Mixing HTC and HPC Workloads With HTCondor and Slurm

Christopher Hollowell <hollowec@bnl.gov>
RHIC/ATLAS Computing Facility
Brookhaven National Laboratory

Co-authors: Joshua Barnett, Costin Caramarcu, William Strecker-Kellogg, Antonio Wong, Alexandr Zaytsev
The RHIC/ATLAS Computing Facility (RACF) at Brookhaven National Laboratory (BNL) has served the HEP/NP community for over 20 years. Primary computing facility for the experiments at RHIC. US Tier1 computing facility for the ATLAS experiment at the LHC.

Provide both processing and data storage services. Batch processor farm with over 50,000 logical cores (~2,200 servers). Over 70 PB of data on tape (HPSS), and more than 45 PB of disk (GPFS, NFS, dCache, XROOTD).

Experimental HEP/NP processing workloads have traditionally fit a High Throughput Computing (HTC) model. Embarrassingly parallel. Jobs fit on a single batch host, and are often single-threaded. Multi-node parallelization libraries (MPI, PVM) not used. Runs well on commodity hardware/servers. No need for specialized low-latency interconnects between hosts. Limited, or no use of specialized processing hardware such as GPUs. Often data intensive. Makes offloading HEP/NP processing (besides simulation) to commercial cloud providers expensive: still need local datacenters.
Recently, scientific computing at BNL has undergone some consolidation as a result of BNL’s Computational Science Initiative (CSI). RACF is now a part of BNL's Scientific Data & Computing Center (SDCC).
As a result of the recent SDCC consolidation, SDCC/RACF is maintaining BNL's HPC (High Performance Computing) systems, as well as our traditional HTC processing installations. New equipment and staffing funds provided by CSI make this possible.

HPC resources being used by diverse user communities at BNL:
- CFN, LQCD Theory, Biology, NSLS-II, etc.

Architected and administrating two new HPC clusters:
- Institutional Cluster (IC)
  - 108 HP Proliant XL190r nodes (in 54 Apollo r2600 chassis)
  - Adding another 92 systems soon
  - 2 Intel Xeon E5-2690v4 CPUs per system
  - 256 GB RAM
  - 2 K80 GPUs per system
  - EDR Infiniband interconnect
- KNL Cluster
  - 144 Intel S7200AP-based nodes (in 36 Intel H2312XXL2 chassis)
  - 192 GB RAM
  - 1 Knights Landing Xeon Phi CPU per system
  - Dual-rail Omni-path interconnect
BNL's Institutional Cluster
Adaptation to Support HPC Cluster Infrastructure

Significant portions of the knowledge/skill needed to maintain and architect HTC systems also applies to HPC cluster administration

However, staff had to become familiar with some technologies we haven't used before

Software

HPC applications generally make use of the MPI message passing library

Further complicated by multiple MPI implementations

Batch system

HTCondor's “parallel universe” only functional for small clusters with dedicated ownership

Adopted a different batch system than on the HTC side of the facility: Slurm

Hardware

Processing

GPUs, Xeon Phi

Low latency interconnects

Infiniband, Omni-path

Typically available on HPC clusters to greatly improve inter-node message passing efficiency
HTCondor

Developed at the University of Wisconsin

Introduced as an LSF replacement at our facility over 10 years ago
BNL an early adopter of HTCondor in the HEP/NP community (2004)
HTCondor is freely available, open source software - saved us significant LSF licensing costs

Excellent for HTC use
HT - “High Throughput” is in the name

Goal of the software is to fill all available batch slots as quickly as possible
Fairness of resource assignment (user priorities) is a secondary consideration, balanced over a large integral of time

Highly scalable in handling large numbers of disparate jobs
In our environment, a single central manager/negotiator pool easily manages more than:
   25,000 batch slots and running jobs
   200,000 idle jobs

Features such as group quotas and partitionable slots have allowed us to implement advanced scheduling policies
HTCondor has support for multi-node job scheduling – “parallel universe”

Parallel universe limitations – suitable for small dedicated clusters
Supports FIFO or best fit scheduling only – can't easily be used in an environment where different users/groups pay for shares of a cluster and opportunistic usage is permitted

All job submissions limited to a single submit node running condor_schedd “Dedicated scheduler”
Reduces scalability
Our HTC systems utilize many submit hosts to improve scaling, and limit single points of total failure

Using with MPI requires the user to utilize custom “mpiscripts” that call condor_ssh to start up processes on the different nodes
Different workflow than with more HPC-centric batch systems
Can confuse users
ssh = slow job spawning times
Most HPC clusters being maintained by other groups at BNL were using the Moab/TORQUE batch system

Significant cost
Decided to investigate Slurm as an alternative

Primarily developed by SchedMD, with a number of outside contributors
Freely available, open source

In use at many large HPC centers, including NERSC

Supports many useful/required features for our HPC clusters

Advanced fairshare scheduling policies for parallel/multi-node jobs
Whole-node scheduling available
Scheduling of GPU resources supported
Allows users to request particular NUMA/MCDRAM KNL configurations
Includes scheduling of node reboots to implement NUMA/MCDRAM configuration changes
Partitioning of resources, and advanced reservation
PMI(2/x) based process spawning – fast job startup times
Network topology aware
Highly available
Anecdotal reports from other HEP/NP sites that Slurm is not capable of handling large numbers (many thousands) of running/queued jobs.

