WPCF 2014 @ Gyongyos Hungary, August 28, 2014

Ripples on Relativistically Expanding Fluid





Jinfeng Liao

Indiana University, Physics Dept. & CEEM

RIKEN BNL Research Center



Research Supported by NSF



OUTLINE

- Introduction: fluctuations in fluid
- Exact sound wave solutions on Bjorken flow
- Exact sound wave solutions on Hubble flow
- Summary & Outlook

Work done in collaboration with: Shuzhe Shi and Pengfei Zhuang from Tsinghua University, Beijing China

References: Shi, JL, Zhuang, arXiv:1405.4546

Distinctive Correlation Patterns Observed



Specific longitudinal and azimuthal angular correlation patterns are observed experimentally

It is widely believed that various fluctuations play curial roles

___>

Fluctuations All Along



see e.g. discussions in Kapusta, Muller, Stephanov, PRC2012

To understand the impact of various fluctuations on final state observables, there are in fact TWO QUESTIONS:

* How/when/where/why a certain fluctuation occurs?

* Once created, how a fluctuation propagates further within the system?

4

We deal with

this question

Sound wave in fluid

The short answer: a fluctuation (if small) spreads out in a fluid in the form of (superposed) sound waves, like ripples on a pond



This however could become highly nontrivial, if the fluid itself is in motion (such as the fireball in heavy ion collisions), i.e. ripples on a flowing stream

Hydrodynamics Framework

The background flow is described by solutions to hydrodynamic equations

$$T^{\mu\nu}_{;\mu} = 0$$

In this work we use ideal hydro, and conformal E.o.S

$$T^{\mu\nu} = (\epsilon + p)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} - g^{\mu\nu}p, \qquad p = c_s^2\epsilon$$

We use usual convenient coordinates for heavy ion collisions:

$$t = \tau \cosh \eta, \qquad z = \tau \sinh \eta,$$

 $x = \rho \cos \phi, \qquad y = \rho \sin \phi.$

The hydro equations read:

$$\begin{split} 0 &= T^{\tau\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\tau\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\tau\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\tau\phi}_{,\phi} + \tau T^{\eta\eta} + \frac{1}{\tau} T^{\tau\tau} + \frac{1}{\rho} T^{\rho\tau}, \\ 0 &= T^{\eta\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\eta\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\eta\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\eta\phi}_{,\phi} + \frac{3}{\tau} T^{\eta\tau} + \frac{1}{\rho} T^{\rho\eta}, \\ 0 &= T^{\rho\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\rho\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\rho\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\rho\phi}_{,\phi} - \rho T^{\phi\phi} + \frac{1}{\rho} T^{\rho\rho} + \frac{1}{\tau} T^{\tau\rho}, \\ 0 &= T^{\phi\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\phi\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\phi\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\phi\phi}_{,\phi} + \frac{3}{\rho} T^{\rho\phi} + \frac{1}{\tau} T^{\tau\phi}. \end{split}$$

Hydrodynamic Framework

 $T^{\mu\nu}_{;\mu} = 0$

The background flow is described by solutions to hydrodynamic equations

In this work we use ideal hydro, and conformal E.o.S

$$T^{\mu\nu} = (\epsilon + p)u^{\mu}u^{\nu} - g^{\mu\nu}p, \qquad p = c_s^2\epsilon$$

Sound wave modes are described in a perturbative way as solutions to <u>linearized hydro equations</u> on top of given background flow solution

$$p = p_0 + p_1 \qquad u^{\mu} = u_0^{\mu} + u_1^{\mu}$$

$$\rightarrow T^{\mu\nu} \approx \{T_0^{\mu\nu}\} + \{T_1^{\mu\nu}\} \longrightarrow T_1^{\mu\nu}{}_{;\mu} = 0.$$

Linearized Hydrodynamic Equations

Sound wave modes are described in a perturbative way as solutions to linearized hydro equations on top of given background flow solution

$$p = p_0 + p_1 \qquad u^{\mu} = u_0^{\mu} + u_1^{\mu}$$
$$\longrightarrow T^{\mu\nu} \approx \{T_0^{\mu\nu}\} + \{T_1^{\mu\nu}\} \longrightarrow T_1^{\mu\nu}{}_{;\mu} = 0.$$

In the coordinates we use, the linearized eqs. read:

