Chiral Kinetic Theory

M. Stephanov

U. of Illinois at Chicago

PRL 109(2012)162001, 113(2014)182302, 115(2015)021601 and 1508.02396 with Yi Yin, Jingyuan Chen, Dam Son, Ho-Ung Yee.

M. Stephanov (UIC)

Chiral Magnetic Effect and Anomaly

Consider free right-handed (Weyl) fermion:

$$\boldsymbol{J} = \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{B}}{4\pi^2}$$

- nondissipative current

• Nielsen-Ninomia (1983):

$$\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{J} = \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}}{4\pi^2} = \mu \frac{dn}{dt}$$

work = energy change



Chiral Magnetic Effect and Anomaly

Consider free right-handed (Weyl) fermion:

Lowest Landau level is chiral

 $\boldsymbol{J} = \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{B}}{4\pi^2}$

- nondissipative current

• Nielsen-Ninomia (1983):

$$\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{J} = \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}}{4\pi^2} = \mu \frac{dn}{dt}$$

work = energy change



Chiral Magnetic Effect and Anomaly

Consider free right-handed (Weyl) fermion:

Lowest Landau level is chiral

$$\boldsymbol{J} = \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{B}}{4\pi^2}$$

- nondissipative current

• Nielsen-Ninomia (1983):

$$\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{J} = \mu \frac{\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}}{4\pi^2} = \mu \frac{dn}{dt}$$

work = energy change



Kharzeev-McLerran-Warringa (2007):



 $\boldsymbol{J} \sim (N_R - N_L) \boldsymbol{B}$

Dirac and Weyl semimetals discovered



Liu et al, Science 343 (2014) 864

Xu et al, Science 349 (2015) 614

CME in ZrTe₅

BNL - Stony Brook - Princeton - Berkeley (arxiv:1412.6543)





90°: CME leads to negative magnetoresistance for $B \parallel E$.

$$J_{\rm CME} = \sigma_{\rm CME} E \sim n_5 B; \quad \frac{n_5}{\tau} \sim EB;$$

$$\sigma_{\mathrm{CME}} \sim \tau B^2 > 0, \, \rho = rac{1}{\sigma_0 + \sigma_{\mathrm{CME}}} <
ho_0.$$

CME and CVE in Relativistic Hydrodynamics

• Hydrodynamics with anomalous current (Son-Surowka 2009):

$$\partial_{\alpha}T^{\alpha\beta} = F^{\beta\gamma}J_{\gamma}; \qquad \partial_{\alpha}J^{\alpha} = CE \cdot B$$

 $J = \text{normal} + C\mu B + (C\mu^2 + AT^2)\omega$

- Chiral Vortical Effect: $J \sim \omega$ (Vilenkin 1980, Erdmenger *et al* 2009)
- CME/CVE currents do not exert drag (Rajagopal-Sadofyev 2015), but, unlike superconducting currents, *can* carry entropy in the "no-drag" frame (MS-Yee 2015)

 $S = normal + ATB + A\mu T\omega$

- Interesting applications of CME/CVE in non-equilibrium conditions

 such as heavy-ion collisions, or high-frequency response –
 beyond hydro.
- Kinetic theory: a non-equilibrium description
- Important for understanding the mechanism of CME/CVE.

• Kin. regime: collisions are rare enough that motion is classical.

Each particle follows classical trajectory x(t), p(t). A "cloud" f(x, p) evolves with time. In a comoving 6-volume, the number of particles can only be changed by collisions:

$$\frac{df}{dt} \equiv \frac{\partial f}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial f}{\partial \boldsymbol{x}} \dot{\boldsymbol{x}} + \frac{\partial f}{\partial \boldsymbol{p}} \dot{\boldsymbol{p}} = C[f].$$



Ignore collisions for now.

- The number of particles in the phase space cannot change?
- How can *classical* equation account for *quantum* anomaly?

