

The 8th International Conference on **Micro-Pattern Gaseous Detectors**

Web Site: https://mpgd2024.aconf.org Email: mpgd2024@ustc.edu.cr

探测与核电子学国家重点实验室

Maxim Titov, CEA Saclay, Irfu, France From (very) Basic Ideas to Rather Complex Gaseous Detector Systems

8 th International Conference on Micro-Pattern Gaseous Detectors, University of Science and Technology of China, Hefei, China, Oct, 14-18, 2024

Gaseous Detectors: A Brief History

1968: MWPC – Revolutionising the Way Particle Physics is Done

The progress in experimental particle physics is driven by the advances and breakthrough in instrumentation, leading to the development of new, cutting-edge technologies:

1968: George Charpak developed the MultiWire Proportional Chamber, which revolutionized particle detection and HEP which passed from the manual to the electronic era.

EROPHAN ORGANIZATION FOR HOCLEAR REVEARDS **1992:**File: Cherpek clarke Bouclier, T. Breasuni, J. Rovier Schannel J. San CEES, Geneva, Switzerland,

Electronic particle track detection is now standard in all particle detectors

Multi-Wire Proportional Chamber (MWPC)

Simple idea to multiply SWPC cell → First electronic device allowing high statistics experiments !!

High-rate MWPC with digital readout: Spatial resolution is limited to s_x \sim *s/sqrt(12) ~ 300* μ *m* **TWO-DIMENSIONAL MWPC READOUT CATHODE INDUCED CHARGE (Charpak and Sauli, 1973)**

Spatial resolution determined by: Signal / Noise Ratio Typical (i.e. 'very good') values: S ~ 20000 e: noise ~ 1000e Space resolution < 100 μ *m*

Multi-Wire Proportional Chamber (MWPC): Wire Displacements

Resolution of MWPCs limited by wire spacing better resolution → shorter wire spacing → more (and more) wires...

✓ **Small wire displacements reduce field quality**

Table 35.1: Maximum tension T_M and stable unsupported length L_M for tungsten wires with spacing s, operated at $V_0 = 5$ kV. No safety factor is included.

- ✓ **Need high mechanical precision both for geometry and wire tension ... (electrostatic and gravitation, wire sag …)**
- \checkmark Several simplifying assumptions are made in analytical calculations: electrostatic force acting on the wire does not change during wire movements, or varies linearly with the displacement, the wire shape is parabolic; only one wire moves at a time.
- \checkmark The advantage of numerical integrations using Garfield++ program is to simulate the collective movement of all wires, which are difficult analytically, and to consider all forces acting on a wire: forces between anode wire and other electrodes (wires, cathode) & gravitational force

Drift Chambers

FIRST DRIFT CHAMBER OPERATION (H. WALENTA ~ 1971); HIGH ACCURACY DRIFT CHAMBERS (Charpak-Breskin-Sauli ~ 1973-75)

Choose drift gases with little dependence $v_D(E) \rightarrow$ *linear space - time relation r(t)*

Measure drift time t_D [need to know to: fast scintillator, beam timing]

Determine location of original ionization:

 $x = x_0 \pm v_D \cdot t_D$

 $y=y_0\pm v_D\cdot t_D$

If drift velocity changes along path: $x=\int_{c}^{t_D} v_D dt$

In any case: Need well-defined drift field ...

The spatial resolution is not limited to the cell size :

Typical single point resolutions of drift chambers: 50...150 µm depends on length of the drift path

- ✓ *primary ionization statistics: how many ion pairs, ionization fluctuations dominates close to the wire*
- ✓ *diffusion of electrons in gas: dominates for large drift length*
- ✓ *electronics: noise, shaping characteristics constant contribution (drift length independent)*

1983/1984: Discovery of W and Z Bosons at UA1/UA2

UA1 used the largest wire / drift chamber of its day (5.8 m long, 2.3 m in diameter)

Discovery of W and Z bosons C. Rubbia & S. Van der Meer,

1984:

Z → *ee* (white tracks) at UA1/CERN

The Evolution of Drift Chambers and Future e+e- Colliders

Lesson #1 - from "open" to "closed" cell

· closed $\frac{1}{2}$ esson #3 – small cells and He gas

Lesson #4 - full stereo configuration

 \cdot no gap electro \cdot consta

larger. the configuration offering the best performance in terms of maxin momentum resolution is one with small, single sense wire closed two st cells, arranged in contiguous layers of opposite sign stereo angles,