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= \frac{p_0 u_1^{\rho}}{\rho} + \frac{p_1}{\tau} + \frac{1}{1 + c_s^2} p_{1,\tau} + p_0 (u_{1,\eta}^{\eta} + u_{1,\rho}^{\rho} + u_{1,\phi}^{\phi}) \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\eta} + \frac{2 - c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\eta} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{p_{1,\eta}}{\tau^2}, \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\rho} - \frac{c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\rho} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} p_{1,\rho}, \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\phi} - \frac{c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\phi} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{p_{1,\phi}}{\rho^2}. \end{aligned}$$

On Top of Bjorken Flow

One well-known solution is the Bjorken flow

We use usual convenient coordinates for heavy ion collisions:

$$t = \tau \cosh \eta, \qquad z = \tau \sinh \eta,$$

 $x = \rho \cos \phi, \qquad y = \rho \sin \phi.$

The hydro equations read:

$$\begin{split} 0 \ &= \ T^{\tau\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\tau\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\tau\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\tau\phi}_{,\phi} + \tau T^{\eta\eta} + \frac{1}{\tau} T^{\tau\tau} + \frac{1}{\rho} T^{\rho\tau}, \\ 0 \ &= \ T^{\eta\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\eta\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\eta\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\eta\phi}_{,\phi} + \frac{3}{\tau} T^{\eta\tau} + \frac{1}{\rho} T^{\rho\eta}, \\ 0 \ &= \ T^{\rho\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\rho\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\rho\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\rho\phi}_{,\phi} - \rho T^{\phi\phi} + \frac{1}{\rho} T^{\rho\rho} + \frac{1}{\tau} T^{\tau\rho}, \\ 0 \ &= \ T^{\phi\tau}_{,\tau} + T^{\phi\eta}_{,\eta} + T^{\phi\rho}_{,\rho} + T^{\phi\phi}_{,\phi} + \frac{3}{\rho} T^{\rho\phi} + \frac{1}{\tau} T^{\tau\phi}. \end{split}$$

The background flow solution reads:

$$p_0(\tau) = p(\tau_0) \tau_0^{1+c_s^2} / \tau^{1+c_s^2} \qquad u_0^{\mu}(\tau) = (1, 0, 0, 0)$$

Linearized Eqs. on top of Bjorken Flow

The linearized equations now read:

$$\begin{split} 0 &= \frac{p_0 u_1^{\rho}}{\rho} + \frac{p_1}{\tau} + \frac{1}{1 + c_s^2} p_{1,\tau} + p_0 (u_{1,\eta}^{\eta} + u_{1,\rho}^{\rho} + u_{1,\phi}^{\phi}), \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\eta} + \frac{2 - c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\eta} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{p_{1,\eta}}{\tau^2}, \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\rho} - \frac{c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\rho} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} p_{1,\rho}, \qquad g^{\mu\nu} u_{\mu} u_{\nu} = 1 \text{ requires } u_1^{\tau} = 0 \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\phi} - \frac{c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\phi} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{p_{1,\phi}}{\rho^2}. \\ \text{The strategy is to go toward 2nd order differentiation with separable variables, by combining these eqns into: \\ \delta &\equiv p_1/p_0 \qquad \delta(\tau, \eta, \rho, \phi) = \delta_{\parallel}(\tau, \eta) \delta_{\perp}(\rho, \phi). \\ \hline \delta_{\perp,\rho\rho} + \frac{1}{\rho} \delta_{\perp,\rho} + \frac{1}{\rho^2} \delta_{\perp,\phi\phi} = -\omega^2 \delta_{\perp}, \\ \tau^{1+c_s^2}(\tau^{-1-c_s^2} \delta_{\parallel,\eta\eta}), \tau = (3 - c_s^2) \omega^2 \tau \delta_{\parallel} + (\omega^2 \tau^2 - 2 + c_s^2) \delta_{\parallel,\tau} + (3c_s^{-2} - 2) \tau \delta_{\parallel,\tau\tau} + c_s^{-2} \tau^2 \delta_{\parallel,\tau\tau\tau} \end{split}$$

N.B. One can also study simpler cases: purely longitudinal and purely transverse sound wave

General Sound Wave Solutions

The equations after separation indicate at the following form for eigen-modes:

$$\begin{split} \delta_{\perp}(\rho,\phi) &\sim J_m(\omega\rho) \, e^{im\phi}, \\ \delta_{\parallel}(\tau,\eta) &\sim e^{ik\eta} \times W(\tau). \end{split}$$

