



Resolving Color and Kinematics for QCD Amplitudes

based on work with Henrik JOHANSSON arXiv:1507.00332 [hep-ph]

Alexander OCHIROV Higgs Centre, Edinburgh University

CALC2015, JINR, Dubna, 27/07/2015

Review: KK relations

Kleiss, Kuijf (1988) [1]

/ 31

Color ordering \Rightarrow (n-1)!/2 primitive amplitudes: $\mathcal{A}_{n,0}^{\text{tree}} = \sum_{\sigma \in S_{n-1}(\{2,\dots,n\})} \operatorname{Tr} \left(T^{a_1} T^{a_{\sigma(2)}} \dots T^{a_{\sigma(n)}} \right) A(1,\sigma(2),\dots,\sigma(n))$

KK relations:

$$A(1,\beta,2,\alpha) = (-1)^{|\beta|} \sum_{\sigma \in \alpha \sqcup \beta^T} A(1,2,\sigma)$$

 \Rightarrow KK basis:

-

$$\left\{A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\sigma) \mid \sigma \in S_{n-2}(\{3,\ldots,n\})\right\}$$

 \Rightarrow DDM decomposition:

$$\mathcal{A}_{n,0}^{\text{tree}} = \sum_{\sigma \in S_{n-2}(\{3,...,n\})} \tilde{f}^{a_2 a_{\sigma(3)} b_1} \tilde{f}^{b_1 a_{\sigma(4)} b_2} \dots \tilde{f}^{b_{n-3} a_{\sigma(n)} a_1}$$

Review: DDM decomposition

 \mathcal{A}

Del Duca, Dixon, Maltoni (1999) [2, 3]

$$\begin{aligned} \sigma(3) \ \sigma(4) & \dots & \sigma(n) \\ 2 \ \mathbf{Q} \ \mathbf{Q}$$

Invitation: Loop level applications

Badger, Mogull, AO, O'Connell (2015) [4]

A(1,2,3,4) + A(1,2,4,3) + A(1,4,2,3) = 0





Invitation: Loop level application

Badger, Mogull, AO, O'Connell (2015) [4]

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{A}_{5}^{2\text{-loop}}(1^{+},2^{+},3^{+},4^{+},5^{+}) &= \\ ig^{7}\sum_{\sigma\in S_{5}}\int\left\{C\left(\square\square\right)\left(\frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) + \Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) + \frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) \\ &+ \frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right) + \Delta\left(\square\square\right) + \frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) \\ &+ C\left(\square\square\square\right)\left(\frac{1}{4}\Delta\left(\square\square\right) + \frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) + \frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) \\ &- \Delta\left(\square\square\right) + \frac{1}{4}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) \\ &+ C\left(\square\square\square\right)\left(\frac{1}{4}\Delta\left(\square\square\right) + \frac{1}{2}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) \\ &+ C\left(\square\square\square\right) + \frac{1}{4}\Delta\left(\square\square\right)\right) \end{aligned}$$

Invitation: Outline

$$\mathcal{A} = \sum_{i} C_{i} A_{i}$$

n particles:	color	kinematics	
	KK relations \Rightarrow	BCJ relations \Rightarrow	
n gluons only	KK basis, $(n-2)! \Rightarrow$	BCJ basis, $(n-3)!$	
	DDM decomposition		
(n-2k) gluons	KK relations \Rightarrow	new BCJ relations?	
k quark pairs	Melia basis, $(n-2)!/k! \Rightarrow$	reduced BCJ basis?	
	new color decomposition?		

This talk: all question marks resolved and more!

QCD color structure



Pure-quark Melia basis

Melia (2013) [5]

$$\left\{A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\sigma)\ \big|\ \sigma\in \operatorname{Dyck}_{k-1}\right\}$$

Dyck word = well-formed brackets

pure-quark $\mathcal{A}_{6,3}(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \underline{3}, \overline{4}, \underline{5}, \overline{6})$: fix $\underline{1}, \overline{2}$; rest must form Dyck words of length 4

 $\begin{array}{rcl} \mathrm{XYXY} & \Rightarrow & (\underline{3}, \overline{4}, \underline{5}, \overline{6}), \, (\underline{5}, \overline{6}, \underline{3}, \overline{4}) \\ \mathrm{XXYY} & \Rightarrow & (\underline{3}, \underline{5}, \overline{6}, \overline{4}), \, (\underline{5}, \underline{3}, \overline{4}, \overline{6}) \\ & \Leftrightarrow & \left\{3\{5\ 6\}4\right\}, \, \left\{5\{3\ 4\}6\right\} \end{array}$

