# Moving to NLO accuracy in dilute-dense processes in the CGC picture

#### T. Lappi

University of Jyväskylä, Finland

#### Initial Stages, Cracow, September 2017



European Research Council Established by the European Commission





#### Outline

#### Trinity of dilute-dense CGC calculations

- Evolution equation (BK)
- Total DIS cross section see also Paatelainen tomorrow
- Single inclusive hadron production in pA-collisions
   Previous talk (lancu)+ tomorrow (Ducloué)
- + essential question: doing the three consistently.

Recent progress in topics not covered here:

- NLO JIMWLK equation
- Exclusive processes
- Dihadron correlations

#### Outline of this talk

- CGC/eikonal description of dilute-dense process
- Status of NLO evolution equations
- Status of NLO DIS cross section

### Eikonal scattering off target of glue



- Dilute probe through target color field
- At high energy interaction is eikonal

Eikonal scattering amplitude: Wilson line V

$$V = \mathbb{P} \exp\left\{-ig \int^{x^+} dy^+ A^-(y^+, x^-, \mathbf{x})\right\} \underset{x^+ \to \infty}{\approx} V(\mathbf{x}) \in \mathrm{SU}(N_{\mathrm{c}})$$

- Initial gluon field in AA: same  $V(\mathbf{x})$
- Amplitude for color dipole

$$\mathcal{N}(r = |\mathbf{x} - \mathbf{y}|) = 1 - \left\langle \frac{1}{N_{c}} \operatorname{Tr} V^{\dagger}(\mathbf{x}) V(\mathbf{y}) \right\rangle$$

from color transparency to saturation



#### Dilute-dense process at LO

Physical picture at small x



#### Forward hadrons



- q/g from probe:
   collinear pdf
- $|amplitude|^2 \sim dipole$
- Indep. fragmentation

"Hybrid formalism";

Dumitru, Jalilian-Marian 2002

Both involve same dipole amplitude  $\mathcal{N}=1-\mathcal{S}$ 

#### Dilute-dense process at LL

Add one **soft** gluon: large logarithm of energy/x



#### Forward hadrons



- Soft gluon  $k^+ \rightarrow 0$ : same large log
- ► Collinear gluon  $k_T \rightarrow 0$ : DGLAP evolution of pdf, FF Dumitru et al 2005

Absorb large log into renormalization of target:

BK equation Balitsky 1995, Kovchegov 1999

#### Dilute-dense process at NLO

Add one gluon, but not necessarily soft



- Leading small-k<sup>+</sup> gluon already in BK-evolved target
- Need to subtract leading log from cross section:

$$\sigma_{NLO} = \int dz \left[ \overbrace{\sigma(z) - \sigma(z=0)}^{\sigma_{sub}} + \overbrace{\sigma(z=0)}^{absorb in BK} \right] \quad z = \frac{k_g^+}{P_{tot}^+}$$

### NLO to NLL

NLO evolution equation:

- Consider NNLO DIS
- Extract leading soft logarithm
- Lengthy calculation: Balitsky & Chirilli 2007
- But additional resummations needed for practical phenomenology



(+ many diagrams at same order)

- α<sub>s</sub><sup>2</sup> ln<sup>2</sup>(1/x): two iterations of LO BK
- $\alpha_s^2 \ln 1/x$ : NLO BK
- α<sub>s</sub><sup>2</sup>: part of NNLO impact factor (not calculated)

#### Summary: power counting



- Current phenomenology LL
- Theory recently becoming understood at NLO & NLL talks lancu. Paatelainen
- Moving to phenomenology, numerical implementations:
  - Fit to DIS data with (approx) NLL evolution (but not NLO) : Albacete 2015, Jancu et al 2015
  - Single inclusive hadrons at NLO (but not NLL) : Stasto et al 2013, Ducloué et al 2015  $\implies$  talk Ducloué
  - Full NLL evolution (Not yet NLO) Mäntysaari 2015
  - next ► NLO DIS cross section (Not yet NLL) Ducloué et al 2017