These eventually lead to the following general solutions:

$$\delta(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi) \;=\; \sum_m \int_0^\infty d\omega \int_{-\infty}^\infty dk \; e^{ik\eta} J_m(\omega\rho) e^{im\phi} W(\tau),$$

with auxiliary functions:

$$\begin{split} W(\tau) &\equiv A_{k,\omega,m}W_{1}(\tau) + B_{k,\omega,m}W_{2}(\tau) + C_{k,\omega,m}W_{3}(\tau), \\ W_{1}(\tau) &= \left(\frac{\tau}{\tau'}\right)^{-\frac{1-c_{s}^{2}}{2} - \alpha_{k}}(\omega\tau)^{\alpha_{k}} \left[\frac{1-c_{s}^{2} - 2\alpha_{k}}{2}J_{-\alpha_{k}}(c_{s}\omega\tau) - (c_{s}\omega\tau)J_{1-\alpha_{k}}(c_{s}\omega\tau)\right], \\ W_{2}(\tau) &= \left(\frac{\tau}{\tau'}\right)^{-\frac{1-c_{s}^{2}}{2} + \alpha_{k}}(\omega\tau)^{-\alpha_{k}} \left[\frac{1-c_{s}^{2} - 2\alpha_{k}}{2}J_{\alpha_{k}}(c_{s}\omega\tau) + (c_{s}\omega\tau)J_{\alpha_{k}-1}(c_{s}\omega\tau)\right], \\ W_{3}(\tau) &= (\omega\tau)^{1+c_{s}^{2}} {}_{1}F_{2}[2;\frac{7+c_{s}^{2} + 2\alpha_{k}}{4},\frac{7+c_{s}^{2} - 2\alpha_{k}}{4};-c_{s}^{2}\omega^{2}\tau^{2}/4] \\ \text{three coefficients for three independent modes,} \end{split}$$

entirely fixed from given perturbation at occurring time.

On Top of Hubble Flow

Another well-known solution is the 3D Hubble flow We use following convenient coordinates:

 $t = \tau \cosh \eta,$ $z = \tau \sinh \eta \, \cos \theta,$

 $x = \tau \sinh \eta \sin \theta \cos \phi$, $y = \tau \sinh \eta \sin \theta \sin \phi$, The hydro equations read:

$$\begin{split} T^{\tau\lambda}_{\ ;\lambda} &= T^{\tau\tau}_{\ ,\tau} + T^{\tau\eta}_{\ ,\eta} + T^{\tau\theta}_{\ ,\theta} + T^{\tau\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + \Gamma^{\eta}_{\ \tau\eta}T^{\tau\tau} + \Gamma^{\tau}_{\eta\eta}T^{\eta\eta} + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\ \tau\theta}T^{\tau\tau} + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\eta\theta}T^{\tau\eta} \\ &\quad + \Gamma^{\tau}_{\theta\theta}T^{\theta\theta} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\tau\phi}T^{\tau\tau} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\eta\phi}T^{\tau\eta} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\theta\phi}T^{\tau\theta} + \Gamma^{\tau}_{\phi\phi}T^{\phi\phi}, \\ T^{\eta\lambda}_{\ ;\lambda} &= T^{\eta\tau}_{\ ,\tau} + T^{\eta\eta}_{\ ,\eta} + T^{\eta\theta}_{\ ,\theta} + T^{\eta\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + 3\Gamma^{\eta}_{\eta\tau}T^{\tau\eta} + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\ \tau\theta}T^{\eta\tau} + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\eta\theta}T^{\eta\eta} + \Gamma^{\eta}_{\ \theta\theta}T^{\theta\theta} \\ &\quad + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\tau\phi}T^{\eta\tau} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\eta\phi}T^{\eta\eta} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\theta\phi}T^{\eta\theta} + \Gamma^{\eta}_{\phi\phi}T^{\phi\phi}, \\ T^{\theta\lambda}_{\ ;\lambda} &= T^{\theta\tau}_{\ ,\tau} + T^{\theta\eta}_{\ ,\eta} + T^{\theta\theta}_{\ ,\theta} + T^{\theta\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + 3\Gamma^{\theta}_{\ ,\tau}T^{\tau\theta} + \Gamma^{\eta}_{\tau\eta}T^{\theta\tau} + 3\Gamma^{\theta}_{\ \theta\eta}T^{\eta\theta} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\tau\phi}T^{\theta\tau} \\ &\quad + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\eta\phi}T^{\theta\eta} + \Gamma^{\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + T^{\phi\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + 3\Gamma^{\phi}_{\phi\tau}T^{\tau\phi} + \Gamma^{\eta}_{\tau\eta}T^{\phi\tau} + 3\Gamma^{\phi}_{\ ,\phi\eta}T^{\eta\phi} + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\tau\theta}T^{\phi\tau} \\ &\quad + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\eta\theta}T^{\phi\eta} + 3\Gamma^{\phi\theta}_{\ ,\phi} + 3\Gamma^{\phi\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + 3\Gamma^{\phi\phi}_{\ ,\phi} + \Gamma^{\eta}_{\ ,\eta}T^{\phi\tau} + 3\Gamma^{\phi}_{\ ,\phi\eta}T^{\eta\phi} + \Gamma^{\theta}_{\tau\theta}T^{\phi\tau} \end{split}$$