Melia basis for n = 6, k = 3:

 $A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\underline{3},\overline{4},\underline{5},\overline{6})\,,A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\underline{5},\overline{6},\underline{3},\overline{4})\,,A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\underline{3},\underline{5},\overline{6},\overline{4})\,,A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\underline{5},\underline{3},\overline{4},\overline{6})$

Melia basis of primitive amplitudes

Melia (2013) [5, 6]

$$\left\{A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\sigma) \mid \sigma \in \operatorname{Dyck}_{k-1} \times \{\operatorname{gluon insertions}\}_{n-2k}\right\}$$

Melia basis for n = 5, k = 2:

$$A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, 5, \underline{3}, \overline{4}), A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \underline{3}, 5, \overline{4}), A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \underline{3}, \overline{4}, 5)$$



New color decomposition

$$\mathcal{A}_{n,k}^{\text{tree}} = \sum_{\sigma \in \text{Melia basis}}^{\varkappa(n,k)} C(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \sigma) A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \sigma) ,$$
$$C(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \sigma) = (-1)^{k-1} \left\{ 2|\sigma|1 \right\} \begin{vmatrix} \underline{q} & \to \left\{ q | T^b \otimes \Xi_{l-1}^b \\ \underline{q} & \to \left| q \right\} \\ g & \to \Xi_l^{a_g} \end{vmatrix}$$
$$\Xi_l^a = \sum_{s=1}^l \underbrace{1 \otimes \cdots \otimes 1 \otimes T^a \otimes 1 \otimes \cdots \otimes 1 \otimes \overline{1}}_l$$

checked analytically up to 8 points

5-point color example

. .

$$\mathcal{A}_{5,2}^{\text{tree}} = C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} + C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} + C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}}$$

$$C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} = -\{2|\Xi_{1}^{a_{5}}\{3|T^{b}\otimes\Xi_{1}^{b}|4\}|1\} = -(\overline{T}^{a_{5}}\overline{T}^{b})_{\overline{i}_{2}i_{1}}T_{i_{3}\overline{i}_{4}}^{b} = \underbrace{3}_{\underline{2}} \underbrace{4}_{\underline{2}} \underbrace{4}_{\underline{2}}$$

Reminder: $C(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \sigma) = (-1)^{k-1} \{2|\sigma|1\} \begin{vmatrix} \underline{q} & \to \{q| T^b \otimes \Xi_{l-1}^b \\ \overline{q} & \to |q\} \\ g & \to \Xi_l^{a_g} \end{vmatrix}$

Tensor representation



Higher-point color example



 $C(\underline{1},\overline{2},13,\underline{3},\underline{5},\overline{6},\overline{4},\underline{7},\underline{9},14,\underline{11},\overline{12},\overline{10},\overline{8}):$



QCD color structure



Review: BCJ color-kinematics duality

Bern, Carrasco, Johansson (2008,10) [7, 8] Johansson, AO (2014) [9]



works for color check/impose on kinematics

Review: BCJ double copy



$$\mathcal{M}_4^{\text{tree}} = i\left(\frac{n_s^2}{s} + \frac{n_t^2}{t} + \frac{n_u^2}{u}\right)$$

Extends to any multiplicity, loop order and group rep.

Bern, Carrasco, Johansson (2008,10) [7, 8]

Johansson, AO (2014) [9]

Review: BCJ relations

Bern, Carrasco, Johansson (2008) [7]

$$\mathcal{A}_{n,k}^{\text{tree}} = \sum_{\text{cubic graphs } \Gamma_i} \frac{c_i n_i}{D_i}$$

$$c_i - c_j = c_k \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad n_i - n_j = n_k$$

$$\Rightarrow$$

$$\sum_{i=2}^{n-1} \left(\sum_{j=2}^i s_{jn}\right) A(1, 2, \dots, i, n, i+1, \dots, n-1) = 0$$

All other BCJ relations can be derived from relabelings thereof. Feng, Huang, Jia (2010) [10]