• Kin. regime: collisions are rare enough that motion is classical.

Each particle follows classical trajectory x(t), p(t). A "cloud" f(x, p) evolves with time. In a comoving 6-volume, the number of particles can only be changed by collisions:

$$\frac{df}{dt} \equiv \frac{\partial f}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial f}{\partial \boldsymbol{x}} \dot{\boldsymbol{x}} + \frac{\partial f}{\partial \boldsymbol{p}} \dot{\boldsymbol{p}} = C[f].$$



Ignore collisions for now.

- The number of particles in the phase space cannot change?
- How can *classical* equation account for *quantum* anomaly?

Action, Berry phase and e.o.m.s

The answer — Berry phase.

Change of momentum direction requires rotation in (quantum) spin space, which adds a phase to the action:

$$\mathcal{I} = \int (\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{A}) \cdot d\mathbf{x} - (\mathcal{E} + \Phi) dt \underbrace{- \mathbf{a}_{\mathbf{p}} \cdot d\mathbf{p}}_{\text{Berry phase } \mathcal{O}(\hbar)}$$

Equations of motion

$$\dot{\boldsymbol{x}} - \boldsymbol{v} - \overbrace{\boldsymbol{\dot{p}} \times \boldsymbol{b}}^{\text{anomi, velocity}} = 0;$$

 $\dot{\boldsymbol{p}} - \boldsymbol{E} - \dot{\boldsymbol{x}} \times \boldsymbol{B} = 0;$

 $v = \partial \mathcal{E} / \partial p, \ \mathcal{E} \equiv |p| - \frac{\hat{p} \cdot B}{2|p|}$ Berry curvature:

$$m{b}\equivm{
abla}_p imesm{a}_p=rac{\hat{p}}{2|p|^2}.$$

The invariant measure now is

s
$$(2\pi)^3$$
 VG, with

Action, Berry phase and e.o.m.s

The answer — Berry phase.

Change of momentum direction requires rotation in (quantum) spin space, which adds a phase to the action:

$$\mathcal{I} = \int (\boldsymbol{p} + \boldsymbol{A}) \cdot d\boldsymbol{x} - (\mathcal{E} + \Phi) dt \underbrace{- \boldsymbol{a}_{\boldsymbol{p}} \cdot d\boldsymbol{p}}_{\text{Berry phase } \mathcal{O}(\hbar)}$$

Equations of motion

$$\dot{\boldsymbol{x}} - \boldsymbol{v} - \overbrace{\boldsymbol{\dot{p}} \times \boldsymbol{b}}^{\text{anom. velocity}} = 0;$$

 $\dot{\boldsymbol{p}} - \boldsymbol{E} - \dot{\boldsymbol{x}} \times \boldsymbol{B} = 0;$

 $v = \partial \mathcal{E} / \partial p, \ \mathcal{E} \equiv |p| - \frac{\hat{p} \cdot B}{2|p|}.$ Berry curvature:

$$m{b} \equiv m{
abla}_{m{p}} imes m{a}_{m{p}} = rac{\hat{m{p}}}{2|m{p}|^2}.$$

The invariant measure now i

Action, Berry phase and e.o.m.s

The answer — Berry phase.

Change of momentum direction requires rotation in (quantum) spin space, which adds a phase to the action:

$$\mathcal{I} = \int (\mathbf{p} + \mathbf{A}) \cdot d\mathbf{x} - (\mathcal{E} + \Phi) dt \underbrace{- \mathbf{a}_{\mathbf{p}} \cdot d\mathbf{p}}_{\text{Berry phase } \mathcal{O}(\hbar)}$$

Equations of motion

 $m{v} = \partial \mathcal{E} / \partial m{p}, \ \mathcal{E} \equiv |m{p}| - rac{\hat{m{p}} \cdot m{B}}{2|m{p}|}.$ Berry curvature:

The invariant measure now is

anom. velocity

is
$$\frac{d^3 \boldsymbol{x} d^3 \boldsymbol{p}}{(2\pi)^3} \sqrt{G}$$
, with $\sqrt{G} = 1 + \boldsymbol{b} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}$.

