Foreground Mismodeling and the Point Source Explanation of the Fermi Galactic Center Excess

LJ Chang, SM., M. LISONT, M. Buschmann N.J. Kods P.P. Scich [1708.13874]



Sidding his his sources

P.C.SFJ OII:

M Buschmonn, M.L. Pour, 5K Sold, L. Chang SM, M. Lisanti, O Macias 12002 123721

Center for Cosmology and Particle Physics

CERN-TH BSM Forum April 2, 2020



People



Malte Buschmann (Michigan)



Laura Chang (Princeton)



Nick Rodd (Berkeley/LBNL)



Mariangela Lisanti (Princeton)





Ben Safdi (Michigan)



Oscar Macias (Amsterdam/Kavli IPMU)

People









ou can sign up to the LHC R	esults Forum mailing list by clicking <u>here.</u>			
Spring 2020				
Speaker	Title	Date	Stream	Slides
aphael Flauger	On H0	2/28/2020 @4pmET	<u>stream</u>	slides
Yoni Kahn	Converging Excesses in Low-Threshold Direct Detection Experiments	3/13/2020 @4pmET	<u>stream</u>	<u>slides</u>
ick Rodd	Update on Galactic Center Excess	4/3/2020 @4pmET	<u>stream</u>	slides
inding	Manangera Lieann			
				am /k



Nick Rodd (Berkeley/LBNL)



Ben Safdi (Michigan)



Outline



edian 68/95% (Mode

 10^{-10}

F [counts cm⁻² s⁻¹]

 10^{-9}

Galactic Center Excess: Background and Methods





 10^{-12} 10^{-11}

 $F^{2}_{10_{-10}}$ $F^{2}_{10_{-10}}$ $F^{2}_{10_{-12}}$ $F^{2}_{10_{$

Towards mitigating diffuse mismodeling

Diffuse mismodeling and lessons from simulation

Outline



Galactic Center Excess: Background and Methods



Fuse mismodeling and lessons from simulation

Towards mitigating diffuse mismodeling

The Galactic Center GeV Photon Excess

Some facts:

- ~Spherically symmetric gamma-ray excess in the Inner Galaxy
- Extends out 10° from the center of Galaxy
- Constitutes $\sim\!10\%$ total flux







Origin of the GCE

Dark Matter

Spectrum and spatial morphology consistent with DM





Daylan et al [1402.6703]

Consistent with thermal cross sections Galactic diffuse emission

Robust to variation of



 $\times 10^{-25}$ — I (0.89) ····· VI (0.64) II (0.15)— VII (0.55)

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Astrophysics

with MSP expectation with stellar distribution



Brandt & Kocsis [1507.05616]

Not seen in other targets



Chang, SM, Lisanti [1804.04132]

Spectrum roughly consistent Spatial morphology consistent



Bartels et al [1711.04778]

+ Macias et al [1611.06644] Macias et al [1901.03822]



Fermi-LAT Collaboration [1503.02641]







The Status c. 2015: Evidence for Unresolved PSs





The Status c. 2015: Evidence for Unresolved PSs





Distinguishing PS from DM with photen statistics



Malyshev & Hogg [1104.0010] Lee et al [1506.05124]







Also point source model and mask (not shown)





Also point source model and mask (not shown)

<u>Source-count distribution</u> gives number of sources in a given pixel with a flux between F and F+dF

Public NPTF implementation available at <u>https://github.com/bsafdi/NPTFit</u>



















- Excess flux is entirely accounted for by the NFW PS template
- Bayes factor in preference for NFW point sources is $\sim 10^7$

Lee, Lisanti, Safdi, Slatyer, and Xue [1506.05124]



11





- Excess flux is entirely accounted for by the NFW PS template
- Bayes factor in preference for NFW point sources is $\sim 10^7$

Lee, Lisanti, Safdi, Slatyer, and Xue [1506.05124]



11

Dark Matter Strikes Back? Leane & Slatyer (2019)

Inject a DM signal onto the real data, then try to recover it with the NPTF pipeline



Behaviour attributed to presence of unmodeled PSs or diffuse mismodeling <u>NB: Not an error in the NPTF method!</u>

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Performed a closure test:







Dark Matter Strikes Back? Leane & Slatyer (2019)

Performed a closure test:

Inject a DM signal onto the real data, then try to recover it with the NPTF pipeline



Issues related to mismodeling were discussed in Lee et al (2015)

for the NFW PSs changes. In particular, the source-count function for NFW PSs is shifted to lower flux, potentially suggesting that some of the near-threshold sources could either be more disk-like in morphology or associated with mis-modeling the diffuse background. However, the preference for NFW PSs remains high, with the model including NFW PSs preferred over that without by a Bayes factor $\sim 10^4$. Unlike the previous analysis that used a truncated

The results of Leane & Slatyer (2019) suggest that these systematics deserve further scrutiny

Behaviour attributed to presence of unmodeled PSs or diffuse mismodeling NB: Not an error in the NPTF method!