 \Rightarrow

basis of (n-3)! primitives

4-point kinematic example



 $n_1 - n_2 - n_3 \propto \bar{u}_1 \not\!\!\!\!\!/_1 \not\!\!\!/_3 \not\!\!/_4 v_2 + \bar{u}_1 \not\!\!/_3 \not\!\!/_4 \not\!\!\!/_2 v_2 - (\varepsilon_3 \cdot \varepsilon_4) (\bar{u}_1 (\not\!\!\!/_1 + \not\!\!/_2) v_2) = 0$

4-point amplitude relation

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{A}_{4,1}^{\text{tree}} &= \frac{c_1 n_1}{D_1} + \frac{c_2 n_2}{D_2} + \frac{c_3 n_3}{D_3} = c_1 \left(\frac{n_1}{D_1} + \frac{n_3}{D_3} \right) + c_2 \left(\frac{n_2}{D_2} - \frac{n_3}{D_3} \right) \\ &\equiv c_2 A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}34} + c_1 A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}43} \\ A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}34} &= \frac{n_2}{D_2} - \frac{n_3}{D_3} = \left(\frac{1}{D_2} + \frac{1}{D_3} \right) n_2 - \frac{n_1}{D_3} \\ &A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}43} &= \frac{n_1}{D_1} + \frac{n_3}{D_3} = \left(\frac{1}{D_1} + \frac{1}{D_3} \right) n_1 - \frac{n_2}{D_3} \end{aligned}$$

$$\Rightarrow \qquad A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}34} = \left(\frac{1}{D_2} + \frac{1}{D_3} - \frac{D_1}{(D_1 + D_3)D_3}\right)n_2 - \frac{D_1}{D_1 + D_3}A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}43}$$

$$\Rightarrow \qquad (s_{14} - m^2)A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}34} = (s_{13} - m^2)A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}43}$$

$$\mathcal{A}_{4,1}^{\text{tree}} = \left(T_{\bar{\imath}_{2j}}^{a_3} T_{\bar{\jmath}_{11}}^{a_4} + T_{\bar{\imath}_{2j}}^{a_4} T_{\bar{\jmath}_{11}}^{a_3} \frac{s_{14} - m^2}{s_{13} - m^2} \right) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}34}$$

5-point kinematic example

$$3, k = 4, \bar{l}$$

$$5, a = \frac{i}{2\sqrt{2}} \frac{1}{(s_{15} - m_1^2)s_{34}} T^a_{i\bar{m}} T^b_{m\bar{j}} T^b_{k\bar{l}} (\bar{u}_1 \varphi_5(\not\!\!\!\!/_{1,5} + m_1)\gamma^{\mu} v_2) (\bar{u}_3 \gamma_{\mu} v_4) = \frac{c_1 n_1}{D_1}$$

$$3, k = 4, \bar{l}$$

$$5, a = \frac{-i}{2\sqrt{2}} \frac{1}{(s_{25} - m_2^2)s_{34}} T^b_{i\bar{m}} T^a_{m\bar{j}} T^b_{k\bar{l}} (\bar{u}_1 \gamma^{\mu}(\not\!\!\!/_{2,5} - m_2)\varphi_5 v_2) (\bar{u}_3 \gamma_{\mu} v_4) = \frac{c_2 n_2}{D_2}$$

$$3, k = 4, \bar{l} = \frac{4}{\sqrt{2}}, \bar{l} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}, \bar$$

$c_1 - c_2 = c_5$	$c_3 - c_4 = -c_5$
$n_1 - n_2 = n_5$	$n_3 - n_4 = -n_5$

$$\Rightarrow (s_{35} - m_3^2) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} + (s_{12} - s_{34}) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} - (s_{25} - m_2^2) A_{\underline{1}5\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}} = 0$$

or $(s_{25} - m_2^2) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} + (s_{14} - s_{23}) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} - (s_{15} - m_1^2) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} = 0$

BCJ relations for QCD

purely gluonic:

$$\sum_{i=2}^{n-1} \left(\sum_{j=2}^{i} s_{jn}\right) A(1, 2, \dots, i, n, i+1, \dots, n-1) = 0$$

becomes

$$\sum_{i=2}^{n-1} \left(\sum_{j=2}^{i} s_{jn} - m_j^2 \right) A(1, 2, \dots, i, n, i+1, \dots, n-1) = 0$$

where *n* is a gluon

number of independent BCJ relations:

$k \setminus n$	3	4	5	6	7	8
0	0	1	4	18	96	600
1	0	1	4	18	96	600
2	-	0	1	6	36	240
3	-	-	-	0	4	40
4	-	-	-	-	-	0

Solution to BCJ relations for QCD

General BCJ relations:

$$A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \alpha, \underline{q}, \beta) = \sum_{\sigma \in S(\alpha) \sqcup \beta} A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \underline{q}, \sigma) \prod_{i=1}^{|\alpha|} \frac{\mathcal{F}(q, \sigma, 1|i)}{s_{2,\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_i} - m_2^2} \,,$$

where α is purely gluonic

Melia basis of (n-2)!/k! primitives $\{A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \sigma) \mid \sigma \in \text{Dyck}_{k-1} \times \{\text{gluon insertions}\}_{n-2k}\}$ \Rightarrow new BCJ basis of (n-3)!(2k-2)/k! primitives $\{A(\underline{1}, \overline{2}, \underline{q}, \sigma) \mid \{\underline{q}, \sigma\} \in \text{Dyck}_{k-1} \times \{\text{gluon insertions in } \sigma\}_{n-2k}\}$

New amplitude decomposition

Full color-dressed amplutude in terms of only (n-3)!(2k-2)/k! color-ordered primitive amplitudes:

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{A}_{n,k\geq 2}^{\text{tree}} &= \sum_{(\underline{q},\sigma)\in\text{ BCJ basis}} A(\underline{1},\overline{2},\underline{q},\sigma) \\ &\times \left\{ C(\underline{1},\overline{2},\underline{q},\sigma) + \sum_{\substack{\beta \subset \sigma \\ \sigma \setminus \beta \text{ gluonic}}} \sum_{\alpha \in S(\sigma \setminus \beta)} C(\underline{1},\overline{2},\alpha,\underline{q},\beta) \prod_{i=1}^{|\alpha|} \frac{\mathcal{F}(q,\sigma,1|i)}{s_{2,\alpha_{1},...,\alpha_{i}} - m_{2}^{2}} \right\} \\ \mathcal{A}_{n,k\leq 1}^{\text{tree}} &= \sum_{\alpha \in S_{n-3}(\{4,...,n\})} A(1,2,3,\sigma) \\ &\times \left\{ C(1,2,3,\sigma) + \sum_{\beta \subset \sigma} \sum_{\alpha \in S(\sigma \setminus \beta)} C(1,2,\alpha,3,\beta) \prod_{i=1}^{|\alpha|} \frac{\mathcal{F}(3,\sigma,1|i)}{s_{2,\alpha_{1},...,\alpha_{i}} - m_{2}^{2}} \right\} \\ &\text{ or } (n-3)! \text{ primitives for } k = 0,1 \end{split}$$

Conclusions

- ► New color decomposition for any quark-gluon tree amplitude in basis of (n - 2)!/k! primitives
- ▶ Can be used inside loops similarly to DDM decomposition
- Color-kinematics duality for massive quarks
- ▶ New BCJ relations for any quark-gluon tree amplitude
- ► Reduced basis of (n-3)!(2k-2)!/k! primitives (or (n-3)! for k = 1, 0)
- ▶ New amplitude decomposition after KK and BCJ relations

Thank you!

Backup slides

6-point color example

 $\mathcal{A}_{6,3}^{\text{tree}} = C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}\underline{5}\overline{6}} \, A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}\underline{5}\overline{6}} + C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{5}\overline{6}\underline{3}\overline{4}} \, A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{5}\overline{6}\underline{3}\overline{4}} + C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\underline{5}\overline{6}\overline{4}} \, A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\underline{5}\overline{6}\overline{4}} + C_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{5}\underline{3}\overline{4}\overline{6}} \, A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{5}\underline{3}\overline{4}\overline{6}} \, A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{5}\underline{5}\underline{5}\overline{4}} \, A_{\underline{1}\underline{5}\underline{5}\underline{5}\underline{5}} \, A_{\underline{5}\underline{5}} \, A_{\underline{5}} \, A_{\underline{5}\underline{5}} \,$