Liouville equation is now anomalous at p = 0:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\sqrt{G} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \boldsymbol{x}}(\sqrt{G}\boldsymbol{\dot{x}}) + \frac{\partial}{\partial \boldsymbol{p}}(\sqrt{G}\boldsymbol{\dot{p}}) = (\boldsymbol{E}\cdot\boldsymbol{B})\underbrace{(\boldsymbol{\nabla}_{\boldsymbol{p}}\cdot\boldsymbol{b})}_{2\pi\delta^{3}(\boldsymbol{p})},$$

Thus current is not conserved:

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{J} = \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B} f|_{\boldsymbol{p}=0} \,,$$

Berry "monopole" at p = 0 acts as source/sink of particle number current. Region $p \leq \sqrt{B}$ is quantum. "Level crossing" at p = 0. Liouville equation is now anomalous at p = 0:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\sqrt{G} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \boldsymbol{x}}(\sqrt{G}\boldsymbol{\dot{x}}) + \frac{\partial}{\partial \boldsymbol{p}}(\sqrt{G}\boldsymbol{\dot{p}}) = (\boldsymbol{E}\cdot\boldsymbol{B})\underbrace{(\boldsymbol{\nabla}_{\boldsymbol{p}}\cdot\boldsymbol{b})}_{2\pi\delta^{3}(\boldsymbol{p})},$$

Thus current is not conserved:

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{J} = \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B} f|_{\boldsymbol{p}=0} \,,$$

Berry "monopole" at p = 0 acts as source/sink of particle number current. Region $p \leq \sqrt{B}$ is quantum. "Level crossing" at p = 0. Liouville equation is now anomalous at p = 0:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t}\sqrt{G} + \frac{\partial}{\partial \boldsymbol{x}}(\sqrt{G}\boldsymbol{\dot{x}}) + \frac{\partial}{\partial \boldsymbol{p}}(\sqrt{G}\boldsymbol{\dot{p}}) = (\boldsymbol{E}\cdot\boldsymbol{B})\underbrace{(\boldsymbol{\nabla}_{\boldsymbol{p}}\cdot\boldsymbol{b})}_{2\pi\delta^{3}(\boldsymbol{p})},$$

Thus current is not conserved:

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \boldsymbol{J} = \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B} f|_{\boldsymbol{p}=0},$$

classical region

Berry "monopole" at p = 0 acts as source/sink of particle number current. Region $p \leq \sqrt{B}$ is quantum. "Level crossing" at p = 0. $p_{\lesssim \sqrt{B}}$ $J_{
m anom} \sim (E \cdot B) b$

• Solving eoms for \dot{x} :



CVE: Coriolis force

(Yin-MS 2012)

$$\dot{\boldsymbol{p}} = 2\mathcal{E}\,\dot{\boldsymbol{x}}\times\boldsymbol{\omega}$$
 i.e., $\boldsymbol{B}
ightarrow 2\mathcal{E}\boldsymbol{\omega}$.

 \bullet Then CME \longrightarrow CVE

$$J_{\text{CME}} = B \int_{p} f \hat{p} \cdot b \quad \longrightarrow \quad J_{\text{CVE}} = \omega \int_{p} 2\mathcal{E} f \hat{p} \cdot b \rightarrow \frac{1}{4\pi^{2}} \mu^{2} \omega$$

• Solving eoms for \dot{x} :



CVE: Coriolis force

(Yin-MS 2012)

$$\dot{\boldsymbol{p}} = 2\mathcal{E}\,\dot{\boldsymbol{x}}\times\boldsymbol{\omega}$$
 i.e., $\boldsymbol{B}
ightarrow 2\mathcal{E}\boldsymbol{\omega}$.

