## $\eta$ Photoproduction off Neutrons

Lilian Witthauer<br>CHIPP Annual Plenary Meeting 2015

Château de Bossey June $29^{\text {th }} 2015$


## Outline

(1) Motivation

Structure of the Nucleon
Former Results
Complete Experiment
(2) Experiment

MAMI and ELSA Accelerators
A2 and CBELSA/TAPS Setup
(3) Analysis

Concept
Background Suppression
(4) Results

Unpolarised Cross Sections
Double Polarisation Observable E
(5) Summary

## QCD

- QCD: fundamental theory of strong interaction
- pQCD successful at high energies
- Low energies: PQCD not applicable
- Phenomenological descriptions: Quark Models
- Numerical methods: Lattice QCD


## confinement


S. Bethke, arXiv:hep-ex/0606035

## Structure of the Nucleon



## Mismatch between experiment and models:

- Ordering of states, missing resonances!
- Model effective dof's or experimental bias?


## Experimental Bias

- Most results only $\pi \mathrm{N}$ scattering: photoproduction

|  | PDG 2010 | PDG 2012 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{N}(1860) 5 / 2^{+}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1875) 3 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1880) 1 / 2^{+}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1895) 1 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1900) 3 / 2^{+}$ | $\star \star$ | $\star \star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(2060) 5 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(2160) 3 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\Delta(1940) 3 / 2^{-}$ | $\star$ | $\star \star$ |

A. V. Anisovich et al., Eur. Phys. J. A 48 (2012) 15

## Experimental Bias

- Most results only $\pi \mathrm{N}$ scattering: photoproduction
- Elm. excitation isospin dependent: neutron



## Experimental Bias

- Most results only $\pi \mathrm{N}$ scattering: photoproduction
- Elm. excitation isospin dependent: neutron
- Resonances broad and overlapping: $\eta$-meson

B. Krusche, arXiv:1110.0192



## Former Results $\gamma+\mathbf{d} \rightarrow \eta+\mathbf{n}+(\mathbf{p})$

## narrow structure:

$$
\mathrm{W}=1.66 \mathrm{GeV}
$$



ELSA, I.Jaeglé et al. Eur. Phys. J A47 (2011) 89

- Seen by GRAAL, LNS Sendai and CBELSA/TAPS collaborations
- Unusual properties compared to other nucleon resonances ( $\Gamma \sim 150 \mathrm{MeV}$ )
- Various explanations


## Various Explanations

## Interference of known resonances:

- BnGa: interference effects from $S_{11}(1535)$ and $S_{11}(1650)$ (Anisovich et al.)
- Giessen Model: Interference effect from $S_{11}(1650)$ and $P_{11}$ (1710) (Shklyar et al.)
- $\eta$-MAID: $D_{15}$ (1675) resonance (Chiang et al.)


## Coupled channel effects:

- s-wave model: K,$K \Sigma$ loops (Döring et al.)

New narrow resonance:

- Reggeized $\eta$-MAID: narrow $P_{11}$ (1670) (Fix et al.)
- Chiral quark soliton model: narrow $P_{11}$ state, $\mathrm{N}(1680)$ (Diakonov et al.)
$>$ Multipole analysis needed to identify quantum numbers!


## Complete Experiment

Model independent multipole analysis (Chiang \& Tabakin):

- 4 single observables: $\sigma_{0}, \Sigma, T, P$
- 4 carefully chosen double polarisation observables


$$
E=\frac{\sigma_{1 / 2}-\sigma_{3 / 2}}{\sigma_{1 / 2}+\sigma_{3 / 2}}=\frac{\sigma_{1 / 2}-\sigma_{3 / 2}}{2 \sigma_{0}}
$$

circularly polarised photons

## longitudinally polarised target

## MAinzer MIcrotron (Mainz)



## ELectron Stretcher Accelerator (Bonn)



## Experimental Setup

## A2 @ MAMI

- Continuous beam
- $E_{\gamma} \leq 1.6 \mathrm{GeV}$
- CB: 672 NaI
- TAPS: $\mathrm{BaF}_{2} \& \mathrm{PbWO}_{4}$
- PID


## TAPS



CBELSA/TAPS @ ELSA

- Quasi-continuous beam
- $E_{\gamma} \leq 3.2 \mathrm{GeV}$
- CBB: 1230 Csl
- MiniTAPS: $216 \mathrm{BaF}_{2}$
- Inner Detector


## Bremsstrahlung Tagging



- longitudinal polarised electrons
- Møller radiator
- circularly polarised photons



## Targets

## Neutron Targets

- light nuclei: deuterium, ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$



## Polarised Target

- deuterated Butanol




## Challenges of Quasi-Free Nucleons (Bound)

## Detection of recoil nucleons:

- neutrons: 10-30\% efficiency
- deposited energy $\neq$ kinetic energy
- but: kinematics completely defined without measuring energy: use only angular information


## Fermi Motion:

- momentum of the initial state nucleon not known
- smears out structures
- solution: use final state particles


## FSI:

- meson-nucleon, nucleon-nucleon
- compare quasi-free to free proton results!


