

# Cosmological attractor approximation in Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity

E.O. Pozdeeva

Skobeltsyn Institute of Nuclear Physics (SINP MSU)

The talk is based on the paper by E.O. Pozdeeva, *Eur.Phys.J.C* 80 (2020) 7,612  
[arXiv:2005.10133 [gr-qc]]

**Virtual Conference of the Polish Society on Relativity 2020**  
*24-26 Sep 2020 Europe/Warsaw*

- The inflation was supposed to solve problems related with the hot big-bang model<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>R. Brout, F. Englert, E. Gunzig, The Creation of the Universe as a Quantum Phenomenon, *Annals Phys.*, **115**, 78 (1978).  
A. A. Starobinsky, "A New Type of Isotropic Cosmological Models Without Singularity," *Phys. Lett. B* **91**, 99 (1980);  
D. Kazanas, "Dynamics of the Universe and Spontaneous Symmetry Breaking," *Astrophys. J.*, **241**, L59 (1980);  
K. Sato, "First-order phase transition of a vacuum and the expansion of the Universe," *MNRAS*, **195**, 467 (1981);  
A. H. Guth, "The Inflationary Universe: A Possible Solution to the Horizon and Flatness Problems," *Phys. Rev. D* **23**, 347 (1981);  
A. D. Linde, "A New Inflationary Universe Scenario: A Possible Solution of the Horizon, Flatness, Homogeneity, Isotropy and Primordial Monopole Problems," *Phys. Lett. B* **108**, 389 (1982);  
A. Albrecht, P. J. Steinhardt, "Cosmology for Grand Unified Theories with Radiatively Induced Symmetry Breaking," *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **48**, 1220 (1982);  
A. D. Linde, "Chaotic Inflation," *Phys. Lett. B* **129**, 177 (1983);  
V. F. Mukhanov and G. V. Chibisov, "Quantum Fluctuation and Nonsingular Universe. (In Russian)," *JETP Lett.* **33**, 532 (1981) [*Pisma Zh. Eksp. Teor. Fiz.* **33**, 549 (1981)];

- The  $R^2$  inflationary predictions <sup>2</sup> in the leading approximation in terms of inverse e-folding numbers  $1/N$  for spectral index  $n_s$  and tensor-to-scalar ratio  $r$ :

$$n_s \simeq 1 - \frac{2}{N}, \quad r \simeq \frac{12}{N^2} \quad (1)$$

are in the best agreement with Planck 2018 data <sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>A. A. Starobinsky, "Dynamics of phase transition in the new inflationary universe scenario and generation of perturbations, Phys. Lett. **B117** 175 (1982).

A. Starobinsky, "The Perturbation Spectrum Evolving from a Nonsingular Initially de Sitter Cosmology and the Microwave Background Anisotropy," Sov. Astron. Lett. **9**, 302 (1983).

<sup>3</sup>Y. Akrami *et al.* [Planck], "Planck 2018 results. X. Constraints on inflation," [arXiv:1807.06211 [astro-ph.CO]].

- There exist two variants for interpretation of relation between time derivative and e-folding number derivative:

$$\textcircled{1} \quad \frac{d}{dt} = H \frac{d}{dN_e} \quad \text{and}$$

$$\textcircled{2} \quad \frac{d}{dt} = -H \frac{d}{dN}.$$

In the case of the first type formulation, the inflation interval in the e-folding formulation is  $-65 < N_e < 0$ .

In the case of the second type formulation, inflation interval in e-folding formulation  $0 < N < 65$ .

The second formulation was applied in cosmological attractor approximation<sup>4</sup> and we follow to the second formulation with

$$N = -\ln\left(\frac{a}{a_{\text{end}}}\right).$$

---

<sup>4</sup>M. Galante, R. Kallosh, A. Linde and D. Roest, "Unity of Cosmological Inflation Attractors," Phys. Rev. Lett. **114** (2015) no.14, 141302 [arXiv:1412.3797 [hep-th]].  
R. Kallosh and A. Linde, "Universality Class in Conformal Inflation," JCAP **1307**, 002 (2013) [arXiv:1306.5220 [hep-th]].