 \bullet Then CME \longrightarrow CVE

$$J_{\text{CME}} = B \int_{p} f \hat{p} \cdot b \quad \longrightarrow \quad J_{\text{CVE}} = \omega \int_{p} 2\mathcal{E} f \hat{p} \cdot b \rightarrow \frac{1}{4\pi^{2}} \mu^{2} \omega$$

Solving eoms for x:



CVE: Coriolis force

(Yin-MS 2012)

$$\dot{\boldsymbol{p}} = 2\mathcal{E}\,\dot{\boldsymbol{x}}\times\boldsymbol{\omega}$$
 i.e., $\boldsymbol{B} \rightarrow 2\mathcal{E}\boldsymbol{\omega}$.

 \bullet Then CME \longrightarrow CVE

$$oldsymbol{J}_{ ext{CME}} = oldsymbol{B} \int_{oldsymbol{p}} f \hat{oldsymbol{p}} \cdot oldsymbol{b} \quad \longrightarrow \quad oldsymbol{J}_{ ext{CVE}} = oldsymbol{\omega} \int_{oldsymbol{p}} 2\mathcal{E} f \hat{oldsymbol{p}} \cdot oldsymbol{b} o rac{1}{4\pi^2} \mu^2 oldsymbol{\omega}$$

Puzzle 2: Where is Lorentz invariance?

$$\mathcal{I} = \int (\boldsymbol{p} + \boldsymbol{A}) \cdot d\boldsymbol{x} - (|\boldsymbol{p}| + \Phi) dt - \boldsymbol{a}_{\boldsymbol{p}} \cdot d\boldsymbol{p} + \frac{\hat{\boldsymbol{p}} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|} dt$$

Modified Lorentz transfromation:

PRL 113(2014)182302

$$\delta \boldsymbol{x} = \boldsymbol{\beta} t + \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta} \times \hat{\boldsymbol{p}}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|}, \quad \delta \boldsymbol{p} = \boldsymbol{\beta} \boldsymbol{\mathcal{E}} + \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta} \times \hat{\boldsymbol{p}}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|} \times \boldsymbol{B}, \quad \delta t = \boldsymbol{\beta} \cdot \boldsymbol{x}.$$

• Side jump.

• Magnetic moment ($m = \frac{\hat{p}}{2|p|}$) needed by Lorentz invariance (Son-Yamamoto)

Puzzle 2: Where is Lorentz invariance?

$$\mathcal{I} = \int (\boldsymbol{p} + \boldsymbol{A}) \cdot d\boldsymbol{x} - (|\boldsymbol{p}| + \Phi) dt - \boldsymbol{a}_{\boldsymbol{p}} \cdot d\boldsymbol{p} + \frac{\hat{\boldsymbol{p}} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|} dt$$

Modified Lorentz transfromation:

PRL 113(2014)182302

$$\delta \boldsymbol{x} = \boldsymbol{\beta} t + \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta} \times \hat{\boldsymbol{p}}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|}, \quad \delta \boldsymbol{p} = \boldsymbol{\beta} \boldsymbol{\mathcal{E}} + \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta} \times \hat{\boldsymbol{p}}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|} \times \boldsymbol{B}, \quad \delta t = \boldsymbol{\beta} \cdot \boldsymbol{x}.$$

- Side jump.
- Magnetic moment ($m = \frac{\hat{p}}{2|p|}$) needed by Lorentz invariance (Son-Yamamoto)

Noether current: $\mathcal{I} = \ldots + \int \mathbf{A} \cdot d\mathbf{x} + \frac{\mathbf{\hat{p}}}{2|\mathbf{p}|} \cdot \mathbf{B} dt$