In these coordinates, the background flow solution reads:

$$p_0 = \frac{p_0(\tau_0)\tau_0^{3(1+c_s^2)}}{\tau^{3(1+c_s^2)}} , \ u_0^{\mu} = (1,0,0,0).$$

Linearized Eqs. on top of Hubble Flow The linearized equations now read:

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &= \frac{1}{1+c_s^2} p_{1,\tau} + \frac{3}{\tau} p_1 + p_0 u_{1,\eta}^{\eta} + p_0 u_{1,\theta}^{\theta} + p_0 u_{1,\phi}^{\phi} + 2 \frac{\cosh \eta}{\sinh \eta} p_0 u_1^{\eta} + \frac{\cos \theta}{\sin \theta} p_0 u_1^{\theta} \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\eta} + \frac{2 - 3c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\eta} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{p_{1,\eta}}{\tau^2} \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\theta} + \frac{2 - 3c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\theta} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{1}{\tau^2 \sinh^2 \eta} p_{1,\theta} \\ 0 &= p_0 u_{1,\tau}^{\phi} + \frac{2 - 3c_s^2}{\tau} p_0 u_1^{\phi} + \frac{c_s^2}{1 + c_s^2} \frac{1}{\tau^2 \sinh^2 \eta} p_{1,\phi} . \end{aligned}$$

The strategy is to go toward 2nd order differentiation with separable variables, by combining these eqns into:

$$c_s^{-2}\tau^2 p_{1,\tau\tau} + (3 + 8c_s^{-2})\tau p_{1,\tau} + 12(1 + c_s^{-2})p_1$$

= $p_{1,\eta\eta} + 2\frac{\cosh\eta}{\sinh\eta}p_{1,\eta} + \frac{1}{\sinh^2\eta}(p_{1,\theta\theta} + \frac{\cos\theta}{\sin\theta}p_{1,\theta} + \frac{1}{\sin^2\theta}p_{1,\phi\phi}).$

General Sound Wave Solutions

The equations after separation indicate at the following form for eigen-modes:

$$p_1(\tau,\eta,\theta,\phi) \;=\; \sum_{l,m} p_{l,m}(\tau,\eta) Y_l^m(\theta,\phi)$$

These eventually lead to the following general solutions:

$$\frac{p_1(\tau,\eta,\theta,\phi)}{p_0} = \left(\frac{\tau}{\tau'}\right)^{\frac{3c_s^2-1}{2}} \sum_{l,m} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} a_{l,m}(k) \cos\left[\beta_k \ln(\tau/\tau')\right] R_l(k,\eta) Y_l^m(\theta,\phi) \, \mathrm{d}k \\ + \left(\frac{\tau}{\tau'}\right)^{\frac{3c_s^2-1}{2}} \sum_{l,m} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} b_{l,m}(k) \sin\left[\beta_k \ln(\tau/\tau')\right] R_l(k,\eta) Y_l^m(\theta,\phi) \, \mathrm{d}k,$$

with special functions:

$$R_{l}(k,\eta) = \sqrt{\frac{\Gamma(l+1+ik)\Gamma(l+1-ik)}{\pi 2^{2l+2}\Gamma(l+3/2)^{2}}} \sinh^{l} \eta \ _{2}F_{1}(\frac{l+1+ik}{2},\frac{l+1-ik}{2},l+3/2,-\sinh^{2} \eta)$$

the two coefficients for radially inward/outward modes, entirely fixed from given perturbation at occurring time.

Showcasing Resulting Correlations

As an example, we show pressure-pressure rapidity correlations arising from $C(\Delta \eta) = \int_{0}^{\infty} C(\Delta \eta) d\eta$

$$C(\Delta \eta) = \int d\eta_1 \delta(\tau, \eta_1) \delta(\tau, \eta_1 + \Delta \eta)$$



longitudinal wave on top of Bjorken flow

Showcasing Resulting Correlations

As an example, we show pressure-pressure rapidity correlations arising from $C(\Delta \eta) = \int d\eta_1 \delta(\tau, \eta_1) \delta(\tau, \eta_1 + \Delta \eta)$ an earlier Guassian perturbation



Showcasing Resulting Correlations

As an example, we show pressure-pressure rapidity correlations arising from $C(\Delta \eta)$ an earlier Guassian perturbation

$$C(\Delta \eta) = \int d\eta_1 \delta(\tau, \eta_1) \delta(\tau, \eta_1 + \Delta \eta)$$



3D wave on top of Hubble flow

Summary & Outlook

* It is important to understand how fluctuations, after occurrence, propagate in relativistically expanding fluid.