## NLL evolution

#### The NLO BK equation

as derived by Balitsky and Chirilli, 2007

Equation: 
$$\gamma = \ln 1/x$$
-dependence from  

$$\partial_{\gamma}S(r) = \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{2\pi^{2}}\mathbf{K}_{1}\otimes[S(X)S(Y)-S(r)] + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{F}N_{c}}{8\pi^{4}}\mathbf{K}_{f}\otimes S(Y)[S(X')-S(X)] + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{c}^{2}}{8\pi^{4}}\mathbf{K}_{2}\otimes[S(X)S(z-z')S(Y')-S(X)S(Y)]$$

#### Notations & approximations

- $S(x y) \equiv (1/N_c) \langle \operatorname{Tr} V^{\dagger}(x) V(y) \rangle$
- $\otimes = \int d^2 z \text{ or } \int d^2 z d^2 z'$
- Here large  $N_c$  & mean field:

$$\langle \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V 
angle o \left\langle \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V 
ight
angle \left\langle \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V 
ight
angle$$



#### The NLO BK equation

as derived by Balitsky and Chirilli, 2007

Equation: 
$$\gamma = \ln 1/x$$
-dependence from  

$$\partial_{\gamma}S(r) = \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{2\pi^{2}}\mathbf{K}_{1} \otimes [S(X)S(Y) - S(r)] + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{F}N_{c}}{8\pi^{4}}\mathbf{K}_{f} \otimes S(Y)[S(X') - S(X)] + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{c}^{2}}{8\pi^{4}}\mathbf{K}_{2} \otimes [S(X)S(z - z')S(Y') - S(X)S(Y)]$$

#### Notations & approximations

- $S(x y) \equiv (1/N_c) \langle \operatorname{Tr} V^{\dagger}(x) V(y) \rangle$
- $\otimes = \int d^2 z \text{ or } \int d^2 z d^2 z'$
- Here large  $N_c$  & mean field:

$$\langle \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V 
angle o \left\langle \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V 
ight
angle \left\langle \operatorname{\mathsf{Tr}} V^\dagger V 
ight
angle$$



$$\begin{split} \mathcal{K}_{1} &= \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y^{2}} \bigg[ 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{4\pi} \bigg( \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \ln r^{2}\mu^{2} - \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \frac{X^{2} - Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{X^{2}}{Y^{2}} \\ &+ \frac{67}{9} - \frac{\pi^{2}}{3} - \frac{10}{9} \frac{N_{F}}{N_{c}} - 2 \ln \frac{X^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \bigg) \bigg] \\ \mathcal{K}_{2} &= -\frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} + \bigg[ \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2} + X'^{2}Y^{2} - 4r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \\ &+ \frac{r^{4}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} + \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(z - z')^{2}} \bigg] \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \\ \mathcal{K}_{f} &= \frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} - \frac{X'^{2}Y^{2} + Y'^{2}X^{2} - r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \end{split}$$

**10/17** □ ▶ < 클 ▶ < 트 ▶ < 트 → 오 < <

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{K}_{1} &= \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y^{2}} \bigg[ 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{4\pi} \bigg( \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \ln r^{2}\mu^{2} - \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \frac{X^{2} - Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{X^{2}}{Y^{2}} \\ &+ \frac{67}{9} - \frac{\pi^{2}}{3} - \frac{10}{9} \frac{N_{F}}{N_{c}} - 2 \ln \frac{X^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \bigg) \bigg] \\ \mathcal{K}_{2} &= -\frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} + \bigg[ \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2} + X'^{2}Y^{2} - 4r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \\ &+ \frac{r^{4}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} + \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(z - z')^{2}} \bigg] \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \\ \mathcal{K}_{f} &= \frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} - \frac{X'^{2}Y^{2} + Y'^{2}X^{2} - r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \end{split}$$