This current is Lorentz covariant

Boost, side jump and angular momentum conservation



 $P_{in} = P_{out} = 0$ $S_{in} = S_{out} = 0$ $L_{in} = L_{out} = 0$

 $\begin{aligned} \boldsymbol{P}_{\mathrm{in}} &= \boldsymbol{P}_{\mathrm{out}} \\ \boldsymbol{S}_{\mathrm{in}} &= 0, \quad \boldsymbol{S}_{\mathrm{out}} = \bigstar \mathcal{O}(\hbar) \\ \boldsymbol{L}_{\mathrm{in}} &= 0, \quad \boldsymbol{L}_{\mathrm{out}} = 0??? \end{aligned}$

Boost, side jump and angular momentum conservation



 $P_{in} = P_{out} = 0$ $S_{in} = S_{out} = 0$ $L_{in} = L_{out} = 0$

Collision kernel nonlocal

 $\begin{aligned} \boldsymbol{P}_{\text{in}} &= \boldsymbol{P}_{\text{out}} \\ \boldsymbol{S}_{\text{in}} &= 0, \quad \boldsymbol{S}_{\text{out}} = \bigstar \mathcal{O}(\hbar) \\ \boldsymbol{L}_{\text{in}} &= 0, \quad \boldsymbol{L}_{\text{out}} = \bigstar \end{aligned}$ "Side jump"

• No spin - no problem. Lorentz invariant form:

$$\partial_{\mu}j^{\mu} = \int\limits_{BCD} \underbrace{C_{ABCD}}_{W_{CD \to AB} - W_{AB \to CD}}$$

$$j^{\mu} = p^{\mu}f$$

• No spin – no problem. Lorentz invariant form:

$$\partial_{\mu}j^{\mu} = \int\limits_{BCD} \underbrace{C_{ABCD}}_{W_{CD \to AB} - W_{AB \to CD}}$$

$$j^{\mu} = p^{\mu}f$$

- Problems with spin:
- *f* is not a Lorentz scalar. Particle positions are frame-dependent.
- Side jump during collisions.

Position and spin in relativistic mechanics

• Center of mass (center of rotation) is frame dependent already in *classical* relativity.

The side jump in frame n' relative to n:

$$\Delta^{\mu}_{nn'} = \lambda \, \frac{\epsilon^{\mu\alpha\beta\gamma} p_{\alpha} n_{\beta} n'_{\gamma}}{(p \cdot n)(p \cdot n')} \, .$$



this is finite generalization of side jump (PRL 115(2015)021601)

• Correspondingly: $f_n(x) = f_{n'}(x + \Delta_{nn'})$.

Collisionfull CKT

Chen-Son-MS, PRL 115(2015)021601



Collisionfull CKT

Chen-Son-MS, PRL 115(2015)021601



$$\mathcal{H}^{\mu} = p^{\mu}\mathcal{H} + S^{\mu\nu}\partial_{\nu}\mathcal{H} + \int_{BCD} C_{ABCD}\,\bar{\Delta}^{\mu}\,\frac{\partial\mathcal{H}}{\partial f}$$

$$\mathcal{H} = f \ln \frac{1}{f} + (1 - f) \ln \frac{1}{1 - f} \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \boxed{\partial_{\mu} \mathcal{H}^{\mu} \ge 0}$$

• Equilibrium solution ($\partial_{\mu}\mathcal{H}^{\mu}=0$) is a rotating FD distribution.

$$\boldsymbol{J}_{\text{CVE}} = \frac{\mu^2}{4\pi^2} \left(\underbrace{\frac{1}{3}}_{=} + \underbrace{\frac{2}{3}}_{=} \right) \boldsymbol{\omega}$$

normal mag. curren

• No drag on a static impurity, but $m{S}_{
m CVE}=rac{\mu T}{6}m{\omega}$ is not zero.

$$\mathcal{H}^{\mu} = p^{\mu} \mathcal{H} + S^{\mu\nu} \partial_{\nu} \mathcal{H} + \int_{BCD} C_{ABCD} \bar{\Delta}^{\mu} \frac{\partial \mathcal{H}}{\partial f}$$

$$\mathcal{H} = f \ln \frac{1}{f} + (1 - f) \ln \frac{1}{1 - f} \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \boxed{\partial_{\mu} \mathcal{H}^{\mu} \ge 0}$$

• Equilibrium solution ($\partial_{\mu}\mathcal{H}^{\mu}=0$) is a rotating FD distribution.