Lesson #5 - summary

- obtained with constant stereo angle transverse projection \ldots but the gas mixture is based on helium with a small amount of quencher open t (90% He / 10% iC_4H_{10} , KLOE gas) which, besides low multiple from th scattering contribution, allows for the exploitation of the cluster consta timing technique, for improved spatial resolution, and of the cluster z (radi counting technique, for excellent particle identification consta
	- suggested wire material is Ag coated AI, but lighter materials are under scrutiny (like metal coated carbon monofilaments)

An ultra-light drift chamber (IDEA concept) targetted for FCC-ee and CePC (100 km) was inspired by DAFNE KLOE Wire Chamber and by more recent version of it for MEG2 exp.

on \bullet

1974 - Now: Time Projection Chamber (TPC)

PEP4 (SLAC)

ALEPH (CERN)

- **Invented by David Nygren (Berkeley) in 1974**
- ✓ **Proposed as a central tracking device for the PEP-4 detector @ SLAC in 1976**

An ultimate drift chamber design is TPC concept - 3D precision tracking with low material budget & PID through differential energy loss dE*/*dx measurement and/or cluster counting dN_{cl}/dx tech.

- ✓ **More (and even larger) TPCs were built, based on MWPC readout, a powerful tool for:**
	- **- Lepton Colliders (LEP, Higgs Factories)**
	- **- Modern heavy ion collisions**
	- **- Liquid and high pressure TPCs for neutrino and dark matter searches**

New generation of TPCs use MPGD-based readout: e.g. ALICE Upgrade, T2K, ILC, CepC

Micro-Pattern Gaseous Detectors: Bridging the Gap for Tracking between Wire Chambers and Silicon-based Devices

Pixel System:

Problem:

Advantages of gas detectors:

- *low radiation length*
- *large areas at low price*
- *flexible geometry*
- *spatial, energy resolution …*

✓ *rate capability limited by space charge defined by the time of evacuation of positive ions*

Solution:

✓ *reduction of the size of the detecting cell (limitation of the length of the ion path) using chemical etching and photo-lithographique techniques developed for microelectronics and keeping at same time similar field shape.*

Micro-Strip Gas Chamber (MSGC): An Early MPGD

Multi-Wire Proportional Chamber (MWPC)

Typical distance between wires limited to ~1 mm due to mechanical and electrostatic forces

Excellent spatial resolution

HERA-B Crisis(1998): Aging Effects in High-Rate Gas Detectors

2008: Original Gaseous Detectors in LHC Experiments

drift tubes), Muon trigger (RPC, thin gap chambers)

CMS: Muon detector (drift tubes, CSC), **RPC** (muon trigger)

LHCb: Tracker (straw tubes), Muon detector *straws, RPCs*(MWPC, GEM)

Mostly wires,

ATLAS MDT: Resolution Limits of High-Rate Wire Chambers

L3 Muon Spectrometer (LEP): ~ 40000 chan. ; ^s *(chamber) < 200* m*m*

ATLAS Muon Drift Tubes (LHC):

- *~ 1200 chambers,* ^s *(chamber) ~ 50* m*m*
	- *370000 tubes, 740000 end-plugs*
	- *12000 CCD for optical alignment*

Intrinsic limitation of wire chambers: (resolution degradation at high rates):

Cross plate Aultilaver In-plane alignment ongitudinal beam

The Higgs at 10: An Experimental Retrospective

2013 Nobel Prize in Physics for Higgs Boson Discovery

Higgs Candidates @ LHC Muon gaseous detectors: $H \rightarrow ZZ \rightarrow 4$ muons (2 Di-Z Boson candidate events decaying into 4 muons in CMS and ATLAS)

Micro-Pattern Gaseous Detector Technologies (MPGD)

- ✓ *Gas Electron Multiplier (GEM)*
- ✓ *Thick-GEM (LEM), Hole-Type & RETGEM*
- ✓ *MPDG with CMOS pixel ASICs ("GridPix")*
- *Micro-Pixel Chamber (µ-PIC)*

 $-V1 = 730$

 $AV2 = 400V$

4 Wilem

40 kV/cm

mising Particle

 $μ$ -*Resistive WELL (μ-RWELL)* ✓ *Resistive-Plate WELL (RPWELL)*

Drift cathode

GFM₁

 $GEM3$

Readout PCB

Rate Capability: MWPC vs GEM:

Ionisation Region

Drift Cathode

 140 nm

^m*-RWELL*

50 µm Drift gap

Gas Electron Multiplier (GEM)

Thin metal-coated polymer foil chemically pierced by a high density of holes

A difference of potentials of ~ 500V is *+* applied between the two GEM electrodes.