## Basic Analysis Concept

- neutral and charged particles: use information from charge sensitive detectors
- event classes:

|  | $\sigma_{\mathbf{p}}$ <br>  <br>  <br> $\gamma p \rightarrow \eta p$ | $\sigma_{\mathbf{n}}$ <br> $\gamma n \rightarrow \eta n$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\eta \rightarrow 2 \gamma$ | $2 n \& 1 c$ | $3 n$ |
| $\eta \rightarrow 3 \pi^{0} \rightarrow 6 \gamma$ | $6 n \& 1 c$ | $7 n$ |

- best solution from $\chi^{2}$-test: for events with $>2$ neutral hits to find $\eta$ and recoil neutron


## Kinematical Cuts

## Missing Mass:

$$
\Delta M=\left|P_{\text {Beam }}+P_{N}^{\prime}-P_{\eta}\right|-m_{N}
$$

## Invariant Mass:

$$
M_{\gamma \gamma}=\sqrt{E_{\gamma_{1}} E_{\gamma_{1}}\left(1-\cos \psi_{12}\right)}
$$



## Other Identification Possibilities (TAPS)

Pulse Shape Analysis:


ToF versus energy:


## $\Delta E$ versus $E(C B / T A P S)$



## Extraction of Unpolarised Cross Sections

$$
\left.\frac{d \sigma}{d \Omega}\right|_{\text {unpol }}\left(E, \cos \theta_{\eta}^{*}\right)=\frac{N\left(E, \cos \theta_{\eta}^{*}\right)}{\epsilon\left(E, \cos \theta_{\eta}^{*}\right) \cdot N_{\gamma}(E) \cdot n_{t} \cdot \Gamma_{i} / \Gamma \cdot \Delta \Omega}
$$

- yields: integrate invariant mass
- photon flux
- detection efficiency: Geant, nucleon detection efficiency correction (hydrogen data)
- factors: target density, branching ratio, solid angle


## Extraction of Observable $\mathbf{E}$



$$
E=\frac{\sigma_{1 / 2}-\sigma_{3 / 2}}{\sigma_{1 / 2}+\sigma_{3 / 2}}=\frac{1}{P_{\gamma} \cdot P_{T}} \cdot \frac{N_{1 / 2}-N_{3 / 2}}{N_{1 / 2}+N_{3 / 2}+2 N_{C}}
$$

## Carbon Subtraction: Missing Mass



## Cross Sections ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(\mathrm{A} 2)$ and $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ (CBELSA/TAPS)



- Nucleon system with different momentum distribution and different neutron/proton ratio
- Exclude nuclear effects (re-scattering of mesons, FSI)
- Narrow structure no artefact!


## Polarisation Observable E (CBELSA/TAPS \& A2)



## Polarisation Observable E - Neutron (A2)



- Model predictions by BnGa: constructive interference of $\mathrm{S}_{11}$ (1535) and $\mathrm{S}_{11}(1650)$
$\rightarrow$ change of sign of the electromagnetic coupling of the $\mathrm{S}_{11}(1650)$ resonance for the neutron $\rightarrow$ contradictory to Quark Model descriptions!


## Summary

Unpolarised cross sections on ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$ and $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ :

- Confirmed narrow structure
- Exclude nuclear effects
- ${ }^{3}$ He published in PRL and EPJA
- $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ ready for publication

Double polarisation observable $\mathbf{E}$ for quasi-free $\mathbf{p} \& \mathbf{n}$ :

- Narrow structure only visible in $\sigma_{1 / 2} \rightarrow \mathrm{~S}_{11}$ or $\mathrm{P}_{11}$ state
- Ready for publication


## Thanks for your attention!

## A2 Experiment



## A2 Frozen Spin Target



## CBELSA/TAPS Experiment



## CBELSA/TAPS: Inner Detector



## Influence of Photoproduction

|  | PDG 2010 | PDG 2012 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{N}(1860) 5 / 2^{+}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1875) 3 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1880) 1 / 2^{+}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1895) 1 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(1900) 3 / 2^{+}$ | $\star \star$ | $\star \star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(2060) 5 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\mathrm{N}(2160) 3 / 2^{-}$ |  | $\star \star$ |
| $\Delta(1940) 3 / 2^{-}$ | $\star$ | $\star \star$ |

**** Existence is certain, and properties are at least fairly well explored.
*** Existence is very likely but further confirmation of quantum numbers and branching fractions is required.
** Evidence of existence is only fair.

