N,\mu_F)$$

**Refactorization for the cross section** 

$$d\sigma_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}(N) = \tilde{\psi}_q(N_q,\mu_F)\,\tilde{\psi}_{\bar{q}'}(N_{\bar{q}'},\mu_F)\,\mathrm{tr}\left\{H_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}\,\,\tilde{S}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}\left(\frac{\sqrt{s}}{N\mu_F}\right)\right\}$$

 $\psi_q, \psi_{\bar{q}'} \rightarrow \text{collinear emission from incoming partons}$  $H_{q\bar{q}' \rightarrow t\bar{t}W}$  is hard function  $\rightarrow$  short distance  $S_{q\bar{q}' \rightarrow t\bar{t}W}$  is soft function  $\rightarrow$  noncollinear soft gluons Thus

$$d\tilde{\hat{\sigma}}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}(N) = \frac{\tilde{\psi}_{q/q}(N_q,\mu_F)\,\tilde{\psi}_{\bar{q}'/\bar{q}'}(N_{\bar{q}'},\mu_F)}{\tilde{\phi}_{q/q}(N_q,\mu_F)\,\tilde{\phi}_{\bar{q}'/\bar{q}'}(N_{\bar{q}'},\mu_F)}\,\mathrm{tr}\,\left\{H_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}\,\,\tilde{S}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}\left(\frac{\sqrt{s}}{N\mu_F}\right)\right\}$$

$$S_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W} \text{ satisfies the renormalization group equation} \\ \left(\mu_R \frac{\partial}{\partial \mu_R} + \beta(g_s) \frac{\partial}{\partial g_s}\right) S_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W} = -\Gamma_{S \ q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{\dagger} S_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W} - S_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W} \Gamma_{S \ q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}$$

Soft anomalous dimension  $\Gamma_{S q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W}$  controls the evolution of the soft function which gives the exponentiation of logarithms of N

Renormalization group evolution  $\rightarrow$  resummation

$$\begin{split} d\tilde{\sigma}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{\mathrm{resum}}(N) &= \exp\left[\sum_{i=q,\bar{q}'} E_i(N_i)\right] \exp\left[\sum_{i=q,\bar{q}'} 2\int_{\mu_F}^{\sqrt{s}} \frac{d\mu}{\mu} \gamma_{i/i}(N_i)\right] \\ &\times \mathrm{tr} \left\{ H_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}\left(\alpha_s(\sqrt{s})\right) \bar{P} \exp\left[\int_{\sqrt{s}}^{\sqrt{s}/N} \frac{d\mu}{\mu} \Gamma_S^{\dagger}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(\alpha_s(\mu))}\right] \right\} \\ &\quad \times \tilde{S}_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}\left(\alpha_s\left(\frac{\sqrt{s}}{N}\right)\right) P \exp\left[\int_{\sqrt{s}}^{\sqrt{s}/N} \frac{d\mu}{\mu} \Gamma_S_{q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(\alpha_s(\mu))}\right] \right\} \end{split}$$

 $H_{q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W}$  and  $\tilde{S}_{q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W}$  and  $\Gamma_{S q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W}$  are  $2 \times 2$  matrices

choose color tensor basis of s-channel singlet and octet exchange  $c_1^{q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W} = \delta_{ab}\delta_{12}, c_2^{q\bar{q}' \to t\bar{t}W} = T_{ba}^c T_{12}^c$ 

The four matrix elements of  $\Gamma_{S q\bar{q}' \rightarrow t\bar{t}W}$  are at one loop

$$\Gamma_{11\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)} = \Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(1)}, \quad \Gamma_{12\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)} = \frac{C_F}{2N_c} \Gamma_{21\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)}, \quad \Gamma_{21\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)} = \ln\left(\frac{(t-m_t^2)(t'-m_t^2)}{(u-m_t^2)(u'-m_t^2)}\right),$$

$$\Gamma_{22\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)} = \left(1 - \frac{C_A}{2C_F}\right) \left[\Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(1)} + 2C_F \ln\left(\frac{(t-m_t^2)(t'-m_t^2)}{(u-m_t^2)(u'-m_t^2)}\right)\right] + \frac{C_A}{2} \left[\ln\left(\frac{(t-m_t^2)(t'-m_t^2)}{s\,m_t^2}\right) - 1\right]$$

where  $\Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(1)} = -C_F \left( L_{\beta_t} + 1 \right)$  is the one-loop QCD massive cusp anomalous dimension, with  $L_{\beta_t} = (1 + \beta_t^2)/(2\beta_t) \ln[(1 - \beta_t)/(1 + \beta_t)]$  and  $\beta_t = \sqrt{1 - 4m_t^2/s'}$ ,  $s' = (p_t + p_{\bar{t}})^2$ ,  $t' = (p_{\bar{q}'} - p_{\bar{t}})^2$ ,  $u' = (p_q - p_{\bar{t}})^2$ 