 \rightarrow the primary electrons released by the ionizing particle, drift towards the holes where the high electric field triggers the electron multiplication process.

Electrons are collected on patterned readout board.

- \checkmark A fast signal can be detected on the lower GEM electrode for triggering or energy discrimination.
- \checkmark All readout electrodes are at ground potential.
- \checkmark Positive ions partially collected on GEM electrodes

Micro Mesh Gaseous Structure (MICROMEGAS)

Micromesh Gaseous Chamber: micromesh supported by 50-100 mm insulating pillars

Small gap: fast collection of ions

 $50 - 100 \mu m$

50-100µm

Pixel Readout of MPGDs: "GridPix" Concept

"*InGrid" Concept: By means of advanced wafer processing-technology INTEGRATE MICROMEGAS amplification grid directly on top of TIMEPIX CMOS ASIC*

3D Gaseous Pixel Detector → *2D (pixel dimensions) x 1D (drift time)*

Other MPGDs Concepts: THGEM, URWELL, RPWELL

THGEM Manufactured by standard PCB techniques of precise drilling in G-10 (and other materials) and Cu etching

STANDARD GEM THGEM

0.1 mm rim to prevent discharges

L. Periale, NIMA478 (2002) 377 LEM!: P. Jeanneret, PhD thesis, 2001

µRWELL and RPWELL

High-rate µRWELL prototypes made by new techniques

https://Indico.cem.ch/event/889369/contributions/4020066/attachments/ 2115302/3560690/RD51_collabration_meeting_Yout.vpptx

µRWELL with 2D-Strip **Readout - For RD51 Tracker**

https://indico.cem.ch/event/1040996/contributions/4404219/attachments/ 2266859/3849374/2021-06-18_RD51-Collaboration%20Meeting-ZhouYi-Final.pdf

Development of RWELL detectors for large area & high rate applications

https://indico.oern.ch/event/889369/contributions/4020068/attachments/ 2115585/3559626/RD51CollaborationMeeting-sgf.pdf

Success Story: MPGD Technologies @ CERN Experiments

- The integration of MPGDs in large experiments was not rapid, despite of the first largescale application in COMPASS at SPS in the] 2000's
- Scaling up MPGD detectors, while preserving the typical properties of small prototypes, allowed their use in the LHC upgrades
	- \rightarrow Many emerged from the R&D studies within the CERN-RD51 Collaboration

Legacy of the CERN-RD51 Collaboration: 2008-2023

RD51 CERN-based "TECHNOLOGY - DRIVEN R&D COLLABORATION" was established to advance MPGD concepts and associated electronics readout systems

- ✓ *Many of the MPGD Technologies were introduced before the RD51 was founded*
- ✓ *With more techniques becoming available, new detection concepts were introduced and the existing ones were substantially improved during the RD51 period (2008-2023)*
- ✓ *Beyond 2023, RD51 served as a nuclei for the new DRD1 ("all gas detectors") collaboration, anchored at CERN, as part of the ECFA Detector R&D Roadmap*

Legacy of the CERN-RD51 Collaboration:"RD51" Model

The success of the RD51 is related to the "RD51 model" inperforming R&D: combination of generic and focused R&D with bottom-up decision processes, full sharing of experience, "know-how", and common infrastructure, which allows to build community with continuity and institutional memory and enhances the training of younger generation instrumentalists.

inds of work involved. Top

re the thick GEM (THGEM

or thick CEA

Scientific organisation in 7 working groups

- WG1: New structures and technologies
- **WG2:** Detector physics and performance ۰
- **WG3:** Training and dissemination \bullet .
- **WG4:** Software & Simulation Tools \bullet
- **WG5: Readout Electronics (RD51 SRS)** \bullet .
- **WG6: MPGD Production & Industrialization** ٠
- WG7: Common test facilities