* Evidence of existence is poor.


## Quark Models: Effective degree of freedom

> 3 equivalent Constituent Quarks

## Quark-Diquark <br> ->2 dof <br> less states



Flux Tubes<br>->more states via rotation or vibration



## Models

- SAID: Database for electro and photoproduction, partial wave analysis with energy independent fits
- MAID: unitary isobar model, Partial wave analysis of SAID and additional data. Uses Breit-Wigner distributions and background contributions as Born term and vector meson exchange term in t-channel (effective Lagrangians)
- BnGa: Coupled channel approach. Simultaneous fitting of different channels and observables. K-matrix parametrisation at low energies, relativistic Breit-Wigner at energies $>2.2$ GeV . Non-resonant terms from t- and u-channel amplitudes.


## Isospin Filter



## Narrow Structure: Models

- etaMAID:
$D_{15}$ (1675) resonance $>\Gamma_{\eta N} / \Gamma_{\text {tot }}=17 \%$ (PDG: $\Gamma_{\eta N} / \Gamma \simeq 0-1 \%$ )
(L.Tiator, NSTAR2005)

- Chiral Soliton Model: non-strange member of the baryon antidecuplet: $P_{11}$
(D.Diakonov et al., arXiv:hep-ph/9703373v2) $u u d d \bar{s}$



## Narrow Structure: Fit with BnGa

Narrow $P_{11}(1685)$ :

$S_{11}$ (1650) Interference :

sign change of elm.
$A_{1 / 2}$ coupling of $S_{11}(1650)$

## Polarisation Observables



| photon |  | target |  |  | recoil |  |  | target + recoil |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | y | z | - | - | - | X | y | Z |
|  |  | - | - | - | $x^{\prime}$ | $y^{\prime}$ | $z^{\prime}$ | $x^{\prime}$ | $y^{\prime}$ | $z^{\prime}$ |
| - | $\sigma_{0}$ | - | T | - | - | P | - | $\mathrm{T}_{x^{\prime}}$ | $\mathrm{T}_{y^{\prime}}$ | $\mathrm{T}_{z^{\prime}}$ |
| linearly | $\Sigma$ | H | -P | -G | $\mathrm{O}_{x^{\prime}}$ | -T | $\mathrm{O}_{z^{\prime}}$ | - | - | - |
| circularly | - | F | - | -E | $-C^{\prime}$ | - | $-C_{z^{\prime}}$ | - | - | - |

## Polarisation Observables

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{d \sigma}{d \Omega} & =\frac{d \sigma_{0}}{d \Omega} \cdot\left\{1-P_{\text {lin }} \Sigma \cos 2 \phi\right. \\
& +P_{x} \cdot\left[-P_{\text {lin }} H \sin 2 \phi+P_{\text {circ }} F\right] \\
& -P_{y} \cdot\left[+P_{\text {lin }} P \cos 2 \phi-P_{\text {circ }} T\right] \\
& \left.-P_{z} \cdot\left[-P_{\text {lin }} G \sin 2 \phi-P_{\text {circ }} E\right]\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Data Overview

|  | beamtime | $\begin{gathered} \text { target } \\ \text { material } \end{gathered}$ | length [cm] | $\begin{gathered} \hline \mathrm{E}_{e^{-}} \\ {[\mathrm{GeV}]} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { collimator } \\ {[\mathrm{mm}]} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | photon pol. | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \hline \text { current } \\ & {[\mathrm{nA}]} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | trigger |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 2008 | $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ | 5.258 | 2.35 | 4 | circular | 0.32 | eta3 |
|  |  |  |  | 2.35 | 7 | circular | 0.32 | eta3 |
|  |  |  |  | 2.35 | 7 | circular | 0.32 | eta3nC |
|  | 2008 | $\mathrm{LH}_{2}$ | 5.262 | 2.35 |  | circular | 0.19 | trig42 |
|  | 02.03.-22.04.2011 | dbutanol | 1.88 | 2.35 | 4 | circular | 0.70 | eta4 |
|  | 08.06.-21.06.2011 | dbutanol | 1.88 | 2.35 | 4 | circular | 0.70 | eta4 |
|  | 04.12.-10.12.2011 | carbon | 1.88 | 2.35 | 4 | circular | 0.70 | eta4 |
|  | 28.10-17.11.2008 | ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$ | 5.08 | 1.508 | 4 | circular | 8.0 | $\mathrm{M} 2+300 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
|  | 31.03-30.04.2009 | $\mathrm{LH}_{2}$ | 10.0 | 1.558 | 4 | circular | 10.0 | $\mathrm{M} 3+360 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
|  | 08.05-25.05.2009 | $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ | 3.02 | 1.558 | 4 | circular | 4.5 | $\mathrm{M} 2+300 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
| > | 15.07.-24.07.2013 | dbutanol | 2.0 | 1.557 | 2 | circular | 8.3 | $\mathrm{M} 2+300 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
| N | 23.02.-28.02.2014 | dbutanol | 2.0 | 1.557 | 2 | circular | 9.0-10.0 | $\mathrm{M} 2+250 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
|  | 28.02.-03.03.2014 | carbon | 2.0 | 1.557 | 2 | circular | 9.0 | $\mathrm{M} 2+250 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
|  | 24.03.-30.03.2015 | dbutanol | 2.0 | 1.557 | 2 | circular | 10.0 | $\mathrm{M} 2+250 \mathrm{MeV}$ |