- The  $\alpha$  – attractors model generalizes the prediction of  $R^2$  Starobinsky inflation.
- The cosmological attractor models predict the same values of observable parameters  $n_s$  and  $r$  in the leading  $1/N$  approximation:

$$n_s \simeq 1 - \frac{2}{N + N_0}, \quad r \simeq \frac{12C_\alpha}{(N + N_0)^2}, \quad (2)$$

where  $C_\alpha$  and  $N_0 \ll 60$  are constants.

- here we have additional freedom in choice of constant  $C_\alpha$

## Models of Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet inflation are actively studied <sup>5</sup>

- 
- <sup>5</sup>M. Satoh and J. Soda, *J. Cosmol. Astropart. Phys.* **09**, 019 (2008)[arXiv:0806.4594];  
Z.K. Guo and D.J. Schwarz, *Phys. Rev. D* **80**, 063523 (2009) [arXiv:0907.0427];  
Z.K. Guo and D.J. Schwarz, *Phys. Rev. D* **81**, 123520 (2010) [arXiv:1001.1897];  
P.X. Jiang, J.W. Hu and Z.K. Guo, *Phys. Rev. D* **88**, 123508 (2013) [arXiv:1310.5579];  
S. Koh, B.H. Lee, W. Lee, and G. Tumurtushaa, *Phys. Rev. D* **90**, 063527 (2014) [arXiv:1404.6096];  
J. Mathew, S. Shankaranarayanan, *Astroparticle Physics* **84**, 1 (2016) [arXiv:1602.00411];  
S. Koh, B.H. Lee and G. Tumurtushaa, *Phys. Rev. D* **95**, 123509 (2017) [arXiv:1610.04360];  
S. Chakraborty, T. Paul and S. SenGupta, *Phys. Rev. D* **98**, 083539 (2018) [arXiv:1804.03004];  
Z. Yi, Y. Gong, and M. Sabir, *Phys. Rev. D* **98**, 083521 (2018)[arXiv:1804.09116];  
N. Rashidi and K. Nozari, *Astrophys. J.* **890**, 58 (2020) [arXiv:2001.07012];  
S. Odintsov and V. Oikonomou, *Phys. Lett. B* **805**, 135437 (2020) [arXiv:2004.00479];  
E. O. Pozdeeva, M. R. Gangopadhyay, M. Sami, A. V. Toporensky and S. Y. Vernov, *Phys. Rev. D* **102** (2020) no.4, 043525,[arXiv:2006.08027 [gr-qc]]

- We construct a gravity model with the Gauss-Bonnet term multiplied to a function of a scalar field which allows to reconstruct expressions for spectral index and tensor-to-scalar ratio from cosmological attractor models in the slow-roll regime. This model includes several constants with variable values. Therefore, we construct a family of models with different values of the constants. We consider the scalar power spectral amplitude and estimate possible values of model parameters using modern observational data .

- 1 We reformulate the problem of the slow-roll regime in Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity in terms of e-folding numbers
- 2 We apply our reformulation to construct model with variable values of parameters which leads to the cosmological attractor approximation for inflationary parameters.
- 3 To satisfy observational data we introduce restriction to model parameters.
- 4 In Conclusions we summaries our results.



# Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity

- We consider the model with the Gauss-Bonnet term multiplied to a function of the scalar field  $\phi$ :

$$S = \int d^4x \sqrt{-g} \left[ \frac{R}{2} - \frac{\partial^\nu \phi \partial_\nu \phi}{2} - V(\phi) - \frac{\xi(\phi)}{2} \mathcal{G} \right], \quad (3)$$

where  $\mathcal{G} = R_{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} R^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma} - 4R_{\mu\nu} R^{\mu\nu} + R^2$ .