• No drag on a static impurity, but $S_{CVE} = \frac{\mu T}{6} \omega$ is not zero.

$$\mathcal{H}^{\mu} = p^{\mu} \mathcal{H} + S^{\mu\nu} \partial_{\nu} \mathcal{H} + \int_{BCD} C_{ABCD} \bar{\Delta}^{\mu} \frac{\partial \mathcal{H}}{\partial f}$$

$$\mathcal{H} = f \ln \frac{1}{f} + (1 - f) \ln \frac{1}{1 - f} \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \boxed{\partial_{\mu} \mathcal{H}^{\mu} \ge 0}$$

• Equilibrium solution ($\partial_{\mu}\mathcal{H}^{\mu}=0$) is a rotating FD distribution.



• No drag on a static impurity, but $S_{\rm CVE} = rac{\mu T}{6} \omega$ is not zero.

$$\mathcal{H}^{\mu} = p^{\mu} \mathcal{H} + S^{\mu\nu} \partial_{\nu} \mathcal{H} + \int_{BCD} C_{ABCD} \bar{\Delta}^{\mu} \frac{\partial \mathcal{H}}{\partial f}$$

$$\mathcal{H} = f \ln \frac{1}{f} + (1 - f) \ln \frac{1}{1 - f} \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad \boxed{\partial_{\mu} \mathcal{H}^{\mu} \ge 0}$$

• Equilibrium solution ($\partial_{\mu}\mathcal{H}^{\mu}=0$) is a rotating FD distribution.

$$\boldsymbol{J}_{\text{CVE}} = \frac{\mu^2}{4\pi^2} \left(\underbrace{\frac{1}{3}}_{\text{normal}} + \underbrace{\frac{2}{3}}_{\text{mag. current}}\right) \boldsymbol{\omega}$$

• No drag on a static impurity, but $m{S}_{
m CVE}=rac{\mu T}{6}m{\omega}$ is not zero.

Summary/Conclusions

- Spin adds O(ħ) terms to EOMs: Berry curvature and magnetic mom.
- Berry monopole accounts for CME and anomaly (source/sink at p = 0).

- CVE from CKT in two ways: rotating frame or rotating distribution
- Nontrivial Lorentz invariance: side jump to conserve L + S; and requires $\Delta \mathcal{E} = -m \cdot B$.
- Lorentz invariance requires side jumps in collision kernel and jump currents



 $B
ightarrow 2 \mathcal{E} \boldsymbol{\omega}$

 $oldsymbol{J} = \langle \dot{oldsymbol{x}}
angle + oldsymbol{
abla} imes oldsymbol{M} \ 1/3 \ 2/3$

$$\delta \boldsymbol{x} = \boldsymbol{\beta} t + \frac{\boldsymbol{\beta} \times \hat{\boldsymbol{p}}}{2|\boldsymbol{p}|}$$



More

CPT

Same equations with opposite signs of B, E and b.

The charge current is $j=j_+-j_-.$ The anomaly

$$\partial_{\mu}j^{\mu} = (\boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B}) \int_{\boldsymbol{p}} f_{+} \boldsymbol{\nabla}_{\boldsymbol{p}} \boldsymbol{b} - (\boldsymbol{a}/\boldsymbol{p}) = \frac{1}{4\pi^{2}} \boldsymbol{E} \cdot \boldsymbol{B} \underbrace{(f_{+} + f_{-})_{\boldsymbol{p}=\boldsymbol{0}}}_{= 1 \text{ for all } T \text{ and } \mu}.$$