## $\mathbf{W}_{B}$ versus $\mathbf{W}_{R}$

Cross Sections as function of...

- $\mathbf{W}_{\mathbf{B}}\left(\mathbf{E}_{\gamma}\right): \sqrt{s}$ calculated with 4-momenta of initial state particles:

$$
W_{B}^{2}=\left(P_{\gamma}+P_{N, i}\right)^{2}=2 E_{\gamma} m_{N}+m_{N}^{2}
$$

$>$ Structures are smeared out because of Fermi motion

## $\mathbf{W}_{B}$ versus $\mathbf{W}_{R}$

Cross Sections as function of...

- $\mathbf{W}_{\mathbf{B}}\left(\mathbf{E}_{\gamma}\right): \sqrt{s}$ calculated with 4-momenta of initial state particles:

$$
W_{B}^{2}=\left(P_{\gamma}+P_{N, i}\right)^{2}=2 E_{\gamma} m_{N}+m_{N}^{2}
$$

$>$ Structures are smeared out because of Fermi motion

- $\mathbf{W}_{\mathbf{R}}: \sqrt{s}$ calculated with measured 4-momenta of final state particles ( $\eta$, participant nucleon):

$$
W_{R}^{2}=\left(P_{\eta}+P_{N, f}\right)^{2}
$$

$>$ No effects from Fermi motion, but experimental resolution for recoil nucleon

## Corrections - Monte Carlo Simulation

## Requires Event Generator (Pluto,GSI)

- Implementation of Fermi motion
- Fermi Plugin
- Used by other collaborations


## Nucleon Detection Efficiency

- Hard to simulate

- Different interaction mechanisms than photons
- Deposited energy $\neq$ total energy
- Recalculate energy with kinematical considerations
- Additional corrections using hydrogen data.


## Cross Sections Deuterium (CBELSA/TAPS)

$$
\gamma \mathbf{p} \rightarrow \eta \mathbf{p}
$$



$$
\gamma \mathbf{n} \rightarrow \eta \mathbf{n}
$$



- Consistent with A2 data
- Deviation from old CBELSA/TAPS data


## Extracted Parameters

|  | $W[\mathrm{MeV}]$ | $\Gamma[\mathrm{MeV}]$ | $b_{\eta} A_{1 / 2}^{n}$ <br> $\left[10^{-3} \mathrm{GeV}^{-1 / 2}\right]$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ (D. Werthmueller) | $1670 \pm 1$ | $29 \pm 3$ | $12.3 \pm 0.8$ |
| $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$ (this work) | $1676 \pm 4$ | $30 \pm 3$ | $15.3 \pm 1.8$ |
| ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}$ (this work) | $1675 \pm 2$ | $46 \pm 8$ | $11.9 \pm 1.2$ |

## Differential Cross Sections $\mathrm{LD}_{2}$, Proton (Bonn)



## Differential Cross Sections LD $_{2}$, Neutron (Bonn)



## Fermi Momentum ${ }^{3} \mathrm{He}(\mathrm{A} 2)$

$$
\vec{p}_{F}=\vec{p}_{P}^{S S}=\vec{p}_{P}^{F S}+\vec{p}_{\eta}-\vec{p}_{\gamma}
$$




- $p_{s}<300 \mathrm{MeV}$ : Long range interactions ratio $\sim N / Z=0.5$
- $p_{s}>300 \mathrm{MeV}$ : Ratio $\sim 1$ as for deuterium, SRC, high Fermi momenta are produced by isospin singlet pairs!
- Dedicated experiments are planned at JLAB!


## $\sigma_{1 / 2}$ Neutron



## $\sigma_{3 / 2}$ Neutron



## $\sigma_{1 / 2}$ Proton



## $\sigma_{3 / 2}$ Proton