CERN Courier (5 pages) Volume, October 2015 Deter RD51 and the rise of micro-pattern gas detectors

Community and Expertize (RD51 Scientific Network)

3 MAJOR ASSETS

 $RD51$:

MPGD Technology Development & Dissemination

R&D Tools, Facilities and Infrastructure

2022: MPGDs for High Luminosity LHC Upgrades

The successful implementation of MPGDs for relevant upgrades of CERN experiments indicates the degree of maturity of given detector technologies for constructing *large-size detectors, the level of dissemination within the HEP community and their reliability*

https://ep-news.web.cern.ch/content/atlasnew-small-wheel-upgrade-advances-0

https://ep-news.web.cern.ch/upgraded-alice-tpc https://ep-news.web.cern.ch/content/demonstratingcapabilities-new-gem

Large-Area MM / GEM Detectors for ATLAS / CMS Upgrade

Resistive MM for ATLAS NSW Muon Upgrade:

Standard Bulk MM suffers from limited efficiency at high rates due to discharges induced dead time Solution: Resistive Micromegas technology:

- Add a layer of resistive strips above the readout strips
- Spark neutralization/suppression (sparks still occur, but become inoffensive)

Still, main issue encountered: HV unstability

==> found to be correlated to low resistance of resistive strip anode \equiv = applied solutions + passivation in order to deactivate the region where R<0.8 MO

Production, sector integration (~1200m² resistive MM):

GEMs for CMS Muon System Upgrade:

- ➢ Single-mask GEM technology (instead of double-mask)
	- \rightarrow Reduces cost /allows production of large-area GEM

➢ Assembly optimization: self-stretching technique: \rightarrow assembly time reduction to 1 day

September 2020: 144 GEM chambers installed

Gaseous Detectors: From Wire/Drift Chamber → **Time Projection Chamber (TPC)** → **Micro-Pattern Gas Detectors**

Primary choice for large-area coverage with low material-budget (+ dE/dx measurement)

1990's: Industrial advances in photolithography has favoured the invention of novel microstructured gas amplification devices (MSGC, GEM, Micromegas, …)

Examples of Gaseous Detectors for Future Colliders:

HL-LHC Upgrades: Tracking (ALICE TPC/MPGD); Muon Systems: RPC, CSC, MDT, TGC, GEM, Micromegas; Future Hadron Colliders: FCC-hh Muon System (MPGD - OK, rates are comparable with HL-LHC) Future Lepton Colliders: Tracking (FCC-ee / CepC - Drift Chambers; ILC / CePC - TPC with MPGD readout) Calorimetry (ILC, CepC – RPC or MPGD), Muon Systems (OK)

Future Election-Ion Collider: Tracking (GEM, mWELL; TPC/MPGD), RICH (THGEM), TRD (GEM)

Gaseous Detector R&D: Common Issues

Despite the different R&D requirements, there is potential for overlapping in many aspects, allowing for a larger community of gaseous detectors to benefit. The most straightforward example is the classic ageing issues, but many others can be mentioned:

- **MPGD- the main challenges remain large areas, high rates, precise timing capabilities, and stable discharge-free operation, picosecond-timing, optical readout**
- **RPC - focus stays on improving high-rate and precise timing capabilities, uniform detector response, and mechanical compactness, pico-second timing**
- **Straw tubes- requirements include extended length and smaller diameter, low material budget, and operation in a highly challenging radiation environment.**
- Large-volume Drift chamber with a reduced material budget in a high-rate environment requires **searching for new materials. Avalanche-induced Ion Back Flow (IBF) remains the primary challenge for TPC applications in future facilities.**

Resistive MPGD Structures: Performance & Trends

SINGLE-STAGE DESIGNS with RESISTIVE MATERIALS and related detector architecture → **μPIC, μRWELL, small-pad res. MM (proposed for ATLAS HL-LHC Forward Muon Tagger), RPWELL** → **improves detector stability; single-stage is advantage for assembly, mass production & cost**

Diamond-like carbon (DLC) resistive layers :

- \rightarrow Solutions to improve high-rate capability (\geq MHz)
- \rightarrow Spark Protection
- \rightarrow Resistive Spreading
- \rightarrow Possibillity to make capacitive sharing

Future R&D Challenges:

• *Radiation-induced modification of surface resistivity after the very high radiation dose*