10/17

Leading order

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{K}_{1} &= \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y^{2}} \bigg[ 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{4\pi} \bigg( \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \ln r^{2}\mu^{2} - \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \frac{X^{2} - Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{X^{2}}{Y^{2}} \\ &+ \frac{67}{9} - \frac{\pi^{2}}{3} - \frac{10}{9} \frac{N_{F}}{N_{c}} - 2 \ln \frac{X^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \bigg) \bigg] \\ \mathcal{K}_{2} &= -\frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} + \bigg[ \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2} + X'^{2}Y^{2} - 4r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \\ &+ \frac{r^{4}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} + \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(z - z')^{2}} \bigg] \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \\ \mathcal{K}_{f} &= \frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} - \frac{X'^{2}Y^{2} + Y'^{2}X^{2} - r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \end{split}$$

- Leading order
- Running coupling (Terms with  $\beta$  function coefficient)

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{K}_{1} &= \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y^{2}} \bigg[ 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{4\pi} \bigg( \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \ln r^{2}\mu^{2} - \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \frac{X^{2} - Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{X^{2}}{Y^{2}} \\ &+ \frac{67}{9} - \frac{\pi^{2}}{3} - \frac{10}{9} \frac{N_{F}}{N_{c}} - 2 \ln \frac{X^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \bigg) \bigg] \\ \mathcal{K}_{2} &= -\frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} + \bigg[ \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2} + X'^{2}Y^{2} - 4r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \\ &+ \frac{r^{4}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} + \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(z - z')^{2}} \bigg] \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \\ \mathcal{K}_{f} &= \frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} - \frac{X'^{2}Y^{2} + Y'^{2}X^{2} - r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \end{split}$$

- Leading order
- Running coupling (Terms with β function coefficient)
- Conformal logs  $\implies$  vanish for r = 0 (X = Y & X' = Y')

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{K}_{1} &= \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y^{2}} \bigg[ 1 + \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{4\pi} \bigg( \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \ln r^{2}\mu^{2} - \frac{\beta}{N_{c}} \frac{X^{2} - Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{X^{2}}{Y^{2}} \\ &+ \frac{67}{9} - \frac{\pi^{2}}{3} - \frac{10}{9} \frac{N_{F}}{N_{c}} - 2 \ln \frac{X^{2}}{r^{2}} \ln \frac{Y^{2}}{r^{2}} \bigg) \bigg] \\ \mathcal{K}_{2} &= -\frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} + \bigg[ \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2} + X'^{2}Y^{2} - 4r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \\ &+ \frac{r^{4}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} + \frac{r^{2}}{X^{2}Y'^{2}(z - z')^{2}} \bigg] \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \\ \mathcal{K}_{f} &= \frac{2}{(z - z')^{4}} - \frac{X'^{2}Y^{2} + Y'^{2}X^{2} - r^{2}(z - z')^{2}}{(z - z')^{4}(X^{2}Y'^{2} - X'^{2}Y^{2})} \ln \frac{X^{2}Y'^{2}}{X'^{2}Y^{2}} \end{split}$$

- Leading order
- Running coupling (Terms with β function coefficient)
- Conformal logs  $\implies$  vanish for r = 0 (X = Y & X' = Y')
- Nonconformal double log  $\implies$  blows up for r = 0

#### Resummations

Following lancu et al 2015

$$\partial_{Y}S(r) = \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{2\pi^{2}}\boldsymbol{K}_{1}\otimes[S(X)S(Y)-S(r)] + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{F}N_{c}}{8\pi^{4}}\boldsymbol{K}_{f}\otimes S(Y)[S(X')-S(X)] + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{c}^{2}}{8\pi^{4}}\boldsymbol{K}_{2}\otimes[S(X)S(z-z')S(Y')-S(X)S(Y)]$$

Resum:

- $\beta$ -function terms in  $K_1$  into running coupling:  $K_{Bal}$
- Double transverse logarithms in  $K_1$  into  $K_{\text{DLA}} \sim J_1(\ln r^2) / \ln r^2$ .
- Single transverse logs in  $K_2$  into  $K_{STL} \sim r^{\alpha_s A_1}$

with DGLAP anomalous dimension  $A_1$ 

Subtract double counting  $K_{sub}$ , include rest of NLO  $K_1^{fin}$ Solve equation Mäntysaari, T.L. 2016 :

$$\partial_{Y}S(r) = \frac{\alpha_{s}N_{c}}{2\pi^{2}} \left[ K_{DLA}K_{STL}K_{Bal} - K_{sub} + K_{1}^{fin} \right] \otimes \left[ S(X)S(Y) - S(r) \right] \\ + \frac{\alpha_{s}^{2}N_{c}^{2}}{8\pi^{4}}K_{2} \otimes \left[ S(X)S(z - z')S(Y') - S(X)S(Y) \right] + N_{F}\text{-part}$$

#### NLL evolution with resummation

Mäntysaari, T.L. 2016



- Resummations essential to get stable results
   good HERA fit with "resummation only" lancu et al 2015
- Importance of non-resummed terms can be tuned (choice of `constant under log' in resummation)
- Here simple rapidity-local resummation lancu et al 2015 Alternative: impose cumbersome but better defined kinematical constraint Beuf 2014, implementation Albacete 2015

### DIS cross section at NLO

#### DIS at NLO: impact factor

Beuf 2016, 2017, more details in talk of Paatelainen



#### DIS at NLO: subtraction of BK

Evaluate cross section as  $\sigma_{L,T}^{NLO} = \sigma_{L,T}^{LO} + \sigma_{L,T}^{dip} + \sigma_{L,T,sub.}^{qg}$ 

- \* UV-divergence
- $\blacktriangleright$  LL: subtract leading log, already in BK-evolved  ${\cal N}$

#### DIS at NLO: subtraction of BK

Evaluate cross section as  $\sigma_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}} = \sigma_{L,T}^{\text{LO}} + \sigma_{L,T}^{\text{dip}} + \sigma_{L,T,\text{sub.}}^{qg}$ 

- \* UV-divergence
- $\blacktriangleright$  LL: subtract leading log, already in BK-evolved  ${\cal N}$
- ► Parametrically  $X(z_2) \sim x_{Bj}$ , but  $X(z_2) \sim 1/z_2$  essential! ( $X(z_2)$  =momentum fraction to which the target is evolved)

#### Numerical implementation

Ducloué, Hänninen, T.L., Zhu 2017

$$\sigma_{L,T}^{\text{ags,sub.}} \sim \alpha_s C_F \int_{z_1, \mathbf{x}_0, \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{x}_2} \int_{x_{\text{B}/x_0}}^1 \frac{dz_2}{z_2} \bigg[ \mathcal{K}_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}}\left(z_2, \mathbf{X}(z_2)\right) - \mathcal{K}_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}}\left(0, \mathbf{X}(z_2)\right) \bigg].$$

 ► Target fields at scale X(z<sub>2</sub>):
 ► X(z<sub>2</sub>) = x<sub>Bj</sub>: unstable (like single inclusive)



 $X(z_2) = x_{Bj}$ 

$$\sim$$
 (  $k_g^+ \sim Z_2$ 

15/17

《曰》《聞》《臣》《臣》 (臣) 《

#### Numerical implementation

Ducloué, Hänninen, T.L., Zhu 2017

$$\sigma_{L,T}^{\text{qg,sub.}} \sim \alpha_s C_F \int_{z_1, \mathbf{x}_0, \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{x}_2} \int_{x_{BJ}/x_0}^1 \frac{\text{d}z_2}{z_2} \bigg[ \mathcal{K}_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}}\left(z_2, \mathbf{X}(z_2)\right) - \mathcal{K}_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}}\left(0, \mathbf{X}(z_2)\right) \bigg].$$