Required for HTC use with many independent jobs.

Slurm recently published an HTC optimization document, however:

http://slurm.schedmd.com/high_throughput.html

Many of Slurm's features not required in an HTC environment.

Can complicate administration.

Slurm accounting requires adding users to Slurm's accounting DB.

An extra administrative step not necessary with HTCondor.

Our HTC users are used to working with HTCondor.

It's working well, and efficiently scheduling resources – not desirable to change.
Possible to Allow for HTC ↔ HPC Opportunistic Use?

Due to different requirements and capabilities, we're using different batch systems for our HTC and HPC installations.

Would it be possible to allow our HTCondor users to make use of our Slurm-managed HPC resources, and vice-versa?

Purely a technical investigation
No official resource sharing relationship defined between our HTC and HPC installations

A mechanism for automatically transforming “vanilla universe” jobs to the “grid universe” has been included in HTCondor since version 7.1.0: the `condor_job_router` daemon

Recently, HTCondor added support for a new “slurm” batch type to the grid universe

Allows HTCondor to interface with Slurm
Currently only available in the development branch
Initially included in the 8.5.3 release in Mar 2016
Investigated this functionality for HTC → HPC opportunistic use
Using HTCondor's Job Router with Slurm

Thanks to Joshua Barnett, an RACF/BNL summer student, for his work implementing this project.

Availability of unused processing resources in HPC clusters is likely due to the inherent packing inefficiencies of multi-node jobs. Can easily fill these unused resources with single-core HTC jobs.

In a test environment, we were able to demonstrate opportunistic usage of Slurm-managed HPC resources via HTCondor, nearly transparently to users. To opt-in, users simply add the following line to a job's JDF:

```
+WantJobRouter = LastRejMatchTime =!= UNDEFINED
```

Created a separate low-priority, preemptible “condor” partition in Slurm for opportunistic use. Example configuration from slurm.conf:

```
PartitionName=condor Shared=FORCE OverSubscribe=YES
State=UP Nodes=test000[1-6] MaxTime=1-00:00:00
DefaultTime=05:00 qos=condor Priority=1
PreemptMode=cancel Default=no
```
Using HTCondor's Job Router with Slurm (Cont.)

Chose to use HTCondor-C communication for the routed grid universe job
Would have required SSH (BOSCO) access to the Slurm submit host to
directly specify “slurm” as the grid resource
Required instantiating a separate HTCondor pool consisting of the collector,
negotiator, and schedd on the Slurm submit host instead

Enabling the condor_job_router daemon in the HTCondor configuration
(/etc/condor/config.d/20_router):

```
# These settings become the default settings for all routes
JOB_ROUTER_DEFAULTS = \[
  
  requirements=target.WantJobRouter is True; \ 
  MaxIdleJobs = 20; \ 
  MaxJobs = 100; \ 
  /* now modify routed job attributes */ \ 
  /* remove routed job if it goes on hold or stays idle for over 6 hours */ \ 
  set_PeriodicRemove = JobStatus == 5 || \ 
    (JobStatus == 1 && (CurrentTime - QDate) > 3600*6); \ 
  set_requirements = true; \ 
  
  ]

JOB_ROUTER_ENTRIES = \[
  [ GridResource = "condor slurmsub01.sdcc.bnl.gov slurmsub01.sdcc.bnl.gov"; \ 
    name = "Slurm_Pool"; \ 
    Set_remote_JobUniverse = 9; \ 
    set_remote_GridResource = "batch slurm"; \ 
    set_remote_Requirements = False; \ 
  ]

JOB_ROUTER_SCHEDD2_NAME = condsub01.rcf.bnl.gov
JOB_ROUTER_SCHEDD2_POOL = condmaster01.rcf.bnl.gov
```
HTCondor's Job Router with Slurm – Architecture

HTCondor Pool

- HTCondor Master
  - condor_negotiator
  - condor_collector
- HTCondor Submit Host
  - condor_job_router
  - condor_schedd
  - condor_gridmanager
  - condor_c-gahp
- HTC Worker Nodes
  - condor_startd