- Application of the variation principle leads to the following system of equations in spatially flat FLRW metric with  $ds^2 = -dt^2 + a^2(t)(dx^2 + dy^2 + dz^2)$ :

$$6H^2 = \dot{\phi}^2 + 2V + 24\xi\dot{H}^3, \quad (4)$$

$$2\dot{H} = -\dot{\phi}^2 + 4\ddot{\xi}H^2 + 4\dot{\xi}H(2\dot{H} - H^2), \quad (5)$$

$$\ddot{\phi} + 3H\dot{\phi} + V_{,\phi} + 12\xi_{,\phi}H^2(\dot{H} + H^2) = 0, \quad (6)$$

where  $H = \dot{a}/a$ , the dot means the derivative of time:  $\dot{A} = dA/dt$ .

# Slow-roll regime in Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity

- We consider the model with the Gauss-Bonnet term multiplied to a function of the scalar field in FLRW metric in the slow-roll regime <sup>6</sup>:

$$\dot{\phi}^2 \ll V, \quad |\ddot{\phi}| \ll 3H|\dot{\phi}|, \quad 4|\dot{\xi}|H \ll 1, \quad |\ddot{\xi}| \ll |\dot{\xi}|H, \quad (7)$$

in which of the equations of motion are:

$$H^2 \simeq \frac{V}{3}, \quad \dot{H} \simeq -\frac{\dot{\phi}^2}{2} - 2\dot{\xi}H^3, \quad \dot{\phi} \simeq -\frac{V_{,\phi} + 12\xi_{,\phi}H^4}{3H}. \quad (8)$$

- The slow-roll parameters are:

$$\epsilon_1 = -\frac{\dot{H}}{H^2}, \quad \epsilon_{i+1} = \frac{d \ln |\epsilon_i|}{d \ln a}, \quad i \geq 1, \quad (9)$$

$$\delta_1 = 4\dot{\xi}H, \quad \delta_{i+1} = \frac{d \ln |\delta_i|}{d \ln a}, \quad i \geq 1. \quad (10)$$

---

<sup>6</sup>Z. Guo and D. J. Schwarz, Phys. Rev. D **81** (2010), 123520 [arXiv:1001.1897 [hep-th]].

# Cosmological attractor generalization

- To get cosmological attractor generalization we consider the model in slow-roll regime using the e-folding number representation and designation  $A' = dA/dN$ :

$$(\phi')^2 \simeq \frac{V'}{V} + \frac{4}{3}\xi'V = \frac{(H^2)'}{H^2} + 4H^2\xi'. \quad (11)$$

- We present the first slow-roll parameters in terms of  $H^2$ ,  $\xi$ :

$$\epsilon_1 = \frac{1}{2} \frac{(H^2)'}{H^2}, \delta_1 = -4H^2\xi'. \quad (12)$$

- The second slow-roll parameters are related with first slow-roll parameters:

$$\epsilon_2 = -\epsilon_1'/\epsilon_1, \quad \delta_2 = -\delta_1'/\delta_1. \quad (13)$$

- The slow-roll approximation requires  $|\epsilon_i| \ll 1$ ,  $|\delta_i| \ll 1$ .

- The numbers of inflation scenarios in Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet can be restricted such as the speed of sound should be real <sup>7</sup>.
- However there is a wonderful properties : In slow-roll regime the speed of sound is real. Such as the square of speed of sound can be presented in the form  $c_A^2 = 1 + \Delta c_A^2$ , where

$$\Delta c_A^2 = -\frac{2\delta_1^2\epsilon_1}{3\delta_1^2 + 2(2\epsilon_1 - \delta_1)(1 + \delta_1)}. \quad (14)$$

In general case of slow-roll regime

$$\Delta c_A^2 \simeq -(\delta_1^2\epsilon_1)/(2\epsilon_1 - \delta_1) \ll 1.$$

If  $2\epsilon_1 \approx \delta_1$ , then  $\Delta c_A^2 \simeq -2\epsilon_1/3 \ll 1$ . Thus, we can conclude  $c_A^2 > 0$  in slow-roll regime.