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

0.30





Dark Matter Strikes Back? Leane & Slatyer (2019)

Performed a closure test:

Inject a DM signal onto the real data, then try to recover it with the NPTF pipeline



Issues related to mismodeling were discussed in Lee et al (2015)

for the NFW PSs changes. In particular, the source-count function for NFW PSs is shifted to lower flux, potentially suggesting that some of the near-threshold sources could either be more disk-like in morphology or associated with mis-modeling the diffuse background. However, the preference for NFW PSs remains high, with the model including NFW PSs preferred over that without by a Bayes factor $\sim 10^4$. Unlike the previous analysis that used a truncated

The results of Leane & Slatyer (2019) suggest that these systematics deserve further scrutiny <u>Goal:</u> to understand and mitigate systematic issues associated with the NPTF in the Galactic Center

Behaviour attributed to presence of unmodeled PSs or diffuse mismodeling NB: Not an error in the NPTF method!

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

0.30





Outline











Galactic Center Excess: Background and Methods

Diffuse mismodeling and some lessons from simulations

Towards mitigating diffuse mismodeling

Outline





Galactic Center Excess: Background and Methods

Diffuse mismodeling and some lessons from simulations

Towards mitigating diffuse mismodeling



Dissecting the NPTF What is the method sensitive to?









Slides inspiration from Laura Chang





Degeneracy between dim PSs and smooth emission



We can never exclude the PS hypothesis*—but we might be able to see evidence for a PS population

*But we may call it into question by inferring a flux distribution inconsistent with astrophysical expectation







Degeneracy between dim PSs and smooth emission



We can never exclude the PS hypothesis*—but we might be able to see evidence for a PS population

*But we may call it into question by inferring a flux distribution inconsistent with astrophysical expectation







So far so good. What about Galactic foregrounds?



Much harder problem in the presence of diffuse emission from the Milky Way

Diffuse foregrounds make up most of the observed emission in the Galactic Center

Diffuse Model Template (p6v11) - Log

10

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

-1.64482



1.45346



Modeling Galactic foregrounds

Galactic foreground model







Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Inverse Compton

Traces electron source populations

π^0 + Bremsstrahlung Traces gas/dust distribution



Modeling Galactic foregrounds

Galactic foreground model







foregrounds?

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Inverse Compton

Traces electron source populations

π^0 + Bremsstrahlung Traces gas/dust distribution

How well can we model

0.

-0.5

Not very well.





Key question

Given the

- Degeneracy between dim PSs and dark matter, and
- 2. Imperfect knowledge of Galactic diffuse foregrounds

How well can we recover evidence of a subthreshold PS population?

Explore this question with simulations







Consider two "extreme" PS flux distributions

"Hard" flux distribution, most PSs just below detection threshold



Representative of distribution inferred in Lee et al (2015)





Consider two "extreme" PS flux distributions

"Soft" flux distribution, larger number of dim PSs



Representative of expectations for MSP flux. Use as benchmark.

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

DM 10^{5} PS 10^{4} $N_{\rm pixels}$ 10_3 10^{2} 10^{1} 2 8 10 0 Photon counts per pixel





Point source recovery: adding more knobs

Just PSs



Sub-1 σ point sources cannot be reliably characterized

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Add PSF

Add diffuse



Testing the effect of foreground mismodeling

Create simulation (including PS or DM) with one diffuse model



Explore whether significance of PS hypothesis consistent with truth

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Run NPTF pipeline with different diffuse model

Model F



PS recovery with foreground mismodeling

"Soft" flux distribution



"Hard" flux distribution





Testing the PS hypothesis











Testing the PS hypothesis





Key takeaways

Degeneracy between dim PSs and dark matter can bias inference One solution: cut off flux distribution below 1- σ **PS** detection threshold

Mismodeling of Galactic diffuse foregrounds can lead to spurious point sources Much harder problem!