- Target fields at scale  $X(z_2)$ :
  - ► X(z<sub>2</sub>) = x<sub>Bj</sub>: unstable (like single inclusive)

• 
$$X(z_2) = x_{Bj}/z_2$$
 OK



 $X(z_2) = x_{Bj}/z_2$ 

$$\sim$$
  $k_g^+ \sim Z_2$ 

#### Numerical implementation

Ducloué, Hänninen, T.L., Zhu 2017

$$\sigma_{L,T}^{\text{qg,sub.}} \sim \alpha_s C_{\text{F}} \int_{z_1, \mathbf{x}_0, \mathbf{x}_1, \mathbf{x}_2} \int_{x_{\text{BJ}}/x_0}^1 \frac{\text{d}z_2}{z_2} \bigg[ \mathcal{K}_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}}\left(z_2, X(z_2)\right) - \mathcal{K}_{L,T}^{\text{NLO}}\left(0, X(z_2)\right) \bigg].$$

- Target fields at scale  $X(z_2)$ :
  - $X(z_2) = x_{Bj}: unstable$  (like single inclusive)

• 
$$X(z_2) = x_{Bj}/z_2$$
 OK

- Lower limit of z<sub>2</sub>
  - ►  $Z_2 > \frac{x_{Bj}}{x_0}$  from target  $k^-$ (assuming  $k_T^2 \sim Q^2$ )
  - Strict  $k^+$  factorization:  $z_2 > \frac{x_{Bj}}{x_0} \frac{M_p^2}{\Omega^2}$ 
    - → would require kinematical constraint
  - For "dipole" term integrate to  $z_2 = 0$



$$X(z_2) = x_{Bj}/z_2$$

$$\sim$$
 kg^+ ~ Z\_2

《曰》《聞》《臣》《臣》

 Major cancellation between different NLO terms



#### 16/17 《 ロ > 《 문 > 《 문 > 《 문 > 》 토 · · 이 Q @

 Major cancellation between different NLO terms (similar for F<sub>L</sub>)



- Major cancellation between different NLO terms (similar for F<sub>L</sub>)
- qg-term explicitly zero at  $x_{Bj} = x_0 \implies$  transient effect



- Major cancellation between different NLO terms (similar for F<sub>L</sub>)
- qg-term explicitly zero at  $x_{Bj} = x_0 \implies$  transient effect
- Running coupling (parent dipole)
  - Transient effect larger



#### NLO/LO ratio



- Major cancellation between different NLO terms (similar for F<sub>L</sub>)
- qg-term explicitly zero at  $x_{Bj} = x_0 \implies$  transient effect
- Running coupling (parent dipole)
  - Transient effect larger
  - But Q<sup>2</sup>-dependence stable



NLO/LO ratio

#### Relative NLO corrections of the magnitude one would expect

#### Instead off conclusions: to do



- Next: fit to HERA data with NLO impact factor (with LL or NLL evolution)
- Needs implementation (both DIS and single inclusive) : match NLL evolution with NLO cross section:
  - Evolution variable  $k^+$  vs  $k^-$
  - Kinematical constraint vs

rapidity local resummation of double logs

- Corresponding different subtractions from cross sections
- Needs loop calculation: quark masses
- Other:
  - Exclusive processes
  - Dihadron correlations

#### Instead off conclusions: to do



- Next: fit to HERA data with NLO impact factor (with LL or NLL evolution)
- Needs implementation (both DIS and single inclusive) : match NLL evolution with NLO cross section:
  - Evolution variable  $k^+$  vs  $k^-$
  - Kinematical constraint vs

rapidity local resummation of double logs

- Corresponding different subtractions from cross sections
- Needs loop calculation: quark masses
- Other:
  - Exclusive processes
  - Dihadron correlations