---

<sup>7</sup>G. Hikmawan, J. Soda, A. Suroso and F. P. Zen, Phys. Rev. D **93** (2016) no.6, 068301 [arXiv:1512.00222 [hep-th]]

S. Odintsov and V. Oikonomou, Phys. Lett. B **805** (2020), 135437 [arXiv:2004.00479 [gr-qc]]

- The spectral index of scalar perturbations and the tensor-to-scalar ratio can be presented in terms e-folding numbers derivatives:

$$n_s = 1 - 2\epsilon_1 + \frac{r'}{r}, \quad (15)$$

$$r = 8|2\epsilon_1 - \delta_1| = 8 \left( \frac{(H^2)'}{H^2} + 4H^2\xi' \right) = 8(\phi')^2. \quad (16)$$

using  $\epsilon_2 = -\epsilon_1'/\epsilon_1$ ,  $\delta_2 = -\delta_1'/\delta_1$ .

- The expression for amplitude in the leading order is :

$$A_s \simeq \frac{2H^2}{\pi^2 r} \simeq \frac{V}{6\pi^2 U^2 r}. \quad (17)$$

# Generalization of the cosmological attractor method

- Accordingly to inflationary parameters of cosmological-attractor models without the Gauss-Bonnet term spectral index includes only logarithmic derivative of tensor-to-scalar ratio

$$\frac{r'}{r} = -\frac{2}{N + N_0}, \quad \text{and} \quad n_s \approx 1 + \frac{r'}{r}. \quad (18)$$

in the leading order of  $1/N$  approximation.

- The model without the Gauss-Bonnet term and exponential potential leading to cosmological-attractor prediction was considered in <sup>8</sup>
- We generalize this model to the Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity.

---

<sup>8</sup>V. Mukhanov, Eur. Phys. J. C **73** (2013), 2486 [arXiv:1303.3925 [astro-ph.CO]]

# Exponential form

To generalize cosmological attractor approximation to inflationary models with the Gauss-Bonnet term we compare (16) with (2):

$$\frac{r}{8} = \frac{(H^2)'}{H^2} + 4H^2\xi' = \frac{3C_\alpha}{2(N + N_0)^2}. \quad (19)$$

For simplicity we suppose that all terms in this equation are proportional to  $1/(N + N_0)^2$  and get the same approximation of slow-roll parameter  $\epsilon_1$  in leading  $1/N$  order:

$$H^2 = H_0^2 \exp\left(-\frac{3C_\beta}{2(N + N_0)}\right), \quad \xi = \xi_0 \exp\left(\frac{3C_\beta}{2(N + N_0)}\right), \quad (20)$$

where  $C_\beta$  is a constant. We substitute (20), (20) to (19) and get:

$$\frac{r}{8} = \frac{3C_\beta}{2(N + N_0)^2} (1 - 4\xi_0 H_0^2), \quad (21)$$

fixing a relation between  $C_\alpha$  and  $C_\beta$ :

$$C_\beta = \frac{C_\alpha}{1 - 4\xi_0 H_0^2}, \quad H_0^2 \neq \frac{1}{4\xi_0}. \quad (22)$$

Accordingly (16) the derivative of field is related with e-folding number:

$$(\phi')^2 = \frac{3C_\alpha}{2(N + N_0)^2}; \quad \phi' = \frac{\omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{3C_\alpha}{2}}}{N + N_0}, \quad \omega_\phi = \pm 1 \quad (23)$$

from here

$$\phi = \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{3C_\alpha}{2}} \ln \left( \frac{N + N_0}{N_\phi} \right), \quad N + N_0 = N_\phi \exp \left( \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right). \quad (24)$$

Using (8), (20) and (24) we construct family of the models with the Gauss-Bonnet interaction and potential with variable parameter  $C_\alpha$ :

$$V = 3H_0^2 \exp \left( -\frac{3}{2} \frac{C_\beta}{N_\phi} \exp \left( -\omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right) \right), \quad (25)$$

$$\xi = \xi_0 \exp \left( \frac{3}{2} \frac{C_\beta}{N_\phi} \exp \left( -\omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right) \right) \quad (26)$$

leading to appropriate inflationary scenarios. This model is generalization of the general relativity model obtained in <sup>9</sup>