*We have found complete and analytic sound wave solutions on top of Bjorken flow.

*We have found complete and analytic sound wave solutions on top of Hubble flow.

* These sound waves can lead to nontrivial correlation patterns after propagating for certain time.

* Outlook for future work: application to phenomenology (hydro fluc., jet, ...); extension to other flow backgrounds; analysis of viscous effects.

Thank you!

BACKUP: Velocity Field for Solutions on top of Bjorken Flow

$$\begin{split} \delta(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi) \ &= \ \sum_{m} \int_{0}^{\infty} d\omega \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} dk \ e^{ik\eta} J_{m}(\omega\rho) e^{im\phi} W(\tau), \\ u_{1}^{\eta}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi) \ &= \ u_{1}^{\eta}(\tau',\eta,\rho,\phi) + \frac{c_{s}^{2}}{1+c_{s}^{2}} \tau^{c_{s}^{2}-2} u_{\perp,\eta}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi), \\ u_{1}^{\rho}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi) \ &= \ u_{1}^{\rho}(\tau',\eta,\rho,\phi) + \frac{c_{s}^{2}}{1+c_{s}^{2}} \tau^{c_{s}^{2}} u_{\perp,\rho}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi), \\ u_{1}^{\phi}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi) \ &= \ u_{1}^{\phi}(\tau',\eta,\rho,\phi) + \frac{c_{s}^{2}}{1+c_{s}^{2}} \frac{\tau^{c_{s}^{2}}}{\rho^{2}} u_{\perp,\phi}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi), \end{split}$$

$$u_{\perp}(\tau,\eta,\rho,\phi) = \sum_{m} \int_{0}^{\infty} d\omega \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} dk \ e^{ik\eta} J_{m}(\omega\rho) e^{im\phi} \int_{\tau'}^{\tau} d\tilde{\tau} \ \tilde{\tau}^{-c_{s}^{2}} W(\tilde{\tau}),$$

BACKUP: Velocity Field for Solutions on top of Hubble Flow

$$\begin{split} u_{1}^{\eta}(\tau,\eta,\theta,\phi) \ &= \ (\frac{\tau'}{\tau})^{2-3c_{s}^{2}} u_{1}^{\eta}(\tau',\eta,\theta,\phi) + \frac{c_{s}^{2}}{1+c_{s}^{2}} u_{\perp,\eta}(\tau',\eta,\theta,\phi), \\ u_{1}^{\theta}(\tau,\eta,\theta,\phi) \ &= \ (\frac{\tau'}{\tau})^{2-3c_{s}^{2}} u_{1}^{\theta}(\tau',\eta,\theta,\phi) + \frac{c_{s}^{2}}{1+c_{s}^{2}} \frac{1}{\sinh^{2}\eta} u_{\perp,\theta}(\tau',\eta,\theta,\phi), \\ u_{1}^{\phi}(\tau,\eta,\theta,\phi) \ &= \ (\frac{\tau'}{\tau})^{2-3c_{s}^{2}} u_{1}^{\phi}(\tau',\eta,\theta,\phi) + \frac{c_{s}^{2}}{1+c_{s}^{2}} \frac{1}{\sinh^{2}\eta} u_{\perp,\theta}(\tau',\eta,\theta,\phi), \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} u_{\perp}(\tau,\eta,\theta,\phi) \ &= \ \frac{1}{\tau} \sum_{l,m} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{\beta_k b_{l,m}(k) + (3c_s^2 - 1)a_{l,m}(k)}{(3c_s^2 - 1)^2 + \beta_k^2} \left[\cos\left(\beta_k \ln\frac{\tau}{\tau'}\right) - 1 \right] R_l(k,\eta) Y_l^m(\theta,\phi) \, \mathrm{d}k \\ &+ \frac{1}{\tau} \sum_{l,m} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{-\beta_k a_{l,m}(k) + (3c_s^2 - 1)b_{l,m}(k)}{(3c_s^2 - 1)^2 + \beta_k^2} \sin\left(\beta_k \ln\frac{\tau}{\tau'}\right) R_l(k,\eta) Y_l^m(\theta,\phi) \, \mathrm{d}k, \end{split}$$