HTCondor-C

Slurm Pool

- Slurm Submit Host
  - condor_negotiator
  - condor_collector
  - condor_schedd
  - blahpd
  - slurmd
- Slurm Master
  - slurmd
  - slurmd
  - mysqld
- HPC Cluster Nodes
  - slurmd
  - slurmd
  - slurmd
Job Router Architecture in Action
User submits a “vanilla” universe JDF to the local condor_schedd

```
condsub01% condor_submit myjob.jdf
```

If no local job slots are available, condor_job_router daemon submits a new copy of the job to condor_schedd with the universe transformed to “grid”

```
condsub01% condor_q
-- Schedd: condsub01.rcf.bnl.gov :
  ID    OWNER    SUBMITTED  RUN_TIME ST PRI SIZE  CMD
 5216.0 testuser  9/21 16:07  0+00:00:00 I 0 122. testloop.sh
 5217.0 testuser  9/21 16:07  0+00:00:00 I 0 122. testloop.sh
```

```
condsub01% condor_q -format '%s:' ClusterID -format 'Universe = %s\n' JobUniverse
  5216:Universe = 5
  5217:Universe = 9
```

```
condsub01% condor_q 5217 -autoformat:n RoutedFromJobID GridResource
  remote_GridResource
  5216.0
  condor slurmsub01.sdcc.bnl.gov slurmsub01.sdcc.bnl.gov
  batch slurm
```

condor_schedd spawns a condor-c_gahp server to submit the job to the remote HTCondor pool running on the Slurm submit host
Job Router Architecture in Action (Cont.)

Job is queued in remote condor_schedd

```
slurmsub01% condor_q -nobatch
-- Schedd: slurmsub01.sdcc.bnl.gov:

   ID   OWNER    SUBMITTED   RUN_TIME   ST  PRI SIZE   CMD
3793.0 testuser 9/21 16:09 0+00:00:00 I 0 122. testloop.sh
```

```
slurmsub01% condor_q 3793 -autoformat:n JobUniverse GridResource
           remote_GridResource
9
batch slurm
undefined
```

condor_schedd spawns blahpd to submit the job to Slurm, and manage it
Calls /usr/libexec/blahp/slurm_submit.sh, which in turns call sbatch

Slurm runs the job on an available HPC cluster node

```
slurmsub01% squeue

   JOBID PARTITION  NAME    USER  ST  TIME  NODES NODELIST(REASON)
   5483    condor bl_76b98 testuser R 00:30 1 hpcnode010
```

All copies of the job updated to reflect the “running” status
HTCondor's Job Router with Slurm – Potential Issues

Can take up to ~5 minutes for the local copy of the job in the queue to reflect remote state
  When job completes, the local accounting statistics are updated to accurate final values

Assumes user exists in both the HTC and HPC systems with the same username

Slurm's accounting DB doesn't know about HTCondor/HTC users
  Prevents them from being able to run
  Created a cronjob that periodically (1/min) checks if the owner of a job in the HTCondor queue on the Slurm submit host exists in the DB
    Calls sacctmgr to add the user if not present - uses a cachefile list of previously seen users to avoid unnecessary sacctmgr calls

HPC HTCondor pool spool directory needs to be in a shared filesystem (i.e. NFS) in order for Slurm nodes to run the user's executable – hoping this requirement will be removed as HTCondor Slurm grid support is improved
  HTCondor copies user's executable to the spool directory, so it needs to be visible on the Slurm compute hosts
    One-line change on the Slurm submit host's HTCondor configuration:
      \texttt{SPOOL = /nfs/spool/condor/}
Allowing our HPC users to opportunistically run HPC jobs on our HTC systems isn't currently possible
  Don't want to run a single HTCondor “dedicated scheduler” to support parallel universe
  HPC applications generally require low-latency node interconnects to run efficiently
    Most of our HTC systems only have 1 Gbps ethernet connectivity
    Many of our HPC users require GPUs or Xeon Phi processors, which aren't available on our HTC resources

However, some of our HPC users have been able to reduce their jobs to running on a single CPU, or single host, making opportunistic usage a possibility using HTCondor Flocking
  No way to transparently route jobs in the Slurm queue to HTCondor
  Users need to submit HTC jobs to the HTCondor pool on the Slurm submit host directly
Conclusions

After many years of maintaining HTC equipment for HEP/NP, RACF has now also been tasked with administrating HPC systems for other user groups at BNL

Due to differing requirements and capabilities it is was decided to administrate two separate batch systems for our HTC and HPC users: HTCondor and Slurm, respectively

Using a configuration we've developed which utilizes the condor_job_router daemon, it's technically possible to allow our HTC/HTCondor users to opportunistically utilize our HPC/Slurm resources

Can be done in a way which is fairly transparent to users

HTC users benefit from the “commodity-centric” nature of their hardware requirements

Possible to allow our HPC users to opportunistically utilize our HTC installations as well via HTCondor flocking, but currently only if they plan on running HTC-like jobs

Users need to manually submit such jobs to HTCondor