#### At two loops

 $\Gamma_{11\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(2)} = \Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(2)}, \quad \Gamma_{12\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(2)} = \left(K_2 - C_A\,N_2^{\beta_t}\right)\Gamma_{12\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)}, \quad \Gamma_{21\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(2)} = \left(K_2 + C_A\,N_2^{\beta_t}\right)\Gamma_{21\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)},$   $\Gamma_{22\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(2)} = K_2\,\Gamma_{22\,q\bar{q}'\to t\bar{t}W}^{(1)} + \left(1 - \frac{C_A}{2C_F}\right)\left(\Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(2)} - K_2\,\Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(1)}\right) + \frac{1}{4}C_A^2(1 - \zeta_3)$ 

where  $K_2 = C_A(67/36 - \zeta_2/2) - 5n_f/18$  with  $n_f$  the number of light-quark flavors,

$$N_2^{\beta_t} = \frac{1}{4} \ln^2 \left( \frac{1-\beta_t}{1+\beta_t} \right) + \frac{(1+\beta_t^2)}{8\beta_t} \left[ \zeta_2 - \ln^2 \left( \frac{1-\beta_t}{1+\beta_t} \right) - \operatorname{Li}_2 \left( \frac{4\beta_t}{(1+\beta_t)^2} \right) \right]$$

and

$$\Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(2)} = K_2 \Gamma_{\text{cusp}}^{(1)} + C_F C_A \left\{ \frac{1}{2} + \frac{\zeta_2}{2} + \frac{1}{2} \ln^2 \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) \right. \\ \left. + \frac{(1 + \beta_t^2)}{4\beta_t} \left[ \zeta_2 \ln \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) - \ln^2 \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) + \frac{1}{3} \ln^3 \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) - \text{Li}_2 \left( \frac{4\beta_t}{(1 + \beta_t)^2} \right) \right] \right. \\ \left. + \frac{(1 + \beta_t^2)^2}{8\beta_t^2} \left[ -\zeta_3 - \zeta_2 \ln \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) - \frac{1}{3} \ln^3 \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) - \ln \left( \frac{1 - \beta_t}{1 + \beta_t} \right) \text{Li}_2 \left( \frac{(1 - \beta_t)^2}{(1 + \beta_t)^2} \right) \right. \\ \left. + \text{Li}_3 \left( \frac{(1 - \beta_t)^2}{(1 + \beta_t)^2} \right) \right] \right\}$$

is the two-loop massive cusp anomalous dimension in QCD

Expansions of the resummed cross section to fixed order NNLO expansions (aNNLO) are consistent with (almost exact) NNLO results aN<sup>3</sup>LO is the state of the art

Electroweak corrections are also included

# Cross sections for $t\bar{t}W$ production



large *K*-factors

#### improved agreement with data at $aN^{3}LO$

# $t\bar{t}W$ cross sections

$tar{t}W$ cross sections (fb) in $pp$ collisions at the LHC							
$\sigma$ in fb	$7  \mathrm{TeV}$	$8  \mathrm{TeV}$	$13  \mathrm{TeV}$	$13.6 \mathrm{TeV}$	$14  \mathrm{TeV}$		
LO QCD	${}^{128}_{-28}^{+39}$	$172^{+51}_{-36}$	${}^{445}_{-84}^{+114}$	$481^{+121}_{-90}$	$506^{ig+126}_{ig-94}$		
lo QCD+EW	$135^{+41}_{-29}$	$\substack{182 + 53 \\ -38}$	$467^{+119}_{-88}$	$505 {+127 \atop -94}$	$531^{egin{array}{c}+132\\-98\end{array}}$		
NLO QCD	$^{164}_{-17}^{+13}$	$226^{+20}_{-23}$	$646 {+83 \atop -74}$	$708^{+94}_{-82}$	$750^{egin{array}{c}+101\-88\end{array}}$		
NLO QCD+EW	$175^{+12}_{-17}$	$^{239}_{-23}^{+19}$	$677^{egin{array}{c} +80 \\ -74 \end{array}}$	$741 {+90 \\ -82}$	$785^{+97}_{-88}$		
aNNLO QCD	$179^{+6}_{-10}$	$^{246}_{-15}^{+9}$	$720^{+29}_{-43}$	$791^{+32}_{-47}$	$837^{+34}_{-50}$		
aNNLO QCD $+$ NLO EW	$190^{+6}_{-10}$	$259^{+9}_{-15}$	$751^{egin{array}{c}+27\-43\end{array}}$	$824 {+29 \\ -47}$	$872^{+31}_{-50}$		
aN <sup>3</sup> LO QCD	$185^{+5}_{-8}$	$253^{+7}_{-12}$	$748^{+24}_{-19}$	$822^{+26}_{-20}$	$870^{+28}_{-21}$		
$aN^{3}LO QCD + NLO EW$	$196 {+5 \atop -8}$	$266^{+7}_{-12}$	$779^{+22}_{-19}$	$855 {+23 \atop -20}$	$905^{+25}_{-21}$		