"STD kit'

m**RWELL High-Rate Layout O(Mhz/cm2) for LHCb Upgrade & Medium-Rate Layout for FCC-ee / CePC**

Towards Large Area in Fast Timing GASEOUS DETECTORS *Gaseous Detectors: Micromegas with Timing (RD51 Picosec Collaboration)* ICOSEC

Your opportunity for MPGD R&D at the USTC:

Large area 4D Picosecond-timing tracker for high-rate experiments:

Optical Readout of MPGDs: Imaging Applications

Optical readout of gaseous detectors

Scintillation light emission Imaging sensors and optics **Applications of optical readout**

Radiation imaging and fluorescence High spatial resolution imaging Optical TPCs Neutron imaging Beam monitoring and medical applications Optical readout for detector R&D **New developments**

Alternative gases and wavelength shifters Ultra-fast imaging SiPM readout Optical readout of negative ion drift detectors

CT and 3 D Imaging:

Steps Towards Long-Term Detector R&D Program

Main target projects of Gaseous Detector R&D

> 2024: New DRD Collaborations @ CERN

- **DRD Reports** at open session of DRDC meetings: https://indico.cern.ch/event/1356910/
- **Indico Category: "Experiments / R&D":** https://indico.cern.ch/category/6805/
- **Full DRD proposals in CERN CDS:**

https://cds.cern.ch/search?cc=DRDC+Public+Documents&sc=1&p=594__%3A%22Proposal%22

• **DRDC Committee:** https://committees.web.cern.ch/drdc (Chair – T. Bergauer HEPHY, Vienna)

- ✓ Proposals contain "**strategic" and "blue-sky" R&Ds,** definition of **Working Groups, Work Packages,** milestones, tasks & deliverables
- ✓ **Strategic funding** to be agreed with funding agencies/ institutions via Work Packages
- ✓ **Next step** is to prepare and sign DRD **MoUs**
- ✓ **Progress** tracked by annual DRDC review \rightarrow next meeting on Nov. 13, 2024: https://indico.cern.ch/event/1424898/

DRD1 Collaboration Example: Gaseous Detectors

- **Large community** of 161 institutes, 700 members, 33 countries *based on previous RD51 collaboration*
- *R&D Framework organized based on:*
	- *- Working Groups (RD51 Legacy): serving as the backbone of R&D, distributed R&D Activities with Centralized Facilities*
	- *- Work Packages: will reflect the DRDTs* → *Strategic R&D and Long -Term Funding (Funding Agency Model)*
	- *- Common Projects: "blue sky" R&D (e.g. PICOSEC started as common project)*

Countries of DRD1 Institutes (today)

Dissemination of MPGD Applications in HEP & Beyond

MPGD Technologies for Dark Matter Detection

IBD Conc

MPGD Technologies for Neutrino Physics

https://indico.cern.ch/event/581417/contributions/2558346/attachments/1465881/2266161/2017_05_Philadelphia _MPGD2017-ConferenceSummary_25052017_MS.pdf

MPGD Technologies for X-Ray Detection and y-Ray Polarimetry

MPGD R&D @ USTC: Technology Advances

Large-area MPGD production

Gaseous detector features large-area, low-mass and cost-effective solution for particle detection. MPGD further enhances its high rate capability and

spatial/temporal resolution for future particle and nuclear physics facilities.

Produced by self-stretching method

Adding resistive layer is essential to ensure stable operation of gaseous detector by effectively quenching the streamer/spark. New candidates, especially Diamond-Like Carbon (DLC), is very promising in developing many kinds of MPGDs.

Cu layer **Cr-Cu interlaye**

Resistive-layer coating

Goal of this project:

- 1. Define a stable and well controlled DLC and DLC+Cu processing method for the production of MPGD electrodes
- 2. Studying the long-term stability under irradiation of DLC and DLCbased detectors.

Novel MPGD structure - uRGroove

uRGroove

Low ion backflow is preferred in applications involving high-rate and/or aging requirements. E.g., to suppress strong space-charge effect in TPC, or to improve life time for gaseous photomultiplier

(GPM).