Review: Double copy for loops

Bern, Carrasco, Johansson (2010) [8]

$$\mathcal{A}_m^{L\text{-loop}} = i^L \sum_i \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{DL}} \frac{1}{S_i} \frac{n_i c_i}{D_i}$$

$$c_i - c_j = c_k \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad n_i - n_j = n_k$$
$$c_i \to -c_i \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad n_i \to -n_i$$

$$\mathcal{M}_m^{L\text{-loop}} = i^{L+1} \sum_i \int \frac{d^{LD}\ell}{(2\pi)^{DL}} \frac{1}{S_i} \frac{n_i n_i'}{D_i}$$

Similarly for fundamental representation

Johansson, AO (2014) [9]

5-point amplitude relation

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{A}_{5,2}^{\text{tree}} &= \frac{c_1 n_1}{D_1} + \frac{c_2 n_2}{D_2} + \frac{c_3 n_3}{D_3} + \frac{c_4 n_4}{D_4} + \frac{c_5 n_5}{D_5} = -c_2 A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} - c_1 A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} + (-c_1 + c_4) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} \\ & A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} = -\frac{n_2}{D_2} - \frac{n_3}{D_3} - \frac{n_5}{D_5} \\ & A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} = -\frac{n_1}{D_1} - \frac{n_4}{D_4} + \frac{n_5}{D_5} \\ & A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} = \frac{n_3}{D_3} + \frac{n_4}{D_4} \end{split}$$

$$\Rightarrow \quad (s_{35} - m_3^2) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} + (s_{12} - s_{34}) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} - (s_{25} - m_2^2) A_{\underline{1}5\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}} = 0 \text{or} \quad (s_{25} - m_2^2) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}5\underline{3}\overline{4}} + (s_{14} - s_{23}) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}5\overline{4}} - (s_{15} - m_1^2) A_{\underline{1}\overline{2}\underline{3}\overline{4}5} = 0$$

$$\mathcal{A}_{5,2}^{\text{tree}} = \left(T_{i_1 \bar{\imath}_2}^b T_{i_3 \bar{\jmath}}^{a_5} T_{j \bar{\imath}_4}^b + T_{i_1 \bar{\jmath}}^b T_{j \bar{\imath}_2}^{a_5} T_{i_3 \bar{\imath}_4}^b \frac{s_{35} - m_3^2}{s_{25} - m_2^2} \right) A_{\underline{1} \overline{2} \underline{3} 5 \overline{4}} \\ - \left(T_{i_1 \bar{\jmath}}^{a_5} T_{j \bar{\imath}_2}^b T_{i_3 \bar{\imath}_4}^b + T_{i_1 \bar{\jmath}}^b T_{j \bar{\imath}_2}^{a_5} T_{i_3 \bar{\imath}_4}^b \frac{s_{15} - m_1^2}{s_{25} - m_2^2} \right) A_{\underline{1} \overline{2} \underline{3} \overline{4} 5}$$

29/31

New formula for gravitational scattering amplitudes

$$\mathcal{A}_{n,k}^{\text{tree}} = \sum_{\sigma \in \text{Melia basis}} C(1,2,\sigma) A(1,2,\sigma) \,,$$

 $C(1,2,\sigma)$ is constructed out of c_i

$$\mathcal{M}_{n,k}^{\text{tree}} = \sum_{\sigma \in \text{Melia basis}} K(1,2,\sigma) A(1,2,\sigma) \,,$$

 $K(1,2,\sigma)$ is constructed out of n_i

Gravity coupled to massive scalars, fermions, vectors

References

- R. Kleiss and H. Kuijf Nucl. Phys. B312 (1989) 616.
- V. Del Duca, A. Frizzo, and F. Maltoni Nucl. Phys. B568 (2000) 211-262.
- V. Del Duca, L. J. Dixon, and F. Maltoni Nucl. Phys. B571 (2000) 51-70.
- S. Badger, G. Mogull, A. Ochirov, and D. O'Connell.
- T. Melia Phys. Rev. D88 (2013), no. 1 014020.
- T. Melia arXiv:1312.0599.
- Z. Bern, J. Carrasco, and H. Johansson Phys. Rev. D78 (2008) 085011.
- Z. Bern, J. J. M. Carrasco, and H. Johansson Phys. Rev. Lett. 105 (2010) 061602.
- H. Johansson and A. Ochirov arXiv:1407.4772.
- B. Feng, R. Huang, and Y. Jia Phys.Lett. B695 (2011) 350-353.