<sup>9</sup>V. Mukhanov, Eur. Phys. J. C **73** (2013), 2486 [arXiv:1303.3925 [astro-ph.CO]]



- We would like to compare inflationary parameters of obtained model (26) with inflationary parameters of the following model:

$$V = 3H_0^2 \left( 1 - \frac{3C_\beta}{4N_\phi} \exp \left( -\omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right) \right)^2, \quad (27)$$

$$\xi = \xi_0 \left( 1 - \frac{3C_\beta}{4N_\phi} \exp \left( -\omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right) \right)^{-2}. \quad (28)$$

- In this model the relation between e-folding numbers and fields values is differ from (24) and can be presented in the form:

$$\frac{N + N_0}{N_\phi} = \exp \left( \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right) - \frac{3}{4} \frac{C_\beta}{N_\phi} \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi, \quad (29)$$

- Here we should note that if  $\omega_\phi = +1$ , then

$$\exp \left( \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right) - \frac{3}{4} \frac{C_\beta}{N_\phi} \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \simeq \exp \left( \omega_\phi \sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}} \phi \right)$$

in the large fields expansion and relation (29) can be roughly approximated to (24).

# Inflationary parameters

In the comparing analysis we suppose  $N_\phi = 3C_\beta/4$  and  $\omega_\phi = 1$  for simplicity and consider the models:

1.  $V = 3H_0^2 \exp\left(-2 \exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right)\right)$ ,  $\xi = \xi_0 \exp\left(2 \exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right)\right)$
2.  $\tilde{V} = 3H_0^2 \left(1 - \exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right)\right)^2$ ,  $\tilde{\xi} = \xi_0 \left(1 - \exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right)\right)^{-2}$ .

To estimate the inflationary parameters (tensor-to-scalar ratio, spectral index of scalar perturbations) for both models we use following expressions

$$r = 8Q^2, \quad n_s = 1 - Q \frac{V_\phi}{V} + 2Q_{,\phi}, \quad Q = V_{,\phi}/V + 4\xi_{,\phi} V/3. \quad (30)$$

In the large field  $\phi$  approximation the expressions for  $r$  and  $\tilde{r}$  are coincide up to second order, the expressions for  $n_s$  and  $\tilde{n}_s$  are coincide up to first order of  $\exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right)$ . The precision coincides with sensibility of cosmological attractor approximation (2). To satisfy the proposal sensibility we can write

$$n_s \simeq 1 + \frac{8(4H_0^2\xi_0 - 1)}{3C_\alpha} \exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right),$$

$$r \simeq \frac{64(4H_0^2\xi_0 - 1)^2}{3C_\alpha} \exp\left(-2\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right).$$

Accordingly to (22) these relations can be presented in the forms:

$$n_s \simeq 1 - \frac{2}{N_\phi} \exp\left(-\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right),$$

$$r \simeq \frac{12C_\alpha}{N_\phi^2} \exp\left(-2\sqrt{\frac{2}{3C_\alpha}}\phi\right)$$

which are fully correspond to (2).

# Restriction to the model parameters

- Accordingly to the Planck data
  - value of scalar spectral index and the restriction to tensor-to-scalar ratio are:

$$n_s \approx 0.965 \pm 0.004 \text{ and } r < 0.056$$

- value of scalar power spectrum amplitude is  $A_s \approx 2 \cdot 10^{-9}$ .
- The considered inflationary models with the Gauss-Bonnet interaction can be presented more precisely, namely, to satisfy condition  $\epsilon_1(N \simeq 0) \approx 1$  we should suppose  $N_0 = \sqrt{3C_\beta/4}$ .
- To follow to ref. <sup>10</sup> we suppose  $N_0 = 1$  and get  $C_\beta = 4/3$ .