Next: possibilities for mitigating diffuse mismodeling



Outline



Galactic Center Excess: Background and Methods





Diffuse mismodeling and lessons from simulation

Towards mitigating diffuse mismodeling
Outline







Diffuse mismodeling and lessons from simulation



Towards mitigating diffuse mismodeling

Galactic Center Excess: Background and Methods



Epistemic classification

Known knowns

Things we know we know

Known unknowns

Things we know we don't know

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Inspired by Josh Ruderman

Unknown knowns

Things we think we know but we don't know

Unknown unknowns

Things we don't know we don't know





Known knowns

- **Resolved point sources**
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales



Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Inspired by Josh Ruderman and Don Rumsfeld

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information



Unknown unknowns Unknown point source populations







Known knowns

- **Resolved point sources**
- **Detector response (PSF)** -
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs -



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales



Inspired by Josh Ruderman and Don Rumsfeld

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information













p6v11 model widely used in previous studies





Towards a better diffuse model



Available at <u>https://github.com/nickrodd/FermiDiffuse-ModelO</u>





Oscar Macias

Models previous considered in Lee et al (2015) and Leane & Slatyer (2019)

- Updated gas tracers
- 3D radiation field for IC
- Components fit in several Galactocentric rings

Macias et al [1901.03822] Macias et al [1611.06644]











Some diffuse models are better than others A Poissonian example: signal injection on data

A different way of seeing the same thing: injected DM onto the data and try to recover it



Oversubtraction evident in some diffuse models



Some diffuse models are better than others A non-Poissonian example: signal injection on data



Large oversubtraction observed for the p6v11 diffuse model, as pointed out by Leane & Slatyer

Injected DM signal cannot be reliably recovered



Leane & Slatyer [1904.08430]

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

20.0





Known knowns

- **Resolved point sources**
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales



Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Inspired by Josh Ruderman and Don Rumsfeld

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information



Unknown unknowns Unknown point source populations







Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs -



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission On large scales

- On small scales

Inspired by Josh Ruderman and Don Rumsfeld

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information









Mitigating diffuse mismodeling Giving the background model more freedom

Less freedom

Less conservative More information about signal Contingent on background model





Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

More freedom

More conservative Less extractable information about signal "Background model-independent"











(Large-scale) Harmonic marginalization Extract large-scale harmonic components of diffuse model



Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Give each large-scale component





Coming back to signal injection... Poissonian example



Oversubtraction evident in some diffuse models





Does Harmonic marginalization help?



Consistency between different diffuse models

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum



Successful signal recovery



Harmonic marginalization for NPTF Test with simulations

As before,

1. Create simulation with one foreground model (Model O)

2. Analyze with a different diffuse model (p6v11)







Harmonic marginalization on data



Oversubtraction effect pointed out by Leane & Slatyer



Harmonic marginalization on data



Oversubtraction effect pointed out by Leane & Slatyer

PS/DM inference consistent between diffuse models Recovered flux fraction consistent with zero



Coming back to signal injection on data...



Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

closure test



Is there a preference for PSs in the data?





Some caveats and future prospects

Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- Detector response (PSF)
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales





Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)** -
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information

Bias due to unmodeled PS populations explored in Leane & Slatyer (2019)

But no evidence for such a population in the data



Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information





Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales







Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Assumed NFW signal morphology

Giving signal more freedom (in North vs South) explored in Leane & Slatyer (2020)



Large asymmetry may be further evidence for diffuse mismodeling







Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales





Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- **Detector response (PSF)** -
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales



Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information





Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- Detector response (PSF)
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



NPTF agnostic to nature of PS-like emission

- Millisecond pulsars
- Multiple PS populations
- <u>Small-scale</u> mismodeling of diffuse emission

Not captured by harmonic marginalization



Known knowns

- Resolved point sources
- Detector response (PSF)
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Possible ways to mitigate

- Better/higher-resolution diffuse models

HI4PI Collaboration

- (Additional) Data-driven techniques for foreground modeling

Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information





Known knowns

- **Resolved point sources**
- **Detector response (PSF)**
- Unresolved extragalactic PSs



Known unknowns

Galactic diffuse emission

- On large scales
- On small scales

Unknown knowns

- The morphology of the excess
- Pixel-to-pixel correlations
- Spectral information









Summary



Degeneracy between dim PSs and smooth emission + diffuse mismodeling can lead to bias PS inference

Better Galactic diffuse models and/or additional diffuse degrees of freedom can mitigate diffuse mismodeling to a large extent

Evidence for PS-like structure in the data robust so far. More work to be done!

Additional slides

Significance of a PS signal Test with simulations



Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum



Harmonic marginalization can mitigate mismodeling effects



Some diffuse models are better than others A non-Poissonian example







NPTF region of interest variations




Diffuse model goodness-of-fit



Siddharth Mishra-Sharma (NYU) | CERN-TH BSM Forum