Low ion backflow (IBF)

DMM : Double Micro-Mesh gaseous structure TMM : Triple Micro-Mesh gaseous structure

Drift

Drift region $3-5$ mm $\frac{P_A}{3A}$ $\tilde{0}$. 2 mm

 5×10^6 gain for single p IBF ratio: down to 3×1

Similar to uRWELL, uRGroove provides compact and low-mass solution for

large-area trackers. The intrinsic 2D structure is beneficial for higher signal gain and readout. uRGroove is the optimal candidate for

gaseous inner tracker at the Super Tau-Charm Facility (STCF).

MPGD R&D @ USTC: Examples of Applications

Thermal bonding Micromegas for PandaX-III TPC, **MIMAC**, **MeGaT**

Jinping Deep Underground Dark Matter Laboratory

- High-pressure 136Xe TPC
- Background suppression
- \blacksquare σ_F <3%@2.5MeV
- Ultra-low radiation level

MIMAC: Directional Dark Matter Detector 70% CF₄ + 28% CHF₃ + 2% C₄H₁₀ $@50$ mba Grid- $\overrightarrow{E}_{\text{drift}}$ X, Y strips Electronic board $X - ray$ generator ■ Low-pressure nuclear-recoil TPC ■ Complementary to existing

techniques ■ Precision measurements of

neutrino cross-section

Pixel CdZnTe

■ High-pressure TPC+CZT

 \blacksquare High resolution

- \blacksquare High sensitivity
- \blacksquare γ polarization measurements

Medical Pencil Scanning Proton Beam monitoring

Standard radiotherapy Proton beam therap

 $>10^9$ Hz/cm² proton Direct readout (camera) \blacksquare 30×40 cm² sensitive area ■ Resolution <400 um

Micromegas-based neutron beam monitor for BNCT

High rate >1 MHz/cm²

■ Discrimination of thermal/fast neutron and ν

Development of radiation measurements and imaging facilities with novel detectors

Cutting Edge Science Relies on Cutting Edge Instrumentation

The detrimental effect of the material budget and power consumption represents a very serious concern for a high-precision Si-vertex & tracking;

CMOS sensors offers low mass and (potentially) radiation-hard technology for future colliders;

✓ *MPGDs have become a well-established technique in the fertile field of gaseous detectors;*

- Several novel concepts of picosecond-timing detectors (LGAD, LAPPD) will have numerous powerful applications in PID & pile-up rejection:
- The story of modern calorimetry is a textbook example of physics research driving the development of an experimental method (PFA);
- The integration of advanced electronics and data transmission functionalities plays an increasingly important role and needs to be addressed;
- Bringing the modern algorithmic advances from the field of machine learning from offline applications to online operations and trigger systems is another major challenge;

1) Our instrumentation represents both a towering achievement, and, in some cases, a scaled-up version of techniques used in the past. Recent discoveries of the Higgs boson and Gravitational Waves required increasingly sophisticated detectors and have created an exceptionally positive environment in society.

1

2

3

 $\mathbf{1}$

2) Key importance to keep an eye on new technologies, based on industry trends;

> 3) Encourage young scientists to do detector R&D; importance of recognition of excellence in instrumentation in careers at universities / RI;

BACK-UP SLIDES

Aging Effects in Gas Detectors: "Non-Local" Phenomena

IRRADIATION AREA mCkm 3460 Volt / 3.5 kHz/cm 3505 Volt / 0.35 kHz/cm ₽10 3460 Volt / 12.5 kHz/cm charge 3505 Volt / 0.98 kHz/cm □ 3505 Volt / 12.5 kHz/cm Curnulated o
Curnulated 3440 Volt / L8 kHz/cm $10²$ 10³ Collimator aperture in mm

/N₂/CO₂ (94:3:2:1): Most likely polymerization of hydrocarbons (no indication that contamination caused aging

6000

8000

10000

12000

Counte rate in Hz/cm

AGING RATE DEPENDS:

M. Kollefrath, ATLAS MDT: ATLAS MUON-NOTE-012 (2001)

CLEAR EVIDENCE THAT AGING RATE DEPENDS ON:

- *Irradiation rate*
- *Ionization density*
- *High voltage (gas gain)*
- *Particle type & energy*
- *Gas exchange rate*

PARTICLE TYPE & ENERGY; IRRADIATION AREA GAS FLOW & IRRADIATION AREA

X-rays or e⁻ can not trigger Malter effect independently of their energy or radiation intensity

Hadrons above certain energy produce Malter effect at ~mC/cm as in HERA-B (Irradiation area above certain limit is necessary for ignition of Malter effect)