---

<sup>10</sup>V. Mukhanov, Eur. Phys. J. C **73** (2013), 2486 [arXiv:1303.3925 [astro-ph.CO]]

Accordingly to (2) the highest value of constant  $C_\alpha$  is related with modern observations restriction to the tensor-to-scalar ratio  $r$  and the value of e-folding number at the beginning of inflation. At the same time a start point of inflation defines the value of spectral index of scalar perturbations.

We numerically estimate the value of the model parameters using (2) and supposing that the inflation begin:

- 1 at  $N \approx 55 - N_0$  before the end of inflation:  $n_s \approx 0.964$  and  $0 \leq C_\alpha < 14.1$ ;
- 2 at  $N \approx 60 - N_0$  before the end of inflation:  $n_s \approx 0.967$  and  $0 \leq C_\alpha < 16.7$ ;
- 3 at  $N \approx 65 - N_0$  before the end of inflation:  $n_s \approx 0.969$  and  $0 \leq C_\alpha < 19.6$ .

To get expression for scalar power spectrum amplitude we substitute (19) and (20) to (17):

$$A_s \simeq \frac{H_0^2(N + N_0)^2}{6\pi^2 C_\alpha} \exp\left(-\frac{3C_\beta}{2(N + N_0)}\right) \quad (31)$$

$$= \frac{H_0^2(N + N_0)^2}{6\pi^2 C_\alpha} \exp\left(-\frac{2N_0^2}{N + N_0}\right), \quad (32)$$

from where

$$\frac{H_0^2}{C_\alpha} = \frac{6\pi^2 A_s}{(N + N_0)^2} \exp\left(\frac{2N_0^2}{N + N_0}\right). \quad (33)$$

To estimate  $H_0^2/C_\alpha$  we suppose  $N_0 \approx 1$  in three cases:

- 1 if the start point of inflation  $N \approx 54$ , then  $H_0^2/C_\alpha \approx 4.09 \cdot 10^{-11}$
- 2 if the start point of inflation  $N \approx 59$ , then  $H_0^2/C_\alpha \approx 3.40 \cdot 10^{-11}$
- 3 if the start point of inflation  $N \approx 64$ , then  $H_0^2/C_\alpha \approx 2.90 \cdot 10^{-11}$

To estimate relation between model parameters  $\xi_0$  and  $C_\alpha$  we use relation (22):

$$\xi_0 = \frac{1}{4} \left( \frac{1}{C_\alpha} - \frac{1}{C_\beta} \right) \left( \frac{H_0^2}{C_\alpha} \right)^{-1} = \frac{1}{4} \left( \frac{1}{C_\alpha} - \frac{3}{4} \right) \left( \frac{H_0^2}{C_\alpha} \right)^{-1}$$

in three cases:

- 1 if the start point of inflation  $N \approx 54$ , then  $\xi_0 \approx (C_\alpha^{-1} - 3/4) 6.10 \cdot 10^9$
- 2 if the start point of inflation  $N \approx 59$ , then  $\xi_0 \approx (C_\alpha^{-1} - 3/4) 7.35 \cdot 10^9$
- 3 if the start point of inflation  $N \approx 64$ , then  $\xi_0 \approx (C_\alpha^{-1} - 3/4) 8.62 \cdot 10^9$ .

The value of parameter  $\xi_0$ : is positive if  $C_\alpha > 4/3$ ;  $\xi_0 = 0$  if  $C_\alpha = 4/3$ ; is negative if  $C_\alpha < 4/3$ .

# Conclusion

- We get the generalization to the cosmological attractor of exponential form to gravity with the Gauss-Bonnet term. The generalization lead to analytical expressions for inflationary parameters coinciding with inflationary parameters of cosmological attractor models in the leading order approximation.
- Within the framework of the model we obtain an analytical expression for scalar power spectrum amplitude
- We estimate the models constants using observation data for the value of scalar power spectrum amplitude, the spectral index of scalar perturbations and the tensor-to-scalar ratio.
- We consider the possible models expanding for a large field.
- For future refinement, it should be noted that the presentation of  $n_s$  up to second order in  $1/N$  can's lead to better agreement with modern observations.



**Thank for your attention**