At 13.6 TeV

NLO QCD corrections  $\rightarrow$  47%

aNNLO QCD corrections  $\rightarrow$  17%

 $aN^{3}LO \ QCD \ corrections \rightarrow 6\%$ 

electroweak NLO corrections  $\rightarrow$  7%

Total aN<sup>3</sup>LO QCD+NLO EW cross section is 78% bigger than LO QCD

# $t\bar{t}W^+$ and $t\bar{t}W^-$ cross sections

$tar{t}W^+$ and $tar{t}W^-$ cross sections (fb) in $pp$ collisions at the LHC							
$\sigma$ in fb	$t\bar{t}W^+$ 13 TeV	$tar{t}W^+$ 13.6 TeV	$t\bar{t}W^{-}$ 13 TeV	$tar{t}W^-$ 13.6 TeV			
LO QCD	$299^{+77}_{-57}$	$322 {+82 \atop -60}$	$146 {+37 \atop -28}$	$\substack{159+40\\-30}$			
lo QCD+EW	$313 {+80 \atop -59}$	$337^{egin{array}{c} +85 \\ -63 \end{array}}$	$^{154}_{-29}^{+39}$	$168\substack{+42\\-31}$			
NLO QCD	$431^{+54}_{-49}$	$470^{+61}_{-54}$	$215 {+29 \atop -25}$	$238 {+33 \atop -28}$			
NLO $QCD+EW$	$450^{+51}_{-48}$	$490^{+58}_{-53}$	$227 {+28 \atop -25}$	$251^{+32}_{-28}$			
aNNLO QCD	$480^{+19}_{-28}$	$525^{+21}_{-31}$	$240^{+10}_{-15}$	$266^{+11}_{-16}$			
aNNLO QCD $+$ NLO EW	$499^{+17}_{-28}$	$\substack{545+19\\-31}$	$252^{+10}_{-15}$	$279^{+10}_{-16}$			
aN <sup>3</sup> LO QCD	$498 \substack{+16 \\ -12}$	$545^{+17}_{-13}$	$250 {+8 \atop -7}$	$277^{+9}_{-7}$			
$aN^3LO QCD + NLO EW$	$517 \substack{+14 \\ -12}$	$565\substack{+15\\-13}$	$262 {+8 \atop -7}$	290 + 8 - 7			

the  $t\bar{t}W^+$  cross sections are larger than for  $t\bar{t}W^-$ 

but the corrections are slightly bigger for  $t\bar{t}W^-$ 

Comparison with 8 and 13 TeV CMS and ATLAS data NLO and even aNNLO results are not sufficient we need  $aN^3LO$  corrections to describe the data

At 8 TeV, measurements from CMS:  $382_{-102}^{+117}$  fb and from ATLAS:  $369_{-91}^{+100}$  fb Theoretical prediction is

 $aN^{3}LO \ QCD + NLO \ EW: 266^{+7}_{-12-6} \ fb$ 

At 13 TeV, CMS finds  $868 \pm 65$  fb with  $t\bar{t}W^+$   $553 \pm 42$  fb and  $t\bar{t}W^ 343 \pm 36$  fb while ATLAS finds  $880 \pm 80$  fb with  $t\bar{t}W^+$   $583 \pm 58$  fb and  $t\bar{t}W^ 296 \pm 40$  fb

Theoretical prediction is aN<sup>3</sup>LO QCD + NLO EW:  $779_{-19-13}^{+22+12}$  fb with  $t\bar{t}W^+$   $517_{-12-9}^{+14+8}$  fb and  $t\bar{t}W^ 262_{-7-4}^{+8+4}$  fb

# Top-quark $p_T$ and rapidity distributions in $t\bar{t}W$ production at 13 TeV





K-factors decrease at larger top  $p_T$ 

*K*-factors increase at larger rapidities

# Top-quark $p_T$ and rapidity distributions in $t\bar{t}W$ at 13.6 TeV





K-factors decrease at larger top  $p_T$  K-factors increase at larger rapidities

#### Summary

- $t\bar{t}W$  production
- soft-gluon corrections through aN<sup>3</sup>LO
- results for total cross sections and differential distributions
- higher-order corrections further enhance and improve the theoretical predictions
- agreement with LHC data within uncertainties